

**CONTRIBUTIONS OF WOMEN'S EMBODIED KNOWING TO EDUCATION  
FOR LEADERSHIP AND PEACEMAKING**

**A Dissertation  
presented to  
the Faculty of the  
Claremont School of Theology**

**In Partial Fulfillment  
of the Requirements for the Degree  
Doctor of Philosophy**

**by  
Susan M. Perz  
May 2002**

**"El Pecho de Mi Madre" ("My Mother's Breast"), © Noris Binet, Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom, Winter 1995, reprinted by permission.**

© 2002

Susan M. Perz

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

*This dissertation, written by*

*Susan M. Perry*

*under the direction of* her *Faculty Committee,*  
*and approved by its members, has been presented to and*  
*accepted by the Faculty of the Claremont School of*  
*Theology in partial fulfillment of the requirements for*  
*the degree of*

**DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY**

*Faculty Committee*

*Mary Elizabeth Mullins Moore*  
*Chairperson*

*Marcia H. Riggs*

*Elizabeth Condi-Frazier*

*Daryl G. Smith*

*May 10, 2002*  
*Date*

*John H. Furrer*  
*Dean*

## **ABSTRACT**

### **CONTRIBUTIONS OF WOMEN'S EMBODIED KNOWING TO EDUCATION FOR LEADERSHIP AND PEACEMAKING**

by

**Susan M. Perz**

This dissertation is a study of the psychology of female embodiment, its relationship to women's leadership and peacemaking, and the role of education in enhancing women's local, national, and global leadership in the church and world. It is a constructive synthesis of research from multiple disciplines: theology, psychology, leadership studies, and religious education, with particular attention to embodiment and peacemaking literature. The thesis is that female embodiment influences women's theologies, psychologies, and leadership styles, creating the potential for unique contributions to peacemaking which can be enhanced through education. An interview study of leadership in a grassroots community organization of African American women, the Newtown Florist Club, Gainesville, Georgia, also informs the study. Themes from the interviews have been engaged in critical dialogue with the literature.

Implications are drawn from the dialogue for an embodied theory and practice of education that enhances women's leadership as peacemakers. Attention is given to analyzing women's historic actions as peacemakers, and future public leadership and peacemaking at grassroots, national, and global levels. The analysis and vision lead to critical reflection on selected religious education theories, and to proposals for an educational approach that enhances embodied knowing and, hence, the leadership and peacemaking practices of U.S. women.



## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

**To Bill Sapp, Dave Webb, and David Tribble:  
Without your help, support, and encouragement, I might not have gone back to  
continue my education and earn a Ph.D.**

**To the Newtown Florist Club:  
Doing these interviews was one of the most powerful experiences of my life.  
Thank you for allowing me to be part of your lives.**

**To my Committee Chair, Dr. Mary Elizabeth Moore:  
For seeing my process through to completion after she moved to Emory,  
and for her insight, precision, and encouragement.**

**To my Committee: Dr. Elizabeth Conde-Frazier, Dr. Daryl Smith, Dr. Karen Baker  
Fletcher, (early on), and Dr. Marcia Riggs (fourth reader), as well as Elaine Walker,  
(Thesis Secretary):  
Thank you for your wisdom, patience, and guidance.**

**To Rhonda Pettit-McPheron, Gabriel Mayer, Khushnud Azariah, and Janet Parachin:  
For being wonderful, supportive friends and colleagues.**

# CONTENTS

Chapter	Page
Introduction . . . . .	1
<b>PART 1: Themes of Women's Embodiment: Women's Contributions to Knowledge, Leadership, Peacemaking, and Religious Education . . . .</b>	<b>14</b>
1. An Interview Study of Leadership in the Newtown Florist Club . . . . .	15
2. Embodied Time . . . . .	34
Cyclical Sense of Time . . . . .	34
The Erotic Creates and Shapes Time . . . . .	70
The Meaning of Time--The Worth of Life . . . . .	90
Addressing Conflict Directly . . . . .	101
Remembering the Future: Making a Way Out of No Way . . . . .	109
3. Embodied Relationships . . . . .	114
Awareness of Feelings and Intuition . . . . .	116
Empathy . . . . .	122
Relationship With the Divine . . . . .	135
Mutuality . . . . .	146
Connectedness and Shared Body . . . . .	159
Synthesizing Thinking . . . . .	189
4. Embodied Self-Giving to Children . . . . .	198
Pregnancy as Passionate Solidarity . . . . .	198
Vulnerability, Risk, Strength, and Courage . . . . .	214
Preservative and Protective Love . . . . .	225
<b>PART 2: New Directions in Religious Education . . . . .</b>	<b>255</b>
5. Structures of Peace Education and Professional Peacemaking . . . . .	256
Community-based education: Insights From the Newtown Florist Club. . . . .	256
Understandings of Peace Education . . . . .	258
United Nations Mandates for Peace Education . . . . .	262
Methods and Criteria for Evaluating the Health of a Community's Social Structure . . . . .	265
Bringing Peace Education Into Local Communities . . . . .	266
The Establishment of Peace Colleges and Peacemaking as a Profession . . . . .	274
6. Embodied Theory and Practice of Religious Education for Peacemaking . . . . .	277
Insights From the Newtown Florist Club . . . . .	277
Theological Assumptions Underlying Religious Education for Peacemaking . . . . .	281
Epistemological and Content Guidelines . . . . .	284
Women's Leadership for Peacemaking, a Bachelor's	

Degree . . . . .	301
Conclusion: Preparing Leadership for International Peacemaking Movements . . . . .	304
Appendix . . . . .	308
A. Interview Questions for the Newtown Florist Club Interview Study	308
B. Skills Involved in Awareness of Feelings . . . . .	309
C. The Problem-Solving Model . . . . .	311
D. El Pecho de Mi Madre (My Mother's Breast) . . . . .	312
E. Ann Wimberly's Eight Dimension of Liberation in Christian Education . . . . .	313
F. Appeal to Womanhood Throughout the World (Julia Ward Howe's Mother's Day Proclamation of 1870 . . . . .	315
G. A Community Twelve Step Recovery Program . . . . .	316
H. Basic Standards of Community Health . . . . .	317
Bibliography . . . . .	322

## Dedication

Dearest Most Beautiful Name,  
...dearest deep River of my soul  
...essence and fragrant Spirit breeze  
who caresses and carries my soulheart skyward and  
soulheartward...  
...making me one with creation  
...rocking me in the bosom of the rhythms of Your universe,  
Creation lies within me and is one with me.  
Ocean depths surge like primordial songs,  
singing me... rocking me to sleep  
in the circle of Your arms... ocean arms... ocean arms...  
...lost and so ultimately, simultaneously found...  
in the circles, cycles, seasons...  
of Your Love... .<sup>1</sup>

To God:  
You have been my constant companion,  
Thank you for your Wisdom and Guidance.  
You are the Love of the my life.

To my mother, Marian Perz:  
You taught me what it means to love.  
Thank you for your insight and for supporting me.

To David L. Smith:  
For being a soulmate.

---

<sup>1</sup> Susan M. Perz, "Dedication," Louisville, Kentucky, 1985.

## **Introduction**

This dissertation is a study of the psychology of female embodiment, its relationship to women's leadership and peacemaking, and the role of education in enhancing women's local, national, and global leadership. It is a constructive synthesis of themes from the research of diverse women scholars in theology, psychology, leadership, and religious education, with special attention to embodiment, women in development, and peacemaking research. Common themes among these disciplines form the foundation for constructing a women's embodied epistemology that articulates currently unarticulated links between female embodiment and women's psychology. Emerging themes are used to articulate implications for an embodied theory and practice of education that enhances women's leadership as peacemakers.

Contributing to this body of knowledge is an interview study of leadership in a grassroots community of African American women. The Newtown Florist Club is a 51-year-old nonprofit community service organization engaged in antiracism and environmental education and advocacy in Gainesville, Georgia. From Fall 2000 to May 2001, I completed nineteen videotaped interviews of the Newtown Florist Club community leaders. Themes emerging from the interviews have been engaged in critical dialogue with the literature. This dissertation includes four types of research: (1) a review of women's scholarship on embodiment, crossing disciplines and identifying common themes; (2) an interview study of leadership characteristics in a grassroots community of African American women; (3) the construction of an embodied epistemology and psychology, linking theoretical constructs regarding embodiment with tenets of existing psychological theories, and (4) the construction of an embodied theory of religious education.

## **Thesis**

Female embodiment influences women's theology, psychology, and leadership styles, creating in women the potential for unique contributions to peacemaking in the public sphere, which can be evoked and enhanced through

education. Medical, anthropological, and psychological research reveals influences of female embodiment on women's development focusing on brain structure, cycles of desire, experiences of pregnancy, birth, and breastfeeding, and western practices of care for the female body. These influences are not deterministic; they combine with, and are heightened and mitigated by, other factors influencing women's development. Although embodied factors do not necessarily lead to peacemaking, their multifaceted influences can affect women's leadership and peacemaking in positive ways that can be enhanced through education. The establishment of an epistemology of female embodiment enables women to understand themselves and to recognize and trust female embodiment as a source of indigenous knowledge, whose potential influences can enhance women's leadership and peacemaking. Systematic study also points to practices of education that can enhance women's leadership and peacemaking.

### **Female Embodiment and Christian Tradition**

The Christian tradition has historically devalued the theological and spiritual significance of female embodiment; however, important advances have been made in the latter half of the twentieth century.

Several scholars have explored biblical texts and arguments related to female embodiment. Phyllis Trible describes biblical texts illustrating linguistic connections between women's wombs and human and Divine compassion, love, and mercy.<sup>1</sup> Elizabeth Johnson describes a "constellation of biblical symbols for God" that revolve around women's experiences of conceiving, bearing, birthing, and breastfeeding.<sup>2</sup> Bridget Mary Meehan provides translations of biblical texts and quotes from Christian mystics describing God in female embodied and motherly terms.<sup>3</sup> Ariel and Chana Bloch translate the texts of the Song of Songs, providing

---

<sup>1</sup> Phyllis Trible, God and the Rhetoric of Sexuality: Overtures to Biblical Theology (Philadelphia.: Fortress Press, 1978), 33.

<sup>2</sup> Elizabeth Johnson, She Who Is: the Mystery of God in Feminist Theological Discourse (New York: Crossroad, 1992), 100.

<sup>3</sup> Mary Bridget Meehan, Exploring the Feminine Face of God: A Prayerful Journey (Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed and Ward, 1991), 3-15.

insights into human relationships and sexuality.<sup>4</sup> Elisabeth Schussler Fiorenza articulates a feminist critical hermeneutics and method which points to the importance of reading between the lines to discern whose voices are missing from biblical texts. She also describes a feminist Christian spirituality rooted in the ekklesia of women as the “body of Christ,” in which “the body is the image and model” for “being church.”<sup>5</sup> Leslie Kendrick notes that both of the major covenants of the Bible were initiated with announcements of pregnancies: Sarah’s and Mary’s.<sup>6</sup> Little attention has been given to connecting these passages with women’s leadership and peacemaking.

The valuing of women’s bodies has often been undercut within Christian tradition. According to Margaret Miles, “there is no iconographical tradition in the Christian West that identifies spiritual struggle or the cultivation of a centered religious self within the female body.”<sup>7</sup> Miles argues that “female bodies, in the societies of the Christian West, have not represented women’s subjectivity or sexuality but have, rather, been seen as a blank page on which multiple social meanings could be projected.”<sup>8</sup> Miles notes that associations among the Fall, Eve, and evil were made by Ambrose, Augustine, Luther, and Kierkegaard. These and other male voices formed a collective interpretation of Christianity in Western culture in which female nakedness was generally associated with Eve and evil. These associations affected gender politics and were used to suppress women’s burgeoning economic power in the late medieval period, including the takeover of medical care by male doctors from midwives and herbalists accused of being witches.<sup>9</sup> In contrast to this history, some recent research describes how women’s different understandings of the self and its

---

<sup>4</sup> Ariel Bloch and Chana Block, Introduction and Commentary, The Song of Songs: A New Translation (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998).

<sup>5</sup> Elisabeth Schussler Fiorenza, In Memory of Her: A Feminist Theological Reconstruction of Christian Origins (New York: Crossroads Publishing, 1983), 350.

<sup>6</sup> Leslie Kendrick, “The Theological Implications of Female Embodiment” (Ph.D. diss., Southern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1991).

<sup>7</sup> Margaret Miles, Carnal Knowing: Female Nakedness and Religious Meaning in the Christian West (Kent, Tn.: Burns and Oates, 1992), 141-44.

<sup>8</sup> *Ibid.*, 169.

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid.*, 114-15, 215; Starhawk, Dreaming the Dark: Magic, Sex and Politics (Boston: Beacon Press, 1997).

boundaries relate to their unique potential for leadership and peacemaking.<sup>10</sup>

Kendrick describes pregnancy as an experience of "passionate solidarity" that can provide clues to both human and divine reality through experiences of symbiotic unity and mutuality.<sup>11</sup> Ruddick describes the act of birth as a self-structuring which arises from "the dissolution of boundaries--a living being inside another, emerging from another." This connectedness with a particular child is a source of maternal strategies of nonviolence, both in the home and in the public domain.<sup>12</sup> Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger, and Tarule study women's ways of knowing. In their first major study, many of these women described childbirth as the single most important learning event of their lives.<sup>13</sup> Penelope Washbourn describes pregnancy as a crisis that challenges a woman's understanding of herself as an individual.<sup>14</sup> Judith Jordan and Janet Surrey elaborate that women experience themselves as self-in-relation, knowing themselves through mutual, interdependent relationships with others, based on mirroring and empathy.<sup>15</sup> Relationality and empathy are thus, key characteristics of women's approaches to leadership.<sup>16</sup> The implications for women's historical actions as peacemakers are strong, but not extensively developed in the literature.

---

<sup>10</sup> Kendrick, 138; Sara Ruddick, Maternal Thinking: Toward A Politics of Peace (Boston: Beacon Press, 1989), 210; Judith V. Jordan, "Empathy and Self Boundaries," and Janet Surrey, "The Self-in-Relation: A Theory of Women's Development," 52-57 in Judith V. Jordan et. al, Women's Growth in Connection: Writings from the Stone Center (New York: Guilford Press, 1991); Penelope Washbourn, Becoming Woman: The Quest for Wholeness in Female Experience (New York: Harper and Row Publishers, 1977), 96-101.

<sup>11</sup> Kendrick, 139.

<sup>12</sup> Ruddick, 210.

<sup>13</sup> Mary Belenky et. al., Women's Ways of Knowing, (New York: Basic Books, 1986), 35.

<sup>14</sup> Washbourn, 96-97.

<sup>15</sup> Jordan, "Empathy and Self Boundaries," and Surrey, "Self-in-Relation," in Women's Growth in Connection, 68-73; 52-57.

<sup>16</sup> Helen B. Regan and Gwen H. Brooks, Out of Women's Experience: Creating Relational Leadership (Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Corwin Press, 1995), 27; and Kathryn R. Hurty "Women in the Principal's Office: Perspectives on Leadership and Power," (Ph.D. diss., University of California, Berkeley, 1985).



### **Statement of the Problem**

"My body knows unheard-of songs."<sup>17</sup>

If unaware of the body's experiences and its influences on psychology, theology, leadership and peacemaking, it can be difficult for women to name, trust, and act with confidence on those experiences. Mary Daly notes the power of naming experience to empower women's ways of being in the world.<sup>18</sup> Mary Field Belenky, Lynne A. Bond, and Jacqueline S. Weinstock empower women to trust unarticulated, intuitive forms of relational leadership.<sup>19</sup>

Helen Regan and Gwen Brooks describe how empowering it was for women principals in their support group to gradually recognize that other women shared similar leadership styles. This knowledge strengthened them in trusting their ways of leading, particularly when they conflicted with traditional leadership models.<sup>20</sup> Mary Elizabeth Moore's description of Bernard Lonergan's transcendental method of theology, which begins with "heightening one's consciousness," is informative for religious education:

The process involves becoming aware of our own experience, understanding the unity of that experience, affirming the reality of it, and deciding to act in accord with the norms found in that experience.<sup>21</sup>

Naming, understanding, and claiming one's experience and inherent ethical norms can lead to the creation of "new systems of value" in the world. Theologian Melissa Raphael writes that feminist sacrality points to new systems of value or norms that

---

<sup>17</sup> Helene Cixous, "The Laugh of the Medusa," Signs (summer 1976): 40, quoted in Margaret Miles, 169.

<sup>18</sup> Mary Daly, Beyond God the Father: Toward a Philosophy of Women's Liberation (Boston: Beacon Press, 1973), 8-9.

<sup>19</sup> Mary Field Belenky, Lynne A. Bond, and Jacqueline S. Weinstock, A Tradition That Has No Name: Nurturing the Development of People, Families, and Communities (New York: Basic Books, 1997), 11-17.

<sup>20</sup> Regan and Brooks, 16-17.

<sup>21</sup> Mary Elizabeth Mullino Moore, Teaching from the Heart: Theology and Educational Method (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991), citing Bernard J. F. Lonergan, Method in Theology (London: Darton, Longman and Todd, 1971), 57-73, 14-15.

are generative for peacemaking and the healing of the earth.<sup>22</sup> This dissertation explores embodied roots and their generative theoretical constructs for peacemaking and seeks to articulate ways that education can help prepare women to draw on these strengths and transform them into praxis in the public sphere of peace education and action.

Once women's epistemological contributions to leadership and peacemaking have been significantly recovered and explored, education can help integrate them with positive contributions from male embodiment and traditional male models of leadership. While this dissertation is concerned with human experience, it primarily concerns itself with the experiences of women, and addresses male experience primarily by providing the opportunity for men to learn about heretofore hidden aspects of human experience from women's research and experiences as documented herein.

### **Discussion of the Thesis**

Several questions are raised by women's embodiment. The current literature touches some aspects of these questions, but almost none of it relates to women's roles in leadership and peacemaking.

How does female embodiment shape women's spirituality and theology in relation to leadership and peacemaking? Ann Ulanov describes how the menstrual cycle creates periods in which numinous experiences and deeper spiritual awarenesses occur.<sup>23</sup> Christin Lore Weber uses women's embodiment as a metaphorical paradigm for women's spirituality, which she describes as "movement through the passageway."<sup>24</sup>

Several scholars have explored the theological implications of female and

---

<sup>22</sup> Melissa Raphael, Theology and Embodiment: The Post-Patriarchal Reconstruction of Female Sacrality (Sheffield, England: Sheffield Academic Press, 1996).

<sup>23</sup> Ann Belford Ulanov, The Feminine in Jungian Psychology and Christian Theology (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University Press, 1970), 172-73, 184-87.

<sup>24</sup> Christin Lore Weber, WomanChrist: A New Vision of Feminist Spirituality (San Francisco: Harper and Row Publishers, 1987), 4-7.

male embodiment. In Leslie Kendrick's dissertation, she asks what women's experiences of, and reflections on, menstruation, pregnancy, and breastfeeding could tell us about theology.<sup>25</sup> Melissa Raphael explores symbolic values of female embodiment, focusing on female sacrality within a feminist context.<sup>26</sup> Little attention has been given to particular theological themes that relate to leadership and peacemaking.

How does female embodiment shape women's psychology? Feminist scholars see a relationship between women's embodiment and psychology. Ann Ulanov draws direct parallels between women's ways of knowing and the nuances of the menstrual cycle, using metaphors of conceiving, pregnancy, and birth to ground a feminist epistemology.<sup>27</sup> Penelope Washbourn discusses the psychological implications of being a female body and the psychological crises inherent in female embodiment, both of which raise religious and identity questions.<sup>28</sup> Paula Reeves discusses the relationship of female embodiment and intuition.<sup>29</sup> Penelope Shuttle and Peter Redgrove discuss the effects of menstruation on women's bodies and psyches, weaving into their discussion psychological and anthropological insights.<sup>30</sup>

Penelope Washbourn comes closest to describing a psychology of female embodiment. Sarah Ruddick breaks ground in describing links between women's embodied experiences and moral decision making. She offers only preliminary observations, however, because her work predates more extensive women's psychologies, such as self-in-relation theory and recent research on embodiment.<sup>31</sup>

Psychological theory that describes links between female embodied experiences

---

<sup>25</sup> Kendrick, 3-4.

<sup>26</sup> Raphael, *Theology and Embodiment*, 67-74, 183-219, 262-97.

<sup>27</sup> Ulanov, 175-77.

<sup>28</sup> Washbourn, 2.

<sup>29</sup> Paula M. Reeves, *Women's Intuition: Unlocking the Wisdom of the Body* (Berkeley: Conari Press, 1999), 26-31.

<sup>30</sup> Penelope Shuttle and Peter Redgrove, *The Wise Wound: Menstruation and EveryWoman* (New York: Marion Boyars Publishers, 1999), 41-91.

<sup>31</sup> Ruddick, 206-18.

and women's psychological attributes is still limited.

If women's embodiment shapes women's psychology, then what implications does this have for women's leadership styles and contributions to peacemaking? Regan and Brooks describe basic characteristics of women's leadership along with foundational values of successful women principals in K-12 schools. They make some connections with women's bodily experience, but not connections to women's psychology or peacemaking.<sup>32</sup> Kathleen Hurty describes five leadership characteristics of women principals which rest on a foundation of connection and caring. Hurty, in particular, has found that a number of women refer to their experiences of mothering as a model and training ground for their leadership as principals.<sup>33</sup> Neither Hurty's nor Regan and Brooks' research draws larger implications for women's leadership and peacemaking.

Ruddick asks how maternal practices, mediated through women's embodiment and mothering behaviors, shape women's thinking as peacemakers, and contrasts maternal thinking with militaristic thinking. Ruddick describes the relationship between mothers' embodiment and psychology, and women's historical and potential contributions to peacemaking.<sup>34</sup> Julia Ward Howe's Mother's Day Proclamation of 1870 is an example of how women's peace movements of the late 1800s relied on women's maternal experiences as a source of power to call for disarmament. Harriet Hyman Alonso documents the development of a feminist-pacifist consciousness in women suffragettes, and a history of women's contributions to peacemaking in the United States.<sup>35</sup> Barbara Mann documents the influence of Iroquoian women's leadership and the matrifocal, largely nonviolent Iroquoian

---

<sup>32</sup> Regan and Brooks, 26, 39.

<sup>33</sup> Hurty, 180-81, 124-25, 84-85, 134-141.

<sup>34</sup> Ruddick, 206-18, 185-87, 191-98.

<sup>35</sup> Harriet Hyman Alonso, Peace as a Women's Issue: A History of the U.S. Movement for World Peace and Women's Rights (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1993), 46-47, 16.

League of Nations on the women's movement in the U.S. and France.<sup>36</sup> Many women scholars describe the importance of women's contributions to peacemaking around the world. Some have placed hope in women to turn around the current planetary crises, but few connections to bodily experiences have been made. Women's potential for peacemaking leadership requires more thorough analysis.<sup>37</sup>

If women's embodiment helps shape theology, psychology, leadership characteristics, and women's contributions as peacemakers, then what kind of religious education is needed to evoke and enhance this potential? Maria Harris describes religious education as a dance in which each dance step gives rise to the next. The dance moves in a circle, with each new movement growing out of the preceding movement, but not necessarily in a set order.<sup>38</sup> If women know through their bodies, then it is important that these ways of knowing be evoked through education. Common themes arising from this study and the education theories of Maria Harris, Ann Wimberly, Mary Elizabeth Moore, and bell hooks are described in this dissertation, along with ways in which women's contributions to peacemaking can be enhanced through education.<sup>39</sup>

---

<sup>36</sup> Barbara Alice Mann, Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas (New York: Peter Lang, 2000), 250-52, 258-89, 26, citing Sally Roesch Wagner, "The Root of Oppression in the Loss of Memory: The Iroquois and the Early Feminist Vision," Iroquois Women: An Anthology, ed. William Guy Spittal (Ohsweken, Ontario: Iroquois Publishing and Craft Supplies, 1990), 223-28.

<sup>37</sup> Raphael, Theology and Embodiment, 248-49; Petra Kelly, "Women and the Global Green Movement," Women In World Politics: An Introduction eds. Francine D'Amico and Peter R. Beckman (Westport, Conn.: Bergin and Garvey, 1995), 172-73; Claske Franck, "Dreams of Peace from Bosnia," (courtesy of Pacem in Terris, Warwick, N.Y.), Integrities, summer 1994, 4-5; Carol M. Stephenson, "Women's International Nongovernmental Organizations at the United Nations," Women, Politics, and the United Nations Contributions in Women's Studies, 151, ed. Anne Winslow (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1995), 136, citing Elise Boulding, Women in the Twentieth Century World (New York: John Wiley, 1977), 165-218. Stephenson points out that the framework created by international NGOs could develop into an international women's regime.

<sup>38</sup> Maria Harris, Teaching and Religious Imagination: An Essay in the Theology of Teaching (New York: Harper Collins Publishers, 1987), 25-26.

<sup>39</sup> Ibid; Ann Streaty Wimberly, Soul Stories: African American Christian Education (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1994); Moore, Teaching from the Heart; Bell Hooks, Teaching to Transgress: Education as the Practice of Freedom (New York: Routledge, 1994).

### **Statement of the Method**

The range of literature and the gaps within it point to the need for exploratory, interdisciplinary research. The concern with embodiment also points to the need for empirical study of a living community. The literature review includes medical, anthropological, and theological literature in relation to women's embodied experience. I will then analyze and interpret the dominant themes in relation to women's approaches to meaning-making, leadership and peacemaking. Particular attention is given to (1) articulating new insights, integrating existing research on female embodiment, and relating these to women's psychology and leadership; (2) interpreting these themes in relation to women's historic actions as peacemakers; (3) highlighting future visions for women's leadership and peacemaking; and (4) developing an educational approach that enhances embodied knowing and, hence, the leadership and peacemaking practices of women.

While this is not an ethnographic study, the steps parallel ethnographic methods. Key concepts and quotes are highlighted in the literature, and these are grouped into fourteen emergent themes, which form the major sections of Chapters Two to Four. In fact, the major sections often bear titles coined by the women scholars or taken from concepts they describe. For instance, the section title: "Pregnancy as Passionate Solidarity," was first described by Leslie Kendrick, and "Addressing Conflict Directly" is a characteristic of maternal thinking described Sarah Ruddick.<sup>40</sup> The original fourteen themes are then grouped into three overarching meta-themes that form the major chapters: Embodied Time, Embodied Relationships, and Embodied Self-Giving to Children.

In addition to the literature review, an interview study was done of nineteen African American women members of the Newtown Florist Club, an organization that provides leadership in antiracism and environmental education and advocacy in a community suffering adverse health effects and deaths which may result from a toxic environment.<sup>41</sup> Major themes emerging from these interviews are summarized in

---

<sup>40</sup> Kendrick, 139; Ruddick, 181.

<sup>41</sup> From Fall 2000 to May 2001 this researcher completed nineteen videotaped interviews of women members of the Newtown Florist Club.

## Chapter 1.

The major themes and video clips of interviews were also used to develop a curriculum for a seven-week Leadership Development Program for Girls in the summer of 2001. The planning, implementation, and reflection upon the summer program was action research, constituting a third method of the dissertation. It was sponsored by the Newtown Florist Club and funded through a grant by the Atlanta Women's Foundation, and it is described in Chapter 5.

### **Resources**

This study draws particularly on women's theology, psychology, leadership, peacemaking, and religious education, with attention also given to studies in anthropology and medicine. The embodiment construction is informed by anthropological, theological, and medical research. Its focus on menstruation, pregnancy, and breastfeeding is drawn from Leslie Kendrick's theological work.<sup>42</sup> The psychological construction is informed by research in psychology and mothering, and the theological construction by women's theological and biblical scholarship. The leadership construction is informed by research in the areas of women's leadership in public education, politics, and churches. The history and future of women's peacemaking is informed by histories of peacemaking movements, and studies of women involved in economic development, and environmental justice. The education construction is informed by research in religious and general education, as well as counselor education. In all of this research, literature plays a primary role, but the study of the Newtown Florist Club is an important source of insight and a resource for understanding living communities.

### **Scope and Limitations**

Due to the need for critical integration of a vast literature to inform women's leadership, much material has been concisely focused to meet the space requirements of the dissertation. The scope and limitations can be summarized,

---

<sup>42</sup> Kendrick, 6.

however:

(1) The study focuses on existing research, which includes reports on interviews with women, as well as research on embodied experiences of women. The primary contribution is to synthesize existing research and to focus its contributions to leadership and peacemaking.

(2) The study seeks to uncover and construct links between female embodied experience and existing theories in psychology, theology, and religious education.

(3) Though the study focuses primarily on western heterosexual women's experience, some research includes both heterosexual and lesbian women, and some dialogue will be included with women in other parts of the world, including a discussion of the implications of female genital mutilation.

(4) The study of leadership is limited to research on women in churches, public education, and politics, emphasizing connections to women's embodiment and peacemaking.

(5) The study of peacemaking focuses primarily on the history of women's peace advocacy in the U.S., but includes examples of women's international peace actions as well as research on women in development, environmental advocacy, and human rights.

(6) Research on religious education theory focuses primarily on women educators whose theories make explicit connections with women's embodiment and/or peacemaking.

### **Conclusion**

This study draws together disparate literature to discern patterns of women's embodiment and knowing, especially in relation to leadership and peacemaking. The interview study of the leadership characteristics of African American women in the Newtown Florist Club adds important dimensions to the existing body of knowledge regarding grassroots African American women's leadership characteristics. By discerning the themes of women's embodied practices, I construct



an embodied epistemology. By relating these themes with women's historic actions as peacemakers, I project future visions for U.S. women's public leadership and peacemaking at grassroots, national, and global levels. By engaging these themes in dialogue with religious education theories, I propose an educational approach and specific proposals, (including a Women's Leadership for Peacemaking degree,) for enhancing embodied knowing and, hence, leadership and peacemaking practices of women in the United States.

## **PART 1: Themes of Women's Embodiment: Women's Contributions to Knowledge, Leadership, Peacemaking, and Religious Education**

Part 1 explores common themes between women's embodied psychology, theology, and leadership that are generative for peacemaking. The reference point for the literature review is a living community--the Newtown Florist Club (NFC), a fifty-one-year-old community service organization. Chapter 1 describes leadership characteristics of the women in NFC. The three following chapters focus on aspects of women's embodied experiences--Embodied Time, Embodied Relationships, and Embodied Self-Giving to Children--and their relationship to women's leadership and peacemaking. Together they reveal an embodied epistemology. Each chapter is divided into subsections describing characteristics of women's embodied knowing, and each subsection begins by exploring related themes from the NFC leadership study.

Given that women's leadership is not always peaceful or nondominating, themes are deliberately sought that are generative for peacemaking. Women's embodiment is understood to refer holistically to female physiology, including hormones, brain, sex organs, and other physical structures.) Secondly, female embodiment refers to the physical practices of women's lives that arise out of caring for a menstruating, pregnant, nursing, or sexually active body-self. These practices are sociologically influenced and historically situated, as is female physiology. Part 2 will explore ways in which these characteristics and their related skills can be enhanced through religious education for peacemaking.

## **CHAPTER 1**

### **An Interview Study of Leadership in the Newtown Florist Club**

We begin with studying a living community, that grounds the literature review. The interview study is community-based, utilizing participatory research elements, not only in the interviews themselves, but also in the analysis of data and conclusions.<sup>1</sup> The primary purpose of the study was to gain descriptive knowledge and understanding of leadership styles and values. Questions regarding female embodiment were not asked so as to discover if women would spontaneously express connections between female embodiment and leadership. Although the women interviewed did not talk about embodiment, they often described mothering as a primary source of their leadership.

The Newtown Florist Club (NFC) is a fifty-one-year-old nonprofit organization located in a grassroots African American community experiencing negative health effects that may be related to environmental degradation. The club was begun in the 1950s by six women who collected ten cents for flowers for the ill or dying in their community. "Helping others" was a primary value described by all four surviving club founders. Miss April worked and struggled with the city of Gainesville to create the park on Desota Street for children to have a place to play. For years, children had played at her home and Miss Linda's home, where adults also gathered to discuss concerns in the community. Miss Linda's service work was so extensive that the city hired her to become a social worker.

Originally, no industries were near Newtown, which was built when the city relocated black and white residents in separate neighborhoods after a tornado destroyed many homes in the 1936. Whereas homes in the new white neighborhood were completed, many homes in Newtown were left without porches. Built on top of the city dump, Newtown is located today within five miles of thirteen industries.

During integration, the NFC was a voice for African American youth who were

---

<sup>1</sup> Lee Lyle Williams, "From Common Sense to Good Sense: Participatory Research, Power, Knowledge and Grassroots Empowerment" (Ph.D. diss., University of Tennessee, 1997).

bussed to “white” schools, while the new “black” high school was closed. During this period, a new generation of leaders in the NFC emerged to organize sports, a band, and a chorus when their children were excluded from extracurricular activities at the white high school. Their recreation programs were eventually copied and instituted by the city. The NFC mediated to prevent high school riots on Redneck Day, and led a countermarch against the KKK in 1998. On more than one occasion, the leadership of the NFC has prevented violence in its community, even as it has worked against structural forms of violence from the surrounding community. The third generation of NFC leaders was shaped by integration and the racism of the 1960s. Together, three generations of leaders have created annual beauty pageants, clubs, carnivals, singing groups, parades, street drama, and summer programs for the youth. Urban renewal took a heavy toll on most of the southside’s black businesses, forced to vacate and never reinstated, devastating both the businesses and the community.

In the early 1990s, club members began questioning the many deaths in their neighborhood. After completing a survey, they realized there had been a death or serious illness in every other home on Desota Street, which is three blocks long, and lined by the junkyard. A nearby plant releases grain dust on the community; another releases large amounts of various forms of the chemical hexane, with accidental soot (1998) and hexane (1995) releases. In 1995, Emory students documented a rate of lupus in Newtown that, when compared with the highest prevalence, represented a six-fold increase; in person-years their study revealed a nine-fold increase.<sup>2</sup> They conclude that “environmental sampling of both air and water seems justified in Newtown, and it would be an entirely appropriate public-health response to both long-standing community concerns and to the findings described here.”<sup>3</sup> The NFC began providing education for colleges, high schools, church groups, government officials, and local agencies through Toxic Tours, with

---

<sup>2</sup> Tarik Kardestuncer and Howard Frumkin, “Systemic Lupus Erythematosus in Relation to Environmental Pollution: An Investigation in an African-American Community in North Georgia,” *Archives of Environmental Health* 52, no. 2 (1997): 85, 87-88. These figures are based on what they describe as conservative calculations.

<sup>3</sup> *Ibid.*, 88.

black ribbons marking the mailboxes of homes where people were sick or had died.

In Miss April's small park, a monument lists twenty-six people who have died in this small community, with more names to be added.<sup>4</sup> Lupus, throat and colon cancers, tuberculosis, kidney disease, asthmatic bronchitis, emphysema, heart disease, and severe skin rashes are common in the community. For eight years, the NFC has tried to get help from the larger City of Gainesville, with no success. NFC members have been active in addressing the environmental concerns of the community, and the club became formally established as a nonprofit organization funded through foundation grants. The fourth generation of leaders, (currently teenagers and young college students,) has been largely influenced by environmental issues as well as recent hate group marches.<sup>5</sup>

Over the past fifty-one years, the NFC has had a distinguished history of antiracist and environmental education and activism, as well as youth leadership development. Most of the club's thirty-two members are women, including its Board of Directors and staff. Most are active in their churches. In a recent visit by a foundation studying the work of the NFC, one foundation member noted that the issues of this community are common to many African American communities, "but not every community has a Newtown Florist Club."

The interview study. After I had been working as a part-time staff person at the NFC for five months, the Newtown Florist Club (NFC) became interested in a study to preserve oral histories of its members. The club had an extraordinary history of women's leadership that needed to be documented, researched, and preserved. I felt this tradition could provide important clues for the healing of local communities and our nation, and I discussed this possibility with staff. To conduct videotaped interviews of club members, (appendix A), I developed a consent form, approved by the NFC's lawyer, to obtain permission from each member interviewed. The tapes will eventually be made available for public viewing, and used in published educational curricula and a video documentary. After hearing the

---

<sup>4</sup> At least five more names need to be added to this monument.

<sup>5</sup> Recent hate group marches include the KKK in 1998 and the Northern Alliance in 2000.

questions and an outline of the proposal, the members voted to approve the project and help.

Some members agreed to accompany me on interviews with the club members I did not know well; they also helped arrange interviews. From November 2000 through May 2001, I interviewed nineteen women in the NFC. I encouraged women to tell their stories. Interviews ranged from one-half hour to two hours, averaging an hour. I completed interviews with nineteen of the twenty-two women currently active in the NFC. Since the interviews were completed in May of 2001, two NFC members participating in the study have passed away. Both suffered with cancer. Their funerals were powerful tributes.

During May of 2001, each videotaped interview was watched by at least two women of the Newtown community (mostly NFC members) and myself. Observers were impressed by the depth and passion of many of the interviews. Each observer took notes regarding the major themes that emerged from each question on a separate observer sheet for each interview (see Appendix A). Observers also recorded significant video clip sections for use in a seven-week Leadership Development Program for Girls to be held in the summer of 2001. After watching each interview, observers shared insights regarding the themes, which I recorded and collated as part of the data. Sections of the interviews were compiled thematically and recorded to create a video curriculum for the Leadership Development Program for Girls that focused systematically on different aspects of women's leadership. Themes emerging from the interviews are summarized in this chapter. Names are changed to protect privacy.

#### Leadership characteristics and values of the Newtown Florist Club

Lively themes emerged from the interviews. Most of the women became involved in the Club through the inspiration of other women in the community (including mothers, friends, and grandmothers), by direct invitations to meetings, through their own desire to help others, and/or to address environmental conditions and other community issues. Some members participated in the NFC as children. Some were motivated by their love for working with children, their desire to provide

positive role models like those provided for them, and their concern for youth. Miss Sophia summed up the feelings of many when she said, "It's a positive group of people."

Over half of the women considered themselves leaders; nine did not. One woman described herself as a worker; six saw themselves as followers. Seven said the heart of women's leadership is being proud to help others. All said cooperation is central to the club. Some of the overarching characteristics of their leadership style are:

Valuing relationships; othermothering and mothering whole communities; creating gathering places for community nurture, recreation, and dialogue.

Effective communication skills and collaboration.

Valuing the "human being," while recognizing and naming dehumanizing structural violence.

Strength to survive profound personal losses, and perseverance over decades and across generations.

Strong faith and vibrant relationships with God.

Nonviolent confrontation, strong assertiveness, and risk-taking.

Keeping abreast of issues affecting their community, valuing education, demythologizing, and using education to address denial.

Highly valuing youth and nurturing leadership development of the next generation.

Nonparochial caring and networking across diverse communities and organizations.

The context for women's leadership development in the NFC is one of multiple interlocking layers of oppression and structural violence. Consider the words of Miss Wynona:

**Miss Wynona:** It is the complexity of everything that you have to deal with layered on top of the other things that is the true African American experience, and so for a group of women in Newtown to have to deal with environmental justice and how that impacts our ability to be able to breathe in fresh air and live in a community that's free from contamination; make sure that our loved ones who go to work and come home are not doubly contaminated by the contamination that they're exposed to on their job and then the contamination that they breathe in in the air; and then have to deal with issues of unfair and unequal treatment in the school system, so that our kids can get a quality

education; to deal with issues of police violence, racial profiling; to deal with issues of drugs and drug abuse; and to deal with issues of just simply wanting to have a nice and decent place to live and to raise your family; and then to deal with issues of employment discrimination; to deal with issues of unequal representation in city and county governments and--all of that layered on top of one after the other--that's a lot for any community to have to deal with. And those are only a few. ...But we overcome. We're not mired down in oppression because we know where our strength comes from [--God.] So, any challenge that anybody wants to send our way, we just take it on, because if it ultimately results in improving the quality of life for the next generation, then it's something that we must do anyway.

**Interviewer:** People in this particular community have dealt with all of that while also having family members or themselves being ill or dying and grieving, which is an exhausting experience all by itself....

**Miss Wynona:** It's a wonder that any of us are still left around here--but we're clear that we're not in control. [i.e. God is in control.] ...the African American experience--whether it's in Newtown or in the Newtown community or any other community--just the experience itself, makes you strong. You can't be a part of it and be in it.... some people lose their way.... But it either makes you strong or it kills you.

With an awareness of the community's context and strength, we turn now to the nine leadership characteristics that the women identified.

**Valuing relationships in an expansive spiral of inclusiveness that moves from personal friendship to mothering each other's children to mothering the community and creating structural change.** Helping others and serving the community have been core values of the NFC since its founding. Action-oriented caring is valued in the self and others, and has been historically expressed by caring for the sick; delivering meals or doing laundry for new mothers, the bereaved, and the elderly; helping with transportation; and, the practice for which they are most known, carrying flowers at funerals. Miss Miriam delivered meals until her death in summer of 2001. Miss Linda still delivers homemade cakes.

The first generation's strong values evolved into a community ethos in which relationships were highly valued. Miss Fiona describes the close-knit, emotionally intimate relationships that developed between women and their families. Nurturing relationships with each other's children gradually developed into what Patricia Hill



Collins calls “othermothering.”<sup>6</sup> The NFC women had strong relationships and standing in their community so that they could nurture and discipline each other’s children. Both Miss May and Miss Fiona note that these second generation women had similar concerns about their families and communities and shared many difficult experiences. Miss May described this in biblical terms: “We’re all in one accord.” Miss Fiona who passed away in the fall of 2001, described the club’s “unity”:

**Miss Fiona:** All of us can identify so much, being pretty much in the same community.... You grew up together and you know each other’s needs; I know her needs--she knows my needs. And you can feel it. That’s one thing that makes unity as well as harmony.... Everybody in the community, in the club, that has been there for years, can say that about each other. ...And even as far as our children. Miss Ann may see Nancy and she can kind of get a hint of whether she’s OK or not. She’ll say: “Is Nancy OK?” It’s just from I guess being around each other so much and us growing up together.

**Interviewer:** You can really read each other, what’s going on.... That’s got to be a rare thing these days.

**Miss Fiona:** It is. We can recognize these things and I don’t think anybody in the club would have a problem with disciplining each other’s children--but it’s the children. You don’t know how they would receive it nowadays as opposed to way back when.... Now you look back and say those were the better days. When I’d come in and Miss Janice will have spanked my child already, and told me he didn’t want a spanking and I’d spank him again and not have a problem with it. And the children, they accepted it. They knew if they went out that door and did something wrong, and Miss Ann saw them, they knew what was coming. They knew what to expect and they didn’t have an attitude.... It’s a shame that we can’t get back to that, but I don’t see it.

**Interviewer:** And my guess is the positive nurturing also came from everybody, too, toward everybody’s children....

**Miss Fiona:** That helped the children to accept any disciplinary action they received from the neighbors because they knew that individual loved them, because of all the positive nurturing that they’d already received from them. So they knew if one of them said something to them to get on to them about something, they knew they were right. ...And now whenever Samuel was gone and my older daughter Elise--whenever they called home they would ask, “How’s Miss Janice doing,” or “How are they doing?” And it would make me feel good because I realized that they remembered them and appreciated them....

Solidarity has grown among the women over decades of intimate personal

---

<sup>6</sup> Patricia Hill Collins, Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness, and the Politics of Empowerment (New York: Routledge, 1991), 119-22.

relationships, othermothering, and sharing personal and community justice crises, including integration, harassment by hate groups, and multiple deaths in the community. Personal relationships among these women are grounded in decades of knowing one another and common struggle. Members know each other's family trees--not just single-generation nuclear family trees--but extended family trees over generations. All of these characteristics help paint a rich understanding of what leaders such as Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., and bell hooks have called the "beloved community."<sup>7</sup>

Several other women described nurturing of other women's children as "adopting" them or being "adopted" by them. Miss Sandra, a single woman in her early thirties, described how a number of youth "adopted" her as their other mom and she "adopted" them back. NFC traditions of othermothering and helping evolved into what Miss Jean called "mothering their community":

**Miss Jean:** They are strong. They're dependable, Christian women, strong ethical backgrounds, strong moral backgrounds, love their families, which translates into loving your community, always wanting something better, always trying to make it better, looking for creative new ways to do things that will benefit our community, which means that it's a better place for our families....

They are mothers that are mothering their communities, looking out for the best interests of their "children." ...great little mothers and grandmothers really out there doing their thing. It's really a privilege, it really is, because there are some awesome little women out there... that belong to the Florist Club. And they really have made a difference and tried so hard, I tell you. Some times it's funny, sometimes dead serious, and sometimes I guess we may seem like we're downright ornery and mean, but we mean to do right.... If they were politicians, oooh, girl.... If some of these little women were politicians--shoot--everything would be right, straightened up, and straightened out. There'd be a whole lot of dust spanked into shape.

It would be very different, very different. A lot of things would be more inclusive.... Nobody that I know ever tries to exclude, always thinking about the children, thinking about how to make something better, thinking about the elderly... when somebody dies, and Miss Janice or Ann call and say that we've been asked to be flower ladies, you might have some other plans, but you put it down because somebody needs you and you just want to be of service. I guess it's probably the best service-oriented organization that I've ever seen. [They are] really dedicated to whatever task it is. ...So many

---

<sup>7</sup> Bell Hooks, Killing Rage: Ending Racism (New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1995), 263; Martin Luther King, Jr., A Testament of Hope: The Essential Writings of Martin Luther King, Jr., ed. James M. Washington (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1986), 8.

of them are so talented. A lot of them don't take credit for a lot that they do.

NFC's mothering also extends to other communities and organizations:

**Miss Tanya:** No matter what they do as far as teaching or working with other organizations, they always have that mother instinct around them--like making sure that it's done, or working real hard to help that person or that organization. And they work in a motherly way with them, sort of like in steps, each one of them takes care of something... they're taking care of the most important things of what that project is ...when that organization really needs them, they're right there. If nobody else shows up, the NFC will--somebody from the NFC will be there. And they will help.... They're willing to stand up for anything. Stand behind any organization when something's going on.

They're also the same with the motherly instinct with the youth... they're always coming up with ideas of trying to teach the youth, or help the youth, or even make things fun for the youth. They're always there when the youth need them--any of the members--not just for projects, but just for disciplinary issues.

Like if a child gets in trouble in school... most of the club members have been mothers themselves--are always there to talk to the youth, to better them... like with the sex issues... and the drug issues. No matter if it's a project that they talk to them about, they talk to them in a way that they're trying to teach them and better them for the future. Also, with appreciation... they're always pleasing the youth... they're thanking them for what they do, appreciating what they do, and showing it through awards, and projects, and jobs.... The neighborhood kids come in [to the office] all the time, just to look around and ask questions, talk to "Big Mama." And it was like that with summer camp. We were like one big family. And I know that was because of the NFC's mother's instinct, and that was one reason why I think some of the parents allowed their kids to participate....

Members take pride in their genuine love for each other, families, youth, and the surrounding communities, combined with effective personal relating skills and a sincere desire to help others. Humor, laughter, and good-natured teasing are also hallmarks of the club. Some members have special ways of greeting each other and fond nicknames. Helping others was the motivating force behind starting the club and a significant aspect of what it does today. Women encourage others' ideas, even when it means letting someone else take credit. They express concern for their own community and the larger diverse community through hard work.

Several women mentioned mothering as a source for women's leadership styles, indicating that they drew on their experiences as mothers in their relationships with each other and their community. Although none mentioned embodied

experiences, these are implied as aspects of mothering. The study avoided specific questions about embodied experiences to discover if they would emerge spontaneously.

Miss Linda's, Miss April's, and Miss Helen's homes evolved into gathering places for youth and adults--places of nurturing, recreation, and dialogue about community issues. Miss Lisa created an evening youth disco in a community shop for a number of years. Miss Olivia works the nightshift in a youth detention facility and has strong relationships with some of the youth:

I'm a grandmother to them. I used to be momma, but I grew out of it. That's just what they call me--and I answer. It means a lot to me. I work at night; some of the kids will call me from their rooms.

Miss Lisa and others coordinated or helped behind the scenes with many youth activities over the years, including pageants, parades, athletics, bands, singing groups, and dance. Miss April's granddaughter, Miss Dana, described with affection how Miss Ann, who recovered from triple-bypass surgery, and Miss May, who has lupus, played baseball with the youth. The women would hit the ball and the children would run their bases. Today community members drop by the NFC office with problems, community concerns, or a laugh and hug.

**Effective communication skills and collaboration.** Women described the importance of skills such as listening, addressing conflicts without anger, using humor, delegating tasks, and respecting each other's abilities. Miss May noted that the club comes to decisions through dialogue. Members who have researched a particular issue educate the club. The issue is discussed and consensus is reached regarding a course of action.

**Valuing the "human being," while recognizing and naming dehumanizing structural violence.** In describing the NFC's values, four women emphasized the value of human life and the dignity and worth of every person. Three explicitly contrasted the NFC's values with what they described as the larger society's failure to value human life over personal gain. They expressed a strong belief in the equal human rights of all people, and in equality across all areas of society; these are also core beliefs underlying their leadership. Miss May contrasted

the NFC's values with those of the city of Gainesville:

**Miss May:** We value the human being... we value equality. Why can't we have clean air? Why can't we live in a subdivision where there is green grass and pretty trees? Why can't you listen to us to see what kinds of plans and strategies that we have? We're taxpaying people so we should have a voice in whatever goes on. Although a lot of people of color are not in attendance of what goes on downtown around the round table--around the round table, they're counting our tax dollars. So I think the citizens should be involved and get some concern about what's going on around them. Whatever you're going to do, it should not be for just one status of people to make money. I think it ought to be open for everybody, people of color, minorities to join in, so that they can exercise their rights and beliefs or talents ...money is more important to some people than a human life.

It seems like everything that happens, or when they want to change some things out there, they look to the people of color neighborhoods. Like "we'll go out there and bash them--what have they got to lose?"

We've got our pride and we've got our dignity just like they do. We may not have the money, we may not have the houses, but we are proper people. And we deserve to be treated humanly. When I sit back and think about a lot of things that I've seen happen down through the years, and you ask why. ...when you start to sit in the meetings, you'll know why. Power and money. To keep the powerful living on the hill, and keep those that have no power at the bottom.

We're all just a paycheck from being homeless, if the truth be told, but... again, it's not what you make; it's what you do with what you make... I have a roof over my head and I'm thankful for that, but I've learned in my life that you have to sacrifice something and nothing is free, believe me you. And I've always said that money comes with a purpose. And if you've got money, you've got a purpose for that money--other than just making your kingdom lavishly. If you've got money, if you want the money to continue to flow, I feel that you've got to help somebody else. You've got this money and you've got to worry about building something for the homeless, building something for those that are less fortunate, some affordable apartments, some affordable houses.

These concerns emerge naturally from the women's experiences. Many have family members who are ill or have died due to health effects that may be environmentally related. Several of the women are also ill and disabled. Miss Ann's sister, Miss Janice, lost two children to lupus, her husband to cancer, and almost died herself of a brain tumor. Miss Ann suffered triple bypass surgery. She describes her feelings after the community completed its 1990 survey and formally recognized for the first time the unusually high illness and death rates in their community. Miss Ann describes the value of those lives to her, and also notes the failure of the

Gainesville community to value human lives over profits,

**Interviewer:** When you did the first survey, and you'd been to the funerals, and you saw the data that you collected and you saw in numbers literally how much death there was in the community, that must have been pretty hard.

**Miss Ann:** It really was, because some of the deaths was your people, your own people who suffered and died--young people who didn't even *have* a life, and when the state comes in and says it's from smoking and drinking and the kids die at 15, they haven't had a life. And to see how they suffer so hard and how they die, it hurts so bad when they come up and tell you that it's your lifestyle.

I had a niece and nephew who died with lupus, and to see them suffer like that, it hurts so bad. It really does. And my neighbor across the street too, to see how she suffered. And to watch my brother-in-laws, two of them died. And I was there with them to close their eyes and close their mouths. It hurts, it really does.

And my brother, he stayed here with me, to see him suffer and die, he got so little you could pick him up and put him in the tub. ...And one day I got off from work... but [he] waited until I got home before he died. And to see him in such pain.... He'd try to get up, and he was pulling down curtains. You had to sit with him all night to try to keep him in the bed.

And you think about how people die and suffer, and other people are reaping the benefit from it. They got all their factories and things up yonder and they make their money and go back over on the other side, and they're happy. And we have to suffer and die because of their gain.

I've lost two brothers-in-law, one brother, a niece, and a nephew.... I guess that's why I continue to fight. You feel like, you know it's wrong--it's so wrong for these things to happen. If somebody doesn't speak up, nothing will ever be done--Nothing!

Miss Jean also emphasizes the value of human life:

**Miss Jean:** And then you have government agencies saying that there's nothing wrong. Well, you tell me! How come they're dying? Now, If you're saying there's nothing wrong.... It's some reason! It's some reason! So prove me wrong! Tell me what's wrong with these people! What's causing it? If it's not from the environment.... It's nothing but racism. When all these things are impacting you in a negative way... When people have so little value for human life.... *Black human life is worth something!* And it's worth it to us as a club to continue to struggle against all of the evils....

When you have a total lack of respect for another human being because they're black, then you don't care what you do to them or how it impacts them, because if people had a conscience in the first place these things would never have happened. Love thy neighbor as thyself--that ain't happening. It's all about money. It's all about greed. It's all about disrespect to human life. And no matter how a whole lot of races would like to believe that we're inferior and we're this and we're that, we are God's people and He

loves us, and we are *worth* something!

Describing the 1995 hexane spill from a nearby company that sent thirty people to the hospital, Miss Ann also shed light on the club's valuing of human life within a larger context of structural violence.

**Miss Ann:** They denied it. The state came in and covered it up for them, and nothing was ever done about it. And they denied that it came from their plant, but the plant manager paid all of our hospital bills. I said, "It's amazing that you didn't do it, but [you] will pay for it." [An anonymous caller told hospital staff to treat the victims for hexane exposure, a chemical used locally by a particular company.]

Miss Helen is also concerned about the hexane spill. She is the widow of one of the four people who died within a year and a half of the spill. She became involved in the NFC after NFC helped her community organize to address effects of the spill.

**Miss Helen:** [The company says] it ain't them and there ain't nothing we can do about it.... And plus, the whole year round, that dust and fumes from that [company] come over here. All year round.... Smell like somebody cookin' in a catpen in the afternoon. ...They kept having meetings with them, trying to talk to them and trying to tell them what was going on. They'd listen, but that would be the end of it.... Never did *nothin'*! My old man, he was in that and... he had to start going to the doctor regular after that, and he got where he couldn't breathe at all, and he just, *he died*. (Covering her face with her hands.) ...it just did never get no better after that.... He lived about year, a year and a half after that. He was sick.... Some days, he was real sick... after that.... They just keep on getting bigger and bigger. They're building more over there.

The community found out that the company switched from N-hexane to a different form of hexane with similar levels of toxicity and flammability, but fewer tests have been done on this form of hexane, so its health effects are undocumented and therefore do not have to be reported. The company has also applied for a Title V permit to almost double its current levels of production, bringing its toxic releases to the highest levels currently permitted by law.

Miss Wynona describes how the oppressive conditions of her community affected her as a child. "Even the littlest person" recognizes that something is wrong even at early ages:

**Miss Wynona:** We ought to be able to live in the kind of community that we can be proud of--"this is *my* town"--and when I was growing up

as a child I wasn't proud of my town. I'm getting more encouraged by it, but I wasn't proud of it when I was growing up.

Women of the NFC have long recognized the effects of these conditions on children and have modeled and instilled in the youth of their community the value of human life over personal gain.

**Perseverance and strength to survive profound personal losses.** In spite of these conditions, NFC persists. Strength, courage, perseverance over generations, and personal risk-taking form a cluster of interrelated themes that underlie the ethics of the club. One of the most compelling stories of Newtown regards Miss Janice. As described earlier, two of her three children suffered with lupus and died in their teens, her husband died of lung cancer (after working much of his life at the now closed Leece-Neville company), and she survived a cancerous brain tumor that was removed. These experiences motivated Miss Janice to stand up for her community, challenge injustices she perceives in local government, and tell the truth regardless of whether or not people like it. Miss Janice describes the deaths of her children and how easy it has been for some people to minimize these events.

Miss Janice also emphasizes the importance of “knowing what you know and knowing that you know it,” in the face of minimization and denial regarding the possibility that environmental factors are causing illness and deaths in the community. This denial has surfaced both within the African American community and the European American community and has been difficult. These women are often able to hold a worldview intact despite little validation of their “reality” and blatant neglect of Newtown by the larger community. NFC members are strong in advocating for themselves and their community, a strength necessary for survival. Most have survived profound personal losses, but have chosen to use the pain as energy to create positive change for others.

Perseverance, courage, and persistence are also characteristics of younger women in the club. Miss Tanya grew up in the club as a member of the B-TUFF youth group. A few weeks before her high school graduation, she experienced kidney failure, which later forced her to leave college and return to Newtown, where



she became an NFC member at age 20, and the club's youth director. She received a kidney transplant and her body accepted it for about five years. She is now on dialysis several times a week, and is waiting for a new transplant. She recalls that, while transporting her records between doctors, her parents saw notes stating that she was misdiagnosed and had toxins in her body of unknown origin. Her doctors had never shared this information with her or her family. Her parents, too busy trying to care for her, were unable to follow up on the meaning of these references.

Miss May was a nurse at North Georgia Regional Hospital until she was diagnosed with lupus. Miss Fiona and Miss Miriam both suffered from cancer at relatively early ages. Miss Miriam described how sewage used to run in the streets until the city was finally forced to put in a sewage system. Miss Ann recalls that three different women living near each other on Desota Street had difficulty giving birth; one had three miscarriages; another gave birth to a stillborn child; the other had triplets, each of whom died within a year. These and other experiences have strengthened the resolve of NFC members to make a difference in their own community and educate the Gainesville community.

**Strong faith and vibrant relationships with God.** A constant theme that emerged in the interviews was a strong faith in a living and vital God who is described as comforter, helper, consoler, guide, wise, loving, and ever-present, with mysterious ways that must not be ignored. Miss Tanya stated that others have told her they can see God in her. Miss Sophia describes the importance of the leadership of the Holy Spirit and notes that the club prays together at every meeting. Most are churchgoers; many are also church leaders. Miss Wynona describes how God's leadership and direction is central to the club's leadership:

**Miss Wynona:** The ability to persevere through times of intense struggle, and the very natural way that the members of the club, the leadership of the club, understand and is connected to the presence of the Holy Spirit that leads and guides them.... I think the embodiment of what has happened here is the ability of people, of Miss Ann and Janice, to listen to the Spirit, to listen to what they feel that God is telling them to do, that has sustained all of us, because they don't move without that. They don't even suggest that we do anything, unless they feel that the Spirit is leading them to do that. That has resulted in the success of many journeys, and that when you're connected

to the Spirit in that way, we don't feel like you can ever go wrong.... Beyond that, I think that we have to always stand on our integrity.

Many women talked about the importance of "putting God first" and "doing God's will." Miss Hope emphasized loving others as Jesus loved, which is lived out by helping others and being a neighbor. Most of the women expressed a strong love for God and their churches.

**Nonviolent confrontation, assertiveness, and risk-taking.** Standing up for the community and speaking out is an important NFC value. NFC members are active in preventing violence in their community, including structural violence. The women have acted many times as mediators to prevent violence, as when the school system asked them to help mediate problems when both black and white students became upset by the high school's Redneck Day. Also, during the 1996 Olympics, the community's repeated requests to the city commission to remove racist signs were denied until the NFC persevered. Miss Wynona describes the NFC's significant role in reducing racial and structural violence:

**Miss Wynona:** [The actions of the club and activism have] prevented a lot of violence, although some viewed it--the work of the NFC being engaged in issues of inequality and the perception of unequal justice ...as the NFC agitating, creating problems and upsetting the normal balance. But what in fact was happening was that Newtown, through all the work that it has done, has helped more than any single organization to reduce racial tensions, improve race relations, and nurture community relations for the betterment of this community, so it has been hard, but it has been good--good for all.

**Interviewer:** And it's helped to reduce some of the structural violence that's been coming from the larger community, the white community predominantly, toward this community.

**Miss Wynona:** Right.

Nonviolent approaches to change and confrontation include the club's work with city and county commissions and state legislatures, as well as many agencies like Georgia Environmental Protection Department (EPD), the EPA, Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ASTDR), and others. Miss Sophia stated that the club goes by the rules, even when they know "the rules were made overnight." Miss May notes that the club does not take "no" for an answer, taking

their concerns up the chain of authority until they get an appropriate response. Miss Sophia elaborates on the club's history of nonviolence in the face of significant personal and community risks.

**Miss Sophia:** Fifty years up to the year 2001 is a very long time. ...they had values of believing that things would get better in time... if they stood up for whatever they believed.... When you think of something of value and you want to know what it's worth, it's worth our lives. I'm sure our lives have been on the line sometimes when we went to do something. There's so many things that could go wrong. There are so many fanatics in the world, and a lot of things could have happened to the club members, or anybody involved in the club. In saying that the club of value is the club of our life, of our souls. That's what's valued. That we fight for what we believe in, we fight to the end, but all in peace.... Even when you come to the meeting or you go to a workshop or you are going to town to talk to the commissioners... You got to have courage... and you're going in faith. Courage to me is faith. Something you can't see, but you just know it's going to be all right.

The women's strong bonds translate into the willingness to take significant personal risks for the good of self, family, and community, involving strong stances such as refusing to let a KKK member enter Miss Ann's house during a press conference in the 1990s, and organizing 600 people in 1998 to stand against the KKK in Gainesville's town square.

#### **Keeping abreast of issues and using education to address denial.**

The NFC values education for members and the community. They serve as watchdogs monitoring issues affecting the community, and they constantly expand their knowledge by attending workshops all over the country, where they network with other communities in studying racism, environmental testing, fundraising, grant writing, dioxin, and economic development. This knowledge is shared with the community, and many women note what a difference the workshops have made.

NFC members value the legacy and wisdom of older and deceased members of their community, expressed through preserving the community's archives, which they hope to place in a museum. They have already published The Newtown Story: One Community's Fight Against Environmental Racism, which they have discussed as guest speakers at Emory and Duke Universities.<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>8</sup> Ellen Griffith Spears, The Newtown Story: One Community's Fight for Environmental Justice (Atlanta, Ga.: Center for Democratic Renewal and the Newtown Florist Club, 1998).

**Highly valuing youth and the leadership development of the next generation.** Children and youth are of great importance to the club. During integration, black students could not participate in the white high school's extracurricular activities, so the NFC created a band, chorus, and sports activities. The NFC played a key role in mediating between their children and the school system. Miss Tanya describes her experiences:

**Miss Tanya:** ...they gave us opportunities to do things and get involved. Not involved like just going on trips like Six Flags and places like that but things that we learned something from. ...the NFC taught me a lot about not just environment, but social issues. It was the first time I actually knew anything about politics, as far as the court system, because I knew nothing about who my congressman was and following those issues, and then also how important it was for the Martin Luther King Day celebration. They made it fun, and then with the summer camp, even working with the youth.... Even though I was a counselor or director at the time, it gave me the opportunity to see myself help other youth get involved with it, and ideas that I had that I could use... they gave us that opportunity to... put on plays and all kinds of stuff. The NFC practically has been my life.

Educating the next generation of leaders is a prime priority of the club's work with youth. Miss Ann told the youth that their job is to carry on after she and others are gone. Miss Wynona describes the formative influence of the NFC on her life and character: "When you're around strong women, you get stronger." Many of the women noted the importance of the modeling and mentoring of older women in their lives. Miss Ann notes that Miss April's mentoring and words of encouragement keep her from giving up. Miss April's son, daughter-in-law, and at least two of her grandchildren are all members of the NFC. Her legacy is a source of strength for many. Her daughter-in-law, Miss Dana, describes her influence: "She helped everybody's kids. Everybody would run to Miss April, wanting to know what to do." NFC members continue today in developing close personal relationships with youth, marked by affection, warmth, and humor.

**Nonparochial caring and networking across diverse communities and organizations.** Miss May notes that the club embraces all the diversity of Gainesville. Miss Dana describes how women in the NFC experience themselves as connected with others and concerned across diverse communities. The NFC collaborates with many diverse social justice groups. They organized a southeast

regional Y2K Summit conference for communities experiencing environmental racism to discuss common struggles. They work with diverse neighborhood groups in Gainesville, including European American groups and Latin American communities, whom they taught to negotiate city systems to get a permit for a Peace March in the town square. They also have a history of dramatic interventions, like the "Funeral for Drugs" street parade they created years ago to encourage youth to bury drugs.

In light of these leadership characteristics and the stories of the Newtown Florist Club, embodiment is seen as a communal reality. Knowing is shaped in the embodied experiences of suffering, and the passionate commitments to motherhood that shape their desires for a healthy community to support their children's growth and development. Further aspects of women's embodied knowing will be identified in the following chapters as studies of women's embodied knowing are brought into conversation with the women of the Newtown Florist Club.

## **CHAPTER 2**

### **Embodied Time**

We turn now to the first of three chapters describing themes which are generative for peacemaking, emerging from a synthesis of women scholars' research in women's embodied experiences, psychology, theology, leadership, and religious education. Together, these three chapters form a women's embodied epistemology. "Embodied Time" focuses on characteristics of women's knowing that uniquely shape women's embodied experiences of time.

Women's cycles of desire are part of nature's cycles and create in women a "Cyclical Sense of Time"; they form an ebb and flow of experiences that create heightened experiences of desire, shaping women's use of time; heightened awareness of the worth of human life; heightened awareness of conflict and willingness to address conflict; and heightened awareness of the need to provide for the future of children, families, and healthy communities. Each section begins with insights from the NFC interview study, and proceeds to identify themes from the literature that are generative for leadership and peacemaking. Implications for structural and systemic change are also described.

### **Cyclical Sense of Time**

Women experience time cyclically through embodied experiences such as menstruation, pregnancy, and breastfeeding. These experiences can heighten women's experiences of themselves as a part of nature. Through menstruation in particular, women experience time as cyclical, with constant subtle changes that occur as patterns of characteristic experiences. As a result, change may be seen as constant and normal. Women's embodied cycles revolve around real or potential others as well as around the self; the growth and development of the self and the ability to facilitate the growth of a child are physiologically intertwined. Thus, time is often experienced as relational.

Women's cycles ebb and flow, with natural meditative states that can facilitate the balancing of work and rest. The cyclical balancing of work and rest inherent in

women's cycles conflicts directly with the exploitation of women's labor and community resources that occurs through oppressive national and global economic patterns--patterns which sabotage many women's efforts to create a balanced life. Thus, respect for (all) women's cyclical experiences of time directly challenges oppressive economic patterns.

Women's cycles involve life and death crises affecting the self and others, which can heighten women's awareness of the consequences of their own actions. Women's embodied cycles form a matrix of future generations, connecting them with past and future generations, and reminding them of the needs of children and the healthy communities needed to support them. Thus, women's embodied cycles form a matrix which can influence women's values and leadership. Women's embodied life-death-life cycles are also self-renewing systems which illustrate processes of creative transformation out of seeming chaos. Melissa Raphael images this kind of Divine and feminist sacral creativity as "the cosmogonic womb" through which the Goddess and women transform themselves, or "churn things into existence."<sup>1</sup> Self-renewing systems are necessary for creation of the sustainable abundance and long-term peace that is crucial to planetary transformation and survival. Women's cyclical experiences of time influence psychology and meaning-making in numerous ways, providing insights for women's leadership and societal change.

**Related insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** The women of the Newtown Florist Club are aware of the natural cycles of time, but they are also intensely aware of disrupted cycles and the need for intentional action to renew life.

Disruptions of women's childbearing cycles points to broken cycles in nature. At least three Newtown women living in close proximity have experienced difficulties giving birth to healthy children. One woman had three miscarriages, one had a stillborn child, and one had triplets who did not live to be a year old. The women recognize that the frequency of broken cycles is not natural.

Connecting to nature and its cycles is related to environmental health, which is

---

<sup>1</sup> Raphael, *Thealogy and Embodiment*, 169, 262-97.

crucial to human health. Newtown residents have suffered from lupus, reproductive problems, and other health effects which may be related to toxins in the environment. They have been advised by local experts not to eat food grown in their neighborhood. They have experienced what may be parallel processes between the degradation of their local environment and their health.

Time revolves around self-renewing relationships and community-renewing goals. Relational mutuality between community members and between generations is a self-renewing cycle that sustains social justice work and fosters leadership development of the next generation. Community members are renewed by frequent mutually empathic conversations. Young people are motivated to develop leadership and care about the community because the community cares about them, spends time with them, includes them in social justice action responses, and empowers them to carry on the community's work.

Change is constant, necessary, and an important ingredient of hope. Miss May states that change is a part of life: "Don't believe that everything has to be the same. Things change daily and things change rapidly." She emphasizes the importance of remembering that oppressive circumstances are changed by peoples' actions in solidarity--as essential to maintaining the hope necessary to continue to advocate for new life-giving possibilities in community.

**Women's cyclical lives are a part of nature.** Women's cycles help them to recognize themselves as part of nature. Medical doctor Christine Northrup writes:

Our blood is our connection to the archetypal feminine. The macrocosmic cycles of nature, such as the ebb and flow of the tides and the changes of the seasons, are reflected on a smaller scale in the menstrual cycle of the individual female body.<sup>2</sup>

Human beings learned to measure time as women marked the days of their menstrual cycles.<sup>3</sup> Lunar rhythms can affect women emotionally, spiritually, and

---

<sup>2</sup> Christiane Northrup, Women's Bodies, Women's Wisdom (New York: Bantam Books, 1990), 97.

<sup>3</sup> Marija Gimbutas, The Language of the Goddess (New York: Harper and Row Publishers, 1989).



physiologically through related electromagnetic changes in the earth's atmosphere.<sup>4</sup>

Shuttle and Redgrove note: "it would be surprising if we did not pick up from our body some conscious trace of these events, if we elect to tune into them"; they conclude that the "womb and its nervous system" is the receiver of "much influential information on... many unexplored wavebands."<sup>5</sup> Menstrual synchronization among women who live in proximity, or who are emotionally close, is common.

**Women's embodied time is cyclical.** Beginning in childhood, women's experiences of cyclical time are relatively constant for about forty years from the onset of menstruation to menopause.<sup>6</sup> Northrup quotes Farida Shaw's description of menopause:

Like an electrical charge, menstruation and the ebb and flow of energy is an "alternating current." During menopause, the flow of energy becomes intensified and steady, like a "direct current."<sup>7</sup>

Northrup observes that she, like many women, thinks in a multimodal spiral pattern using both hemispheres of her brain and the intelligence of her body at the same time.<sup>8</sup> Theologian Melissa Raphael observes that spiral thinking is central to spiritual feminist conceptual understandings.<sup>9</sup>

Maria Harris describes teaching as a dance where each step flows out of the one preceding it, moving from contemplation to engagement, formgiving, emergence, release, and back to contemplation.<sup>10</sup> She describes this dance as a "learning circle."<sup>11</sup> She also describes five powers that are claimed in teaching in such cycles: the power to receive, rebel, resist, re-form, and love. She describes

---

<sup>4</sup> Shuttle and Redgrove, 154-55.

<sup>5</sup> Ibid.

<sup>6</sup> Paula Weideger, Menstruation and Menopause: The Physiology and Psychology, the Myth and the Reality (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1975).

<sup>7</sup> This quote is attributed to Farida Shaw, according to Tamara Slayton, Reclaiming the Menstrual Matrix: Evolving Feminine Wisdom--A Workbook (Petaluma, Calif.: Menstrual H Foundation, 1990), 39; quoted in Northrup, 430.

<sup>8</sup> Northrup, 32.

<sup>9</sup> Raphael, Theology and Embodiment, 148, calls herself a "theologian" spelled with an "a" to emphasize her feminist approach to theology.

<sup>10</sup> Harris, Teaching and Religious Imagination, 25.

<sup>11</sup> Ibid., 43.

the religious educator's process of transforming the educational environment by recreating the cycle, beginning with silence (and listening,) political awareness, (and analysis,) mourning, (and letting go,) bonding, (and re-forming,) birth, (and celebration,) and then returning to silence.<sup>12</sup> This latter cycle draws on birth imagery. Similarly, Mary Elizabeth Moore notes that "learning is a rhythmic process of discovery" in praxis knowing:

Reflection is grounded in particular observations, taking off from one set of observations and landing back in the land of renewed observations. And the reflection is both imaginative and rational.<sup>13</sup>

This rhythmic process of learning informs an organic worldview and the educational practices of teaching from the heart, writes Moore.

**Women's cycles and women's time are made up of continuous, constant changes.** Menstruation and ovulation involve intricate, comprehensive changes that occur constantly over roughly twenty-nine day cycles. Shuttle and Redgrove emphasize how menstrual changes involve the whole physical being, describing it as "a feedback mechanism of exquisite sensitivity which links the body's roots to the mind."<sup>14</sup> Weideger, Northrup, Shuttle and Redgrove provide detailed descriptions of these comprehensive changes.<sup>15</sup>

Openness to change is a characteristic of maternal thinking, according to Ruddick.<sup>16</sup> Women founders of community gathering places for social change, (public homeplaces) were described as "unusually open-minded" by researchers Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock. These women regularly reexamined old habits and assumptions, adopted new strategies and challenges, questioned, reevaluated, and considered issues from different vantage points.<sup>17</sup>

The focus on change is characteristic of women's feminist and liberation theologies, arising from the need for significant, even radical, social and economic

---

<sup>12</sup> Ibid., 89.

<sup>13</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 212.

<sup>14</sup> Shuttle and Redgrove, 27.

<sup>15</sup> Weideger 24-35; Shuttle and Redgrove, 25-26; Northrup, 98-103.

<sup>16</sup> Ruddick, 89-93.

<sup>17</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 155-61.

changes. Ada Isasi-Diaz describes practices of economic domination as a source of oppression of Latin American people which threatens their survival and calls for its transformation.<sup>18</sup> Emilie M. Townes describes the problem of toxic dumping in African and Latin American communities and calls for an end to this form of “contemporary lynching.”<sup>19</sup> This focus on change is also characteristic of women scholars in ethnic and women’s studies, such as Patricia Hill Collins, who notes that institutional transformation is a primary goal of African American women in their approaches to work. Often they are willing to put their own jobs in jeopardy.<sup>20</sup>

Similarly, women’s religious education theories usually emphasize holistic change, facilitated by teachers who nurture the growth of students. Mary Elizabeth Moore describes an organic worldview as the context of religious education in which knowledge is energy that is always moving.<sup>21</sup> No answers can be held onto forever; thus, reality is filled with expectations and new discoveries.

**Time is experienced as a cyclical ebb and flow of subtly shifting characteristic experiences.** Menstruation is often a time of physical strength, spiritual awareness, ESP, self-expression and creativity, reflection, self-nurture, self-empathy, pleasure and aggressive desire in sexual expression, physical pain and discomfort, emotional anxiety, tension, and irritability.<sup>22</sup> Ovulation is often a time of receptive sexual desire, outward focus on the needs of others, other-focused empathy, and an initiation of the creative projects germinated during menstruation.<sup>23</sup>

---

Ann Ulanov writes that women should not “squander” menstrual time on

<sup>18</sup> Ada Maria Isasi-Diaz, *En la Lucha, In the Struggle: A Hispanic Women’s Liberation Theology* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993), 18.

<sup>19</sup> Emily M. Townes, *In a Blaze of Glory: Womanist Spirituality as Social Witness* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1995), 47-60.

<sup>20</sup> Collins, 159, 154-58.

<sup>21</sup> Moore, *Teaching from the Heart*, 209-10.

<sup>22</sup> Northrup, 102, citing Therese Benedek and Boris Rubenstein, “Correlations Between Ovarian Activity and Psychodynamic Processes: The Ovulatory Phase,” *Psychosomatic Medicine* 1, no. 2 (1939): 245-70; Ulanov, 175-77, 182-92; Raphael, *Theology and Embodiment*, 193-203; Northrup, 98; Kendrick, 44-45, 53-63; Susan Perz, personal experience; Shuttle and Redgrove, 55-58, 73-84, 91-100; Weideger, 44-58, 167-69, 187-90; and Dena Taylor, *Red Flower* (Freedom, Calif.: Crossing Press, 1988), 24-28, 42-53, 55-71.

<sup>23</sup> Northrup, 98 and 102, citing Benedek and Rubenstein; Weideger 121-25.

busyness, focusing instead on what is happening to the body and mind, which will increase self-confidence. She writes, "Because this sense of herself is rooted in psychosomatic reality, it does not lead to inflation or a drive for power but to stabilization, and a real sense of her own strength." She notes that "a woman often feels an ingathering of her energy and feelings to a deeper center below the threshold of consciousness." Ulanov states that a woman's estrangement from her own centeredness can increase pain and irritability, but centering can reveal new insights, relationships, and creative possibilities.<sup>24</sup>

The ebb and flow of women's cycles of desire is described by Kendrick, who writes, "We live in concert with a rhythm that is internally, not externally, imposed; one that teaches us to trust a process that gently 'lives' us, divine life ebbing and flowing through the female life cycle."<sup>25</sup> Shuttle and Redgrove note that the cycle is as unique to each woman as a fingerprint.<sup>26</sup> In adjusting to embodied cycles, a woman experiences time relationally through an interdependent relationship with her body.

Chinese American public school teacher Opal notes that these rhythms affect teaching. Teachers need to be flexible, adapting to the natural spiraling ebb and flow of change, balancing self and environment, and balancing teaching styles with the learning styles of children. She compares school to an orchestration, and teaching to music that has rhythm, reflection, flow, discipline, and the freedom to be creative.<sup>27</sup>

**Women's embodied cycles revolve around their relationships with real or potential others.** Embodied time is physiologically relational, revolving around the creation of a potential or real child, regardless of whether a woman is or is not consciously focused on a real or potential child, though for many women, this focus is intentional. Decision-making and change thus occur within the context of real

---

<sup>24</sup> Ulanov, 176.

<sup>25</sup> Kendrick, 222-23.

<sup>26</sup> Shuttle and Redgrove, 27.

<sup>27</sup> Maenette K. P. Ah Nee-Benham and Joanne E. Cooper, Let My Spirit Soar!: Narratives of Diverse Women in School Leadership (Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Corwin Press, 1998), 105-06.

or imagined relationships and have relational consequences. This may help explain women's tendency to conceive of themselves as what Noddings calls "ones-caring" rather than as persons performing social or employment roles and may also contribute to the development of empathy in women.<sup>28</sup> Collins notes that African American women frequently put their jobs in jeopardy in the creation of institutional transformation for the sake of empowering the African American community.<sup>29</sup> Regan and Brooks noted that the school principals they studied understood themselves as persons serving their students and teachers, rather than as persons fulfilling a job role.<sup>30</sup>

The development of girls generally includes a growing physical and psychological capacity to nurture the life of another human being in the body; thus, the development of the self includes a growing awareness of ways in which self-development and the growth of real and potential others are entwined. After menarche, many experiences of the self occur in relationship to a potential child--wanted or not. These experiences may be a factor in women's awareness of social contexts and their tendency to utilize situational ethics in moral decision making.<sup>31</sup>

**Women's pattern of time includes natural meditative states, and an inherent balancing of work and rest.** Northrup describes the importance of the menstrual cycle in helping women have balanced rest, work, activity, and reflection in their lives.<sup>32</sup> Such inclinations toward balance conflict with western industrial society's expectations of constantly escalating achievement, rigidly structured time, and

---

<sup>28</sup> Nel Noddings, Caring: A Feminine Approach to Ethics and Moral Education (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984), 182.

<sup>29</sup> Collins, 159, 154-58.

<sup>30</sup> Regan and Brooks, 40.

<sup>31</sup> Carol Gilligan, In a Different Voice (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982), 38, 24-63.

<sup>32</sup> Northrup, 98, 100.

exploitation of labor.<sup>33</sup>

Scholars describe how women's cycles of menstruation, pregnancy, and breastfeeding bring them into direct and repeated conflicts with U.S. culture's linear concept of time, the rigid structuring of industrial schedules, and the profit- rather than child-centered values of our nation. Emily Martin suggests that many PMS cases are actually caused by the industrial system--in fact, she understands PMS to be a societally caused disease reflective of modern culture, pathologized as an emotional disorder, and subjected to a variety of cures.<sup>34</sup> Reeves notes that Western society leaves no room for the healing wisdom, reflection, and introversion of menstruation either physiologically or psychologically.<sup>35</sup> Women in Kendrick's theological reflection group described "feeling little permission to take time from normal activity when besieged by cramps or the related discomfort of menstruation."<sup>36</sup>

Myra Leifer describes pregnancy as another time of intense inward reflection and meditation by women as they prepare for profound psychological, physiological, and life changes.<sup>37</sup> Kendrick's group describes breastfeeding as a meditative time of deep spiritual connectedness.<sup>38</sup> Ann Ulanov describes these times as kairos experiences of time: "For the feminine style of consciousness, time is qualitative rather than quantitative."<sup>39</sup>

Leifer's research indicates that postpartum depression lasts close to seven

---

<sup>33</sup> Kendrick, 75, 47, 92, citing Margaret Meade, Male and Female: A Study of the Sexes in a Changing World (New York: Dell Publishing, 1949), 188; Janet Kahn and Susan Bailey, Shaping a Better World: A Teaching Guide on Global Issues/Gender Issues (Wellesley, Mass.: Center for Research on Women, 2000), 48, 53-61; Saskia Sassen, Globalization and Its Discontents: Essays on the New Mobility of People and Money (New York: New Press, 1998), 41-49.

<sup>34</sup> Emily Martin, "Premenstrual Syndrome: Discipline, Work, and Anger in Late Industrial Societies," in Blood Magic: The Anthropology of Menstruation eds. Thomas Buckley and Alma Gottlieb (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), 161.

<sup>35</sup> Reeves, 29.

<sup>36</sup> Kendrick, 43.

<sup>37</sup> Myra Leifer, Psychological Effects of Motherhood: A Study of First Pregnancy (New York: Praeger Publishers, 1980), 42.

<sup>38</sup> Kendrick, 192.

<sup>39</sup> Ulanov, 175.

months and may be partly due to inadequate support.<sup>40</sup> Despite the important emotional, developmental, and physiological benefits of breastfeeding for babies, many mothers lack the emotional, financial, and practical help they need to breastfeed for one year.<sup>41</sup> The toll on young mothers created by the fragmentation of extended families is often high, particularly when fathers are expected to return to work within a week of childbirth, leaving many young mothers virtually alone with newborns and young children. In Germany, the government subsidizes Mother's Centers, where mothers come together to help each other care for children, perform household tasks, and receive social services; in the U.S., Mother's Centers receive no such support.<sup>42</sup>

Bonnie Miller-McLemore, Leslie Kendrick, and Christine Northrup each mention how western culture's linear time mitigates against the natural work-rest balancing inherent in women's cycles.<sup>43</sup> Workers in the U.S. work more hours than in any other industrialized nation.<sup>44</sup> These conflicts are intensified by sexism, classism, and racism. The toll on African American women's health and personal development as they take on extra responsibilities to preserve families and communities, has been noted by womanist theologian Townes and can be seen in epidemiological research revealing shortened lifespans.<sup>45</sup> Maintenance activities in U.S. culture are most often performed by persons at the bottom of the role-differentiation pyramid as described by Regan and Brooks.

Below the fault line lies a whole different world, inhabited primarily by women, people of color, and low-status white males. Its organization is horizontal and

---

<sup>40</sup> Leifer, 40.

<sup>41</sup> International Conference on Human Lactation (1977), Breastfeeding and Food Policy in a Hungry World ed. Dana Raphael (New York: Academic Press, 1979), 26-30; Kendrick, 127; Ina May Gaskin, Babies, Breastfeeding, and Bonding (South Hadley, Mass.: Bergin and Garvey Publishers, 1987), 160, 278.

<sup>42</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 195.

<sup>43</sup> Bonnie J. Miller-McLemore, Also a Mother: Work and Family as a Theological Dilemma (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1994), 56-58; Kendrick, 54, 159-60, 189; Northrup, 103.

<sup>44</sup> Families and Work Institute, "American Workers," (brief commercial), Smart Medicine, TNT, February 2002.

<sup>45</sup> Emily M. Townes, "And All the Colored Folks is Cursed," Martin Luther King, Jr. Lecture, Claremont School of Theology, Claremont, Calif., Feb. 1996.

collaborative; it is cyclical and repetitive. Most of daily life takes place here: ...changing diapers, planting the fields, and teaching.<sup>46</sup>

Women's unpaid family labor needs to be considered here; if added to national accounting systems, it would account for twenty-five to thirty percent of global output."<sup>47</sup>

Interlocking local and global economic patterns help explain obstacles to a balance of work and rest. Saskia Sassen documents the unprecedented growth of the informal sector workforce in which workers lack benefits and often work multiple jobs.<sup>48</sup> Barbara Ehrenreich documents the difficulty in earning a livable income on minimum wage.<sup>49</sup> Workaholicism creates exhaustion and hurriedness, preventing adequate self-care and time for children, making it harder for people to be empathic towards self and others, including their children. Children, as a result, often act out in schools or join gangs for companionship.

Women's difficulty in achieving a healthy balance between work and rest is further illustrated by the fact that globally, women make up about seventy percent of the poor.<sup>50</sup> This situation is elaborated by United Nations Development Fund for Women, (UNIFEM) facts from 1991 :

- \* The number of women living in rural poverty increased 50% since 1975.
- \* Women in Asia and Africa work 13 hours per week more than men and are mostly underpaid.
- \* Women earn 30 to 40 percent less than men for equal work.

---

<sup>46</sup> Regan and Brooks, 14, citing Peggy McIntosh, Interactive Phases of a Curriculum Revision: A Feminist Perspective Working paper, no. 124 (Wellesley, Mass.: Center for Research on Women, 1983).

<sup>47</sup> United Nations Development Fund for Women, UNIFEM Annual Report (flyer), 1991.

<sup>48</sup> Sassen, 46-49, 86-90.

<sup>49</sup> Barbara Ehrenreich, Nickel and Dimed: On (Not) Getting by in America (New York: Metropolitan Books, 2001), 1-3, 218-19, citing the following newspaper articles: "Study: More Go Hungry Since Welfare Reform," Boston Herald, 21 January 2000; "Charity Can't Feed All While Welfare Reforms Implemented," Houston Chronicle, 10 January 2000; "Hunger Grows as Food Banks Try to Keep Pace," Atlanta Journal and Constitution, 26 November 1999; "Hunger Problems Said to Be Getting Worse," Milwaukee Journal Sentinel, 15 December 1999; and "Rise in Homeless Families Strains San Diego Aid," Los Angeles Times, 24 January 2000.

<sup>50</sup> Look at the World Through Women's Eyes, NGO Forum on Women, Huairou, China, August 30-September 8, 1995, prod. Karen Hessel, 22 min., National Council of Churches on behalf of the U.S. Ecumenical Women's Network: Beijing and Beyond, 1996, videocassette.



\* Economic and social gaps are widening between women and men.<sup>51</sup>

"According to the United Nations Report on the Status of Women, women do two-thirds of the world's work for one-tenth of the world's wages, yet they own less than one one-hundredth of the world's property," writes Northrup.<sup>52</sup>

U.S. groups like the National Congress of Neighborhood Women in the Northern hemisphere and Third World women's groups at the 1995 World Summit on Social Development in Copenhagen, Denmark, described common patterns of social disintegration, poverty, and employment. They observe that women finally became important to development planners in the 1980s when experts recognized that women's labor could be harnessed for "national development goals" by meeting women's basic needs for education, training, access to credit, public services, health care and other services, while reinforcing women's traditional roles. They conclude:

The efficiency approach assumes that women will add responsibilities to their already overburdened schedules by shifting time, work, and energy as needed by their households and communities. Women are seen as instruments and resources to be exploited, not independent persons with dreams, agendas, talents, and human rights.<sup>53</sup>

Women in the North note that "the jobs that are available mostly do not pay a family wage or a living wage and that many of our neighbors live hand to mouth, unable to save, unable to create any assets toward some kind of economic security."<sup>54</sup>

Women's groups from the North and from Third World countries saw their

<sup>51</sup> United Nations Development Fund for Women, UNIFEM Annual Report (flyer), 1991.

<sup>52</sup> Northrup, 5; Riane Eisler, Sacred Pleasure: Sex, Myth, and the Politics of the Body--New Paths to Power and Love (San Francisco: HarperCollins Publishers, 1996), 339, citing The State of the World's Women 1985 (New York: United Nations, 1985). See also Nuket Kardam, "Women and Development," Women, Gender, and World Politics: Perspectives, Policies, and Prospects, eds. Peter R. Beckman and Francine D'Amico (Westport, Conn.: Bergin and Garvey, 1994), 149; Helen I. Safa, The Myth of the Male Breadwinner: Women and Industrialization in the Caribbean (Boulder: Westview Press, 1995).

<sup>53</sup> Maria Riley, World Policy Institute, "Development at the Crossroads: Women in the Center," Resource Center Bulletin, no. 41 (Albuquerque: Alternative Women In Development, [Alt-WID] and Interhemispheric Resource Center), August 1995, 9, 12, citing Caroline Moser, Gender Planning and Development: Theory, Practice and Training (London: Routledge, 1993, 69).

<sup>54</sup> Riley, 9, 12, citing Moser.

community disintegration as coming from the market-driven model of global development which supports undemocratic globalization benefitting the G-7 countries, (the United States, Canada, France, Germany, Italy, Japan, and the United Kingdom,) which “are home to almost all of the world’s major transnational corporations and commercial banks,” and “hold controlling interests in international financial institutions, including the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund, (IMF), and the regional development banks.<sup>55</sup> They also describe “the unsustainable pattern of consumption and production, particularly in industrialized countries,” as a source of deterioration of the global environment, “of grave concern, aggravating poverty and imbalances...”<sup>56</sup> “More than one billion people in the world live in abject poverty, most of whom go hungry every day,” they add.<sup>57</sup> The declining social structure means that many people have little or no access to “income, resources, education, health care, or nutrition,” and a majority of these persons are women.<sup>58</sup>

National resources are diverted by an elite few, who benefit from unprecedented corporate “superprofits;” military expenditures worldwide that primarily benefit industry; worldwide structural adjustment policies; corporate sweatshops located in Third World countries; environmental deregulation; corporate subsidies and tax cuts; and what salary expert Graef Crystal terms “obscene”

---

<sup>55</sup> Ibid., 5, 10.

<sup>56</sup> Ibid., 2.

<sup>57</sup> Ibid.

<sup>58</sup> Ibid.

compensation packages for many U.S. CEOs.<sup>59</sup> Riley observes, "As the wealth of the world increases, so does the number of people in poverty--especially women, children, the elderly, the disabled, and the unemployed."<sup>60</sup> She concludes, "Development, as it has operated for the past fifty years, is a failure, and billions of people are in crisis."<sup>61</sup> The dominance of free market forces has greatly enhanced the power and profits of national and international elites, creditor nations, and international financial institutions, at the expense of poor communities and nations, she writes.<sup>62</sup>

Riley further notes that "women carry a disproportionate share of the problems of coping with poverty, social disintegration, unemployment, environmental degradation and the effects of war," and "women carry the greatest burden of the failure of development," a fact noted during the last decade by "the U.N. and its agencies, nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), development experts, technocrats, the World Bank, and the regional development banks."<sup>63</sup> Despite a plethora of U.N. conferences during this time, however, "none of them has analyzed the systemic nature of the problem," and none of their Programs for Action

---

<sup>59</sup> Sassen, 13-14, 46-47, 88; Jeanne Vickers, Women and War (Atlantic Highlands, N. J.: Zed Books, 1993), 38-49; Riley, 10, citing Rosi Braidotti, Ewi Charkiewicz, Sabine Hausler, and Saskia Wieringa, Women, the Environment and Sustainable Development: Towards a Theoretical Synthesis (London: Zed Books, 1994), 91. Tony Clarke, with the International Forum on Globalization, Dismantling Corporate Rule: Towards a New Form of Politics in an Age of Globalization, draft San Francisco, Calif. (International Forum on Globalization, 1995), 7-11; Kahn and Bailey, 53-90; Deborah Zubow and Elizabeth Nesbitt, "Who Gets Welfare?" (Philadelphia: Women's International League for Peace and Freedom [WILPF] and National Welfare Rights Union [NWRU], 1995, poster series; John Manual Andriote, "The Crystal Ball," Working Woman, February 1998, 32, citing Crystal's newsletter, The Crystal Report. Andriote summarizes Crystal's research which reveals that in 1996, seventeen CEOs in the one thousand large and medium-sized U.S. companies he studied, earned annual salary and stock options that totaled more than \$20 million per year; another sixty received more than \$10 million. He adds that U.S. CEOs earn as much as 200 times the salaries their average workers, (compared with Japan where CEOs earn between 16 and 25 times as much as workers,) and three times the salaries of CEOs in the United Kingdom.

<sup>60</sup> Riley, 2.

<sup>61</sup> *Ibid.*, 2-3.

<sup>62</sup> *Ibid.*, 4.

<sup>63</sup> *Ibid.*, 2, citing Declaration and Program of Action of the World Summit for Social Development (New York: United Nations, 1995), Paragraph 16.

challenge “the reigning development model and economic rationale that drive the global economy,” she writes, which “judges a nation’s development by its level of production and consumption of goods and services,” using the gross national product (GNP) as a primary indicator, while ignoring the contrasting effects of certain goods and services such as food, medicine, and military expenditures on quality of life.<sup>64</sup> The GNP ignores patterns of over- and under-consumption by rich and poor nations as well as social and environmental costs, she adds.<sup>65</sup> “Women researchers and policy advocates are developing global analyses that demonstrate that poverty, environmental degradation, violence, and social disintegration are problems in all countries of the world and have their roots in the market-driven model of global development,” she concludes.<sup>66</sup>

Former president Jimmy Carter notes that, “It is surprising to most Americans that people in other nations often define human rights almost exclusively as those that sustain life--the right to adequate food, medical care, a home, education, and a job,” while the U.S. understands human rights in terms of freedom of expression, voting, worship, travel, assembly, and other freedoms.<sup>67</sup> He recalls arguments with leaders of Communist countries in which he accused them of jailing people without trials, censorship, etc., only to be confronted in return regarding homelessness, unemployment, second-class citizen treatment of minorities, and high costs of medical care in the U.S.<sup>68</sup>

The ability to provide for such basic needs through nonexploitive, adequate employment with reasonable benefits thus emerges as essential for most women in achieving a healthy balance between work and rest. The first step in achieving this goal is the ability to recognize the global patterns which are obstacles to such

---

<sup>64</sup> Ibid., 7.

<sup>65</sup> Ibid., citing James Hug, S. J., “Discussion Paper in Response to the Draft Declaration and the Draft Programme of Action for the U.N. World Summit for Social Development” (Washington, D.C.: Center of Concern, 1994), 3.

<sup>66</sup> Ibid., 10.

<sup>67</sup> Jimmy Carter, Talking Peace: A Vision for the Next Generation (New York: Dutton Children’s Books, 1993), 100.

<sup>68</sup> Ibid.

opportunities. Women's desires for a cyclical balance of work and rest, and a safe place to raise children must be understood within a demythologized global context and the particular ways in which it oppresses and exploits women, families, and communities.

**The exploitation of women's labor and local community resources emerges in national and global patterns which sabotage many women's efforts to balance work and rest.** Women's ability to achieve a natural balance between work and rest is often sabotaged by policies and institutions operating at the global level often behind closed doors--which makes them more difficult to recognize, name, and correct. When women's labor is exploited and families and community resources are hijacked by the policies of global institutions and redirected to fit the "super-profit"-making agendas of global transnational corporations, women often feel forced to add to their existing burdens in order to compensate for the loss of family and community resources, increasing environmental devastation, and resulting threats to family and community survival.<sup>69</sup> Often so-called "development" processes and policies don't create development for local communities, but rather, super-profits for large corporations.<sup>70</sup>

The global women's movement's agenda focuses on two directions: organizing for effective local, national, and global action; and "challenging the current development process by defining alternatives," notes Riley.<sup>71</sup> Women's critiques of reigning "development" models and practices have demythologized many of these patterns of exploitation, while highlighting how these practices affect women.<sup>72</sup> Such analyses and action at national and global levels highlight patterns in which women's labor and the resources of families and communities are exploited by

---

<sup>69</sup> Riley, 9.

<sup>70</sup> Vandana Shiva, Stolen Harvest: The Hijacking of the Global Food Supply (Cambridge, Mass.: South End Press, 2000), 117.

<sup>71</sup> Ibid., 10.

<sup>72</sup> Sassen; Kahn and Bailey, 53-90; Linda Basch, Nina Glick Schiller, and Cristina Szanton Blanc, Nations Unbound: Transnational Projects, Postcolonial Predicaments, and Deterritorialized Nation-States (Amsterdam, Netherlands: Gordon and Breach Publishers, 1994); Riley.

transnational corporations and the global institutions that have been supporting them, (such as the World Trade Organization, the World Bank, and the Intermonetary Fund).

These patterns include: (1) "the steel ceiling," which often occurs when rural community development efforts lack the access to capital and the power to influence broader policies needed for their expansion, (2) corporate scandals and illegal investment practices, which threaten the investments and jobs of U.S. workers, (3) structural adjustment policies of the World Bank and the Intermonetary Fund, which force countries to shift their resources away from the needs of healthy families, communities, and environments to serve the "super-profit"-making agendas of corporations; (these policies are required of countries in order for them to be issued loans to pay the interest on their foreign "development" debt), (4) the increasing use of sweatshops in industrialized nations including the U.S., as well as the Third World, (5) historically unprecedented corporate greed, which has led to a variety of strategies to dramatically increase profits, such as privatization, temporary, part-time, and contract labor, as well as unprecedented CEO salaries, and (6) location of corporate sweatshops in countries with oppressive military governments as well as U.S. support of corrupt governments or revolutionary groups in the service of corporate interests. Structural adjustment, the use of sweatshops, and the use of low-wage, temporary labor are patterns which particularly affect women.

Because women are often among the poorest paid and most vulnerable workers, women are often most severely affected by these policies.<sup>73</sup> Many are forced to work even harder for even less money or to insure the family and community survival. Women's analyses clarify ways in which women's lives and labor are exploited, families and communities are threatened, and women's well-deserved rest within a balanced life is stolen.

Helen Lewis describes "the steel ceiling," as limiting the continued growth of many grassroots rural efforts. Describing the situation of families in the rural U.S. and the world, she writes, "While grassroots community groups have succeeded in

---

<sup>73</sup> Look at the World Through Women's Eyes.

developing many creative, innovative programs... At some point, the communities encounter the steel ceiling which limits how far they can develop.”<sup>74</sup> The height of the ceiling is dependent on a community’s resources, ability to manipulate the larger system; rural communities lack access to the capital and other resources needed to do substantial economic development, she writes.<sup>75</sup> “They are still... outside the mainstream economy and unable to influence their policies,” she adds.<sup>76</sup> She gives as an example the efforts of Ivanhoe, Virginia community members to create and recruit profitable industry after their local mines and factories were closed down by their parent companies because they did not make *enough* profit.<sup>77</sup>

Changes in development policies, and distribution of development money and resources are needed to help rural communities develop economic security and substantially improve their income and economic well-being. “Coalitions must be formed and enough power developed to change the conventional development model,” whose agenda “does not include preserving or reviving small rural communities,” she writes. “Until the needs and agendas of these communities are included in the national and international development plans, community efforts will be stalled, short circuited and ignored.” She concludes, “Rural communities will continue to be disposable and the creativity and participation which these grassroots movements encourage and develop will be shunted aside.”<sup>78</sup> Such patterns place women and families in a perpetual pattern of economic struggle that undermines women’s attempts to create a balanced life of reasonable work and rest.

Clarke and the International Forum on Globalization (IFG), further illuminate

---

<sup>74</sup> Helen Lewis, Rebuilding Communities: A 12 Step Recovery Program, essay draft, 1997, 29, based on “Community Development as Ministry,” Dotson Nelson Lecture on Religion and Life, Samford University, Birmingham, Ala., 10 Oct. 1995.

<sup>75</sup> Ibid., 29-30.

<sup>76</sup> Ibid., 30.

<sup>77</sup> Mary Ann Hinsdale, Helen M. Lewis, and Maxine S. Waller, It Comes from the People: Community Development and Local Theology (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1995), 18-27, 74-76; James M. Childs, Jr., Greed: Economics and Ethics in Conflict (Minnesota: Fortress Press, 1989), 34. Childs writes, “In many cases, the decision to cut [labor] is simply the path of least resistance or a way to increase profits in an already profitable operation,” 34.

<sup>78</sup> Lewis, Rebuilding Communities, 30.

ways in which the steel ceiling functions. They point out that the “world’s leading business and governmental elites have been gathering on a regular basis over the past three decades or more--through forums” such as the Bilderberg, the Council on Foreign Relations, and the Trilateral Commission to develop strategies for corporate globalization, as well as through business councils that exist in most industrialized countries which meet to develop consensus on policies which benefit the agendas of the principal transnational corporations, (such as NAFTA and GATT,) and then to develop “massive lobbying and advertising campaigns” which are promoted by networks of trade associations. Through policy research institutes and public relations firms; facts, policy positions, expert analysis, opinion polls, and citizen front groups for their campaigns are mobilized to “change national governments and their policies,” note Clarke and the IFG. “By campaigning for debt elimination, privatization, and deregulation, business coalitions have effectively dismantled many of the powers and tools of national governments,” they add.<sup>79</sup>

Corporate accounting scandals and questionable investment practices threaten the livelihoods and investments of many American workers. Not only did Enron cheat its workers out of their investments while executives sold off stock before it lost its value, but such practices can leave corporations vulnerable to bankruptcy and their employees jobless.

In 1822 this would not have been possible because U.S. state laws governing the actions of corporations held corporate investors and officials liable for their proportion of the corporation’s debts. “Government spending during the Civil War brought these corporations fantastic wealth,” note Richard Grossman and Frank Adams, along with considerable power.<sup>80</sup> Corporations bribed elected and appointed officials; as a result corporations were able to obtain land, minerals, timber, and water, and were gradually given limited liability for their actions. Corporations rewrote the laws governing their existence, note Grossman and

---

<sup>79</sup> Clarke and the IFG, 7-8.

<sup>80</sup> Richard L. Grossman and Frank T. Adams, “Taking Care of Business: Citizenship and the Charter of Incorporation,” pamphlet, Cambridge, Mass.: Charter, Ink, 1993, 9, 16.



Adams.<sup>81</sup> In 1886, the Supreme Court declared corporations legally persons (with more protection under the 14th Amendment and the Bill of Rights than most women and former slaves.)<sup>82</sup> As a result, hundreds of local, state, and federal laws were struck down, and legislatures no longer had the power to govern the actions of corporations or dismantle them if there were too many corporate abuses, note Grossman and Adams.<sup>83</sup> Corporations were originally chartered for 20-50 years by state legislatures and then disbanded in order to protect the public interest. Their purpose had to be tied directly to the public good; no corporate charters were to be granted for if the “object is merely private or selfish according to the Supreme Court of Virginia in 1809.<sup>84</sup>

The Enron scandal is instructive of the lack of boundaries separating corporations and government. Thomas Frank notes that Enron bankrolled pundits, endowed university chairs in economics in political science, pushed deregulation in the fields in which it operated, gave campaign contributions to nearly half of Congress and was so influential that “journalists now speak of Enron as the main force behind the movement for electricity deregulation” in the late 1990s.<sup>85</sup> He further notes that national politicians received appointments to their board, but he adds that “this is the way markets work.”<sup>86</sup> “Regulatory oversight is systematically, shut down, bought off and defunded;” business journalism and investment banking become salesmanship; political power can be bought; and “industry lobbyists routinely craft the legislation that is supposed to regulate their industries,” he adds.

A federal law prohibiting corporate donations would prevent corporations from unduly influencing public policy, notes Jane Anne Morris, who stresses that the fear of losing corporate donations often stifles public debate and much needed

---

<sup>81</sup> Ibid., 16.

<sup>82</sup> Ibid., 20.

<sup>83</sup> Ibid., 20, 10-15.

<sup>84</sup> Ibid., 6-9.

<sup>85</sup> Thomas Frank, “Shocked, Shocked! Enronian Myths Exposed,” The Nation, 8 April 2002, 17.

<sup>86</sup> Ibid., 20.

criticism of corporate practices such as toxic dumping.

Read any management textbook and you will see how it coaches would-be corporate officers to shamelessly court community support and pre-empt citizen criticism.<sup>87</sup>

She recommends reading Toxic Sludge Is Good For You! by John Stauber and Sheldon Rampton "for a detailed analysis of how corporate PR [public relations] specialists manipulate their public personas."<sup>88</sup> Corporate donations were originally made illegal by the U.S. Founding Fathers because they did not want corporations to have undue influence in public policy; they had already experienced such abuses from British corporations. Laws restricting corporate influence were repealed as corporations gained more power over time.<sup>89</sup>

The history of Enron's involvement in politics helps illustrate ways in which democracy is threatened by inappropriate corporate influences, so that it becomes difficult for local communities and their development initiatives to have appropriate power in the larger system, which Lewis describes as an aspect of the steel ceiling.<sup>90</sup> The stress of unemployment also mitigates against any balancing of work and rest.

Practices of currency trading, as well as financial bubbles created through speculative investment practices that falsely inflate the marketplace and are often followed by a market crash, (for instance the 1994 Mexican pesos crisis), are described by David Korten and Bernard Lietaer.<sup>91</sup> Such crashes have the potential to damage the life savings investments of average working people not involved in market speculation.

---

<sup>87</sup> Jane Anne Morris, "America Needs a Law Prohibiting All Corporate Donations," Rachel's Environment and Health Weekly, 11 July 1996, (flyer), available from P.O. Box 5036, Annapolis, Maryland 21403-7036.

<sup>88</sup> Ibid., available from Common Courage Press, (800) 497-3207, 1995.

<sup>89</sup> Grossman and Adams, 4, 6-8.

<sup>90</sup> Lewis, 29-30. For a more detailed discussion of these processes, see Clarke and the IFG; Sassen; and The Nation (articles on-line) available from: <http://www.thenation.com>.

<sup>91</sup> David C. Korten, "That ABCs of Finance Capitalism," IFG News, San Francisco, International Forum on Globalization, (IFG), summer 1997, 5; Bernard Lietaer, "From the Real Economy to the Speculative," IFG News, San Francisco, International Forum on Globalization, (IFG), summer 1997, 7-9.

The devastating effects of structural adjustment can be seen in the example of Sri Lanka, whose small and home-based industries, such as handless, run mostly by women, immediately collapsed and were replaced by export industries dependent on low-age female labor "to keep production costs low"--after two major structural adjustment policies were implemented in 1977: economic liberalization requiring lowered tariffs and the removal of barriers to foreign investment, and the promotion of export-oriented industrialization, writes Riley.<sup>92</sup>

Many Third World countries are forced to agree to such "structural adjustment" agreements in order to refinance their loans through the World Bank and the Intermonetary Fund. These loans, originally made in order to further Third World development, are now so large that many Third World countries cannot even pay the interest on the debt. Many social justice organizations have advocated that the debts be canceled, as the promised development was unsuccessful and largely benefitted corporations, and the debts have grown disproportionately large. Rep. Barbara Lee introduced a bill in Congress to cancel the debt in 2001; the bill was referred to the Subcommittee on International Monetary Policy and Trade.<sup>93</sup>

When structural adjustment diverts a country's funds for education and other social structure funding to the agendas of corporations (such as building airports, highways, dams, or other projects which may shut down local businesses), it is typically girls whose education is cut short to stay home and help their mothers cope with increased burdens in the home, for instance, in Ethiopia, Mauritius, Paa New Guinea, and Sri Lanka.<sup>94</sup> Since the education of women has emerged as a chief

---

<sup>92</sup> Riley, 8, citing Swarna Jayaweerna, "Structural Adjustment Policies, Industrial Development and Women in Sri Lanka," Mortgaging Women's Lives, ed. Pamela Sparr (London: Zed Books, 1991), 36.

<sup>93</sup> Barbara Lee, H.R.1567 "To encourage the provision of multilateral debt cancellation for countries eligible to be considered for assistance under the Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC) Initiative or heavily affected by HIV/AIDS, and for other purposes," 4 April 2001. (legislation on-line), available from: <http://thomas.loc.gov>.

<sup>94</sup> Christine Fox, "Girls and Women in Education and Training in Papua New Guinea," 39-42; Pauline Rose and Mercy Tembon, "Girls and Schooling in Ethiopia," 85-100; Sheila Bunwaree, "Gender Inequality: The Mauritian Experience," 137-43, Swarna Jayaweerna, "Gender, Education, Development: Sri Lanka," 174-78, 180-86; all in Gender, Education, and Development: Beyond Access to Empowerment, eds. Heward, Christine, and Sheila Bunwaree (New York: Zed Books, 1999).

factor in limiting population growth, the lack of education for girls not only increases their work hours in the home as children, but also increases the likelihood that they will be younger mothers parenting a greater number of children under increasingly difficult conditions.<sup>95</sup>

Structural adjustment in Guatemala during the 1980s resulted in "increased unemployment and underemployment, lower wages (real wages fell 73.7 percent from 1985-1992), less access to health and education, and an alarming growth of hunger and malnutrition, note Michelle Tooley and Rick Axtell, and women were disproportionately affected since over half of the labor force is female.<sup>96</sup> "Women carry a disproportionate share of the problems of coping with poverty, social disintegration, unemployment, environmental degradation and the effects of war," notes Riley. Most of these conditions are fairly typical results of structural adjustment policies.<sup>97</sup> Here again, a balance of work and rest is subverted in the daily struggle for survival.

A synthesis of women's analyses illustrate the scope and degree of social structure devastation created by structural adjustment policies. In past decades, structural adjustment policies of the World Bank and Intermonetary Fund, Third World nations have required Third World nations to cut government spending on social services, privatize, grow cash crops instead of food, sell off environmental resources cheaply, and open their borders to exploitative foreign investment, in order to be issued loans to help pay off their foreign debt.<sup>98</sup> Structural adjustment policies in Africa shifted many nations away from growing food crops in 1970 to cash crops for

---

<sup>95</sup> Shona Wynd, "Education, Schooling and Fertility in Niger," 110-16; Jayaweera, 180; Mo Sibbons, "From WID to GAD: Experiences of Education in Nepal," 194; Christine Heward, "Closing the Gender Gap? The Informal Sector in Pakistan," 215; all in Gender, Education, and Development.

<sup>96</sup> Michelle Tooley and Rick Axtell, "Guatemala and the Slaughter of the Innocents," Seeds Magazine, December 1995, 12.

<sup>97</sup> Riley, 2.

<sup>98</sup> Suet-ling Pong, "Gender Inequality in Educational Attainment in Peninsular Malaysia," in Heward and Bunwaree, 155, citing E. M. King and A. Hill, eds. Women's Education in Developing Countries: Barriers, Benefits, and Policies (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press/World Bank, 1993); Clarke and the IFG, 10.

export, even as imported food prices rose. This was “a primary reason for Africa’s food crisis,” writes Vandana Shiva.<sup>99</sup>

Before 1900, Haiti “produced few cash crops beyond coffee,” and peasants sold small amounts of subsistence crops such as cassava, corn, and rice, write Linda Basch, Nina Glick Schiller, and Cristina Szanton Blanc.<sup>100</sup> Many of these small farmers are women, notes Shiva.<sup>101</sup> Today, as a result of structural adjustment and U.S. agribusiness penetration, which was supported by the 1915 U.S. military invasion, cash crops like sugar and coffee are Haiti’s primary crops grown by migrant workers on U.S. agribusiness plantations. Haiti now imports seventy percent of its food and many mothers are forced to feed their children coffee and sugar water made from gleanings from the fields.<sup>102</sup> These patterns have caused widespread immigration to the U.S. in which immigrants financially support families in their home countries who once survived by subsistence farming.<sup>103</sup> “In the two regions with the most structural adjustment experience, per capita income has stagnated (Latin America) or plummeted (Africa)” and deepened poverty around the world,” writes socially responsible investment expert Amy Domini.<sup>104</sup> Structural adjustment was a significant factor in the worldwide depression of the 1980s, according to Peggy Antrobus.<sup>105</sup> For many people, time revolves around survival.

Transnational corporations (TNCs) pressure the U.S. government to adopt similar policies and priorities that divert national resources from social structure funding

---

<sup>99</sup> Vandana Shiva, The Violence of the Green Revolution: Third World Agriculture, Ecology, and Politics (Atlantic Highlands, N.J.: Zed Books, 1991), 221.

<sup>100</sup> Basch, Schiller, and Blanc, 152.

<sup>101</sup> Shiva, Stolen Harvest, 7.

<sup>102</sup> Ibid.; Mickey Mouse goes to Haiti: Walt Disney and the Science of Exploitation prod. Rudi Stern, about 20 min., Crowing Rooster Arts, 1996, videocassette.

<sup>103</sup> Basch, Schiller, and Blanc, 168, 155-66, 171.

<sup>104</sup> Amy Domini, Socially Responsible Investing: Making a Difference and Making Money (Chicago: Dearborn Trade, 2001), 23.

<sup>105</sup> Peggy Antrobus, in conversation with Charlotte Bunch and Marianne DeKoven, “Peggy Antrobus,” ed. Mary S. Hartman Talking Leadership: Conversations with Powerful Women (New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1999), 38-39.

and environmental protection to support their interests.<sup>106</sup>

Sweatshop manufacturing plants are increasingly being utilized in industrialized nations, (including the U.S.), as well as in the Third World.<sup>107</sup>

Sweatshops are increasingly being utilized in the U.S.: the garment sweatshops in New York, and the high-tech production plants in Los Angeles and surrounding areas.<sup>108</sup> Most of these low-wage sweatshop jobs employ women, particularly immigrant women, notes Sassen.<sup>109</sup> U.S. TNCs have relocated most factories in the toy, textile, and garment industries to Third World countries where they often utilize sweatshops in what Sassen calls a historically unprecedented quest for “superprofits.”<sup>110</sup> This exodus to the Third World has increased unemployment in the U.S. and diminished the power of labor unions. As U.S. plants are closed and relocated in Third World countries, they typically have no labor unions, and few, if any, environmental regulations. In fact, when Third World workers attempt the unionize, their plants are often quickly closed and relocated to other Third World countries.<sup>111</sup> The combination of structural adjustment policies, rural steel ceilings, corrupt governments, and military regimes in many Third World countries, has left many women and children, especially girls, little option but to work in sweatshops who recruit them because of the dexterity of their small hands, their perceived obedience, their willingness to submit to difficult work conditions, and the perception that they are more docile than men.<sup>112</sup>

---

<sup>106</sup> Clarke and IFG, 8, 7-11; Vickers, 13-15, 46-49, 68-73; WILPF and NWRU, Zubow and Nesbitt poster series.

<sup>107</sup> Sassen, 115.

<sup>108</sup> Ibid., 115, 128-29.

<sup>109</sup> Ibid., 128-29, citing Torres R. Solorzano, “Female Mexican Immigrants in San Diego County,” Center for U.S.-Mexican Studies, University of California, San Diego, research in progress, 1983; Kahn and Bailey, 53-90.

<sup>110</sup> Synthesis of Kahn and Bailey, 53-90; Sassen, 88, 115, 121, 128-29, 156; Jeffrey Gettleman, “It’s Like Getting Fleeced: Cotton Mill Workers at a Martinsville, Va., Firm Will Soon Be Joining the Thousands of U.S. Textile Workers Left Behind in a Landscape of Plants Closed by Globalization,” Los Angeles Times, 20 February 2002, part A, 1.

<sup>111</sup> Kahn and Bailey, 53-90.

<sup>112</sup> Sassen, 42, 151, 121, 128-9, 156, 161, 165; Kahn and Bailey, 53-90; Tooley and Axtell, 12.

Further complicating this picture is the new dominance of global institutions such as the World Trade Organization, which has the power to overturn national laws and make “illegal” the labeling of “nonsweatshop” garments, genetically engineered foods, and other products.<sup>113</sup> It can constrain government policies that protect food safety and require inspections. It has the power to allow companies to inspect their own beef inside and outside the U.S., and to overturn hard-won citizen-backed laws like the law restricting tuna fishing that protects dolphins.<sup>114</sup> These policies complicate and can add stress to the jobs of homemakers wishing to provide healthy food for their families.

Historically unprecedented corporate greed has led to the use of strategies such as privatization and part-time, temporary workers, which create underemployment, unemployment, and a new phenomenon: the working homeless.<sup>115</sup> Strategies can include privatization (in which pay is shifted from service providers to CEOs), deregulation of laws governing the actions of corporations, shutting down plants and laying off workers because they don’t make *enough* profit, and increased use of part-time, contract, and temporary workers (mostly women, especially immigrants,) who have no eligibility for benefits.<sup>116</sup> Sassen cites 1992 U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, which predicted “a massive growth of low-wage service jobs, including service jobs catering to firms,” from 1992 to 2005, (including “retail sales workers, registered nurses, cashiers, truck drivers, waiters and waitresses, nursing aides, janitors, food preparation workers, and systems analysts,”) while jobs requiring a college degree were predicted to rise by only from twenty-three to twenty-four percent.<sup>117</sup> Further, she notes, the B.L.S. did

---

<sup>113</sup> University of Southern California Corporate Teach-In Conference on Global Economics for College Students and Faculty, Berkeley, Oct. 1996; The Working Group on the WTO/MAI, A Citizens’ Guide to the World Trade Organization: Everything You Need to Know to Fight for Fair Trade, (pamphlet on-line) posted July 1999, available from <http://www.tradewatch.org>, 1-16; Sassen, 5, 25-26, 81-83, 86, 92-100; Clarke and IFG, 7-8.

<sup>114</sup> Ibid.

<sup>115</sup> Sassen, 137-48, 115, 121-31, 86-92; Ralph Nader, “Ralph Nader Speaks,” speech at Glenn Memorial Auditorium, Emory University, Atlanta, 31 Oct. 2001.

<sup>116</sup> Sassen, 137-48, 199; M. H., quoted in Hinsdale, Lewis, and Waller, 21-23; Riley, 4-5.

<sup>117</sup> Sassen, 143.

not predict an increase in workers' median weekly wage. As a result, many adults work 2-3 jobs in order to make ends meet, so that a balance of work and rest is a rare respite rather than the norm for many women.<sup>118</sup>

In response, movements in various states have emerged to pass (or expand the scope of existing) living wage laws. These movements arise out of the same source as the campus-based antisweatshop movement, writes Bobbi Murray in The Nation. She notes that these movements rely on the moral imperative that, "People who work full-time should not be forced to survive at or below the poverty line."<sup>119</sup> She notes that one man, who planned quit his third job after the living wage law was passed, is not atypical.<sup>120</sup> In 1999, Rep. Barbara Lee introduced a bill in Congress to establish a living wage and to facilitate "conversion of military programs to civilian activities;" the bill was referred to the Subcommittee on Early Childhood, Youth and Families.<sup>121</sup>

At the same time, CEOs earned 419 times as much as the average line worker in 1999, notes James Childs. During the 1980s, "manufacturing workers' wages remained flat" while CEO salaries "increased threefold," he adds. He cites Crystal's 1991 study which showed that the average salaries of CEOs from two hundred of the top major companies, were \$1.4 million per year in base salary and bonus, and \$2.8 million per year with stock options and other long-term incentives.<sup>122</sup> He cites Crystal's chapter, "High Pay, Low Performance," which documents numerous examples of executives who failed "reasonable tests of CEO performance," while earning "huge pay packages."<sup>123</sup> Such exploitive salaries divert

---

<sup>118</sup> Bobbi Murray, "Living Wage Comes of Age: An Increasingly Sophisticated Movement Has Put Opponents on the Defensive," The Nation, 23 July 2001, 24-28; Barbara Ehrenreich, 197-99.

<sup>119</sup> Murray, 24-28.

<sup>120</sup> Ibid.

<sup>121</sup> Barbara Lee, H.R.1050 "To establish a living wage...", 3 March 1999, (legislation online), available from <http://www.thomas.loc.gov>.

<sup>122</sup> James Childs, 37, 36-38, citing Graef S. Crystal, In Search of Excess: The Overcompensation of American Executives (New York: Norton, 1991), 27-28.

<sup>123</sup> James Childs, 37, citing Crystal, 99-109.



corporate resources to an elite few--away from the reasonable support of families and by extension healthy communities. As a result, many workers must work unreasonable hours in multiple jobs just to survive, while an elite few enjoy obscene salaries and benefits despite substandard job performance.

The exploitation and oppression of local families and communities has been further deepened by corporate and U.S. government practices that involve working within or supporting repressive governments. Some corporations intentionally contract with sweatshops in countries with repressive governments, note Kahn and Bailey. They cite as one example, Nike's sweatshops in Indonesia, where the corrupt dictatorship outlawed labor unions and set minimum wage at a bare minimum. "Nike suppliers in Indonesia rely on 'management by terror,'" they note, citing Jeff Ballinger who worked in Indonesia for five years with workers.<sup>124</sup> The U.S. also has a history of supporting corrupt governments and revolutionary groups wishing to overthrow democracies--when it benefits the interests of U.S. corporations.<sup>125</sup>

The current global governance structure threatens the national sovereignty and democracy of the U.S. and countries around the world, the safety of the global food supply and the global financial structure which is becoming increasingly unwieldy due to the enormity of its transactions as well as illegal accounting and investment practices.<sup>126</sup> "Food democracy is an imperative in this age of food dictatorship, in which a handful of global corporations control the global food supply and are reshaping it to maximize their profits and their power," writes Shiva.<sup>127</sup> These conditions also threaten the survival of people and local environments worldwide. For instance, when only five strains of corn are produced by corporations, (instead of the vast biodiversity produced by small farmers,) one

---

<sup>124</sup> Kahn and Bailey, 74-75.

<sup>125</sup> Tooley and Axtell, 10-15; Sider, 155-58.

<sup>126</sup> Clarke and the IFG, 12-26; David C. Korten, "That ABCs of Finance Capitalism," 4-7; Bernard Lietaer, "From the Real Economy to the Speculative," 7-10; both in IFG News, San Francisco, International Forum on Globalization (IFG), summer 1997.

<sup>127</sup> Shiva, Stolen Harvest, 117.

disease could wipe out most of the world's supply of corn--or when genetically engineered foods blow into organic and conventional fields and corrupt the crops.<sup>128</sup> Knowledge of these and other global conditions, their enormity, and the seriousness of their consequences, can cast a shadow over the rest and recreation that women and families are able to enjoy.

Salih Booker and William Minter have described a global system of "minority rule whose attributes include: differential access to basic human rights, wealth and power structured by race and place; structural racism, embedded in global economic processes, political institutions and cultural assumptions; and the international practice of double standards that assume inferior rights to be appropriate for certain 'others,' defined by location, origin, race or gender."<sup>129</sup> They have called this system "global apartheid," a term which they believe captures fundamental characteristics of "the current world order" missed by other labels, such as "corporate globalization."<sup>130</sup> Since 1980, "capital has flowed as never before out of the countries of the 'developing' South [Third World] into the 'developed' North," notes Riley, thus the huge income gap between "developed" and Third World nations.<sup>131</sup>

A similarly enormous income gap exists within the U.S. which has the greatest income gap between rich and poor of any industrialized nation and surprisingly high poverty rates.<sup>132</sup> In 1998, the middle fifth of U.S. households

---

<sup>128</sup> Tony Clarke and the IFG, 12-15; Sassen, 201-02; Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO), no. 4 "How Secure is Our Food? Food Security and Agriculture Under the New GATT and World Trade Organization (WTO)," Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) Primer: Understanding the Impact of the Global Economy on Women and the Environment (New York: WEDO, 1995); Shiva, The Violence of the Green Revolution, 171-94; Shiva, Stolen Harvest, 5-56, 95-114; Vandana Shiva, Monocultures of the Mind: Perspectives on Biodiversity and Biotechnology (New York: Zed Books, 1993), 52-53.

<sup>129</sup> Salih Booker and William Minter, "Global Apartheid," The Nation, 9 July 2001, 11. They cite, for example, a lawsuit by four international pharmaceutical corporations against the South African government to protect their enormous profits against a 1997 South African law designed to make it easier for the four million South Africans living with AIDS or HIV to get lifesaving medicines. Worldwide protests forced the companies to drop the lawsuit.

<sup>130</sup> Ibid.

<sup>131</sup> Riley, 3.

<sup>132</sup> Children's Defense Fund, State of America's Children Yearbook 1996 (Washington, D.C.: Children's Defense Fund, 1996), xx.

earned 15% of total U.S. incomes, the bottom fifth earned only 3.6%, and the next-to-bottom fifth earned 9%, while the top fifth earned 49.2%, and the second-to-top fifth earned 23.2%. U.S. worker layoffs have increased at the same time that corporate profits and CEO salaries have risen.<sup>133</sup> The U.S. ranked number one among industrialized nations in the number of billionaires it has, and their assets totaled \$1.2 trillion in 2000; at least two percent of those listed in the 2000 Forbes annual billionaires list also owned, held stock, or were CEOs of corporations that utilize sweatshops.<sup>134</sup> Decreasing social structure funding and degraded environments have turned many U.S. inner cities into war zones that severely challenge women trying to raise healthy children.

Women researchers and advocates describe a wide range of socially just interventions. In response to such U.S. and worldwide conditions, the 1999 Seattle protests against the World Trade Organization (WTO), and the Washington, D.C. 2000 protests against the WTO and the World Bank reflect “a broad-based coalition of students, environmentalists, unions, farmers, scientists and other concerned citizens...” from all over the world, writes Tim Robbins in The Nation.<sup>135</sup> Nongovernmental organizations are often instrumental in organizing and participating such protests.

Another form of socially just intervention is the practice of investing only in corporations whose actions are more socially just, a practice which is described in detail by Ami Domini.<sup>136</sup> Socially just investment funds screen corporations using many criteria, including production of weapons, alcohol, cigarettes or other products; environmental and human rights violations, discrimination, and other practices; use of sweatshops; etc., notes Domini. Some older and more established socially just

---

<sup>133</sup> James Lardner, “The Rich Get Richer: What Happens to American Society When the Gap in Wealth and Income Grows Larger?” U.S. News and World Report, 21 February 2000, 43.

<sup>134</sup> Children’s Defense Fund, xx; see also a comparison of Peter Newcomb and Peter Kafka, The 400 Richest People in America: Forbes, 2000 Annual Edition, 117-377, with Kahn and Bailey, 53-90.

<sup>135</sup> Tim Robbins, “What I Voted For: Nader’s Campaign Made a Lot of People Angry, But His Cause is Worth the Fight,” The Nation, 6-13 August 2001, 24-26.

<sup>136</sup> Domini.

investments average higher rates of return than standard “blue-chip” funds.<sup>137</sup>

Corporate self-monitoring through Codes of Conduct and church monitoring of corporate activities have produced limited and often temporary results; once focus shifts away from problematic practices, they are too often resumed.<sup>138</sup> Riley suggests that the structure of corporations is flawed because its production costs do not include the effect of corporate actions on communities and the environment. Such costs are also not included in calculations of a nation’s Gross National Product (GNP), she notes.<sup>139</sup>

Other potential opportunities for socially just transformation through regulation of such global systems are described by Saskia Sassen, who notes that global finance and information centers are located in particular global cities such as New York, London, Sydney, Toronto, and Paris, where such centers rely on concentrations of capital, fiber optic cable to office buildings, specialized workforces, (such as accounting, public relations, printing, economic consulting, and other industries,) and low-wage labor servicing high-priced novelty shops for the rich. She notes that “many of the resources necessary for global economic activities are not hypermobile [they rely on specific places and locations] and could, in principle be brought under effective regulation.”<sup>140</sup> She further notes that global cities operate as a transnational global network and “relate to each other in distinct systemic ways. For example, the interaction among New York, London, and Tokyo, particularly in terms of finance and investment, consists partly of a series of processes that can be thought of as the chain of production in finance,” she adds.<sup>141</sup> Because there is such a “range of activities and organizational arrangements necessary for the

---

<sup>137</sup> Ibid., 37, 19-27, 49-106.

<sup>138</sup> Women’s Environment and Development Organization (WEDO), no. 1 “Codes of Conduct for Transnational Corporations: Strategies Toward Democratic Global Governance,” Women’s Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) Primer: Understanding the Impact of the Global Economy on Women and the Environment (New York: WEDO, 1995), 5.

<sup>139</sup> Riley, 7, citing James Hug, SJ “Discussion Paper in Response to the Draft Declaration and the Draft Programme of Action for the United Nations World Summit for Social Development” (Washington, D.C.: Center of Concern, 1994), 3.

<sup>140</sup> Sassen, 202.

<sup>141</sup> Ibid., 212.

implementation and maintenance of a global network of factories, service operations, and markets,” an understanding of this dependence and place-locatedness “displaces the focus from the power of large corporations over governments and economies,” (and its monolithic, ambiguous, and out-of-reach character,) and suggests concrete opportunities for regulation and intervention.<sup>142</sup>

Lewis advocates educational goals that stress what she calls “economic literacy,” that increases the knowledge of local people and their understanding of the economy in a way that enhances “effective citizen participation and strategy-development.”<sup>143</sup> “Economic literacy enables and empowers local citizens to analyze their economic problems and resources, to develop solutions themselves to joblessness and poverty, and to gain the tangible skills they need to make rural community-based development happen,” she writes.<sup>144</sup> Such education helps citizens recognize global sources of local conditions and identify policy initiatives and actions that address root causes.

Demythologizing the effectiveness of such social-economic systems is crucial to achieving religious education goals. Harris’s theory of religious education calls for rest and play, which is not only healthy, but also a source of insight and learning.<sup>145</sup> This balance between work and rest is likely to be difficult to achieve without changes in U.S. and global governance. Shrinking leisure and volunteer time affect religious education, religious communities, and nonprofit organizations, decreasing character-formation opportunities and intensifying the importance of nurturing citizenship through vocation. Decreasing incomes also shrink church budgets, affecting ministers of education and youth.<sup>146</sup>

---

<sup>142</sup> Ibid., 213, 195-214.

<sup>143</sup> Lewis, 9.

<sup>144</sup> Ibid.

<sup>145</sup> Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 145; see also 26, 38-40, 57, 115-16, 136-41, 144-57.

<sup>146</sup> Church Women United financial consultant Ann Kohler told the 2000 leadership assembly that financial giving will begin declining over the next generation, affecting churches and nonprofits. Ann Kohler, financial report to Church Women United 2000 Leadership Conference, Hoboken, N. J., summer 2000; see also <http://www.churchwomen.org>.

Women's critiques of current economic policies and development theories demythologize them, revealing their devastating effects on women, families, communities, and the environment, and pointing out the small global elite who actually benefit from them. Women's economic critiques reveal root sources of women's exploitation and oppression so that women may more effectively address them in their struggles for survival and their efforts to create more balanced lives, while supporting the thriving of healthy families and communities.

**Women's cycles involve life and death crises affecting the self and others.** The potential for pregnancy carries the possibility of new life for a child and the possibility of death for the mother and/or the baby. Childbirth is an intense bonding experience with a child, and the life-and-death implications may serve to heighten a mother's devotion to the child's survival. It can also contribute to a tendency to think concretely about others, while conceptualizing the self as "one-caring," because of the recognition that one's actions can directly or indirectly affect others.<sup>147</sup> Women's life and death cycles also highlight the tenuous relationship between chaos and creativity in nature's cycles and the importance of considering the consequences of actions.

**Women's embodied cycles form the matrix of future generations.** Dena Taylor quotes The Women's Encyclopedia of Myths and Secrets: "As any flower mysteriously contained its future fruit, so uterine blood was the moon-flower supposed to contain the soul of future generations."<sup>148</sup> Menstrual blood is a reminder of the possibility of children and their needs--not only personally--but communally--for clean air, a sustainable peaceful environment, love and care, and cultures that support their intrinsic worth, growth, and development. Ada Maria Isasi-Diaz's definition of the term "mujerista" combines an embodied understanding of women as a matrix of future generations, with a nonparochial understanding of women's leadership. She writes that "A mujerista is a Hispanic Woman who struggles to liberate herself not as an individual but as a member of a Hispanic

---

<sup>147</sup> Noddings, 182.

<sup>148</sup> Taylor, 2.

community.” This involves gathering “the hopes and expectations of the people about justice and peace.”<sup>149</sup> Mujeristas work for liberation rather than equality within oppressive structures. This involves gestating people willing to work for the common good:

A mujerista is called to gestate new women and new men--Hispanics who are willing to work for the common good, knowing that such work requires us to denounce all destructive sense of self-abnegation.<sup>150</sup>

Women’s embodied cycles connect them with past and future generations, reminding them of the needs of future generations and the kinds of communities that will support them.

Through mothering and activism, women’s leadership is also a matrix out of which healthier communities are born and sustained. In the Navajo Changing Woman menarche ritual, a woman’s role is explicitly connected to the health and abundance of the earth as well as the nation. In this Navajo menarche initiation, a young girl becomes Changing Woman on whose shoulders the fate of the whole nation resides.<sup>151</sup>

**The life-death-life cycle is a self-renewing system.** Love is a self-renewing system, creating intimacy, mutuality, and new life in numerous forms. Public school teacher Opal helps her students connect to the cycles of life through understanding endings and beginnings occurring in nature.<sup>152</sup> Riane Eisler describes the central theme of life in Goddess worship as the cyclic unity of birth, sex, death, and regeneration.<sup>153</sup> The importance of the cycle of life has far-reaching implications, including a worldview that supports recycling, regenerative sustainable ecological systems, and preventative international diplomacy. In her work with indigenous farmers in India, Vandana Shiva describes how indigenous women farmers work in harmony with nature, noting that women’s self-renewing partnerships are being

---

<sup>149</sup> Ada Maria Isasi-Diaz, 4.

<sup>150</sup> Ibid., 4.

<sup>151</sup> Taylor, 12, 15, citing Bruce Lincoln, *Emerging from the Chrysalis* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982), 19-33, 107.

<sup>152</sup> Ah Nee-Benham and Cooper, 99-101.

<sup>153</sup> Eisler, 62-70.

destroyed by agribusinesses, many of which are now using nonrenewing terminator seeds, (they die rather than generate more seeds.)<sup>154</sup>

Self-renewing systems of various kinds are central to nature, human health, and the creation of sustainable abundance including the human body's energy system, human emotions that heal and renew, mutual sharing in relationships that provide energy for collaboration and leadership, reproduction, and human sexual eros which spills over nonsexually into love for children and healthy communities.<sup>155</sup> The self-renewing system of human reproduction is being threatened by the pervasiveness of dioxins in many different foods and in air and other pollution as reflected in a fifty percent decrease in men's sperm counts compared with the previous generation. Dioxin has also been detected in human breastmilk.<sup>156</sup> Dioxin is a highly toxic family of chemicals that disrupt human neurological systems resulting in birth defects and diseases; and it was one of the main causes of death at Love Canal.<sup>157</sup>

Divine Love is the abundant self-renewing energy of the world, regenerating that which has been damaged or destroyed, bringing new life out of death. Chaos theory describes ways in which the ebb and flow of creation and destruction in the life and death cycle can work positively as a self-renewing system of nature as things spontaneously disorganize and reorganize at a higher level of functioning, writes Melissa Raphael. Citing the work of J. Gleick, she notes, "Turbulence is introduced into a given system when dissonant rhythms or frequencies mount up to the point at which a given system becomes stormy, 'cacophonous', incomprehensible and finally

---

<sup>154</sup> Martha L. Crouch, "How the Terminator Terminates: An Explanation for the Non-scientist of a Remarkable Patent for Killing Second Generation Seeds of Crop Plants," (Edmonds, Washington: Edmonds Institute, 1998), reprinted in Kahn and Bailey, 233, citing Ho, Mae-Wan, Harmut Meyer, and Joe Cummins, "The Biotechnology Bubble," The Economist 28 (1998): 146-153; Shiva, Stolen Harvest, 3, 7, 17, 24-27, 48-49, 82-84; Shiva, The Violence of the Green Revolution, 235-51.

<sup>155</sup> Raphael, Theology and Embodiment, 117.

<sup>156</sup> Lois Marie Gibbs and the Citizens Clearinghouse for Hazardous Waste, Dying from Dioxin: A Citizen's Guide to Reclaiming Our Health and Rebuilding Democracy (Boston: South End Press, 1995), 118, 113-15.

<sup>157</sup> *Ibid.*, 112; Temma Kaplan, Crazy for Democracy: Women in Grassroots Movements (New York: Routledge, 1997), 18, 25.



enters a state of collapse.”<sup>158</sup> Although industrial capitalism has not reached the point of turbulence, she observes that “its logistical complexity and social discord seem to be pushing it towards that state.” She notes that “feminist activism or turbulence... attempts to break up the ordered but unjust patterns of the patriarchal system, ‘freeing up’ consciousness and space for new biophilic patterns of social organizations to form.”<sup>159</sup>

Noting that once the turbulence point is reached, change occurs catastrophically; she likens this process to the grain of sand that causes an avalanche when added to a sand-pile that has reached capacity, irreversibly changing the shape of the sand pile. Similarly, “a butterfly flapping its wings on one side of the world may affect the weather on the other side,” she writes.<sup>160</sup> “The complexity of the capitalist economic system and the ecological system it depends on are perceived by many commentators (not just spiritual feminists) to be poised by their very nature on the edge of collapse,” adds Melissa Raphael.<sup>161</sup> In this context, the self-renewing work of the many scattered peace, justice, environmental, people’s rights, social services, and other worldwide movements can spontaneously come together as a seemingly chaotic, nonviolent force that disorganizes the death-dealing effects of patriarchal structures, creating space for social and economic reorganization at more functional and healthy levels for the common good. She writes:

Spiritual feminist chaos, however, belongs to the natural generative rhythms of the universe... Sacral turbulence such as that of radical ecofeminist activism attempts to stir or disorganize patriarchal order into a chaotic state of change. Chaos theory reminds us of the mysterious ability of systems to degenerate and then, out of chaos, to self-organize into new patterns of order and complexity. ...it defuses the coercive force which holds nature and society in the artificial grip of uniformity and conformity. It refuses the monocultural standardization that stunts healthy human and natural biodiversity.<sup>162</sup>

Cyclical disorganization and reorganization, or destruction and renewal, are innate in a

---

<sup>158</sup> Raphael, Theology and Embodiment, 248, citing J. Gleick, Chaos: Making a New Science (London: Sphere, 1990), 122.

<sup>159</sup> Raphael, Theology and Embodiment, 248.

<sup>160</sup> Ibid.

<sup>161</sup> Ibid.

<sup>162</sup> Ibid., 255.

theological cosmology. Change is as constant, normal, and unpredictable as the weather, and involves creative transformations out of chaos.<sup>163</sup> Cultural transformation theory builds on chaos theory and posits that social transformation toward partnership models of social organization, away from dominating models, can occur in similar ways, notes Eisler.<sup>164</sup> Through such processes, "pleasure--not in the sense of a short-term escape or distraction, but in the sense of healthy, long-term fulfillment--can instead be institutionalized, and even sacralized," she adds, for instance, meaningful, fulfilling work and relationships.<sup>165</sup> Melissa Raphael observes that the natural tendency of chaos to spontaneously reorganize reflects the actions of the Holy, and states, "The Goddess is the principle of anti-chaos who brings in a new order from the edge of the old."<sup>166</sup> She also images Divine and feminist sacral creativity as "the cosmogonic womb" through which the Goddess and women transform themselves, or "churn things into existence."<sup>167</sup>

### **The Erotic Creates and Shapes Time**

Because, my child, my dear and only One love sustains the spirit and the spirit sustains life. It is sweet to be loved but to be able to love is to possess the life force. I love you. Therefore I am strong. Whatever my age, I am sustained by my own power to love.

Pearl S. Buck, The Goddess Abides

The focus of this section is upon the power of the erotic and its relationship to time, as a natural outgrowth of the focus on cycles. The erotic, sourced in the Divine, refers to the loving energy that fuels all relationships, encompassing both eros and agape. It points us to our deepest needs and desires and energizes self and world transformation. Brock cites Haunani-Kay Trask, who calls it "the unique human energy

---

<sup>163</sup> Ibid., 256-61.

<sup>164</sup> Eisler, 11.

<sup>165</sup> Ibid.

<sup>166</sup> Ibid., 255-56.

<sup>167</sup> Raphael, Theology and Embodiment, 169, 262-97.

that springs from the desire for existence with meaning..."<sup>168</sup> The erotic, as the pleasure of loving is embodied in women's relationships with others, and creates and shapes time by influencing human health and motivation.

Brock elaborates, "Trask sees the feminist articulation of Eros as moving well beyond the identification of passion and love with genital sexuality to a sense of the body and a power that cherishes life in its multiplicities of feelings and forms."<sup>169</sup> This pleasure of loving and cherishing of life is the energy that fuels the life force and is the central organizing concept of the erotic, which has the potential to shape ways in which women understand and use time. The erotic is uniquely embodied in women; the pleasure of loving, as well as creativity and birth are central metaphors. Relationships give meaning to time, and life priorities are structured accordingly.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** Particularly because of the deaths and illnesses in their community, NFC women have long been concerned with the cherishing and nurturing of life. The power of the erotic fuels social justice. Women in the NFC were inspired by their passion for the health and safety of their families to work for social justice.

Concern for children and families spirals outward into the larger community and world in ever-expanding circles of loving to create societal and institutional change. The Newtown women's expansive movement from close personal relationships to mothering the whole community, other organizations, and caring about Gainesville as a whole, illustrates how women's concern for their children naturally expands into larger and larger spheres of concern. Their work with the local school system and city government reflects these desires and concerns.

The pleasure of loving in human relationships is one primary sustaining force for women's continued leadership and social action in difficult circumstances. Women in the club joke and tease with each other, have affectionate nicknames, laugh at themselves, find ways to make learning fun for youth, and truly enjoy life. The club

---

<sup>168</sup> Brock, 25, citing Haunani-Kay Trask, Eros and Power: The Promise of Feminist Theory (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1986.)

<sup>169</sup> Brock, 40, citing Trask.

regularly plans community social events, many of which combine fun, leadership recognition, fundraising, and celebration of community. Loving and mentoring human relationships are emotionally pleasurable and rewarding in and of themselves. Miss Lisa stated that her extensive work with the youth was done behind the scenes. Her reward comes when they come back to her and remember, and in her pleasure at seeing them fulfill their dreams.

**Divine love is the source of the erotic.** Brock describes the erotic as “the power of our loving each other at the depths of our being” which is the incarnation of divine love in the human heart.<sup>170</sup> The emotional and holistic pleasure of loving is Divinely created and is central to life and meaning-making. Human beings are created in the image of the Divine who takes pleasure in loving. Out of this pleasure arises creativity and birth. In women’s theological literature, an emphasis is often placed on Divine creativity; the Divine is love and takes pleasure in loving, which is the source of creativity. In Christianity, God desires human companionship in the Garden of Eden, and later sends Jesus into the world out of an overflowing love for God’s creation.<sup>171</sup> Starhawk describes the Wiccan Goddess creation story in which Divine self-love overflows to create the world, illustrating the relationship between healthy self-esteem, self-love, love for others, and creative self-giving.<sup>172</sup> In fact, loving the self and others is a central concept in most world religions. Sharon Welch describes the terms “holy” and “divine” as “a quality of being worthy of honor, love, respect, and affirmation.”<sup>173</sup> This quality of being is experienced “within the web of life,” and is “a process of healing relationship.”<sup>174</sup> The processes of loving, honoring, respecting, and valuing the worth of the other, learned in relationship with the Divine teach us how to love, honor, respect, and value the worth of ourselves and others.

---

<sup>170</sup> Brock, 45-46.

<sup>171</sup> Gen. 1:26-31, Charles Caldwell Ryrie, The Ryrie Study Bible: The New International Version (Chicago: Moody Press, 1986), 8-9; John 3:16, Ryrie, 1456.

<sup>172</sup> Starhawk, Spiral Dance: A Rebirth of the Ancient Religion of the Great Goddess (New York, Harper Collins Publishers, 1989), 31-32, citing the oral teaching of the Faery tradition of Witchcraft.

<sup>173</sup> Sharon D. Welch, A Feminist Ethic of Risk (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1990), 178.

<sup>174</sup> Ibid.

Scripture tells us that God Is Love, and we are to “Love the Lord your God with all of your heart, soul, mind, and strength.”<sup>175</sup> Jesus says, “Love your neighbor as yourself” and “Love one another.”<sup>176</sup> Most radically, Jesus states: “Love your enemies.”<sup>177</sup> Rita Nakashima Brock notes that Jesus’ life--“living for others”--was an act of love as important and significant as his “dying for others”--his death and resurrection.<sup>178</sup> Theologians Ada Maria Isasi-Diaz and Gustavo Gutierrez note that loving actions that liberate people from oppression and meet their needs incarnate God’s presence in the world.<sup>179</sup> In describing the theological basis for Latin American Bishops’ preferential option for the poor, Isasi-Diaz writes, “Poverty dims and defiles the image and likeness of God in human beings.”<sup>180</sup> Agnes Sanford describes God’s creative energy as: “The very life force existing in a radiation of an energy akin to the light one sees with the eyes, but existing at a higher rate of vibration... ..every created thing gives forth this light...”<sup>181</sup> Brock describes “a feminist alternative for understanding Christ, not singly as the son, but as the full incarnation of God/dess in life-giving relationships.” She thus expands Christ beyond Jesus of Nazareth, where “we can find the true power of the redemption of human life revealed in the life-giving power of community.”<sup>182</sup>

Religious educator Mary Elizabeth Moore describes aspects of an organic worldview sourced in the love of God:

---

<sup>175</sup> John 4:8-16; Luke 10:27; Deut.6:5; Lev.19:18, in Ryrie 1709, 1423, 250, 168.

<sup>176</sup> Matthew 22:37; Luke 10:27; Lev. 19:18; John 13:34 in Ryrie, 1352, 1423, 168, 1477.

<sup>177</sup> Matthew 5:44, in Ryrie, 1322-23.

<sup>178</sup> Rita Nakashima Brock, Journeys by Heart: A Christology of Erotic Power (New York: Crossroad Publishing, 1988), 58, 94-96.

<sup>179</sup> Isasi-Diaz, 39, 56, 128-33, 148-50, 157-58; Gustavo Gutierrez, The God of Life, trans. Matthew J. O’Connell (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1991), xi-xiii, xv-xvii.

<sup>180</sup> Isasi-Diaz, 194, citing Third General Conference of Latin American Bishops, Puebla--Evangelization at Present and in the Future of Latin America (Washington, D.C.: National Conference of Catholic Bishops Secretariat, Committee for the Church in Latin America, 1979), 178.

<sup>181</sup> Agnes Sanford, The Healing Gift of the Spirit (New York: HarperSanFrancisco, 1966), 25, 27.

<sup>182</sup> Brock, xiii.

The first aspect of this organic worldview is that God is the empowering center of life--the spirit moving and creating in the universe, inspiring and requiring our love. God is not only the source of life and the everpresent Redeemer and Creator of new life, but also God is our God.<sup>183</sup>

She adds that God's love is personal, relational, and evocative of mutual reciprocal love. Moore applies these concepts to "teaching from the heart":

God loves every aspect of creation; thus, all creation is holy. Our love of God is linked inextricably to love of creation. Teaching from the heart is, most importantly, loving God and neighbor.<sup>184</sup>

Moore continues: "Perhaps the art of teaching from the heart is really an act of reverence, that is, feeling awe again and again and again (re-vering)." She writes that teaching involves receiving and passing on the gifts of God to others.<sup>185</sup> Revering God also involves living and participating as cocreators with God in a living tradition of God's actions, past and present, and a future that is "God's new creation." Education is based on revering the self, "other persons, cultures, and other parts of the environment," she writes.<sup>186</sup>

Her education theory focuses on "revering the particularities of a concrete case," "revering the narratives that weave together our lives and the life of the earth," and "revering the oppressed and the poor and the dynamics of liberation."<sup>187</sup> Revering "involves appreciating the teachers and learners, the texts, and the ideas and feelings that are part of the educational process."<sup>188</sup> She observes the practice of revering in John Cobb, who encourages students to understand the views of an author before evaluating the author's work.<sup>189</sup> She also notes Paulo Freire's

---

<sup>183</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 208, citing Charles Hartshorne, Natural Theology for Our Time (LaSalle, Ill.: Open Court Publishing, 1967), 131-37.

<sup>184</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 209.

<sup>185</sup> Ibid., 213.

<sup>186</sup> Ibid.

<sup>187</sup> Ibid., 213, citing Mary Elizabeth Moore, Education for Continuity and Change: A New Model for Christian Religious Education (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1983).

<sup>188</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 213-14.

<sup>189</sup> Ibid., 214.

reverence in discerning the social realities of a people and learning from them.<sup>190</sup>

She concludes: "To revere the vocation of teaching, then, is to live in awe of our work--the calling of God's Spirit, the possibilities for nourishing and receiving and replenishing the community, the dangers of perpetuating oppression, and the artistry of our acts."<sup>191</sup>

These educational reflections circle back to the movement and vastness of love. Elizabeth Johnson writes: "Love is the moving power of life, that which drives everything that is toward everything else that is."<sup>192</sup> Divine love is understood as "All-That-Is-One" in Goddess tradition, pervading spirit, consciousness, and matter.<sup>193</sup> Thus, the Divine can be understood as the energy of Love, the Life Force, shaping the deepest human desires and meaning-making. The desire to love and be loved, which Noddings and Haunani-Kay Trask associate with meaning in life, may be the most basic human instinct.<sup>194</sup> Soelle also notes that "in loving we... participate in the meaning of life..."<sup>195</sup> She adds that "Love is perhaps the deepest need that people have: learning to give and receive, their greatest task."<sup>196</sup> Aquino notes that Latin American women's *mujerista* theology begins with experience and expresses life, honors the spiritual experiences of women and men trying to love and seeking justice in daily life, and the "primacy of desire."<sup>197</sup>

Rita Nakashima Brock describes erotic power as "the fundamental power of

<sup>190</sup> Ibid., citing Paulo Freire, Pedagogy in Process: The Letters to Guinea-Bissau, trans. Carman St. John Hunter (New York: Seabury Press, 1978), frontispiece.

<sup>191</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 219.

<sup>192</sup> Johnson, She Who Is, 143.

<sup>193</sup> In Spiral Dance, Starhawk notes that "All That Is-One" is an understanding of the Divine in Goddess theology, 209, 38-40, 91-92.

<sup>194</sup> Noddings, 173-75, 51, 46-50, 30-37, 14, 144-47; Haunani-Kay Trask, Eros and Power: The Promise of Feminist Theory (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1986), 92-93; quoted in Brock, 25.

<sup>195</sup> Dorothy Soelle, The Strength of the Weak: Toward a Christian Feminist Identity (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1984), 39.

<sup>196</sup> Ibid., 40.

<sup>197</sup> Maria Pilar Aquino, Our Cry for Life: Feminist Theology from Latin America (Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books, 1993), 110-11.

existence-as-a-relational-process.”<sup>198</sup> She elaborates: “The erotic is the basis of being itself as the power of relationship, and all existence comes to be by virtue of connectedness, from atoms to the cosmos.”<sup>199</sup> Both Moore and Brock describe the importance of knowing through the heart.<sup>200</sup> Brock understands the erotic as “the foundation of heart,” which fuels social justice and “compels us toward compassion, collective action, integration, self-acceptance, and self-reflective memory in our critical reflection of the past.”<sup>201</sup>

Audre Lorde elaborates on the erotic relationally saying that it (1) provides power which comes from the joy of sharing deeply any pursuit with another person, lessening their difference, (2) underlies the human capacity for joy, exerting ethical demands for the sake of the self, and (3) creates standards of value by which the quality of life is judged.<sup>202</sup> Brock describes the power of loving as the central human life force. The erotic as the power of loving incarnates from a Divine who loves to love.<sup>203</sup> Heyward Carter also describes the erotic as the “life-force,” notes Eisler.<sup>204</sup> These affirmations reveal Divine love as the source of the erotic, suggesting another kind of cycling time centered around Divine-human mutuality: Divine to human to Divine to human. Erotic cycles of mutuality can shape ways in which time is understood and used. Divine and human loving is inherently life-giving. Just as Divine love overflows in creation, so does love overflow in human beings to create new life in a child, or to create nonsexual expressions of love for family, friends, and community through meaningful work, community service, the arts, athletics, and a general zest for life. In these ways, the pleasure of loving positively shapes culture and priorities.

---

<sup>198</sup> Brock, 41.

<sup>199</sup> Ibid.

<sup>200</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 197-98, 202-07, 212-16; Brock, 37, 40-42, 45-46.

<sup>201</sup> Brock, 42.

<sup>202</sup> Audre Lorde, Sister Outsider: Essays and Speeches (Freedom, Calif.: Crossing Press, 1984), 56-57.

<sup>203</sup> Synthesis of Brock, 25-27 and author's construction.

<sup>204</sup> Eisler, 285, citing Carter Heyward, Touching Our Strength (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1989), 3, 101.



**The pleasures and joys of loving are embodied in women.**

Women's cycles of desire heighten women's awareness of love and desire directed toward the self and others during menstruation and ovulation, respectively, notes Northrup.<sup>205</sup> Thus, the erotic is embodied cyclically in women, creating a sense of time that is nuanced by these alternating poles of experience. Luce Irigaray describes women's complex sense organs in relation to female sexuality and women's immense comprehensive whole-body capacity for emotional/sexual experience, as well as multiple orgasms. She notes that women's ability to love occurs as a whole-person integrated experience and informs women's ways of knowing and ways of conceptualizing the world.<sup>206</sup> In their translation of biblical love poem, the Song of Songs, Ariel Bloch and Chana Block note that "eros is celebrated as the most powerful of human pleasures..."<sup>207</sup> Women's time is structured through experiences of psychic (emotional and cognitive), spiritual, physical, and sexual pleasure in relating with themselves and others.

The pleasure of loving is also an aspect of mothering and includes experiences such as the joy in feeling a baby kick during pregnancy. A graduate school classmate shared with me that she had her first child while in Sweden, where she learned a whole different understanding of childbirth as a spiritual process that is pleasurable. As a result, she said, the birth of her first child was more like an orgasm, than anything else.<sup>208</sup> Midwife Ina May Gaskin notes that breastfeeding is often pleasurable to women.<sup>209</sup> Women's experiences of pleasure in relationships may intensify women's motivation to love the self and others, thereby heightening interest in relating with others and shaping women's use and structuring of time accordingly.

---

<sup>205</sup> Northrup, 98-101, 103-04, citing Therese Benedek and Boris Rubenstein, "Correlations Between Ovarian Activity and Psychodynamic Processes: The Ovulatory Phase," *Psychosomatic Medicine* 1, no. 2 (1939): 245-70.

<sup>206</sup> Luce Irigaray, *This Sex Which Is Not One*, trans. Catherine Porter with Carolyn Burke (Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1985), 24, 28-31.

<sup>207</sup> Bloch and Bloch, 19.

<sup>208</sup> Colleague, conversation with author, 1996.

<sup>209</sup> Ina May Gaskin, 12-13; Eisler, 298.

Some cultural practices such as female genital mutilation (FMG), change or diminish the power of the erotic to structure time through experiences of physical as well as psychic pleasure in relating to others. FMG causes long-term health problems due to infections, chronic pain in urinating and menstruating, sexual difficulties, and the necessity of reopening the sutures and resewing them at the birth of every child, according to Hanny Lightfoot-Klein and the World Health Organization.<sup>210</sup> When these health effects occur, female genital mutilation replaces the structuring of women's time through experiences of pleasure in relationships, with experiences of pain in relationship to others. FMG can decrease not only women's experiences of pleasure in human sexuality, but the related health problems likely diminish women's overall pleasure in life and human relationships and threaten women's survival.

At the U.N. Fourth World Congress on Women in 1995, Hilary Rodham Clinton emphasized repeatedly that "women's rights are human rights."<sup>211</sup> FMG violates a woman's basic human right to sole ownership and self-determination of her body. The right to experience pleasure in loving the self and others through the body in human sexuality is a basic human right, as is the right to choose if, when, and with whom to share one's body and self. As an act of violence, FMG is an assault on the dignity and worth of girls.

The Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action created at the U.N. Conference on Human Rights affirms that "the human rights of women and of the girlchild are an inalienable, integral and indivisible part of universal human rights" and apply across differences, so that political, economic, or cultural differences cannot be used to justify human rights violations, quotes Riley. Because women's rights "are often denied or diminished under the excuse of protecting cultures or traditions, the programme represents a significant victory for women, achieved through the efforts of a loose coalition of women's groups who launched the Global Campaign for

---

<sup>210</sup> Hanny Lightfoot-Klein, Prisoners of Ritual: An Odyssey into Female Genital Circumcision in Africa (New York: Haworth Press, 1989); World Health Organization, Female Genital Mutilation: An Overview (Geneva: World Health Organization: 1998), 23-36.

<sup>211</sup> Look at the World Through Women's Eyes.

Women's Human Rights to give women's human rights high visibility at the conference, she notes. Thus, the U.N. conference laid important groundwork for the elimination of violent practices such as FMG.

Midwife Arisika Razak reminds us that "women's genitals were once sacred icons. The Sheila-na-gig statue found in Ireland was placed over church doors: the legs are open crosswise while the feet are joined in a diamond shape and the vulva and genitals are prominently, nakedly displayed," she writes.<sup>212</sup> Some images of the sacred vulva found in the south of France are thirty thousand years old, and are located in cave sanctuaries near Les Eyzies and the Dordogne region, notes Riane Eisler. According to archaeologists, "the cave was symbolic of the Great Mother's womb. It's entrance was thus a symbol of the sacred portal or vaginal opening," she adds.<sup>213</sup> She suggests that these icons related to "prehistoric erotic myths and rites were not only expressions of our ancestor's joy and gratitude for the Goddess' gift of life, but also expressions of joy and gratitude for the Goddess' gifts of love and pleasure..."<sup>214</sup> In Tantric yoga, kundalini energy "awakened through the pleasures of sex, rises through the body to bring about a state of ecstatic bliss," notes Eisler.<sup>215</sup>

Eisler connects the resurgence of a partnership-based society with the movement of women and men to resacralize sexuality and birth as sacred and

---

<sup>212</sup> "Arisika Razak," interview by Cathleen Rountree Coming Into Our Fulness: On Women Turning Forty (Freedom Calif.: Crossing Press, 1991), 82-83.

<sup>213</sup> Eisler, 16.

<sup>214</sup> Ibid., 58. Eisler cites evidence of the sacredness of women's genitals depicted in religious art in many other early cultures in areas such as Yugoslavia, Romania, Bulgaria, Japan, Egypt, the Roman Empire, and India. Some date back as early as the Paleolithic (early Stone Age), and Neolithic (when agriculture started), periods, she notes. She describes icons such as Goddess sculptures with "highly emphasized vulvas," "highly stylized pubic triangles," double spirals on the torso underneath a spiral sea, and a sacred triangle with double spirals (ancient symbols of regeneration), as well as symbols in nature such as a flower-bud and cowrie shell. Eisler, 410, clarifies that her use of the term Goddess refers not to "a female mirror image of what we today call God," but to "the creative female power as symbolic of the life force that animates our universe," as it was used by "our prehistoric ancestors." See Eisler, 16-17, citing the following: Marija Gimbutas, The Language of the Goddess (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1989, 99), 260, Plate 9, 102; Elinor Gadon, The Once and Future Goddess (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1989), 43, 18-19; Buffie Johnson, Lady of the Beasts (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1988), 130-31. See also Gimbutas, 18, 58-75.

<sup>215</sup> Ibid., 17, citing Gadon, 1989, 18-19.

spiritual acts.<sup>216</sup> Perhaps today the sacredness of female embodiment can not only symbolize the sacred act of giving birth to a new life, but also the love and pleasure which motivates and creates new life in the form of a relationship, a child, a vocation, a community service, or artistic expression.

Human genital embodiment is a place where emotional, cognitive, spiritual, nonverbal, and physiological aspects of loving have the potential to powerfully and pleasurably intersect. Thus a theology of human sexuality might point toward a world view in which the pleasure and joy of whole-person loving and its life-giving potential for the self, family, and community is central.

In partnership societies, human relationships are bonded through pleasure rather than pain or fear, and "the pleasures of caring behaviors are socially supported," writes Eisler.<sup>217</sup> "Pleasure is associated with empathy for others," and caretaking, lovemaking, and other activities that bring pleasure to relationships are seen as sacred, she adds.<sup>218</sup> Women's embodied pleasure in relating to others influences and is influenced by women's psychological pleasure in relating to others, which in turn, shapes women's priorities and use of time.

**The erotic shapes women's relationships in terms of pleasure in relational connecting, enhanced self esteem, and psychological growth.**

Janet Surrey notes that women take pleasure in being related to others.<sup>219</sup> Women's pleasure in relating, mutually empowering others, being understood, and understanding others motivates psychological growth which occurs through relationships.<sup>220</sup> Judith Jordan writes that women's interests in knowing others is not simply altruistic or drive-centered. As a result, relationality may come to be seen as an ontological aspect of human being as Brock describes. Relationships grow,

---

<sup>216</sup> Ibid., 65-66.

<sup>217</sup> Eisler, 405.

<sup>218</sup> Ibid.

<sup>219</sup> Janet Surrey, "The Self-in-Relation: A Theory of Women's Development"; and Surrey, "The Relational Self in Women: Clinical Implications," both in Women's Growth in Connection, 57; 36-38.

<sup>220</sup> Jordan, "Empathy and Self Boundaries," 56-59, and "The Meaning of Mutuality," 87, 82-86, both from Women's Growth in Connection, 56-59; 87, 82-86.

develop, and unfold over time and may influence women to understand time as a developmental process in which one phase gives rise to the next.

The pleasure of relating with others may influence women's overall styles of relating and influence the meaning of women's time. Judith Jordan contrasts an "objectifying/power/control mode" of relating with "the empathic/love mode" in which people understand each other as subjects and experience connectedness. She notes that Gilligan's understanding of responsibility and caring is at the heart of this moral system, as well as caring for the relationship and providing mutual empathic feedback that helps each person attain clarity in their self-understandings and relationships with others.<sup>221</sup> She describes the joy and zest involved in this kind of relating, which often comes with clarity and is a characteristic of the empathy/love mode of relating:

We feel a sense of well-being, pleasure, and delight in knowing and being known. Joy seems "contactful" and outreaching and not comparative.<sup>222</sup>

Jordan notes that there are numerous noncompetitive ways of developing self-worth including, "confidence in self and others, gratitude, courage, clarity, relational capacity..." She adds that in the empathy/love mode of relating, confidence is not an entitlement or one's "right" or "claim" based on achievements or inherent worth. She elaborates:

It is trust or faith in oneself and/or others, a clearly relational concept. Both joy and confidence stand in marked contrast to narcissistic pride as a basis for good feelings about oneself.<sup>223</sup>

As an empathic/love mode of relating expands outward it can transform the organization of human societies. For example, Eisler describes the existence of partnership societies in human and animal life based on shared pleasure and

---

<sup>221</sup> Judith Jordan, "Clarity in Connection: Empathic Knowing, Desire, and Sexuality," Women's Growth in Diversity: More Writings from the Stone Center, ed. Judith Jordan, (New York: Guilford Press, 1997), 56, citing both Carol Gilligan, In a Different Voice (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982), and Janet Surrey, "The 'Self-in-Relation': A Theory of Women's Development (Work in Progress no. 13)" (Wellesley: Ma.: Stone Center Working Paper Series, 1984).

<sup>222</sup> Jordan, 56.

<sup>223</sup> Ibid.

cooperation.<sup>224</sup>

**The erotic creates and shapes time and matter.** Our deepest desires can create life and shape time in transformative ways. Just as Divine love overflows to form creation, so also in human relationships, overflowing love for one's self and partner can literally create time for a child through lovemaking, conception, and giving birth. The erotic also creates time through its influence on human evolution and health.

"The evolution of love was a major turning point in the movement toward more complex or highly developed life forms on our planet," notes Eisler.<sup>225</sup> Human frontal and nonseasonal sexuality, as well as prolonged pregnancy and infant dependence on mothers were the catalysts for what biologists Humberto Maturana and Francisco Varela terms, "a biology of cooperation and a linguistic coordination of action," quotes Eisler.<sup>226</sup> Language developed as a tool to facilitate sharing and cooperation among humans whose motivation for connectedness over time and development of capacity for intimate relationship was enhanced by women's year-round sexuality, (in contrast to animals' seasonal mating patterns,) notes Eisler.<sup>227</sup> According to Maturana and Varela, "the intimacy of recurrent individual interactions, which personalize the other individual with a linguistic distinction such as a name," also may have created conditions which facilitated the emergence of a distinct sense of self and recognition of distinct others "in a linguistic domain," quotes Eisler.<sup>228</sup> Eisler concludes that "the most adaptive development in the evolution of our own species seems to have been the development of our great human capacity for love, and not, as some earlier theorists claimed, our capacity for great violence and aggression."<sup>229</sup> In light of this evolutionary history, Eisler observes that "a social

---

<sup>224</sup> Eisler, 11, 34-52, 126-42, 347-71.

<sup>225</sup> Ibid., 175.

<sup>226</sup> Ibid., 172, citing Humberto Maturana and Francisco Varela, The Tree of Knowledge (Boston: Shambhala, 1987), 222.

<sup>227</sup> Ibid., 172-73, citing Maturana and Varela, 219-23.

<sup>228</sup> Eisler, 173, citing Humberto Maturana, Preface to El Caliz y La Espada (Spanish edition of The Chalice and the Blade), by Riane Eisler (Santiago, Chile: Editorial Cuatro Vientos, 1990), xv.

<sup>229</sup> Eisler, 175.

organization oriented more to partnership than domination is more congruent with our biological evolution.”<sup>230</sup> Eisler understands love to be “the highest expression of the evolution of life on our planet, as well as the universal unifying power.”<sup>231</sup> Thus, the pleasure of loving has important implications for the future growth and development of the human species and human society.

Loving others is healthy for individual human beings as well, and contributes positively to human health and longevity. Infants can fail to thrive and may die without emotional nurturance in addition to physical care, notes Eisler.<sup>232</sup> Chemicals such as phenylethylamine and endorphins are a factor in what Eisler calls “the euphoria of ‘falling in love,’” as well as the pleasure and contentment that parents and other adults experience in caring for children and being in loving relationships in general.<sup>233</sup> Studies show that people in relatively happy long-term marriages and stable relationships who have regular sex, live longer.<sup>234</sup>

A “helper’s high” is often experienced when people do “good deeds” or are helpful to others, and is probably created through chemicals such as endorphins, notes Eisler, citing Dr. Dean Edell’s survey of seventeen hundred women who reported a link between such helping experiences and a “decrease in stress-related disorders and headaches.”<sup>235</sup> Just the act of watching a loving act increases immune responses as does falling in love, notes Deepak Chopra, who adds that people who feel loved have increased immune responses and faster healing.<sup>236</sup>

---

<sup>230</sup> Ibid., 177.

<sup>231</sup> Ibid., 405.

<sup>232</sup> Ibid., 173, citing Ashley Montagu, Touching, 3d ed. (New York: Harper and Row, 1986).

<sup>233</sup> Eisler, 174, citing the following: Michael Liebowitz, The Chemistry of Love (New York: Berkeley Press, 1983); Anthony Walsh, The Science of Love (Buffalo, N.Y.: Prometheus Books, 1991), 99; and Helen E. Fisher, Anatomy of Love (New York: Norton, 1992).

<sup>234</sup> Lisa Douglas and Marsha Douglas, “Astonishing Facts That Will Change Your Sex-Life Forever,” New Woman, July 1977, 86.

<sup>235</sup> Eisler, 383, citing Dr. Dean Edell, M.D., “To Your Health,” Edell Health Letter, April 1991, 2.

<sup>236</sup> Deepak Chopra, The Path to Love: Renewing the Power of Spirit in Your Life (New York: Harmony Books, 1997), 42-43.

Ashley Montagu notes that the skin is one of the most complex sense organs of the human body, and loving touch promotes connectedness to others. Humans and animals alike respond positively to affectionate, nonsexual touch, which has been shown to reduce disease and contribute positively to human mental health.<sup>237</sup> Montagu also describes a study of fourteen groups of rats that were fed cancer-producing diets. At the end of the study, one rat grouping had a sixty percent higher immune system response than the other groups of rats. The only difference they could find was that the person feeding them took each one out and petted them at every feeding.<sup>238</sup> A sense of being loved and supported and social support networks have been linked with lowered levels of arterial sclerosis and surgical recovery time, notes Eisler.<sup>239</sup> She quotes Humberto Maturana's observation that people "depend on love and we get sick when it is denied to us."<sup>240</sup> Surgeon Bernie Siegel writes that "Love itself is a miraculous force," and describes ways in which human love contributes to physical health.<sup>241</sup> The positive affects of love on human health are evident. Thus, it appears that human beings are physiologically formed to experience pleasure and increased health through loving the self and others.

In contrast, a societal lack of love based on race (or other differences) can

---

<sup>237</sup> Ashley Montagu, Touching: The Human Significance of the Skin (New York: Columbia, University Press, 1971), 1-37; Ashley Montagu, "Breastfeeding and Its Relation to Morphological, Behavioral, and Psychocultural Development," in International Conference on Human Lactation, Breastfeeding and Food Policy in a Hungry World, 194; Eisler, 173, citing Montagu, Touching, 3d ed. (New York: Harper and Row, 1986). Pets have been recommended to people for this reason, Chopra, 42-43.

<sup>238</sup> Montagu, Touching, 11-14, citing the following: F. S. Hamnett, "Studies of the Thyroid Apparatus: I," American Journal of Physiology 56 (1921): 196-204, p.199; F. S. Hamnett, "Studies of the Thyroid Apparatus V," Endocrinology 6 (1922): 221-19; and M. J. Greenman and F. L. Duhring, Breeding and Care of the Albino Rat for Research Purposes 2nd edition (Philadelphia: Wistar Institute, 1991).

<sup>239</sup> Eisler, 382-83, citing Dean Ornish, M. D., Reversing Heart Disease (New York: Ballantine, 1990), 90, and citing J. S. House, K. R. Landis, and D. Umberson, "Social Relationships and Health," Science 29 (1988): 540-50.

<sup>240</sup> *Ibid.*, 383, citing Humberto Maturana, preface to El Caliz y La Espada, xv.

<sup>241</sup> Bernie Siegel, Love, Medicine and Miracles: Lessons Learned about Self-Healing from a Surgeon's Experience with Exceptional Patients (New York: Harper Trade, 1991), xi, 28-29.



contribute to depression and ill health. For instance, African Americans and others experience a societal lack of love through: (1) discrimination and prejudice in individual attitudes and societal policies, (2) structures and systems that create conditions like environmental racism, poverty, inadequate medical care, and other forms of neglect and exploitation, and (3) cultural tolerance of hate groups, acts of terrorism such as African American church burnings, and the lack of comprehensive multicultural and anti-internalized-dominance education for instance, in public schools. Epidemiology studies reveal significant differences between the life expectancies of African American persons compared with European Americans, and many studies document "widely recognized" links between poverty, ill-health and shortened life expectancy.<sup>242</sup> Two-thirds of the "excess" mortality suffered by African Americans aged thirty-five to fifty-four compared to European Americans "could only be accounted for by the direct and indirect effects of low socioeconomic status itself, i.e., the relative deprivation of poverty that blacks suffer from at vastly higher rates than whites," writes psychiatrist James Gilligan.<sup>243</sup> These effects include low income,

---

<sup>242</sup> Robert A. Hahn and Steven Eberhardt, "Life Expectancy in Four U.S. Racial/Ethnic Populations: 1990," Epidemiology 6, no. 4 (1995): 352; Robert A. Hahn et. al., "Poverty and Death in the United States--1973 and 1991," Epidemiology 6, no. 5 (1995): 490, citing the following: A. Antonovsky, "Social Class, Life Expectancy and Overall Mortality," Milbank Mem. Fund Quarterly 45(1967): 31-73; A. Antonovsky, J. Bernstein, "Social Class and Infant Mortality," Social Science Medicine 11(1977): 453-470; M. G. Marmot, M. Kogevinas, M. A. Elston, "Social/economic Status and Disease," Annual Review of Public Health 8(1987): 111-35; D. R. Williams, "Socioeconomic Differentials in Health: A Review and Redirection," Social Psychology Quarterly 53(1990): 81-99; G. E. Kaplan, J. E. Keil, "Socioeconomic Factors and Cardiovascular Disease: A Review of the Literature," Circulation 88(1993): 1973-1998; N. E. Adler, T. Boyce, M. A. Chesney, S. Folkman, S. L. Syme, "Socioeconomic Inequalities in Health: No Easy Solution," Journal of the American Medical Association 269(1993): 3140-3145; M. N. Haan, G. A. Kaplan, "The Contribution of Socioeconomic Position to Minority Health, Report of the Secretary's Task Force on Black and Minority Health. 2 Crosscutting Issues in Minority Health (Washington, D.C.: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 1985); D. Black, J. N. Morris, C. Smith, P. Townsend, Inequalities in Health: The Black Report (Harmondsworth, Middlesex, England: Penguin Books, 1982); M. Whitehead, The Health Divide (Harmondsworth, Middlesex, England: Penguin Books, 1987); and N. Krieger, D. Rowley, A. A. Hermann, B. Avery, M. Phillips, "Racism, Sexism, and Social Class: Implications for Studies of Health, Disease, and Well-Being," American Journal of Preventive Medicine 9(1993): 82-122.

<sup>243</sup> James Gilligan, Violence: Reflections on a National Epidemic (New York: Vintage Books, 1996), 192, citing Mac W. Otten, Jr., Steven M. Teutsch, David F. Williamson, and James S. Marks, "The Effect of Known Risk Factors on the Excess Mortality of Black Adults in the United States," Journal of the American Medical Association, 263(3):845-50.

unequal access to health care, and “the pathogenic (indeed, lethal) stresses caused by lower socioeconomic class position, racial discrimination, social rejection, and unemployment.” he writes.<sup>244</sup> These studies reveal ways in which a society's lack of love is perpetuated and reproduced in its institutions, policies, formal and informal practices. Through these conscious and unconscious processes, love comes to be restricted to one's own group and experienced parochially, so that it is increasingly marginalized from public life and relegated to the home and family. The restriction of love to the private sphere, noted by Dorothy Soelle, and its parochialization, noted by Ruddick, result in consequences that are harsh and stark, as these studies reveal.<sup>245</sup> If love is further distorted until it is no longer love, but addiction--for instance, greed--then addiction becomes the force which creates and shapes time and priorities, with the result that things take precedence over persons and the living earth.<sup>246</sup>

In contrast, when love is understood nonparochially and inclusively to be a necessary foundational value that permeates public life, the result is transformative. In such an understanding, the erotic shapes life in transformative ways by influencing how time is prioritized and used, as well as the meanings and purposes that shape understandings of time. The erotic is the energizing force behind dreaming and imagination. It creates time for that which it loves, and it shapes our uses of time, whether it is in prioritizing family, vocation, social justice or other activities. Eisler notes that human nature is capable of choosing to create either partnership or dominator cultures, neither of which is a predetermined inevitability.<sup>247</sup> In her description of the conceptual foundations of partnership-based, (vs. domination-based) societies, Eisler describes the centrality of pleasure in loving others: “Specifically, what I am suggesting is that our ancestors celebrated sex not only in relation to birth and procreation, but as the mysterious--and in that sense, magical--source of both

---

<sup>244</sup> Gilligan, *Violence*.

<sup>245</sup> Soelle, 37-38; Ruddick, 177.

<sup>246</sup> James Childs, *Greed: Economics and Ethics in Conflict*.

<sup>247</sup> Eisler, 51-52, 37-50.

pleasure and life.”<sup>248</sup> In partnership societies, pleasure, birth, and life-giving activities are usually central metaphors that shape understandings of the meanings and purposes of time. Similarly, the life-giving pleasure of loving others is a central value that shapes healthy families, communities, and nations when it is not limited parochially to one’s own group alone.

These values are transformative for society and can shape the priorities and activities of primary institutions of culture so that they center around the needs of healthy families and communities. Melissa Raphael describes the importance of women’s biophilic labor, for instance, crafts, which adequately support women, families, and communities, without damaging the environment.<sup>249</sup> Vandana Shiva describes ways in which rural women work in harmony with their environment to provide for their families--without exploiting others.<sup>250</sup> Nonprofit, grassroots, and nongovernment organizations (NGOs,) which often attract women, create social services and transform systems and structures so that they are more socially just, nonexploitive, and meet local needs. When economic and governmental institutions are founded upon values of loving and supporting all people regardless of differences, they are more likely to meet local needs in a just manner, and create systems, structures, and policies that support rather than exploit women, families, and communities.

When institutions, policies, and structures are themselves shaped and continually transformed by the needs and deepest desires of their communities, people are empowered to allow their deepest desires to emerge and to shape their priorities and use of time--not only in personal and individual ways, but also through larger systems and structures. Parents who wish to spend more time with their children are empowered by economic institutions such as Mothers Centers in which

---

<sup>248</sup> Ibid., 58.

<sup>249</sup> Raphael, Thealogy and Embodiment, 128-53.

<sup>250</sup> Vandana Shiva, Ecology and the Politics of Survival: Conflicts Over Natural Resources in India (Newbury Press, Calif.: Sage Publications and the United Nations University Press, 1991), 103-22, 303-27; Shiva, The Violence of the Green Revolution, 231-63; Shiva, Monocultures of the Mind, 8-64, 141-48.

women share tasks and wisdom.<sup>251</sup> Social services such as family counseling can help people better care for their families and create quality time. Vocational counseling and childcare services can empower women to discover and fulfill their vocational dreams so they can spend their lives doing what they love. The tendency of NGOs to focus on providing life-giving services that enhance the future of children is consistent with Gutierrez' description of a God of life.<sup>252</sup> The concern to meet the immediate and real needs of families and communities fuels liberation theology and women's leadership. In these ways, the erotic infuses a culture's prioritization and uses of time.

**Expanding circles of loving can influence women's use of time, shaping women's priorities and fostering women's leadership.** Ruddick notes that in mothering, women's concerns for the nurturing, safety, and health of their infant's environment naturally expand into larger and larger spheres of concern, from the circle of a mother's womb to her arms; to family and extended family circles; to community, national, and ultimately global circles of concern, if not limited by parochial attitudes.<sup>253</sup> The othermothering tradition described by Collins can develop into mothering whole communities as in the NFC and is a source of women's developmental leadership and women's concern for policy and institutional transformation.<sup>254</sup> As noted earlier, healthy families are the backbone of healthy communities, healthy nations, and ultimately, a healthy nonviolent world. Through their connection to the erotic, women often recognize the connections between healthy families and healthy communities. Thus, the erotic is the source of human agency and power in effective leadership. The pleasure and joy of loving others motivates women's leadership. Women's leadership spirals outward into the public sphere to transform policies, systems, and structures that are not caring.

The erotic is central to women's leadership. Brock describes "a theology

---

<sup>251</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 180-201.

<sup>252</sup> Gutierrez, xi-xiii, xv-xvii.

<sup>253</sup> Ruddick, 79-81, 241.

<sup>254</sup> Collins, 119-22, 128, 146, 222; Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 168-69, 234, 253.

grounded in a feminist view of “love as the basis of all power in human life.”<sup>255</sup>

Emotional intimacy, care and nurturance are expressions of love that, when genuine, are inherently powerful, growth and life-producing. Collins calls the erotic “power as energy,” fueling and inspiring agency, giving agency its humanizing character, and creating meaningful purposes and goals.<sup>256</sup> Lorde notes that recognizing the power of the erotic can mean the difference between pursuing “genuine change in our world” and “merely settling for a shift of characters in the same weary drama.”<sup>257</sup>

Love is the central cohesive force that holds together the possibility and empowerment of Howard Thurman’s and Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr.’s understanding of community, writes Collins.<sup>258</sup> Helen Regan and Gwen Brooks note that the women principals they studied describe care as the “development of an affinity for the world and the people in it, translating moral commitment to action on behalf of others.” For them, care is the “amniotic fluid” in which all of women’s leadership is situated.<sup>259</sup>

**Women’s cycles create in women the potential to experience life with erotic wholeness.** Women who live with monthly cycles and cultures that live closely with the earth’s cycles often emphasize the interconnectedness of all life. Psychologist Linda James Myers describes an Afrocentric worldview in which the self is extended to include the community, the Ancestors, and the unborn.<sup>260</sup> McFague offers the idea of the world as God’s body as an image of God with

---

<sup>255</sup> Brock, xii.

<sup>256</sup> Collins, 228, 196-97.

<sup>257</sup> Lorde, 59.

<sup>258</sup> King, 156, 163, 252; and Collins, 197, citing Katie G. Cannon, Black Womanist Ethics (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1988).

<sup>259</sup> Regan and Brooks, 27, 29.

<sup>260</sup> Linda James Myers, Understanding an Afrocentric World View: Introduction to an Optimal Psychology (Dubuque, Iowa: Kendall/Hunt Publishing, 1993), 20, citing J. Mbiti, African Religions and Philosophy (New York: Doubleday Press, 1970), and citing W. Nobles, and “African philosophy: Foundations for Black Psychology,” in Black Psychology, ed. H. Jones (New York: Harper and Row, 1972).

ecological implications.<sup>261</sup> Moore describes an organic worldview, noting that: "The very possibility that creation could love and be whole derives from God."<sup>262</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock note that women leaders they studied conceptualized everyone as part of one human family.<sup>263</sup> "Love is recognized as the highest expression of life on our planet, as well as the universal unifying power," notes Eisler.<sup>264</sup>

Women's cycles connect women with earth cycles and the power of the erotic, while also familiarizing women with experiences of time as a patterned unity of experiences, (through repetitive cycles such as menstruation and birthing). As a result, women may experience life with a heightened sense of erotic wholeness which may in turn heighten women's ability to grasp larger patterns or "see the big picture." These skills can contribute positively to women's leadership by enhancing valuing of others as well as women's ability to understand the connections and disconnections (overall patterns) between various points of view in order to work collaboratively with others to create visions for the future that are based on consensus.

### **The Meaning of Time--The Worth of Life**

Brock notes that relationality is an ontological characteristic of human existence.<sup>265</sup> Crises of female embodiment like pregnancy and childbirth uniquely reveal the relational meanings of women's experiences of time, which inherently point to standards of value in which human life is of ultimate worth. Persons whose value and worth is denied based on embodied characteristics like skin color or

---

<sup>261</sup> Sallie McFague, The Body of God: An Ecological Theology (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993), 22, 17-21.

<sup>262</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 209.

<sup>263</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 16.

<sup>264</sup> Eisler, 405.

<sup>265</sup> Brock, 7.

gender may experience themselves in conflict with culture at an ontological level. The value of each human life is a foundational value of mothering and women's leadership that fosters inclusion of individuals and groups, highlighting the importance of time spent with children as well as the need for the transformation of systems and structures that perpetuate addictive ways of being. The valuing of human life mitigates against exploitation by pointing to the inherent worth of individuals and nations, highlighting their right to be self-determining.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** The NFC women evaluated time in terms of the worth of life, coming back to three basic conclusions. First, the human being is of incomparably greater value than money or personal gain. Miss May, Miss Sophia, Miss Ann, and Miss Jean each passionately described the value and worth of human life, and emphasized that the club "values the human being." They contrasted this value with personal gain at the expense of human life, which leads to such actions as: practicing employment discrimination; a proposal to build a highway through black residential neighborhoods where elderly have already been relocated and lost their homes previously in the 1970s urban renewal; allowing thirteen industries and a junkyard to be built near local communities; blaming people's illnesses and deaths on smoking and drinking and refusing to investigate adequately; and earning a good living in a factory and going home across town to a house on the lake without ever thinking about how others have to suffer to support their lifestyle.

In their second conclusion, NFC women emphasized the importance of equality in relationships with others and in societal and institutional treatment of persons, regardless of race, ethnicity, or other differences. Many women described experiences in which they or their children had been treated in discriminating or humiliating ways as a result of racism--as well as the resistance and stands they took to counter these systems and structures.

The third conclusion is the negative influence of environmental devastation on children's self esteem. The struggle for self-worth while living in an environmentally devastated neighborhood like Newtown is described by Miss Wynona, who

recalled how hard it was for her to grow up in Newtown with no sewage system, houses left unfinished, grain dust coating them when they played outside, and soot spills from nearby industry. Miss Wynona stated that “even the littlest person” is aware that something is wrong with the kind of living conditions she grew up with.

**Women’s bodies have potential to teach us about the worth of every human being.** In women’s experience, the erotic characterizes time and reveals the sanctity, dignity, and worth of human life as a foundational value. Women’s time is uniquely influenced by the erotic with alternating cyclical experiences of desire focused on the self and others. The relational meaning of women’s physiological time or women’s embodied time has to do with the female body’s potential to create and nurture new life. Her recognition of this potential as a sacred process might influence her to view her nurturing relationships with other peoples’ children as sacred as well. Certainly the decision to have a child is a decision to participate in a cocreative process with the Divine. In so doing, a woman gives to another human being the gift of time--human life--the potential for a lifetime of time, or from 0 to over 100 years of life. Human life--or time--is irreplaceable. Healthy mothering recognizes the unconditional worth of every child as a birthright.

“Our female sexuality can then reveal a quality of existence found in our bodies that speaks of the creative, renewing, and loving aspect of all life,” writes Washbourn.<sup>266</sup>

Women routinely risk their lives to give birth. During the 19th century, about one in four women died in childbirth or of related complications.<sup>267</sup> Today, with cheerful denial, women and society as a whole, “forget” that women routinely risk their lives in childbirth to give another human being new life. Ruddick notes that through their embodied experiences of pregnancy and birth, mothers know the cost of human flesh.<sup>268</sup> Kendrick writes that “Pregnancy may provide the first genuine

---

<sup>266</sup> Washbourn, 48-49.

<sup>267</sup> Brendan Wyatt, medical student, Vanderbilt University, conversation with author, 1992.

<sup>268</sup> Ruddick, 186, citing Olive Schreiner, Women and Labour (1911; London: Virago, 1978), 172.



occasion for anything approaching unconditional love in human experience."<sup>269</sup> She continues:

The mother takes the risk, since her life is never guaranteed, of laying down her life for another. At the very least, she lays aside her life for another."<sup>270</sup>

In childbirth, a mother risks her life, in order to make it possible for another human being, a child, to have life. In so doing, women choose to value the erotic--the ability to have a deeply profound relationship with a child--over their own security. This requires the adoption of a standard of value in which the value of another's life is worth risking one's own life. Because risking one's life in childbirth is so common among women, and because experiences with life-and-death implications are so powerful, this standard of value may be taken for granted even as it is deeply imprinted.

Mothering, which includes motherly fathering, is a life practice which also requires radical reorganization of one's time and life in order to nurture the growth of a child. One significant example is the feeding and nurturing of infants by breast or bottle. Child nurturance expands over the lifetime to many other complex activities.

Breastfeeding is a particularly vulnerable act of loving nurture that puts a child at the center of a woman's life for a significant period of time. A breastfeeding woman tenderly symbolizes and lives out the significance, value, and worth of children, even as her incarnate love, as milk, is fed upon and becomes incarnated as a child's flesh-and-blood body. Yet ironically, a breastfeeding woman is still often considered less acceptable in public than billboards and public photos of women with oversexualized, barely covered breasts whose bodies are being used to sell cars, clothing, or other products. This irony illustrates a clash of cultural values between the value of human life and its commodification. This clash of values is not simplistically played out on the canvas of women's bodies. Rather, women's embodied power to love, value, create, and nurture human life is relevant to both private and public spheres of life, inherently powerfully confronting any exploitation, commodification, or addictions such as sex or greed, which attempt to decentralize

---

<sup>269</sup> Kendrick, 117.

<sup>270</sup> Ibid.

the value of human life as the central value of society.<sup>271</sup> The commodification of women's bodies is an attempt to decentralize the value of human life as the central standard of value for society.

In a world that often values profits over human life, the valuing of human life that is expressed in women's risk-taking experiences of pregnancy and childbirth, stands in stark contrast. This valuing of human life is a standard of value that inherently challenges oppressive structures, systems, and hierarchies, critiquing processes that commodify human life, and pointing to processes that respect the cycles of human and ecological life. This standard of value is an aspect of the sacredness of female embodiment and its transformative political power, that is described by Melissa Raphael, who compares biological labor and the labor of regenerating the world.<sup>272</sup> She cites Starhawk's emphasis on the sacredness of all of life.<sup>273</sup> Northrup describes the importance of expanding young women's understandings of female embodiment: "We must begin to see female birth power for what it is--the basis of all of creation."<sup>274</sup> She believes that women's recognition of their inherent worth is central to global change: "When women tap into this power, the children, the ideas, and the new world to which we give birth will be supportive of all beings, including ourselves."<sup>275</sup> These awarenesses can foster values and priorities which shape the next generation's use of time in ways that sustain and

---

<sup>271</sup> The valuing of human life and the earth and its creatures are central values that are held in harmony as well as tension. However, an exploration of global patterns of human and environmental exploitation reveals that these oppressive patterns often have the same sources (as has already been discussed). Such exploration reveals that greed, rather than simply androcentrism is at the heart of both human and environmental devastation. Any long-term exploration of human sustainability points to the interdependence of human and ecological survival and thriving. For instance, when women are educated, birth rates decrease, as does population. Shona Wynd, "Education, Schooling and Fertility in Niger," 110-16; Jayaweera, 180; Mo Sibbons, "From WID to GAD: Experiences of Education in Nepal," 194; Christine Heward, "Closing the Gender Gap? The Informal Sector in Pakistan," 215; all in Gender, Education, and Development.

<sup>272</sup> Raphael, Thealogy and Embodiment, 128-30, 1307.

<sup>273</sup> Ibid., 129, citing Starhawk, Fifth Sacred Thing (New York: Bantam Books, 1994), 18, and i.

<sup>274</sup> Northrup, 372.

<sup>275</sup> Ibid.

preserve the sacredness of human life and creation.

**The valuing of every human life regardless of difference is a core belief underlying women's leadership.** The ultimate worth and value of all living things is a central tenet of feminism, as well as women's leadership. "There are, in all feminisms, two final and related moral adjudicators: the full humanity of women and the absolute value of all living things, neither of which has, until very recently, informed mainstream liberal ethics and theology," writes Melissa Raphael.<sup>276</sup> As Helen Regan and Gwen Brooks participated for twenty years in a support group for women principals, they realized that their leadership styles were different from more male-oriented ways they had learned in school. They noted that a belief in the worth of every child regardless of differences of race, gender, etc. was a foundational priority that shaped all their actions as leaders. They described the experience of one woman, Nancy, who helped the group recognize their foundational beliefs as school principals regarding the value of every child. Nancy was leading a group whose task was to create a policy to determine criteria for placing special education children using a weighting option that would value some children more than others. Nancy's goal was to reach a decision collaboratively allowing everyone's voice to be heard, without violating her value system regarding the equal worth of every child. To accomplish this goal, she asked everyone at the table to describe their beliefs about children:

Once the beliefs were on the table, the weighting option was unacceptable to everyone, and the group was eventually able to come up with a procedure beneficial to children and acceptable to everyone: board, administration, the teachers, and the union.<sup>277</sup>

Regan and Brooks describe how Nancy's request helped the members of the task force recognize the discrepancy between their values about children and the union's weighting option:

After listening to Nancy's story, Sarah noted that the uncaring attitude toward children manifested in the union's press for a weighting option simply became untenable in the context of articulated beliefs about the value of children. ...Nancy's insistence that the members of her committee articulate their beliefs

---

<sup>276</sup> Raphael, *Theology and Embodiment*, 42.

<sup>277</sup> Regan and Brooks, 28.

about children... forced them to listen to other voices and in so doing, to hear themselves as well.<sup>278</sup>

Regan and Brooks concluded that their common commitment to respecting the worth of all people was “a common foundation in which the five attributes [of women’s leadership] are embedded.”<sup>279</sup>

Starhawk notes, “every being is sacred--meaning that each has inherent value that cannot be ranked in a hierarchy or compared to the value of another being.”<sup>280</sup> Inherent in the sacredness of every being is a just social organization and denial of permanent privilege to any one group. In the Iroquois communalistic system every person is of ultimate worth and value, contributing as they are able, and participating equally in the governance and prosperity of the nation.<sup>281</sup> Wimberly’s dimensions of Christian education highlight the human need for access to the basic survival necessities of life with human dignity and respect. This includes liberation from material needs to material sustenance and equal participation and benefits from political, occupational, educational, residential, health care, governance, and other structures that support community and national life.<sup>282</sup> These are conditions that support the worth of all persons.

**Inclusion is a value in women’s leadership that honors the ontological value and quality of every human life.** Inclusion often characterizes mothering and is often a characteristic of women’s leadership. The ability to expand one’s care and concern nonparochially to include those of mothers vastly different from oneself is a key distinguishing feature of effective leadership and peacemaking.<sup>283</sup> Regan and Brooks describe inclusion as a characteristic of the

---

<sup>278</sup> Ibid.

<sup>279</sup> Ibid., 74-75.

<sup>280</sup> Raphael, Theology and Embodiment, 67-68, citing Starhawk, The Fifth Sacred Thing (New York: Bantam, 1994), i.

<sup>281</sup> Barbara Alice Mann, Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas (New York: Peter Lang, 2000), 202-28.

<sup>282</sup> Wimberly, 22-26.

<sup>283</sup> Ruddick, 177.

leadership styles of women principals.<sup>284</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock quote Jane Caputi as she describes the leadership of her grandmother and her grandmother's elderly women friends who mentored her and were her role models growing up. She describes how they threw "a great protective net over everything," and refused to let any child be excluded.<sup>285</sup> Through affectionate words and touch, Jane Caputi recalls how these women helped each child feel uniquely special:

They would never let you be a stranger. They wouldn't allow it, even if you wanted it. They were always saying, "Come into my house. Be a part of my family." When they took your hand, the whole world seemed to glow. ...They had a magnificent force that binds us and holds us.<sup>286</sup>

This inclusion based on the worth of every child is characteristic of women's mothering and leadership, and sets a standard of value by which women evaluate systems and structures in culture. Petra Kelly, who founded the Green Party in Germany, a party based on the equality of all people, nonviolence, and social justice, describes the destructiveness of social constructions that do not value the inherent worth of people and the Earth.

We must overcome the numbing of our innate sensibilities that makes it possible for people across this world to be dominated, oppressed, exploited, and killed. The Earth is sacred unto herself, and her forests and rivers and various creatures have intrinsic value.<sup>287</sup>

In contrast, after studying the global economy for twenty years, Saskia Sassen writes that mainstream economic globalization is a "narrative of eviction" which excludes "a whole range of workers, firms, and sectors that do not fit the prevalent images of globalization."<sup>288</sup> Her book is a feminist analytic reading of global economic systems, their affects on women, and specific openings for women's presence. Toxic waste concentrated in African-, Latin-, and Native-American

---

<sup>284</sup> Regan and Brooks, 26.

<sup>285</sup> This quote is attributed to Jane Caputi by Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 296-97.

<sup>286</sup> *Ibid.*, 297.

<sup>287</sup> Petra Kelly, "Women and the Global Green Movement," Women in World Politics: An Introduction eds. D'Amico, Francine, and Peter R. Beckman (Westport, Conn.: Bergin and Garvey, 1995), 173.

<sup>288</sup> Sassen, 82.

communities in the U.S. described by Emilie M. Townes and Dave and Sharon Kitchen can also be termed narratives of eviction.<sup>289</sup> The Kitchens note that much of the waste in over one hundred sites in Native American communities is nuclear waste.<sup>290</sup>

Conflict and exclusion may be experienced ontologically by persons who experience discrimination based on embodied characteristics like gender, race, ethnicity, sexual orientation, disability, weight, or age. The U.S. did not begin its journey as a nation founded on the equal value of every person.<sup>291</sup> Mann notes that one of the little-known, but main motivations for the American Revolution was "the colonists' intention of retaining slavery against Great Britain's act outlawing the slave trade in 1772."<sup>292</sup> She adds that Iroquois leaders were "deeply aware of the colonial push to enslave all non-European peoples, with Native Americans high on the list...."<sup>293</sup> After the Revolution, the equal value of every person was left out of the U.S. Constitution when the Founding Fathers modeled it on the Iroquois Constitution.<sup>294</sup> Women, children, apprentices, Native and African Americans were considered exploitable--as slaves by John Adams and many other white males

---

<sup>289</sup> Townes, 56-57; Dave Kitchen and Sharon Kitchen, Native American radio show hosts and guest lecturers in Psychology of Cultural Diversity course, Brenau University, 1999.

<sup>290</sup> Kitchen and Kitchen; Paula Giese, "The Burial Ground Nobody Wants to Save: The Mdewakanton of Minnesota Face the Spectre of Nuclear Waste," *Akwesasne Notes New Series*, fall 1995, 33-39, (also available on-line from <http://www.ratical.org/AkwesasneNs.html>). In fact, the "second worst nuclear disaster in U.S. history" occurred on indigenous land when uranium mine tailings spilled into the Rio Puerco River in New Mexico during the 1980s, according to Reaching Critical Will, a project of Women's International League for Peace and Freedom (WILPF), "The Dirtiest Dozen Corporations--Partners in Mass Destruction," Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, WILPF (articles on-line), posted September 2001, available from <http://www.reachingcriticalwill.org>.

<sup>291</sup> Eisler notes that "when American colonists imported Blacks from Africa and looked for models of laws to govern their status as slaves, they chose the English common law governing the status of married women," which was derived from Church law and allowed a man to beat his wife "if she did not perform her services to his satisfaction, just as slave owners were permitted to beat their slaves," 210, citing Blackstone, *Commentaries on the Laws of England* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1765), and citing Riane Eisler, *Dissolution* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1977). Mann notes that Native Americans were also taken as slaves by early colonists. Mann, 41, 44-45, 196, 221.

<sup>292</sup> Mann, 44.

<sup>293</sup> Ibid.

<sup>294</sup> Ibid., 246-48, 161-67, 208-10.

during the colonial period, notes Mann, who cites John Adams' biting reply to his wife's letter asking him to "Remember the Ladies" when he and others drafted the fledgling U.S. Constitution--a letter he replied to by concluding, "Depend on it, We know better than to repeal our Masculine systems," notes Mann.<sup>295</sup> This history is a legacy which the United States is still struggling to recover from. Those persons who were not among the original privileged group, (adult white males owning property,) have historically had to struggle for acceptance and equal rights--and still struggle today.

Maria Isasi-Diaz writes that *mujerista* theology is concerned about the struggles and survival of women and their communities within systems and structures that reinforce economic, gender, and ethnic discrimination.<sup>296</sup> Threats to survival created by discrimination and structured violence directly affect people's lifespans and their quality of life, and thus their experiences of time. People who have suffered multiple losses may spend more time cherishing valued relationships, and may prioritize time so as to use their lives most effectively to improve the situation of others or the next generation, as is the case in the NFC.

Moore notes that reverent teaching is difficult within a societal context of discrimination. "When social structures stereotype and exclude persons based on these differences, they create socialization processes that make it difficult for these persons to revere themselves," she writes. Because of this, she adds, teaching involves transforming social structures as well as the cultivation of respectful interpersonal relationships.<sup>297</sup>

Inclusion also refers to the rights of persons, peoples, and nations to be self-determining. At issue is not only the cultural priorities that shape time, but who is included in the shaping of these priorities. Feminist, Civil Rights, peace, environmental, consumer, and other movements in the U.S. have helped the

---

<sup>295</sup> Ibid. 247-48, citing L.H. Butterfield, Marc Friedlaender, and Mary-Jo Kline, The Book of Abigail and John: Selected Letters of the Adams Family, 1762-1784 (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1975), 122-23. Her book includes much of the texts of two letters exchanged by John and Abigail Adams on this subject in March and April of 1776.

<sup>296</sup> Isasi-Diaz, 16-22, 27-28, 94-97, 174, 178-79, 186.

<sup>297</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 216.

people of the United States become more self-determining. As noted earlier, the self-determination of many Third World countries has historically been compromised by structural adjustment and other policies that often center around the agendas of corporations.<sup>298</sup> As a result, many children have been forced to spend their childhoods working in sweatshops and living in poverty, rather than being educated in a classroom with at least subsistence levels of sustenance waiting for them at home.<sup>299</sup>

**Children's sense of self-worth is shaped, in part, by the amount and quality of focused time that they receive from significant adults.** Because time is irreplaceable, our values are most powerfully reflected in our use of time. It is no wonder that children experience themselves as being valued and of worth when adults spend time with them. When we are fully present to others, we give our most precious irreplaceable gift--a portion of our lives, our irreplaceable time. Wimberly describes eight dimensions of liberation that African American people participating in Christian education have named. All of these dimensions, beginning with positive self-regard and self-valuing, require time and intentionality. When communities and families embody time so as to heighten the sense of human worth, people can see themselves as created and valued by God.<sup>300</sup> Brock describes the centrality of relationships to human life, which is ontologically relational:

Through the profound acknowledgment of our primal connectedness we can begin to find grace and to embrace and to heal the damage and suffering of our deepest selves and our society. Original grace is this healing gift, a reality that begins at birth... Bodies are our first and most powerful connection to both ourselves and all else. The loving touch of flesh upon flesh is the first reassurance that one is a self in a world of caring selves. ...If we begin with an understanding that we are intimately connected, constituted by our

---

<sup>298</sup> Christine Heward and Sheila Bunwaree, eds. Gender, Education and Development: Beyond Access to Empowerment (New York: Zed Books, 1999). This book provides case studies of the effects of structural adjustment in eleven countries. See also Tony Clarke and the IFG, 7-16; Lester R. Brown, et. al., State of the World 2000: A Worldwatch Institute Report, ed. Linda Starke (New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 2000), 189-94, citing "Text of Uruguay Round Ministerial Decision on Trade and Environment," 14 April 1994, provided in Natural Resources Defense Council and Foundation for International Law and Development, Environmental Priorities for the World Trading System (Washington, D.C.: 1995).

<sup>299</sup> Kahn and Bailey, 53-74.

<sup>300</sup> Wimberly, 22-26.



relationships ontologically, that is, as a basic unavoidable principle of existence... This ontological relational existence, the heart of our being, is our life source, our original grace.<sup>301</sup>

In their descriptions of mother-daughter mirroring in relationships, Janet Surrey and Judith Jordan describe how such a relational existence is shaped, resulting in an experience of self-in-relation with others, rather than a separate self.<sup>302</sup> Brock describes the importance of healthy, loving families, in communicating this original grace and thus, nurturing compassionate, ethical persons and creating sane and just societies.

The quality of care given to children is crucial to whether they grow into loving persons or destructive adults capable of monstrous acts. That care takes place in the family, which is itself shaped by its society... Family is the fundamentally necessary factor for the building of human character and for the development of all societies, including ours.<sup>303</sup>

In experiences of self-in-relation, women discover themselves in ongoing, mutual, attentive and empowering relationships with others that shape their priorities and time in ways that positively shape societies and nations.

### **Addressing Conflict Directly**

Women's menstrual cycles periodically heighten women's awareness of conflicts, increase their willingness to address conflict, and may facilitate the development of cycles of reflection and action in women. During menstruation, women may reflect on their own actions as well as their relationships with others and their culture. As regular cycles of reflection and action are internalized, they may come to structure women's intrapsychic time. The ability to address conflict directly is also enhanced by women's experiences of mothering. Through accurate feedback and discipline, mothers model and teach cycles of naming wrongs, making reparations, and forgiveness as well as cycles of reflection on consequences and

---

<sup>301</sup> Brock, 8, 21, 7.

<sup>302</sup> Janet Surrey, "The Self-in-Relation: A Theory of Women's Development;" Judith Jordan, "Empathy and Self Boundaries;" and Surrey, "The Relational Self in Women: Clinical Implications;" in Women's Growth in Connection, 54-59; 73; 36-38.

<sup>303</sup> Brock, 4.

outcomes, dialogue, and action. These cycles are central to healthy personality, relationships, leadership, healthy communities and nations, and world peace.

Such skills for addressing conflict are later incorporated into women's leadership, and include problem-solving and consensus decision-making. Rage can result from multilayered levels of structural violence that persist over time.<sup>304</sup> The ability to transform frustration and rage into intentional nonviolent social action may also be developed over time through women's mothering experiences. The ability to address conflict can be limited by time when people have to work two jobs to survive, and by fears of reprisal that could leave them in life- or health-threatening poverty and homelessness.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** The women of NFC are strongly committed to addressing conflict for as long as conflict lasts.

The NFC works for nonviolent social change. Miss Ann's involvement with youth in the Newtown community illustrates ways maternal nonviolence moves into the public sphere as children get older. There were large offensive racist signs against African and Latin Americans on the front lawn on a school bus route near the community, which community members had been trying to get removed for several years. The club talked with county commission members until the signs finally came down. Women leaders in the club were called in as mediators when Gainesville High School's celebration of Redneck Day caused racial conflicts. The club also held a town meeting attended by over one hundred people, including the sheriff, in 2001 to discuss incidents of racial profiling and to achieve a better understanding between police and African American and Latino communities.

Addressing conflict by standing up for one's community requires courage, patience, strength, and perseverance over time. Women noted that these characteristics helped them to maintain their struggle for basic human rights and humane living conditions over time.

Women of the NFC channel their pain and anger at structural violence into

---

<sup>304</sup> According to Jeanne Vickers, the concept, structural violence was first defined in 1967 by Johan Galtung, a Norwegian researcher in peace studies. Vickers, 17.

social justice action. Miss Wynona described how multilayered levels of oppression bore down on members of her community to create structural violence. The women of the NFC still have to add more names to the stone monument documenting the names of people who have died in their community of diseases like lupus, cancer, kidney failure, respiratory diseases, and heart disease. Emory medical students documented a six times higher rate of lupus than the highest perviously reported incidence, but the State of Georgia blamed the deaths on “lifestyles of drinking and smoking,” despite the fact that lupus has been proven to be unrelated to smoking or drinking.<sup>305</sup> For the women of the NFC, standing up for oneself and one’s community is a matter of survival, and an outgrowth of their deep love for community members. Many of the women have survived profound family losses and yet they use their pain as energy to create change that will benefit others in the future.

Socioeconomic factors limit peoples’ time and freedom to address conflict.

Many people in the community are unable to keep up with issues or attend town meetings to stand up for their community and address conflicts because they are working two jobs. Numerous women in the NFC also noted that many people in the black community, especially men working to support families, felt unable to stand up for issues in public for fear of losing their jobs and relegating their families to the dangers of poverty.

**The menstrual cycle includes a “moment of truth” when women are more likely to speak up and address conflict directly.**<sup>306</sup> This cyclical truth-telling time is facilitated by a more reflective internal mood during menstruation that may function to deepen self-empathy. An increased awareness of one’s own needs and frustrations, coupled with a time when internal desires are more focused on self-nurturing, may make women more likely to speak out on their own behalf during menstruation. This may help women to balance and protect the needs of the

---

<sup>305</sup> Hahn and Eberhardt, 85, 88. See also Miss Ann, interview by author, Nov. 2001, videotape, Newtown Florist Club, Gainesville, Ga.

<sup>306</sup> Shuttle and Redgrove, 58; Emily Martin, “Premenstrual Syndrome: Discipline, Work, and Anger in Late Industrial Societies,” Blood Magic: The Anthropology of Menstruation eds. Thomas Buckley and Alma Gottlieb (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), 65, 178.

self. Northrup notes that, from ovulation until the onset of menstruation, “women are more in tune with their inner knowing and what isn’t working in their lives.” She adds that “women need to believe in the importance of the issues that come up” during this time.<sup>307</sup>

**The skill of addressing conflict directly is learned through involved mothering, and is a characteristic of maternal thinking that is incorporated into women’s leadership.**<sup>308</sup> Healthy mothering involves honest appraisal of behaviors, the application of natural and logical consequences, and just righting of wrongs, notes Ruddick. She notes that as mothers care for children, they are forced to address children’s conflicts directly, prevent violence, and teach children how to face each other, apologize, and make amends.<sup>309</sup> Involved parents know that over-idealization of a child denies the child’s need for honest appraisal and results in withholding important feedback about how its behavior affects others. Without feedback and appropriate limit-setting, a child does not learn self-discipline. As children grow, they internalize parental feedback as an ebb and flow cycle of action and reflection in which actions are critiqued and refined in light of their consequences to the self and others. Time is, in part, intrapsychically structured by this cycle of reflection and action.

Mann provides an example from Iroquois history of how skills of maternal thinking are incorporated in women’s leadership in the service of peace. She tells how the Jigonsaseh, (the main Iroquois leader, a woman,) guided the Iroquois negotiations among five Native American nations to address conflict with a dysfunctional leader directly, collaboratively, and nonviolently. Rather than judge the ethically deranged Adodaroh and reject him from the community, he was powerfully confronted by the community, who showed him how out of line he was and invited him to take a position of leadership and undergo a healing process facilitated by

---

<sup>307</sup> Northrup, 101.

<sup>308</sup> Ruddick, 172-76, 180-84; William Glasser, Reality Therapy: A New Approach to Psychiatry (New York: Harper and Row, 1990), 44-45. Skills for addressing conflict directly are taught as part of the University of Florida Counselor Education Program.

<sup>309</sup> Ruddick, 172-76, 180-84.

another leader, Ayonwantha, by helping him “comb the snakes out of his hair,” or untangle his ethical derangement. The Jigonsaseh led her community to approach the situation using skills of synthesizing thinking characteristic of the Iroquois, based on the synthesis of opposites in human characteristics.<sup>310</sup>

Not only does dysfunctional leadership demand confrontation, but so also do the dysfunctional behaviors of nations that fail to critique and refine their own actions. Character-building feedback is just as important for a nation as it is for a child, yet the U.S. people have historically viewed criticism of the United States not as a passionate love for this country, but as unpatriotic, (for example, the vehement criticism of Jane Adams’ efforts to prevent World War I.)<sup>311</sup> This failure to engage in cyclical reflection and action through open public dialogue is crippling the U.S. in its international and internal relations. A mother who does not love her child does not discipline. Patriots who do not critique and work for the improvement of their country likewise do not love it. Flag-waving is meaningless without this passion; unfortunately flag-waving is more popular than doing the hard work of “untangling the hair” of U.S. leaders, policies, systems, and actions. The problem of honest dialogue is further obstructed by the corporate monopoly of U.S. media, which limits the free flow of information.<sup>312</sup>

Anger and conflict management skills are often not systematically taught in schools and must be learned through trial and error, sometimes in the midst of difficult historical circumstances of oppression. Yet anger management and conflict resolution skills are central to personal and public peacemaking and are important though neglected aspects of religious and secular education. When families, leaders, communities, and nations structure time for regular reflection and public dialogue to address conflicts and evaluate actions, they create safety valves that protect the peace.

---

<sup>310</sup> Mann, 36-38, 89-94, 112.

<sup>311</sup> Sybil Oldfield, “Jane Addams: The Chance the World Missed,” Women in World Politics: An Introduction eds. Francine D’Amico and Peter R. Beckman (Westport, Conn.: Bergin and Garvey, 1995), 161.

<sup>312</sup> Tony Clarke and the IFG, 7-16, 9.

Skills that can be used as part of these cycles of public reflection, dialogue, and action include problem-solving and consensus decision-making. The Problem-Solving Model is described in literature on women's psychology and leadership and is also taught in Counselor Education programs (see Appendix C). This model involves the following steps described in more detail in the appendix: (1) problem-posing, (2) freeform brainstorming, (3) consideration of possible consequences of each choice, (4) choosing a course of action, and (5) choosing a first step.<sup>313</sup>

**Consensus decision making has historically been a characteristic of women's leadership, organizations, and societies.** Alonso describes the use of consensus decision making as the first of three main characteristics of women's peace groups. She writes that the Woman's Peace Party, the Women's Peace Union, Women Strike for Peace and WREE all worked by consensus, "a decision making process that was intended to expand leadership, rather than to narrow it."<sup>314</sup> Consensus as a primary decision making method may have its roots in the practices of mothering and family relationships. While consensus within families, between adult partners, and between parents and children is certainly not always attained, it is often sought. Historically, the Iroquois relied on consensus decision-making. Unlike in the U.S., where dissent is often labeled trouble-making, Mann writes that dissenting was fully accepted and valued in Iroquois society. Further, dissent was to be shared with the group, rather than used as a reason for withdrawal:

Haughty withdrawal from the council arena suggested that loners set themselves up as possessing judgment superior to everyone else's. Heckewelder recorded that such dissenters were "generally looked upon as depraved beings, who not daring to associate with the others, lurk about by themselves, generally bent on mischief."<sup>315</sup>

Mann notes that isolating oneself during disagreement instead of addressing it directly through public dialogue within the community was unacceptable: "It obviated the One Mind of Good Government, threatening consensus by refusing to honor the

---

<sup>313</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 92-98. This model is taught as part of the counselor education program at the University of Florida.

<sup>314</sup> Alonso, 261.

<sup>315</sup> Mann, 209.

process of input.”<sup>316</sup> Conflict was handled with “gentle exchanges among people,”-and “Fighting is for dogs” was the watchword of the people.<sup>317</sup>

Inclusion and synthesizing skills are needed to sort through multiple and conflicting needs, perspectives, and world views, in the development of consensus. Through regular reflection and dialogue, the needs of the self and multiple others in community emerge, are mutually valued, and lay groundwork for consensus and action.

**Rage is a normal response to multilevel, interconnected forms of structural violence over time.** Rage and nonviolence are synthesized in women’s leadership; love is ultimately more powerful than violence. bell hooks describes the level of rage created by racism that coexists for many in the African American community with a vision of beloved community.<sup>318</sup> Structural violence in Newtown has already been described. Townes documents that ninety percent of the toxic waste in certain areas of the south is concentrated in African American and Latin American communities compared with European American communities.<sup>319</sup> There is “killing rage” because structured violence is killing people. In a 2000 campaign speech, Ralph Nader described structural forms of violence like policies and practices that knowingly allow dangerous levels of pollution into communities--as murder.<sup>320</sup> If structured violence is murder, denial is its accomplice. This occurred in the Holocaust when communities were hauled off to the gas chambers one by one, while others watched in silence and fear. It is happening now in the environmental racism that allows toxic and nuclear waste to be dumped into low-income communities of color. Nationally, there are over 100 nuclear waste dumps in Native American communities.<sup>321</sup>

---

<sup>316</sup> Ibid.

<sup>317</sup> Ibid., 207.

<sup>318</sup> Bell Hooks, *Killing Rage: Ending Racism* (New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1995), 27, 21-30, 363-72; King, 73, 146, 252.

<sup>319</sup> Townes, *In a Blaze of Glory*, 56-57.

<sup>320</sup> Ralph Nader, campaign speeches, 2000.

<sup>321</sup> Kitchen and Kitchen.

Kelly articulates the importance of women standing up to confront the violence against the Earth and its inhabitants:

We must explain to men in power that we are not weak, we are not meek, that we are, in fact, very angry people--angry on our own behalf because of the large and small war waged against us every day, and angry on behalf of the entire planet Earth.<sup>322</sup>

Baker Miller and Surrey describe psychotherapy practiced from a global perspective in which connections between personal pain and global crises are revealed "to empower individuals to act with awareness of the larger world, 'to act locally and think globally.'"<sup>323</sup> They understand anger as a "resource for personal and global change."<sup>324</sup> In this way, anger can be seen as love in action, rectifying, healing, and transforming.

**The freedom to address conflict in personal and public relationships can be limited or facilitated by time, financial independence, and survival needs.** Historically, women in the U.S. have recognized connections between economic independence and the ability to leave abusive marriages or relationships. Freedom to stand up for themselves is connected to the ability to support themselves and any children. Mann notes the failure of our founding fathers to adopt the Iroquois communalistic economic system, (which is distinctive and different from both communism and capitalism,) in which everybody's basic survival needs are guaranteed through communal cooperation, when they modeled the U.S. government and Constitution after the Iroquois Constitution of Great Law of Peace. She notes that the Iroquois concepts, which were adapted by U.S. founding fathers to form the Bill of Rights, are not supportable or compatible with the economic system of capitalism, (which has now evolved into monopoly corporate capitalism.)<sup>325</sup> (Nor is it compatible with communism.) Thus, freedom of speech is affected by discretionary time and financial independence.

---

<sup>322</sup> Kelly, in Women in World Politics, 173.

<sup>323</sup> Jean Baker Miller and Janet Surrey, "Rethinking Women's Anger: The Personal and the Global," Women's Growth in Diversity, 210.

<sup>324</sup> Ibid.

<sup>325</sup> Mann, 204-19, 162-64; Grossman and Adams.



### **Remembering the Future: Making a Way Out of No Way**<sup>326</sup>

The metaphor and reality of birth creates a crisis in women's experience that ruptures conventional understandings of what is possible. The possibility of childbirth highlights conceptual understandings of time that may be heightened through women's embodied experiences: (1) through participation in processes in which each phase creates the possibility for the next phase, what seems impossible can become possible, (2) the process of remembering the future of a child and anticipating its needs makes demands on the present, (3) it is possible to make a way out of no way in order to meet needs or overcome obstacles that at times seem insurmountable. Through these understandings of time and possibilities, women parent under difficult conditions, uphold entire communities, develop into persons they never dreamed they could be, persevere under conditions of structural violence, and work against incredible odds for world peace.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** The women in the NFC have been working for social justice and transformation for over fifty years and have persevered in particular efforts for a decade or more. Women's leadership in the NFC rests upon a deep spirituality that sustains perseverance over time for the sake of the next generation and its future. Members of the NFC consistently attempt to accomplish goals that might seem impossible to others. The NFC went to city commission meetings and city offices numerous times to get the name of the street that lines their community changed from Myrtle Street to Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd., a task which many thought would be impossible. In 2001, the NFC held a street dedication ceremony for their newly renamed street, Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. Miss Ann recalls how her mentor's admonition not to give up sustains her

---

<sup>326</sup> "Remembering the future," is a phrase from Marjorie Suchocki's, Claremont School of Theology chapel speech, Claremont, Calif., fall 1995. "Making a way out of no way" is an African American expression described by Christine Wiley, "Faith Journey: How Black Women See God, Womanist Theology in Action," Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom (winter 1995): 13, (available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net)), citing Alice Walker, In Search of Our Mother's Gardens: Womanist Prose (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1983), xi. The title is presented in this order because of sequencing: the advent of children first prompts us to remember their future needs, which can inspire us to make a way out of no way to meet those needs.

today. The past is inspiring the present for the sake of the future.

**Imagining and believing in the impossible is embodied in women.**

Women's belief in the impossible is often grounded in their experience of childbirth, which seems impossible. Women jokingly wonder how a baby can fit through what appears to be a rather small opening in their bodies, and marvel at the miracle of birth. No small amount of anxiety attends some women regarding childbirth, and Myra Leifer notes that a woman's fears for her own and her baby's safety are normal during pregnancy.<sup>327</sup>

In 1995, thirty-three Pakistani Christian women were interviewed regarding their perspectives and experiences of Pakistani life and culture. Several women stated that they thought of God's mysterious ways during pregnancy. Two women stated that they realized that God is a God of the impossible during pregnancy and childbirth. Two women said that, in childbirth, they could see the power of God to do the impossible.<sup>328</sup>

**Children often cause women to remember the future.** This awareness of children's future needs places demands on women's experiences of the present and can mean recognizing that what seems impossible must become possible. Women's passion for the well-being of their children, families, and communities empowers them along with their faith in God to make a way when no way seems to exist. "Making a way out of no way" is an African American women's understanding for finding creative ways of coping with racial, gender, and class oppression, articulated by Alice Walker, notes counselor Christine Wiley.<sup>329</sup> In mothering, the present is constantly informed and corrected by the demands, possibilities, and anticipated needs of the future.

Ruddick notes that mothers often retain a cheerful optimism about the future

---

<sup>327</sup> Leifer, 45-50.

<sup>328</sup> Susan M. Perz, in collaboration with Khushnud Azariah, the Women's Development Programme of Pakistan, Gabriele Mayer, and Mary Elizabeth Moore, "Women's Interview Responses Regarding the Situation of Women in Pakistan," *Al-Mushir*, (The Counselor) (Pakistan) 42, no. 4, (fall, 2000): 127-46.

<sup>329</sup> Walker, xi; quoted in Wiley.

even as they face significant challenges and lack of support in the social structure.<sup>330</sup> Belenky, McClinchy, Goldberger, and Tarule describe how women raised in isolated and demeaning circumstances challenge their self-understandings as persons who are “deaf and dumb” and incapable of possessing knowledge, for the sake of the present and future needs of their children when they become mothers. Women in this stage labeled “silence” were moved by the responsibilities of parenting to challenge these assumptions and ask for help in learning how to better care for their newborns. The impossibility of possessing knowledge became possible to these mothers for the sake of their children, whose undifferentiated needs and cries had to be discerned and responded to after birth. With little or no ability to conceptualize the self, or the future, women were moved into the next stage of development and forced to consider the future by the experience of having a child.<sup>331</sup> Bonds with others sustained through empathic connections are important links that inspire us to reconceptualize and recreate our worlds.

Matthew Fox notes that Cornel West’s definition of depravity is refusal to change.<sup>332</sup> The ability to imagine a better future is empowering to people and threatens systems and structures of oppression. Fox cites liberation theologian James Cone’s criticism of religious understandings primarily focused on heaven:

black theologian James Cone points out how a futuristic eschatology instead of a realized eschatology played into the hands of slavemasters who wanted their slaves to look forward to a liberated existence only in the life after this one.<sup>333</sup>

Native American values (such as considering the consequences of our actions for seven generations) challenge us to remember the future and to make a way out of no way to create the kinds of future that all of our children need and deserve. Dean Marjorie Suchocki urged new students to “remember the future,” particularly

---

<sup>330</sup> Ruddick, 74-75, 79, 98-99.

<sup>331</sup> Belenky, McClinchy, Goldberger, and Tarule, 35-36, 23-25.

<sup>332</sup> Matthew Fox, Original Blessing: A Primer in Creation Spirituality (Santa Fe: Bear and Company, 1983), 274, citing Cornel West, Prophesy Deliverance!: An Afro-American Revolutionary Christianity (Philadelphia: 1982), 17, 16.

<sup>333</sup> James H. Cone, Black Theology and Black Power (New York: 1969), 101; quoted in Fox, 274.

when academics are rigorous and times are difficult.<sup>334</sup> Remembering the future can not only apply to students' own futures, but to the difference they hope to make in the world for others through their vocation.

**Remembering the future can inspire women leaders to make a way out of no way for world peace.** In the Fourth World Congress on Women, the NGO Forum speaker Charlotte Bunch commented on women's amazing resources and leadership within families and communities. She emphasized the importance of women entering global policy debates and influencing the directions of global policy, stating that this was no different from the work women do throughout their lives because of women's leadership in local communities. She stated:

Women have been the leaders who have held families and communities together in times of crises, who have managed on budgets that were unmanageable to raise children, who have managed to keep people together in the midst of war and conflict.<sup>335</sup>

She noted that "women's voices and women themselves" disappear in the progression from community to national and international policy making. Women's leadership, she believes, needs to move from community to national and international levels:

And it is precisely that kind of movement that we have begun in the last decade, to demand women's place at the table of global policy making as well as at the table in the kitchen.<sup>336</sup>

Because of women's close connections with children, families, and communities, they may be more able to keep their future in mind when making national and international policy decisions. Because women often value relationships, and often have strongly bonded relationships with children, women may be less willing to compromise childrens' futures so that a few can get rich.

In her study of African American women's literature and history as leaders, Sharon Welch found that the ability to embark on a social justice struggle with no guarantee of the outcome was an important ethical characteristic and one that was particularly instructive to middle- and upper-economic status European Americans

---

<sup>334</sup> Suchocki speech.

<sup>335</sup> Look at the World Through Women's Eyes.

<sup>336</sup> Ibid.

who are used to committing themselves to activities that guarantee some positive return or outcome.<sup>337</sup> She notes that when people consider the achievement of sustainable peace, justice, and harmony impossible, it creates apathy that discourages people from acting. She adds that apathy and discouragement do not ethically exonerate us from responsibility.<sup>338</sup> Theologian McFague, physicist and nuclear expert Bertell, educator Harris, political party founder Kelly, and others remind us that an economically just and sustainable world peace is the only real source of security for future generations.<sup>339</sup> Policies such as the Iroquois mandate that requires that three viable peace initiatives must be made before war can be initiated might help national and world leaders to remember the future of their nations' succeeding generations.<sup>340</sup>

Holding in mind the future and allowing the future needs and demands of healthy children, nations, and the Earth to shape decisions and priorities made in the present, is a spiritual and ethical discipline with the potential to heal the planet.

---

<sup>337</sup> Welch, 43-47, 96-99, 106-11.

<sup>338</sup> Ibid., 15.

<sup>339</sup> McFague, 1-8; Rosalie Bertell, No Immediate Danger: Prognosis for a Radioactive Earth (Summertown, Tn.: Book Publishing, 1985), 310-17, 1-12, 246-48; Harris, Teaching and Religious Imagination, 77, 84-96; Kelly, in Women in World Politics, 169-71, 173.

<sup>340</sup> Mann, 180.

## **CHAPTER 3**

### **Embodied Relationships**

“Embodied Relationships” is the second of three chapters describing themes that are generative for peacemaking, emerging from a critical synthesis of research on women’s embodied psychology, theology, leadership, and peacemaking. This chapter focuses on characteristics of women’s embodied knowing that uniquely shape women’s relationships. In particular, they can heighten a woman’s awareness of feelings and intuition; experiences of empathy; awareness of the Divine; sensitivity to the needs of self and others, thus enhancing mutuality; experiences of connection with others and shared body in pregnancy and breastfeeding; and awareness of the need for synthetic thinking. Each section summarizes themes that are generative for leadership and peacemaking, and begins by offering related insights from the NFC interview study. Implications for systemic and structural change are also discussed with an emphasis on current historical contexts.

To uncover the drama and intricacy of embodied relationships, I will begin with a personal story, then proceed to the literature. In 1986, while attending a seminary that was experiencing great controversy over women’s ordination and oppressive understandings of women, I had the following mystical experience:

The most significant experience of my life began shortly after my maternal grandmother died, with a spiritual dream. I dreamed I was holding a cocoon. Inside was a butterfly struggling to get out. I agonized with it as it struggled to be free. Then, suddenly I realized that it was OK for it to struggle and relaxed. I looked up and there stood my father in the courtyard and he said, “It’ll never work.” I looked at him and thought to myself, “You’ll see.” My response had no bitterness in it—a response of complete inner peace. Then I looked down and there emerged the most beautiful butterfly I’d ever seen! It was turquoise with green and purple, and it was radiant. I looked up at my dad and I said, “Do you see now?” again with only joy and peace. Then the butterfly flew away.

(Growing up, I often did creative projects with my dad’s good-humored, but sometimes skeptical help. He’d patiently help me through a whole project and then he’d say, shaking his head, “It’ll never work.” I knew though, that it probably would work—and I was usually right. I learned to persevere despite good-humored skepticism.)

About three months later, I was doing a Clinical Pastoral Education (C.P.E.) unit, working on developing my ministerial identity, and trying to decide whether to become ordained. I was part of a group of student ministers that

met weekly. My parents had been visiting me, and despite my career achievements, my father had been critical of my failure to marry and have children. That morning, I said goodbye to my parents and went to my C.P.E. group. During our meeting, spontaneously, the group members began affirming me--every one in the circle, except for one man who said something critical to me with a sarcastic smile. (Later, I realized that this was something that my father also sometimes did, despite the fact that he was overall a good man.) The group members one by one confronted him. I was stunned. I realized in a new way my worth, and the importance of not allowing anyone to discount me.

After the meeting, I realized I had begun my menstrual cycle and was completely unprepared. As I drove home, I felt this sweet feeling pulling me toward a special place I often went to be peaceful and write poetry. I felt God was pulling me there. When I drove into the parking lot, I thought "What is this about, God, why I am here?" Before I had even closed the door, I saw a butterfly sitting in the grass. I was stunned. I approached it slowly. It was dead, but perfectly whole with turquoise on its wings. I knelt down to pick it up and as I did I said inside myself to God... "You... this is from You..." And as I said it, the physical world disappeared and was replaced first by this awesome sense of God's tenderness and personal, sweet, loving kindness in speaking to me through this precious symbol. I don't remember standing up. Then I was flooded with the sense of an awesome, powerful, radiant Holy Presence whose pulsating heartbeat was growing stronger inside me. I became afraid and it went suddenly away. I spent the next 45 minutes walking around asking it come back, but of course, having no control whatsoever over God, it did not. It was a deeply sweet, personal, lovingly kind, awesomely powerful, thunderously silent, pulsating Energy, like the heartbeat of the universe.

I was left standing with the butterfly perched on my finger exactly as it had been in my spiritual dream--ready to fly. I was awed and overwhelmed at the awesomeness of such a gift of Holy Presence.

I realized later that the butterfly was also a symbol of my mother. Within a year, this mystical experience sustained me through the unexpected illness and deaths of my father and brother. I felt that God was saying that to be me and to be female, was and is very good. The Holy was present to me on the first day of my menstrual cycle at a time when I felt the least presentable. I realized then that I am more spiritually sensitive and open to God at that time. I realized that God had blessed all of who I am as a woman--and I made the decision to become ordained. Later, I realized that this experience was meant to be shared as a blessing of every woman's femaleness, created in the image of the Divine.

With this story of embodied relationships in the background, I turn now to the literature on women's embodied relationships, beginning with the phenomenon of heightened awareness of feelings and intuition.

## **Awareness of Feelings and Intuition**

Awareness of feelings, intuition, and spirituality are shaped by many factors, including embodiment, family, life experiences, socialization, culture, and structural violence in society. There are four main themes in the literature relating to women's awareness of feelings:

- \* Awareness of feelings is a skill that has specific components related to the development of self-empathy and empathy toward others.
- \* Female embodiment enhances women's awareness of feelings through differences in women's brain structures, and through women's experiences of cycles like pregnancy, breastfeeding, and most notably, menstruation/ovulation.
- \* Women's embodied experiences and awareness of feelings shape and enhance intuition.
- \* A comprehensive awareness of feelings enhances women's leadership capabilities.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** Women in the NFC have always relied on each other for emotional support and friendship. Recognizing feelings through attentive listening is a central skill for family, friendship, community life, and leadership. Sharing feelings and experiences creates the empathy that motivates the development of leadership. Feelings often highlight unmet needs, and an awareness of feelings contributes to the ability to accurately assess and synthesize multiple and conflicting needs, contexts, and actions within a community toward common social justice goals. Many NFC women described the importance of mutual dialogue in assessing community needs, addressing conflicts, comprehending complex social forces in their context, and acting effectively. The ability to articulate feelings, thoughts, and intuitions rather than deny them has been central to their ability to recognize possible dangers in their environment.

**Skills related to awareness of feelings.** Awareness of and accessibility to one's own feelings and the feelings of others involves personal relating skills with affective, cognitive, intuitive, and spiritual dimensions. These abilities function as essential components of decision making, and important aspects of healthy psychological well-being, emotionally intimate personal relationships, integrity and



ethical accountability, effective public leadership, and peacemaking. (See Appendix B.)

Feelings are invaluable in identifying one's own needs, and recognizing those of others. Deeper feelings, needs, and desires must be distinguished from surface feelings and from responses stemming from addictions, neglect, abuse, or illness. A sustained awareness of feelings creates a foundation for accurate identification of healthy needs, appropriate empathic responses, resistance to oppression, and integritous actions that are central to effective caring. Jordan questions the Western individualistic psychological ideal "that one can be aware of and true to one's values, desires, motives, feelings, and thoughts as if in a vacuum." Her research points to the importance of mutual listening relationships in which women hear and recognize their own feelings, thoughts, beliefs, and dreams through mirroring.<sup>1</sup> Healthy mutual relationships built on good listening and empathic skills help people become more aware of their feelings and to know and understand themselves and others better. Anne Wilson Schaef notes that repression of feelings is a characteristic of alcoholic and other forms of dysfunctional family systems.<sup>2</sup>

**Enhancement of women's awareness of feelings through socialization and embodied knowing.** Female embodiment, as well as western women's socialization, appear to play important roles in women's ability to be aware of their feelings. Women may have an enhanced physiological ability to experience/feel their own feelings because of brain structure. Northrup cites medical research describing physiological differences between women and men which show that most women have a more well-developed, thicker corpus callosum connecting right and left hemispheres of the brain, allowing information and complex processing to flow between hemispheres more readily. She notes that because women use both hemispheres of the brain in communicating, and because the right brain has more connections to the body, women have heightened access to body wisdom,

---

<sup>1</sup> Judith Jordan, "Clarity in Connection: Empathic Knowing, Desire, and Sexuality," *Women's Growth in Diversity*, 50.

<sup>2</sup> Ann Wilson Schaef, *When Society Becomes an Addict* (San Francisco: Harper and Row Publishers, 1987), 88-90.

creating “a busier and wider interchange of information in the female brain.”<sup>3</sup> These physiological characteristics are enhanced by cultural influences that encourage women to be more aware of and expressive of feelings, more intuitive, and caring, which in turn can influence evolution. Myers describes how repeated patterns of thinking create pathways in the brain that over time can begin to function like “grooves” that make certain ways of thinking and responding more second-nature than others.<sup>4</sup>

Female embodiment and its cycles function to draw women into deeper experiences and more nuanced awareness of their feelings. Women’s cycles tend to draw women into a deeper awareness of their feelings in general through heightened awarenesses of different feelings and experiences throughout their monthly cycles. Repetition of these cycles over decades, may then help women be aware of a wide variety of feelings, able to make fine distinctions between feelings, and more likely to address conflicts during menstruation, so that denial may, at times, be difficult. Leifer noted in her study of seventeen pregnant women that pregnancy is a crisis during which women were going through complex mental and emotional changes in preparation for the birth of their child, with heightened fears for the baby’s and their own health and safety, joy, anticipation and fears of motherhood, etc.<sup>5</sup>

Significant contrasts exist between the feelingful awareness evoked of women by their bodies, (and required of women by their children,)--and the denial of feelings that the military is predicated upon, writes Ruddick. She points out the military relies on abstractions like “the enemy” to divert soldiers and the public from the concrete humanity of people on the opposite side of armed conflicts. Military language focuses on weapons designed to destroy other weapons systems, with

---

<sup>3</sup> Northrup, 32-3, citing Stephanie Field et. al., Science News 127 no. 301; and citing Anne Moir and David Jessel, Brain Sex (New York: Carol Publishing, 1991), 32.

<sup>4</sup> Linda James Myers, “The Deep Structure of Culture: Relevance of Traditional African Culture in Contemporary Life,” Journal of Black Studies 18, no. 1 (Sept. 1987): 72-85.

<sup>5</sup> Leifer, 42-60.

civilians killed described as collateral damage.<sup>6</sup> Ruddick's work points to the ethical information provided by feelings and the dangers inherent in their denial. Feelings tell us when something is horribly wrong, or wonderfully right. Audre Lorde notes the spiritual connection between the energy of the erotic and awareness of feelings.<sup>7</sup> As the energy of God, the erotic allow us to hear God's wisdom through awareness of feelings.

**Throughout the menstrual cycle, intuition works differently; menopause changes intuition again, notes Northrup.<sup>8</sup>** Reeves also discusses women's unique intuitive capabilities (for instance, experiences such as knowing, before answering, who is on the line when the phone rings):

None of us is a closed system. The heart is an "energetic communicator," as is every other part of the bodymind... When we experience such [intuitive] knowing, we often also experience a sense of bafflement, because this sort of event comes unbidden and evades scientific inquiry or physical explanations.<sup>9</sup>

She notes that such experiences introduce "a parallel reality that is somehow more real than the one we once held sacrosanct. Insights and intuitions flash quietly in and out, respiration slows, heart rhythms smooth out, health is improved, and life decisions are made based upon the influence of these events."<sup>10</sup> The body's natural rhythms appear to be "a complex organizing principle whose innate intelligence is both local (cellular) and nonlocal (intuitive)," writes Reeves.<sup>11</sup>

Northrup also points out that birth control can interfere with intuitive functioning, an observation also noted by her colleague, an osteopathic physician who referred a patient to her to change her method of birth control after she'd been on the pill for a number of years. Dr. Northrup describes her colleague's assessment:

he felt that continued use of the pill was interfering with her ability to know what

---

<sup>6</sup> Ruddick, 146, citing Carol Cohn, "Sex and Death in the Rational World of Defense Intellectuals," *Signs* 12, no. 4, 687-718, (691, 711, and passim.)

<sup>7</sup> Audre Lorde, 56.

<sup>8</sup> Northrup, 100-03, 460-61.

<sup>9</sup> Reeves, 28.

<sup>10</sup> Ibid.

<sup>11</sup> Ibid.

her next steps in life should be. The referral note to me read: "Birth control pills are interfering with intuitive function. Suggest alternatives." I applaud this doctor for his insight.<sup>12</sup>

Melissa Raphael notes that through the menstrual cycle, "the sacral body generates its energy for psychological and political change," energy which springs from "the speaking, oracular womb."<sup>13</sup> She adds,

As a contemporary reconstruction of female insight heightened by the phases of the menstrual cycle, the contemporary oracle represents a female capacity to give solicited, authoritative judgments--or simply a direct self-awareness--unavailable to normal rational thought.<sup>14</sup>

She notes that when women's menstrual insights critique the "established order," they resemble the "unsolicited tirades against injustice of the Jewish prophets of the eighth century B.C.E."<sup>15</sup> Judy Grahn's experience of intense menstrual pain is followed by deep insights, observes Raphael, in "an internalized journey to consult an oracle who is herself."<sup>16</sup> Women's intuitive experiences help them to access holistic ways of knowing that can contribute to women's wisdom and enhance women's leadership.

### **Awareness of feelings enhances women's leadership abilities.**

Mutual reciprocal caretaking of feelings between mothers and daughters, described in self-in-relation theory, later translates to other relationships.<sup>17</sup> This ability to mutually mirror feelings, empathize, nurture, and empower each other is later translated into adult relationships and becomes the foundation for women's leadership. Hurty identifies five dimensions of "coactive [or mutual] empowerment."<sup>18</sup> One is "emotional energy," which she describes as "feeling with" the other, doing the "emotion work required in interpersonal relationships and

---

<sup>12</sup> Northrup, 108.

<sup>13</sup> Raphael, Theology and Embodiment, 198-99.

<sup>14</sup> Ibid.

<sup>15</sup> Ibid.

<sup>16</sup> Ibid., 201, citing Judy Grahn, Blood, Bread and Roses: How Menstruation Created the World (Boston: Beacon Press, 1993), 42.

<sup>17</sup> Surrey, "The Self-in-Relation," Women's Growth In Connection, 54-57.

<sup>18</sup> Hurty, 180.

engaging others in productive emotional labor.” She understands emotions as energy, “a power source that can be employed both personally and interpersonally.”<sup>19</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock note the importance of integrating thinking and feeling in leadership.<sup>20</sup>

Regan and Brooks also name intuition as one of the five characteristics of women’s leadership. They define intuition as “the ability to give equal weight to experience and abstraction, mind and heart... a natural mental ability, strongly associated with experience...”<sup>21</sup> Intuition is relational and functions to integrate thought and feelings, conscious and unconscious information. As women build on their experiences, they place greater trust in their intuition.<sup>22</sup>

These factors may help women experience their emotions consciously, utilize them intentionally in their decision-making, value the information they provide, and feel their emotions intensely. Women may be less likely to deny the value and the pleasures of the relational connections they experience with others, themselves, nature, and the Divine, even as they acknowledge the pains, frustrations, and disappointments that are part of these relationships. Feelingful awareness of concerns for others may make it more likely that a woman will visualize the possible positive and negative consequences of behaviors and situations for themselves and others, anticipate them, and intercede preemptively. This process involves at least four crucial steps: (1) acknowledging the existence of others in one’s world: family, community, the Divine, the earth environment, hemisphere, etc. (2) valuing them, their contributions, and their innate worth and fulfillment, (3) valuing connectedness to these others through feelings, thoughts, and presence, (4) feelingfully and thoughtfully visualizing the consequences of actions in relation to others and the self, (5) adjusting decisions or aspects of decisions accordingly. These are skills that can be taught and enhanced through education as early as K-12 schools.

---

<sup>19</sup> Ibid.

<sup>20</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 19-20, 22, 53.

<sup>21</sup> Regan and Brooks, 33-34.

<sup>22</sup> Northrup, 100-3; Shuttle and Redgrove, 141-47; Reeves, 25-31; Susan M. Perz, clinical counseling experiences as a long-term therapist, corporate employee assistance counselor, and high school guidance counselor totaling over ten years.

## **Empathy**

An awareness of feelings naturally leads to experiences of identifying with the feelings and situations of others. Judith V. Jordan cites Schafer's definition of empathy as "the inner experience of sharing in and comprehending the momentary psychological state of another person."<sup>23</sup> Jordan notes that empathy is a complex process that requires "a high level of psychological development and ego strength," a "well-differentiated sense of self" and "an appreciation of and sensitivity to the differentness as well as the sameness of another person."<sup>24</sup> Empathy toward the self and others is embodied in women's cycles of desires and may serve as one source of women's ethic of care. Through embodied experiences women are often moved to global concerns for others and the Earth. Empathy in mother-child relationships shapes self-worth and creates mutual caretaking of the relationship, which empower both and ultimately develops into an experience of the self-in-relation. Thus, empathy toward the self and others is an important aspect of human love and morality.

Empathy, an ever-present aspect of women's experiences, is central to women's leadership, which can be enhanced through expanded understandings of Jordan's conceptualization of contextual empathy. Finally, balancing the needs of the self and others can be incorporated into the systems and structures of culture.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** The NFC was founded out of empathy for ill community members and a desire to help others. Empathic responsiveness to community needs has historically led to the creation of government sponsored social services and nonprofit organizations. Miss Linda's experience describes ways in which nonprofits have sprung up in the U.S. to replace work that women once did as matter-of-course, volunteer work, as they responded empathically to the needs in their communities. Miss Linda was "meals

---

<sup>23</sup> Judith V. Jordan, "Empathy and the Mother-Daughter Relationship" in Women's Growth in Connection, 29, citing R. Schafer, "Generative Empathy in the Treatment Situation," Psychoanalytic Quarterly, 28 no. 3 (1959): 342-73.

<sup>24</sup> Ibid.

on wheels” for her community decades before the nonprofit organization ever existed. It is no coincidence that Miss Linda was eventually hired to be a social worker in her community and paid to do much of what she had been doing for years as a volunteer.

Racism is marked by limited crosscultural empathy. Many people who have lived in Gainesville for years, are unaware of the negative environmental and health effects being experienced by people of color in Newtown despite the fact that numerous newspaper articles have described the problem over the years. Even more surprising, many people react to this information by saying they have never heard of Newtown.

Expanded understandings of contextual empathy can lead to greater understanding of structural, historical, multicultural, and environmental contexts. Miss Ann provides an example of how an absence of contextual empathy can miss a person’s concerns. A few years ago, a tornado went through the North side of Gainesville and damaged part of an empty school building. No one was killed. Miss Ann mentioned her fears about a tornado hitting their part of town. An educator, counselor, or leader living in a different area of town, focusing on the immediate situational context of the conversation, might have dismissed her concerns. In so doing, crucial information about the health and safety of the community would be missed. A larger historical context of the conversation would reveal, however, that Newtown was created after a tornado came through Gainesville in 1936 and devastated the black community. An understanding of environmental and geographic contexts would also reveal that there is only one exit route from the community. A large industrial complex nearby stores large amounts of the chemical hexane, which leaked into the area once, and may have contributed to five deaths over the next two years. Another company overlooks the community’s playground, and a junkyard lines the community. If a tornado hit one of the industries, large amounts of chemicals could be released into the community. Further, the concentration of Gainesville industries in communities of color is an aspect of the community’s structural and multicultural contexts that has left a legacy of suspicion

toward government agencies. Awareness of historical, environmental, structural/systemic, and multicultural contexts provides a richer empathic understanding and a bigger picture of the complexity and highly problematic nature of the community's situation, as well as crucial information for collaborative leadership.

**Empathy is embodied in women in physiological responses that connect women with themselves, others, the earth, and the Divine.** This connection is found in scripture which describes feminine images of God who comforts as a breastfeeding mother.<sup>25</sup> Noris Binet's poem makes similar connections between the emotional and physiological nurture that occurs in breastfeeding (see Appendix D.) During the twelfth century, Jesus was described as a breastfeeding mother reviving and instructing the soul at his breast by Anselm of Canterbury, Bernard of Clairvaux, and Aelred of Rievaulx, notes Caroline Walker Bynum.<sup>26</sup> Gueric abbot of Igny explicitly associated the heart and womb of God which he described in terms of fertility, security, and union with God, notes Bynum.<sup>27</sup> Adam, abbot of Perseigne described Christians as drinking Christ, the milk, at the Virgin Mother's breasts, notes Bynum.<sup>28</sup> These images from the Middle Ages emphasize the empathic nurturance, affection, and wise instruction of Jesus, God as

---

<sup>25</sup> Isaiah 66:11-12; Psalm 22:9-10; John 15:9; in Ryrie, 1006, 739-40, 1480.

<sup>26</sup> Carolyn Walker Bynum, Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High middle Ages (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1982), 113, citing the following regarding Anselm: Helinand, sermons 6 and 14, PL 212: cols. 531D and 591-94; Meditative Orations, chap. 8, PL 180: col. 230C; trans. Sister Penelope, The Works of William of St. Thierry 1: On Contemplating God..., Cistercian Fathers Series 3 (Spencer, Mass., 1971): 141; Correspondence, letter 4, 30. See also Bynum, 115, citing the following regarding Bernard: Bernard, letter 146, PL 182: col. 303B-C; Bernard, sermon 29 on the Song of Songs, par. 6, OB 1:207. See Bynum, 124, citing the following regarding Aelred: De Jesu puero duodenni, sect. 3, par. 31, in Aelrod, Opera omnia, 1, ed. A. Hoste and C. H. Talbot, CCCM 1 (Turnhout, 1971): 277-78 (cf. *ibid.*, par. 30, 1:276); De institutione inclusarum, chap. 26, Opera omnia 1:658, and chap. 31, 1:668-71; Speculum caritatis, bk. 2, chap. 12, Opera omnia 1:79-80.

<sup>27</sup> Bynum, 121, citing the following: Second sermon for the Annunciation, chap. 4, Sermons 2:140: "Haec est ad uterum cordis via spiritus concipiendi"; see also second and third sermons for the Annunciation, 126-62 *passim*. See also Bynum, 122, citing Second Sermon for Lent, Sermons 2:26-36.

<sup>28</sup> Bynum, 124, citing Correspondence, letter 35, 305-07, and PL 211: cols. 602-03; letter 45, 443, and PL 211: col. 624; letter 48, 471-74 and 477, and PL 211: cols. 635-36 and 638; letter 53, 541-43 and 545-46, and PL 211: cols. 604-05 and 607; letter 54, 553-55; also letter 64, 629-30, and PL 211: col. 651.



Mother and Father, and the Virgin Mary as mediator of Christ. Empathy is an important aspect of Divine love.

Both self-empathy and other-directed empathy are embodied in Women's cycles.<sup>29</sup> Northrup observes that women are "outgoing and upbeat" before ovulation, "very receptive to others" during ovulation; premenstrually, women are "more inward and reflective."<sup>30</sup> A constructive synthesis of research further suggests that before and during menstruation, women feel more empathy for themselves, and are more focused on their own needs for self-nurture; before ovulation, women are more outwardly focused on the needs of others and are more like to be empathically focused outward, with a particular receptivity toward others during ovulation. These observations are made not as biologically-determined realities, but as poles of emphasis between which women's desires usually cycle.

These movements of empathy between self and others may influence women's development of the ethic of care (in which women seek to balance the needs of self and others in moral decision-making,) described by Carol Gilligan.<sup>31</sup>

**Embodied experiences of empathy can and often do move women to global concerns for others and the Earth.** Northrup notes that, premenstrually, "many women feel more inward and more connected to their personal pain and the pain of the world."<sup>32</sup> Women sometimes experience their breastmilk letting down in response to the cries of someone else's baby, a physiological response that knows no parochial boundaries. Mary June Nestler describes ways in which women's embodied experiences can form metaphors for our ethical actions as Christians and for God's love for us:

Isn't part of this being a new creation, a postpartum Christian who is given and who has given birth, about having a body that responds viscerally, deeply, immediately, and generously to the hunger of the world, a hunger of

---

<sup>29</sup> Constructive synthesis of Shuttle and Redgrove, 74-76, 62, 56-58, 48, 32, 29-30; Weideger, 119-29; and Northrup, 97-104, citing Benedek and Rubenstein.

<sup>30</sup> Northrup, 102, citing Benedek and Rubenstein.

<sup>31</sup> Gilligan, 69-74, 126-27, 147-50, 164-74.

<sup>32</sup> Northrup, 103.

body and spirit so often created by violence?<sup>33</sup>

She suggests that we are called to be “people for whom there is no situation where God’s redeeming hands cannot reach... No place where the bosom of God cannot nurse and nurture and cause to grow...”<sup>34</sup> Kendrick notes that a woman in her group described her empathic bonding to a nursing mother killed in the Middle-East conflict after Saddam Hussein sprayed his own people with poison gas: “When I saw the woman with the nursing baby I thought, ‘There’s a woman just like me.’”<sup>35</sup> Kendrick argues that women’s nursing affects their “ways of being in the world”:

The non-competitive nurturing relationship of breast-feeding significantly impacts women’s concerns for the well being of others beyond themselves. These concerns are frequently expressed in realms such as ecology, social justice, and peacemaking.<sup>36</sup>

Kendrick notes that women’s experiences of empathy in nursing can serve as a metaphor for God’s love as in the earlier cited reference to God as a nursing mother, and can invite women to participate in God’s empathy for all people.<sup>37</sup>

Translating empathic connections into nonparochial political commitments is not inevitable. Ruddick writes that many mothers do not grasp the connections between what is good for their own children and what is good for other children. Even so, she notes that many mothers discover similar “passions and responsibilities” in other mothers, which widens their vision.<sup>38</sup>

**For women with the physiological potential to become pregnant, empathy is an ever-present aspect of experience.** As noted earlier, Brock describes relationality as an ontological aspect of human experience.<sup>39</sup> Phyllis Tribble writes that, in Hebrew, the word for a woman’s womb and the word for compassion are cognates.

---

<sup>33</sup> Mary June Nestler, “Birth of Compassion,” School of Theology at Claremont Occasional Paper, April 1995, 3.

<sup>34</sup> Ibid., 3.

<sup>35</sup> Kendrick, 192.

<sup>36</sup> Ibid., 197.

<sup>37</sup> Ibid., 193, 195-203.

<sup>38</sup> Ruddick, 231-33, 177.

<sup>39</sup> Brock, 7.

In its singular form the noun *rehem* means "womb" or "uterus." In the plural, *rahamim*, this concrete meaning expands to the abstractions of compassion, mercy, and love... Accordingly, our metaphor lies in the semantic movement from a physical organ of the female body to a psychic mode of being.<sup>40</sup>

Johnson elaborates on this association: "This psychic mode of being, compassionate care, can be demonstrated by men as well as women, ...but it is a woman's love for the child of her womb that is the paradigmatic metaphor."<sup>41</sup>

Johnson points out that connections between women's womb, love, compassion, and mercy also apply to God:

Accordingly, when God is spoken of as merciful, the semantic tenor of the word indicates that the womb is trembling, yearning for the child, grieved at the pain. What is being showered upon the wayward is God's womb-love....<sup>42</sup>

She adds: "The human experience of giving birth, with its physical and psychic relations, is an analogy that hints at the unfathomable depths of divine love."<sup>43</sup>

Elizabeth Conde-Frazier notes that women she talked with in Latin America whose sons or husbands had been "disappeared" for political reasons, described their feelings of loss, empathic connection, and yearning for them not only as emotional feeling, but as a physical womb pain. These women found that their womb pain began to subside as they told their pain and anger to other women with similar experiences and joined with them in political action to make a difference.<sup>44</sup> For these women, love and loss were experienced significantly through the womb.

A woman who has the physiological potential to become pregnant is forced by her gendered embodiment to consider the possibility and future needs of a child, even if it is only to say, "No, I don't want a child," or to choose a birth control method. In this sense, empathy is embodied as an ontological aspect of female being.

<sup>40</sup> Trible, *God and the Rhetoric of Sexuality*, 33, citing Georg Schmuttermayr, "RHM--Eine Lexikalische Studie" *Biblica* 51 (1970): 499-532; and citing Israel Eitan, "An Unknown Meaning of Rahamim," *JBL* 53 (1934): 269-71.

<sup>41</sup> Johnson, *She Who Is*, 101.

<sup>42</sup> Ibid.

<sup>43</sup> Ibid.

<sup>44</sup> Elizabeth Conde-Frazier, Assistant Professor of Religious Education at Claremont School of Theology, Calif., telephone interview by author, 2000, written notes, Gainesville, Ga.

Empathy toward others is thus embodied in women's experiences of menstruation, pregnancy, birth, and breastfeeding.

**Mother-child mirroring occurs through listening, and shapes identity formation and self-worth.** "The hand that rocks the cradle, rocks the world," is a folk saying told to me by my mother, Marian Perz.<sup>45</sup> Surrey notes that connections based on feeling states between mother and daughter develop over time into a mutual reciprocal mirroring process in which "mother and daughter become highly responsive to the feelings of each other."

Through this mutual sensitivity and mutual caretaking, mothers already are teaching "mothering" or "caring" practices to girl children. By "mothering" I do not necessarily mean what has been traditionally labeled as "one-directional" mothering, but attentiveness and emotional responsivity to the other as an intrinsic, ongoing aspect of one's own experience.<sup>46</sup>

Surrey adds that mutual mother-daughter empathic mirroring over time leads to an evolving relational mutuality. Jordan describes how mirroring allows a growing child to learn to distinguish its own feelings from those of others, to distinguish between different feelings, and to expand its sphere of empathic relationships to family, friends, and community. Recounting the story of a young child who, seeing her mother upset, brought her mother her teddy bear, Jordan notes that even young children are capable of responding empathically.<sup>47</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock describe women leaders they studied as good listeners who learn inclusively from others.<sup>48</sup> Hurty's description of the importance of pondering the situation of the other, and the use of emotional energy in relating to others in women's leadership, highlights qualities that are components of empathy.<sup>49</sup>

**Empathic relational capability and training is needed in leadership and**

---

<sup>45</sup> I grew up hearing my mother tell me this old folk saying. Marian T. Perz, conversation with author regarding folk saying, 1968.

<sup>46</sup> Janet Surrey, "The Relational Self In Women: Clinical Implications," Women's Growth in Connection, 37.

<sup>47</sup> Jordan, "Empathy and Self Boundaries," Women's Growth in Connection, 55, 71-74, 87-88.

<sup>48</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 272.

<sup>49</sup> Hurty, 180-81.

religious education. Surrey notes that “the ability to be in relationship appears to rest on the capacity for empathy in both or all persons involved.”<sup>50</sup> She adds, “almost no attention has been devoted to the topic of teaching and learning empathy.”<sup>51</sup> The field of counselor education offers effective models for teaching and learning empathy currently used to train counselors.<sup>52</sup> Joe Wittmer and Robert D. Myrick have applied these skills to teaching through “facilitative teaching,” and identified six characteristics of facilitative teachers that enhance personal growth in classrooms: effective listening, genuineness, understanding, respect, intelligence, and skill in interpersonal communication.<sup>53</sup> These skills for effective teaching can be taught, for instance, in K-12 schools in weekly half-hour workshops after school over six weeks with follow-up sessions as needed.

**Mutual caretaking of their relationship by mothers and daughters evolves into mutual empowerment and ultimately, an experience of identity in terms of the self-in-relation.** Surrey describes how, through the process of empathically sharing emotional and cognitive aspects of experiences, mother and daughter “become highly responsive to the feeling states of each other.”<sup>54</sup> Thus, each becomes:

mobilized to care for, respond to, or attend to the well-being and development of the other. Moreover, they care for and take care of the relationship between them. This is the motivational dynamic of mutual empowerment, the inherent energizing force of real relationship.<sup>55</sup>

Thus, young girls learn a sense of relational competency with others and internalize a sense of empowerment in relationships in general.

---

<sup>50</sup> Janet Surrey, “The Self-in-Relation: A Theory of Women’s Development,” Women’s Growth in Connection, 53.

<sup>51</sup> Ibid.

<sup>52</sup> Gerard Egan, The Skilled Helper: A Model for Systematic Helping and Interpersonal Relating (Monterey, Calif.: Brooks/Cole Publishing, 1975), 22-24, 34-40, 60-72, 77-106; also, counseling courses of the University of Florida Education Department’s Counselor Education program which teach Carl Rogers’ counseling theory of reflective listening.

<sup>53</sup> Joe Wittmer and Robert D. Myrick, Facilitative Teaching: Theory and Practice (Minneapolis: Educational Media Corp., 1980), 44.

<sup>54</sup> Surrey, “Self-In-Relation,” in Women’s Growth in Connection, 56.

<sup>55</sup> Ibid., 57.

Through this mutually empathic relational empowerment, young girls come to experience themselves not as single, separate selves, but as a “self-in-relation,” which Janet Surrey describes as:

a mode in which all of life activity is carried on in a context of attentiveness and responsivity to the other as an intrinsic ongoing aspect of one's own experience...<sup>56</sup>

The self is experienced as relationally connected to others rather than separate.

**The ability to empathize with self and others is an important aspect of loving and can be enhanced through education.** Empathy is motivated by and can intensify genuine interest in and concern for others, even to an intrinsic valuing of relationships. Wimberly writes that shared love in significant relationship is an important dimension of liberation that can be enhanced through Christian education. Shared love is empowering and is enacted through sharing stories, sharing love in a family, doing right by others, and celebrating that life is a gift worth sharing (see Appendix E for a complete list of these dimensions of liberation).<sup>57</sup>

“Education for love” or “emotional literacy--to help students learn ways of being and relating that equip them” to participate in partnership rather than dominator societies is also discussed by Eisler, who feels that such education can accelerate positive cultural transformation.<sup>58</sup> She names as examples the use of “‘interior monologues’ in which students are encouraged to think from the perspective of different characters in history, literature, or life,” taught by Bill Bigelow and Linda Christiansen at Jefferson High School in Portland, Oregon; the Self-Science curriculum, (Karen Stone McCown, Nueva Learning Center,) designed to raise social and emotional competence of children; and a program at Crossroads School in Santa Monica, Ca., which describes itself as designed to stimulate “sensitivity to

---

<sup>56</sup> Ibid.

<sup>57</sup> Wimberly, 22-26.

<sup>58</sup> Eisler, 385, citing Daniel Goleman, “A Great Idea in Education,” Connections 1 (June 1994a), 2.

others, self-understanding, and intuition, imagination, and body wisdom.”<sup>59</sup> She asserts that education focused on teaching students to relearn love, “beginning with how we can be more loving parents to our children,” is crucial to transforming society.<sup>60</sup>

**Empathy is central to women’s leadership and ethical action.** A new mother empathically attunes herself to her infant’s cries in order to determine its needs and respond. A person in pain experiences self-empathy and quickly attempts to remove the painful stimulus. We often take for granted the important link between empathy and responsive action. Empathy inherently points people to needs that demand ethical choices. When combined with a genuine interest in self and others, empathy can lead to respect for the dignity and worth of persons as a foundation for moral decision-making. For theologian Marcia Riggs, responsive action is a key factor distinguishing between real empathy and sympathy. She writes that many upper and middle-class Blacks feel “sympathy without empathy” for Blacks in lower income brackets, acknowledging their plight without a willingness to participate actively with them in mutual liberation.<sup>61</sup> Similar critiques could also be levied against wealthy Americans and those who ignore structures that oppress. Riggs describes this as an ethical dilemma of liberal individualism. She calls instead for communalism, in which black people have an “awareness of one another as inter-related.”<sup>62</sup> Such an awareness is also called for among all people.

**Expanded contextual understandings of empathy enhance the effectiveness of women’s leadership across differences.** Jordan describes an understanding of “contextual empathy” that moves beyond knowing as a simple interaction, to what she describes as:

---

<sup>59</sup> Eisler, 385, citing the following: Bill Bigelow and Linda Christiansen, “Promoting Social Imagination Through Interior Monologues,” *Rethinking Schools* 8 (Winter 1993), 18; Daniel Goleman, “Emotions 101,” *Connections* 1 (June 1994b), 10; and Shelley Kessler, quoted in “The Mysteries Program,” *Connections* 1 (June 1994), 4.

<sup>60</sup> Eisler, 387.

<sup>61</sup> Marcia Y. Riggs, *Awake, Arise, and Act: A Womanist Call for Black Liberation* (Cleveland: Pilgrim Press, 1994), 19-20.

<sup>62</sup> Ibid.

an overarching sense of presence with and openness to the other person's experience and general point of view, a kind of "contextual empathy." It is as if we can understand more fully the scope of the necessity of their particular organization of experience.<sup>63</sup>

Empathy is contextual and complex, involving the synthesis of multiple contexts. Accurate empathic responses and an awareness of the world-views of persons different from the self are essential for effective leadership. Jordan describes how women, blacks, lesbians, gay men, and others in minorities often are not heard receptively from those in the dominant culture when they describe their experiences and worldviews.<sup>64</sup> European American women have often failed to hear women of color, partly due to their lack of contextual awareness of the realities of the lives of many women of color.<sup>65</sup> Surrey describes the empathic process as "seeing through the eyes of the other."<sup>66</sup> In order for women of different groups to be able to see themselves and each other more clearly, it will be helpful for them to learn to take otherness or difference inside the self, and dialogue with the contextually complex life experiences of others.

To this effect, Jordan's description of contextual empathy can be further clarified by breaking it down into five types of contextual empathy that can illuminate another's world view. These contexts can help listeners develop better intuitive skills and more fully comprehend the experiences of the self and others:

1. Immediate situational contexts--refers to those aspects of the situational context which are more immediately apparent, such as the situation of the person, group/s, institutions or other entities involved.
2. Larger historical contexts--refers to contexts such as the history of the city, nation, religion, person, profession, group of people, etc. which may have bearing on a particular situation.
3. Systemic and structural contexts--refer to political, economic, or governmental systems and structures, institutions, policies, procedures, laws, as well as form of government locally and globally, economic system, etc. which may have bearing on a particular situation.
4. Multicultural-multigroup contexts--refers to faith, ideology, gender, ethnic

---

<sup>63</sup> Judith Jordan, "Clarity in Connection: Empathic Knowing, Desire, and Sexuality," Women's Growth in Diversity, 56.

<sup>64</sup> Ibid.

<sup>65</sup> Hooks, Teaching to Transgress, 96-106; Collins, 189-92.

<sup>66</sup> Janet Surrey, "Self-in-Relation," in Women's Growth in Connection, 55.



background or "race," age, weight, affectional/sexual orientation, region, economic status, or other difference as well as the larger societal history of the group which may be relevant to a particular situation.

5. Environmental and geographical contexts--refers to landscape (ocean, plains, mountains,) presence or absence of beauty, pollution or lack of it, weather, population density, location, ecological factors, etc. which may have bearing on a particular situation.

These contexts interact with and influence each other because they are organically related and can contribute to the multilayered levels of oppression described by Miss Wynona in the NFC. Expanded contextual understandings contribute to a development of more accurate empathic listening, as described in the discussion of different contexts illuminating Miss Ann's fear of tornados.

**Balancing the needs of self and others can be structured into the policies and systems of institutions and governments.** All too often, however, balancing the needs of self and others gets translated into "balancing the needs of the self--with others who are like me"; it is an ethic applied parochially. This is particularly true when opportunities for empathy toward others are forestalled by a lack of proximity. The lack of proximity itself is often created by prejudices which shape individual actions and shape structures and systems. For instance, when people of color are prevented from buying homes in white neighborhoods, then whites' more personal interactions with people of color are distanced, a phenomenon which hooks terms "a state of psychic social apartheid."<sup>67</sup>

Many women are now starting their own nonprofit organizations to address unmet needs in their communities. Many have found corporate and bureaucratic governmental structures incompatible with women's styles of leadership. Increasingly, women are calling for transformation of these structures. Institutions have gendered culture, which affects "the processes, practices, images and ideologies, and distributions of power in the various sectors of social life," states Joan

---

<sup>67</sup> Hooks, Killing Rage, 224.

Acker.<sup>68</sup> Women's ability to transform structures increases as their numbers increase, notes Rosenthal:

When women have been visible in substantial numbers over an extended period, they have greater ability to redefine the framework, assumptions, and definitions central to political leadership.<sup>69</sup>

Many women find the values and structure of nonprofits and NGOs more compatible because they are created and structured to meet a legitimate community need while also meeting the needs of employees. Transnational corporations lack an internal structure that works to balance the needs of the corporation with those of its surrounding community.<sup>70</sup> In recent years, many women have left corporate positions, suggesting an incompatibility with their needs and/or values. Women have increasingly sought careers in and created nonprofits, NGOs, or other organizations that are consistent with their basic values and concerns.

Kelly recognizes the need for a mutual, egalitarian economic system of relationships between people and nations, as well as new nonexploitive ways of relating with the Earth. She writes: "Transforming the planet also means promoting social justice, an end to the rich countries' exploiting the poor..."<sup>71</sup> She sums up the vast discrepancies in use of world resources by a small percentage of the world's population:

Europe, if it is to become a true continent of peace, ecology, and nonviolence, must begin to understand that 20 percent of the world's population has been using 80 percent of the world's resources and that the planet is already devastated.<sup>72</sup>

She adds that Western Europe needs to learn and create policies of self-restraint and solidarity with the Third World in a fully demilitarized and socially just society.

<sup>68</sup> This quote is attributed to Joan Acker, "Gendered Institutions: From Sex Roles to Gendered Institutions," Contemporary Sociology 21(1992): 565-69; according to Sally J. Kenney, "New Research on Gendered Political Institutions," Political Research Quarterly 49, no. 2 (June 1996): 445-46; quoted in Cindy Simon Rosenthal, When Women Lead: Integrative Leadership in State Legislatures (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998), 5.

<sup>69</sup> Rosenthal, 6.

<sup>70</sup> Riley, 7; Clarke and the IFG, 7-16; Shiva, The Violence of the Green Revolution, 234-40; Shiva, Stolen Harvest, 7-11, 16-18, 21-35.

<sup>71</sup> Kelly, in Women in World Politics, 173.

<sup>72</sup> *Ibid.*, 179.

Such are the goals of Kelly and other women who wish to develop empathic, responsive institutions and social structures.

### **Relationship With the Divine**

Experiences of the Divine can be heightened before and during menstruation. Spiritual practices of some Native American nations have recognized menstruation as a sacred time; some cultures are even organized around the menstrual cycle in order to cultivate spiritual knowledge. Menstrual synchrony further intensifies women's potential for wisdom relevant to the community. Through spiritual experiences of Divine empathy and presence, women and communities may conceive of themselves as a self-in-relation-with-God. Feminine images of God are empowering for women and reveal relationships of cocreativity with the Divine.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** Women in the NFC rely on their faith in God for wisdom and guidance into daily life and social action. Christian faith and the power of God's guidance and love are central to counteracting internalized and external oppression. Women in the NFC see themselves participating in God's activity within their community and the larger City of Gainesville. Christian faith is central to almost all of the women in the NFC. All belong to churches and many are quite active. Many women describe their relationships with God in personal terms. Miss Wynona stated that the leaders of the club do not move without God's direction. Their faith in God supports the idea that all people have equal worth and counters messages of devaluation coming from structural violence in the larger community.

**Women's embodied experiences help them develop spiritual ways of knowing that extend beyond ordinary sense experiences.** During menstruation, there is a resonant amplification of women's spiritual connection. Northrup notes that premenstrually, the "veil between the worlds' of the seen and

unseen, the conscious and the unconscious, is much thinner.”<sup>73</sup> Melissa Raphael writes that menstruation is a time of heightened oracularity, spiritual awareness, outpouring of creativity, and introspection.<sup>74</sup> Some Native American traditions honored menstrual synchrony through women’s lodges, looking to women’s wisdom emerging from this time as a source of guidance for the nation. Dena Taylor recounts the description of menstrual seclusion provided by Ruby Modesto, a Cahuilla Medicine Woman:

It was a ceremonial occasion which enabled a woman to get in touch with her own special power. It was a time to Dream and have visions. Each month the women went to their own vision pit.<sup>75</sup>

Both women and men had vision pits, which were places to enter the “Dreamtime” and pray. Ruby Modesto added, “This was how the people learned.”<sup>76</sup> Insights drawn from these cyclical experiences may be relevant to all aspects of life. A Yurok Indian woman related how she is trying to keep the ways of her grandmother: “A menstruating woman should isolate herself, because this is the time during which she is at the height of her powers.”<sup>77</sup> She described “mundane tasks and social distractions” as well as concerns with the opposite sex as a waste of this valuable spiritual time which is considered in her culture to be wealth. She concluded: “Rather, all of one’s energies should be applied in concentrated meditation on the nature of one’s life, to find out the purpose of your life,’ and toward an accumulation of spiritual energy.”<sup>78</sup> Taylor notes that Brooke Medicine Eagle suggests that women “keep a large and lovely book for recording... visions, dreams, imaginings and intuitive flashes,” and includes her description of the importance of menstrual dreams

---

<sup>73</sup> Northrup, 101.

<sup>74</sup> Raphael, *Theology and Embodiment*, 197.

<sup>75</sup> Taylor, 27, citing Ruby Modesto and Guy Mount, *Not for Innocent Ears* (Arcata, Calif.: Sweetlight Books, 1980), 42.

<sup>76</sup> Ibid.

<sup>77</sup> Thomas Buckley, “Menstruation and the Power of Yurok Women,” *Blood Magic: The Anthropology of Menstruation*, eds. Thomas Buckley and Alma Gottlieb (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), 190; also Taylor, 27, citing Thomas Buckley, “Menstruation and the Power of Yurok Women: Methods of Cultural Reconstruction,” *American Ethnologist* 9, 47-60.

<sup>78</sup> Buckley; Taylor.

in Native American culture:

The information received as the menses begins is the clearest human picture from within the womb of the Great Mystery, of the unknown and our future. Among our dreaming peoples, the most prophetic dreams and visions (of the coming of the white peoples and other such almost incomprehensible changes) were brought to the people through the Moon Lodge.<sup>79</sup>

These stories illustrates the importance of women's spiritual knowing. Shuttle and Redgrove suggest that "such women's colleges could beat out, as it were, the menstrual pulse in synchrony, with its associated mental and sexual power," quoting a nun who described her convent as 'a powerhouse of prayer.'<sup>80</sup> Ecclesiastes 3:1, "a time for every purpose under heaven," refers to a spiritual dimension of human cycles.<sup>81</sup> The menstrual cycle is a resource for self-knowledge and personal spiritual connections with the Divine that can involve important insights and facilitate spiritual development. Enhanced spiritual connectedness seems to be mediated through women's cycles.

**Women conceive of themselves as a self-in-relation-with-God through spiritual experiences of Divine empathy and mirroring.** A sense of deep relation with God characterizes much of women's religious and theological writing. Ntozake Shange's writes: "i found god in myself and i loved her, i loved her fiercely."<sup>82</sup> In this, she points to the power of God's intimate presence, enabling her to overcome internalized and external oppression. The biblical story of Hagar's encounter with God in the desert after running away from slavery is similar in that Hagar is empowered by the experience and chooses to name God in nonpatriarchal, possibly Egyptian terms, rather than in the language of Sarah and Abraham, whom she perceives as her oppressors.<sup>83</sup> Delores Williams describes

---

<sup>79</sup> Taylor, 39, citing Brooke Medicine Eagle, "Women's Moontime--A Call to Power," *Shaman's Drum*, 24.

<sup>80</sup> Ibid., 178. They note that families are also affected by menstrual rhythms.

<sup>81</sup> Eccles. 3:1 in Ryrie, 894-95.

<sup>82</sup> Johnson, *She Who Is*, 67, citing Ntozake Shange, *For Colored Girls Who Have Considered Suicide/When the Rainbow is Enuf* (New York: Macmillan, 1976), 63.

<sup>83</sup> Gen. 16:1-16 in Ryrie, 28-29; Delores S. Williams, *Sisters in the Wilderness: The Challenge of Womanist God-Talk* (Maryknoll, N. Y.: Orbis Books, 1993), 23-24, citing Helmer Ringgren, *Israelite Religion*, trans. Davie E. Green (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1966), 21-22.

this as an example of God's actions to counter internalized oppression and to intervene in oppressive circumstances. She cites Phyllis Trible's observation that Hagar is the only person in the Bible to name God, whom she calls, "the God who sees me."<sup>84</sup> God came to her in the desert, saw her life circumstances, and helped her. She names her son "Ishmael," which means "God has heard," notes Williams.<sup>85</sup> This story is a powerful recounting of Divine empathy and mutuality. Genesis 16:13 also records that she saw God: "I have now seen the One who sees me."<sup>86</sup> Surrey describes the importance of "feeling seen" by another and "seeing the other" in mutual empathy.<sup>87</sup> Hagar felt accurately "seen" by God. Hagar is allowed to name God in the context of mutual empathy; even as the God of the Old Testament resists being named when the ability to name implies power over.

This accent on Divine relationship is also found in the educational literature. Moore highlights scriptures that address the dynamic relationship between persons and God:

Through the heart, a person speaks to God, seeking after God's face (Ps. 27:8), and through the heart, a person trusts God (Ps. 28:7). ...the heart can turn to God and follow God's commands (Deut. 30:8-14). The heart has ability and will to reach out to God and to obey God's lead.<sup>88</sup>

She refers to the passage in Psalms 33:14-15, which describes how active God is in "fashioning the hearts of all the inhabitants of the earth."<sup>89</sup> She adds: "God is acting... for the sake of relationship."<sup>90</sup>

Wimberly also turns to scripture to uncover the Divine-human relationship. She says, "As Christians... we see ourselves through the eyes of God found in

---

<sup>84</sup> Williams, 23, citing Phyllis Trible, Texts of Terror: Literary-Feminist Readings of Biblical Narratives (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1984), 18; see also synthesis of Williams, 23; and Gen. 13-14 in Ryrie, 29.

<sup>85</sup> Williams, 31, citing Gen. 21:17.

<sup>86</sup> Gen. 16:13 in Ryrie, 29.

<sup>87</sup> Janet L. Surrey, "Self-in-Relation," in Women's Growth in Connection, 55.

<sup>88</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 204.

<sup>89</sup> Ibid., 204.

<sup>90</sup> Ibid., 204-05.

Jesus Christ revealed in Scripture,” and “see our lives as gifts from God.”<sup>91</sup> When Wimberly’s insight is viewed through the lens of self-in-relation theory, this mirroring process can be seen as an experience of ourselves as a self-in-relation-with-God. Wimberly describes the challenge of maintaining a positive self-image in the face of what could be described as racist mirroring:

We must be attentive to the positive views liberated in us in spite of assaults to our value and dignity and equally aware of self-views that counter the value God places on us, thereby blocking our liberation and vocation... Our challenge is to seek an ongoing inner surety of our human value based on knowing deeply God’s value of all persons revealed in Scripture... The assumption is that when we value ourselves the way God values us, we open ourselves to a variety of dimensions of liberation. We begin to see possibilities we had not... imagined.<sup>92</sup>

For Wimberly, the accent is on God’s valuing of our human lives, which allows us to understand who we are and Whose we are and who we can become.

The power of God to correctively mirror back to us who we really are, can heal internalized oppression and transform oppressive circumstances. Often personal transformations mediated by the Divine have implications for the common good. Wimberly adds that through these experiences, “We also open ourselves to vocation, which is our response to God’s call to care for others.”<sup>93</sup>

Mystical experiences are intense experiences of the self-in-relation-with-the-Divine. Mystical experiences and an interview study provide examples of ways in which the Divine relates intimately with human selves to overcome internalized oppression and transform external circumstances.

In the mystical experience described earlier, I experienced myself in relation to God, myself, and my family. God brought me to a place where I found a butterfly as an image of myself. God mirrored back to me the positive way in which God saw me--and the positive way in which God sees women, countering theologically oppressive understandings of women in the church, and “unclean” descriptions of menstruation in scripture. In this mutual encounter, God allowed me to experience God’s presence. This mystical experience was an anchor that reminded me of what

---

<sup>91</sup> Wimberly, 49.

<sup>92</sup> Ibid., 50.

<sup>93</sup> Ibid.

God saw in me, and I trusted that more than I trusted myself during devastating grief experiences when my father and brother died. This was a stunning act of preemptive empathy on God's part, and for me, a powerful experience of myself-in-relation-with-God.

Johnson describes such power in women's conversion experiences:

...conversion experienced not as giving up oneself but as tapping into the power of oneself simultaneously releases understanding of divine power not as dominating power-over but as the passionate ability to empower oneself and others.<sup>94</sup>

Johnson notes that women's self-affirmation against what she calls traditional, negative, "internalized devaluations of women," awakens a "new experience of God as beneficent toward the female and an ally of women's flourishing."<sup>95</sup> She writes that the Holy Spirit empowers people to thrive "in the midst of the antagonistic structures of reality."<sup>96</sup> As discussed in the previous chapter and in my opening story in this chapter, these mystical experiences can be intensified for women during menstruation.

Menstruation creates a powerful intersection between the heightening of a woman's own self-love and care; deeper awareness of feelings and needs; increased capacity for critical reflection and insight; an increased willingness to address conflicts; and heightened experiences of Divine comfort, guidance, and empathy, which together, may heighten women's openness to profound transformations that have both personal and communal implications. Thus, precisely at a time of month when may be most likely to recognize dysfunctional patterns in their lives or society and act to correct them, women are also most likely to be highly tuned to their own spiritual connectedness with the Divine and able to access Divine wisdom, guidance, and support. The existence and ramifications of this profound intersection, facilitated by the menstrual cycle, have not been elaborated in women's psychology.

God's intervening actions described in these mystical experiences are powerful examples of ways in which God's intimate Divine-human relationships can

---

<sup>94</sup> Johnson, *She Who Is*, 67.

<sup>95</sup> *Ibid.*, 66.

<sup>96</sup> *Ibid.*, 143.



overcome oppression to transform individual lives, whole communities, and nations. Further, God reconstitutes God's own identity in the face of oppressive conceptualizations of Divinity. This God is YHWH, translated from the Hebrew: I Am That I Am; I Was Who I Was; and I Will Be Who I Will Be.<sup>97</sup>

In an interview study of Pakistani women, the power of women's embodied mystical experiences was clear, as was the particular power of those experiences to help women counter cultural experiences of oppression. Thirty-three Pakistani Christian women were asked to describe their experiences of numerous aspects of their lives including their experiences of the church, the legal system, education, their homes, their overall experiences of God, and their particular experiences of menstruation, pregnancy, childbirth, and breastfeeding. Many of the women described these embodied experiences as experiences of the presence of God; almost all named their embodied experiences along with their overall relationship with God as the two most positive aspects of their lives. Embodied experiences inspired the women to see themselves as cocreators with God, and they felt they should be respected in the culture because of it. For example, several women described themselves as creators, created in God, the Creator's image. One woman said: The miracle of God is in woman's body.<sup>98</sup> Thus, we see in these women, as in the literature, a stress on the power of intense relationship with the Divine, often mediated through women's bodily experience.

**The community is also a self-in-relation-with-God.** Not only does God act empathically and salvifically toward individuals, but also toward entire communities. The story of Our Lady of Guadalupe is one such moving instance in which Divine love came to the mestizo people of Mexico in their most desolate time after the Spanish had conquered them and missionaries had destroyed their culture and indigenous religion in 1531. Gloria Anzaldua notes that Our Lady of Guadalupe was actually a synthesis of Tonantsi, the Virgin of Tepeyac, the Spanish religious

---

<sup>97</sup> Translated by Susan Perz, Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary, 1990.

<sup>98</sup> Susan M. Perz, in collaboration with Khushnud Azariah, the Women's Development Programme of Pakistan, Gabriele Mayer, and Mary Elizabeth Moore, "Women's Interview Responses Regarding the Situation of Women in Pakistan," *Al-Mushir* (The Counselor) 42, no. 4, (Pakistan) (Fall 2000): 129-30, 142-40.

figure Guadalupe, and Mary of the Christian faith.<sup>99</sup> According to Virgil Elizondo, Our Lady of Guadalupe embodies a synthesis of two religions and cultures, even as the people themselves embody ancestries from the indigenous peoples of Mexico and from Spain.<sup>100</sup>

Elizondo tells the story of how an indigenous Indian man named Juan Diego on his way to mass, heard beautiful birds singing, as if he were in paradise. A beautiful lady appeared and called his name endearingly. Her clothes radiated like the sun. She addressed him as the dearest of her children and told him of her "living desire that there be built a temple, so that in it I can show and give forth all my love, compassion, help, and defense..."<sup>101</sup> She described herself, saying, "I am your loving mother," and promised, "...to all the inhabitants of this land and to all who love me, call upon me, and trust in me, I will hear their lamentations and will remedy all their miseries, pains, and sufferings."<sup>102</sup> Our Lady instructed Diego to go to the bishop and build a temple at that place. He did this, but the bishop, but did not believe him. Elizondo writes that, when Juan Diego returned to the lady feeling unworthy, she encouraged him to go back. The bishop asked for a sign, which the Lady promised to provide. On returning home, he heard his uncle was sick, but on his way to visit him, the lady assured him his uncle was well. He turned and went to the hill where he saw beautiful roses of all colors blooming out of season in December. He gathered them into his tilma, or cloak, and brought them to the bishop. As he unfolded his tilma, the image of the Lady appeared on it and has remained there ever since. From that time on, "millions of Mexicans have come to the church through the mediation of the brown virgin of Tepeyac," writes Virgil Elizondo.<sup>103</sup>

This story can be understood as an empathic response of Our Lady to her people, lifting them up out of oppressive conditions and hopelessness into a

---

<sup>99</sup> Gloria Anzaldua, Borderlands: The New Mestiza, La Frontera (San Francisco: Spinsters/Aunt Lute, 1987), 49-53.

<sup>100</sup> Virgil Elizondo, The Future is Mestizo: Life Where Cultures Meet (New York: Crossroad Publishing, 1992), 65-66, 59-60.

<sup>101</sup> Ibid., 61.

<sup>102</sup> Ibid.

<sup>103</sup> Ibid., 62-63.

renewed awareness of themselves as a community-in-relation-with-the-Divine. In the Christian tradition, this communal emphasis is pervasive.

The Christian experience of Jesus can be understood as an incarnate experience of the self-in-relation-with-God for Christians. Jesus' presence not only incarnated God as Emmanuel, "God with us," but He transformed his surrounding community into an inclusive family of God, capable of mediating God's love in the world. Jesus' ministry, along with experiences of the Holy Spirit such as Pentecost, galvanized the early Christian church as a vital, socially just community-in-relation-with-God.

**Feminine images of the Divine are transformative for women.** The human ability to see oneself incarnationally mirrored and created in the image of the Divine is enhanced by diverse images of the Divine, that encompass not only physical appearance, but aspects of character. Carol Saussy in her book God Images and Self Esteem noted that feminine images of God were important to sixteen of the twenty-one women in her study.<sup>104</sup> Johnson provides a comprehensive overview of feminine images of the Divine in the Bible including: Mother, Sophia, Jesus-Sophia, and Spirit, in her book She Who Is.<sup>105</sup> In addition, she explains that the glory of God, the "kabod YHWH," can be seen in nature. She translates the Hebrew word "kabod" as the "weighty radiance of divine presence in the world... drawing near and passing by to enlighten, warm, and set things right."<sup>106</sup> Because women's cycles, as well as human life itself, are a part of nature, images of the Divine that sacralize nature are empowering and can foster restoration of healing connections between human and created life. This is even more important because the burdens of environmental degradation usually fall most heavily on women.<sup>107</sup>

---

<sup>104</sup> Carroll Saussy, God Images and Self Esteem: Empowering Women in a Patriarchal Society (Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1991), 70.

<sup>105</sup> Johnson, She Who Is, 124-87.

<sup>106</sup> Elizabeth Johnson, Antoinette Brown Lecture at Vanderbilt University, Nashville, 23 March 1995.

<sup>107</sup> Riley, 2; Shiva, Stolen Harvest, 7-11, 16-18; Sassen, 41-45; Gibbs, 111-26.

McFague notes that all images of God are metaphors.<sup>108</sup> Saussy quotes

Starhawk's description of the importance of the Goddess as a symbol for women:

The image of the Goddess inspires women to see ourselves as divine, our bodies as sacred, the changing phases of our lives as holy, our aggression as healthy, our anger as purifying...<sup>109</sup>

Feminine images of the Divine empower women to overcome internalized and external forms of oppression. Starhawk notes that women's abilities to be nurturing, to create, to set limits, to destroy, or transform when needed are also aspects of the image of the Goddess and of "the very force that sustains all life."<sup>110</sup> Starhawk continues:

Through the Goddess, we can discover our strength, enlighten our minds, own our bodies, and celebrate our emotions. We can move beyond narrow, constricting roles and become whole.<sup>111</sup>

Feminine images of the Divine challenge violence toward women as desecration of humanity created in the image of the Goddess. The sacrality of female embodiment can empower women to develop their full potential as persons, to see their bodies as holy, and to reject all forms of violence against women. Applying Freire's concept of uncommodified, uncoopted human beingness; women's beingness, created in the image of the Divine, does not exist for the pleasure of men, but is "being for itself" incarnating "beingness for itself" in women.<sup>112</sup> The Divine feminine incarnate in women should not be mutilated or cut as in practices of female genital mutilation, or subjected to incest, rape, domestic violence, or other abuse, nor should it be excluded from church or communion because of menstruation or pregnancy, which are holy embodied experiences incarnating the sacred in the ordinary. It is at these times when women should most be serving communion since it is women's blood that nurtures new life in the womb

<sup>108</sup> McFague, 31-40.

<sup>109</sup> Saussy, 69, citing Starhawk, "Witchcraft as Goddess Religion," in Spretnak, *Politics*, 51.

<sup>110</sup> Saussy.

<sup>111</sup> Ibid.

<sup>112</sup> Synthesis of Paulo Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (New York: Continuum Publishing Company, 1993), 55, 44-51; and Melissa Raphael, 75-77.

and is transformed into breastmilk that nurtures newborns--another form of communion.

**The ability to love is the source of co-creative activity with God.**

Kendrick points out both of God's major covenants with God's people described in the Bible were initiated through the announcements of pregnancies.<sup>113</sup> Co-creation with God through pregnancy is a major Biblical theme that links the fates of individual families with the fates of whole nations as well as the Jewish and Christian faiths. Sarah, Hagar, and Mary all participated with God in cocreative processes that gave birth to individuals, nations, and whole new faith understandings, including the Christian faith.<sup>114</sup> God's embodied cocreativity is also a metaphor for nonprocreative cocreativity with God through women's leadership and meaningful work and relationships.

Guidelines that emphasize the full humanity and equality of women inform Christian women's leadership and cocreativity with God. At the U.N. Fourth World Congress on Women NGO Forum, Rebecca Todd Peters, from the U.S., named four principles which guide the work and attitudes of Christian feminists:

First, that women and men were created by God as coequal partners.  
Second, that the Bible and our faith contain the seeds for the liberation of the oppressed.<sup>115</sup>

In her third point she states that those aspects of the Christian tradition that are oppressive and "deny the full humanity" of women or any other persons, must be "discarded, ignored, or transformed."<sup>116</sup> In her fourth point, she emphasizes that the whole community must be involved in the struggle for liberation of all the people in community. She summarizes:

These are the four principles I see guiding the work of Christian feminists and increasingly providing the opportunity for young women to find the Christian tradition liberative rather than oppressive.<sup>117</sup>

---

<sup>113</sup> Kendrick, 84-86.

<sup>114</sup> Williams, Sisters in the Wilderness, 15-33; Kendrick, 85-86.

<sup>115</sup> Look at the World Through Women's Eyes.

<sup>116</sup> Ibid.

<sup>117</sup> Ibid.

Johnson notes that God is concerned about the welfare of all people: "Creating and sustaining the universe, God as mother is concerned not only with the good of privileged individuals but with the well-being of the entire household of the world."<sup>118</sup>

### **Mutuality**

Women learn mutuality through their mother-daughter relationships as well as through their relationships with their bodies. In women's adaptations to significant embodied changes, women learn to share power and to reject illusions of absolute power. Mutual nurturing, empowerment, dialogue, collaboration, and visioning are incorporated into women's developmental leadership in which women lift up others as they lead. Women's developmental style of leadership helped lay the groundwork for the Civil Rights Movement.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** As the NFC women's mutual relationships with others have circled outward from their own families, to create othermothering relationships and to address common concerns, they have lifted up others and developed leadership within their own community. NFC women continue efforts to extend this mutuality to the systems and structures surrounding them.

Women have experienced the tragic consequences that occur when structures and systems do not reflect a mutual concern for all members of society. Illness and death due to oppressive environmental conditions, racism, and classism, have revealed to women the extent to which the health of nature and multiple communities of peoples are inseparable.

Adjusting with ease to the needs of others is routine and expected. Women routinely rearrange their schedules to carry flowers for funerals, care for the sick, and help each other. Responding to social justice issues raised by the larger community requires constant vigilance and immediate responsiveness, which often means rearranging personal time for the good of the community.

---

<sup>118</sup> Johnson, *She Who Is*, 181.

Women's leadership in the NFC is based on mutual relationships, caring, and decision making. Women keep current with each other's personal and professional lives week to week. Decisions are made as a group after members' perspectives have been sought and shared.

The leadership of women in the NFC illustrates a natural development of women's relational leadership that includes: (1) valuing every person and relationships, (2) listening and empathizing, (3) recognizing and synthesizing desires and needs, (4) mutual nurturance, empowerment, and peership, (5) inclusive collaboration through brainstorming, othermothering, visioning, prioritizing, equally distributing resources, conflict-management, and consensus-decision-making, (6) ethical consensus-based action, (7) mothering their community and transforming and/or creating new systems and structures. The NFC went through this process when they responded to the lack of inclusion in curricular activities of their youth in the white high school during integration. Their leadership and the leadership of youth transformed the high school structure. This progression illustrates how women's embodied ways of knowing can evolve into leadership and structural change.

**At menarche and in women's cycles, a woman learns to adapt to significant bodily changes, and may develop a more conscious recognition of her interdependent relationship with her body.** A woman has a living, changing relationship with her body. She may at different times experience her body as "self" or "other."

Women learn the skill of demand tolerance in their relationships with their bodies' cycles.<sup>119</sup> Therapist Dave Hingsburger describes the skill "demand tolerance" as a skill that adults learn, allowing them to function in healthy ways within relationships. He notes that adults respond to demands inherent in relational commitments, such as doing chores in a family.<sup>120</sup> This same concept also applies to human bodies. In order to stay alive, human beings must feed, shelter, and care

---

<sup>119</sup> Dave Hingsburger, "Ring of Safety," paper presented at the Sixth Annual Institute on Dual Diagnosis Conference, Chapel Hill, North Carolina, 28 July 1999.

<sup>120</sup> Ibid.

for their bodies. Women's cycles of menstruation, pregnancy, childbirth, and breastfeeding place unique demands on women to (1) adjust to or cope with body changes and sensations including pain and pleasure, (2) adjust to related emotional changes, (3) learn and carry out practices of self-care related to these embodied changes often, and (4) in the case of pregnancy, face the possibility of risking life in childbirth.

Women learn in relationships with their bodies the joy, satisfaction, and pleasure, as well as the pain, frustration, and inconvenience of being a self, so that both joy and pain may be seen as inherent to relationships not only with the self, but with others. At the same time, the joy, enrichment, and pleasure of being in healthy relationship with the self and others outweighs the pain.

At menarche, a girl learns to accept less control over her body, realizing that a lack of complete control in relation to her body is normal, an insight which may be generalized, so that complete control may become understood as impossible and undesirable. This may extend to the ability to accept human limits and mortality, empowering women to adapt to life changes. Further, as women learn about themselves and others through cyclical embodied experiences, they may come to recognize the learning experiences that mutuality makes possible, and which absolute control precludes. Jordan notes the inherent violence in psychological constructions based on the supremacy of the needs of the self:

Any system that emphasizes the ascendancy of individual desire as the legitimate basis for definition of the self and interpersonal relationship is fraught with the possibility of creating violent relationships based on competition of need and the necessity for establishing hierarchies of dominance, entitlement, and power.<sup>121</sup>

Women's embodied experiences may help women to develop an unwillingness to use coercive power, recognizing the illusion of absolute control and its destructiveness to relationships and ecology. Willingness to respond to the needs of others is internally embodied, and can involve profound emotional and physiological changes within the self. Pregnancy and childbirth inherently involve

---

<sup>121</sup> Jordan, "Clarity in Connection: Empathic Knowing, Desire, and Sexuality," Women's Growth in Diversity, 57-58.



profound experiences of demand tolerance for a woman in which her bodyself literally rearranges its organs and psychic space to make room for someone else's life.<sup>122</sup> Women's interdependent relationships with their bodies may help them conceptualize relationships with other people and the earth interdependently in terms of shared power.

Ethicist Welch describes the dangers of the illusion of absolute power relationships in relation to U.S. history and its understanding of national security, (for instance its use of nuclear weapons in World War I against Japan, and its choice to ignore the option of diplomatic negotiation requested by the Japanese).<sup>123</sup>

Welch also decries the "the despair of the affluent" and the middle class which is "cushioned by privilege and grounded in privilege."<sup>124</sup> When easy solutions cannot be found and there are no guarantees that our actions will be successful, "a striking paralysis of will when faced with large, complex problems" results.<sup>125</sup> She observes, "If one cannot do everything to solve the problem of world hunger, for example, one does nothing."<sup>126</sup> Despair and discouragement "is the privilege of those accustomed to too much power, accustomed to having needs met without negotiation or work, accustomed to having a political and economic system that responds to their needs," writes Welch.<sup>127</sup> She continues, "It is easier to give up on long-term social change when one is comfortable in the present--when it is possible to have challenging work, excellent health care and housing, and access to the fine arts."<sup>128</sup> She concludes, "when the good life" is possible and accessible, "it is tempting to despair of its ever being in reach for others and resort merely to enjoying it for oneself and one's family."<sup>129</sup> In this way, Welch writes, good, "well-

---

<sup>122</sup> Arlene Eisenberg, Heidi E. Murkoff, and Sandee E. Hathaway, What to Expect When You're Expecting, (New York: Workman Publishing, 1996), 107, 260; Leifer, 35.

<sup>123</sup> Welch, 41-47.

<sup>124</sup> Ibid., 15.

<sup>125</sup> Ibid., 3.

<sup>126</sup> Ibid.

<sup>127</sup> Ibid.

<sup>128</sup> Ibid.

<sup>129</sup> Ibid.

intentioned people are responsible for the nuclear arms race.”<sup>130</sup> She predicts that without change, these patterns “will lead us again and again to the horrors of genocide, to the threat of nuclear war.”<sup>131</sup>

Such preoccupation with one's own security is one form of what Ruddick calls parochialism and what Freire calls semi-intransivity--both of which are significant obstacles to enlightened awareness of social concerns and cultural transformation.<sup>132</sup> Because there are usually risks inherent in most social justice actions--risks with no guarantees of success and risks which carry possible threats to security--social justice action requires an ethic of faith in the face of risks, unknowns, and the absence of guaranteed outcomes.

In contrast, Asasi-Diaz notes that the preferential option for the poor rests on the idea that “the poor can see and understand what the rich and privileged cannot, because power and richness are self-protective and, therefore, distort reality. The poor have no vested interest in maintaining their present situation.”<sup>133</sup> Their vision, she adds, is a vision of transforming human life for everyone--not just for themselves.<sup>134</sup>

Women seek to reform policies and practices that rely on illusions of absolute control. Environmental lawyer Carolyn Raffensperger advocates prevention and the “precautionary principle” in the use of science to protect the environment and public health, challenging the idea that science can completely control technologies, the most damaging of which are genetic engineering, nuclear energy, and the 80,000 synthetic compounds that have been released into the land, water and air by the

---

<sup>130</sup> Ibid., 2.

<sup>131</sup> Ibid.

<sup>132</sup> Ruddick, 177; Freire, Education for Critical Consciousness (New York: Continuum, 1998), 17-20.

<sup>133</sup> Asasi-Diaz, 194.

<sup>134</sup> Ibid., citing Jose Miguez Bonino, “Nuevas Tendencias en Teologia,” Pasos (Departamento Ecumenico de Investigaciones, San Jose, Costa Rica, 1987), 22.

petrochemical industry.<sup>135</sup> She mandates that the burden of proof of these and other technologies should lie with industry before they are ever used, rather than resting on a public forced to respond reactively after the damage has been done, writes Karen Olson.<sup>136</sup>

The naming of societal neglect of women as a serious form of abuse that is psychologically and physiologically damaging is critical. When linear-time-oriented western society does not honor women's natural rhythms, it endangers women's embodied balance of mutuality between the self and others. It can be dangerous for women to be overly self-giving in cultures that neglect women and women's needs. Women's adaptability and willingness to adapt to the needs of others can be a strength and a liability. Women learn to put down what they are doing and give their full attention to children and others, and pick up where they left off. They learn the art of multiple tasking, but women can also become too easily diverted from important dreams and priorities. Advocacy for women and women's needs is the missing half of mutuality in many cultures around the world. This includes not only attention to neglect, but also violence against women.

**Valuing the self and others mutually is central to women's leadership.** Because women's leadership is based on genuine love and care for others, it has an ethical base that is not easily coopted. Johnson describes the spiritual significance of this kind of love:

Love is the moving power of life, that which drives everything that is toward everything else that is. When love is mutual it signifies a respect, a prizing, and a bondedness that subvert the potential for domination inherent in peoples' concrete differences.<sup>137</sup>

She adds that patriarchal structures cannot be legitimized when God as Spirit is understood as "mutual love proceeding," whose transformative movement is

---

<sup>135</sup> Synthesis of Karen Olson, "Our Planet, Our Selves: Carolyn Raffensperger's Quest to Make an Ounce of Prevention an International Cause," Utne Reader, May-June 2000, 62-64; and Kenny Ausubel, "The Coming Age of Ecological Medicine," Utne Reader, May-June 2000, 59.

<sup>136</sup> Olson, 62.

<sup>137</sup> Johnson, She Who Is, 143.

"toward reciprocity in community."<sup>138</sup>

As the creative dynamic of mutual love, the Spirit vitally moves, attracts, impels, connects, and sets up a solidarity of reciprocal, freeing relation throughout the whole world as well as between herself and creation.<sup>139</sup>

Moore notes that this kind of reverence is also central to teaching:

The hope is that teachers and learners will come together with respect for their mutual subjectivity and for the considerable importance of the decisions they must make. Teaching that does not enhance ...subjectivity and ...decision making on the part of all participants will objectify, control, and manipulate.<sup>140</sup>

She emphasizes the importance of teaching that helps students not only revere others, but also to revere themselves.

### **Mutual nurturing and empowerment in women's leadership.**

The mutuality in women's leadership makes genuine care and collaboration possible. Hurty observes five dimensions of women principals' leadership: emotional energy, nurtured growth, reciprocal talk, pondered mutuality, and collaborative change, practiced within a context of connectedness. She describes these characteristics as coactive empowerment in which participants take part in collaborative decision-making, problem-solving, and conflict resolution.<sup>141</sup> Actions are ultimately based on trust, rather than being hierarchical or bureaucratically organized. She notes that in order to fulfill its potential, growth has to be nurtured over time, through high and low points:

A nurturer recognizes even minute evidence of growth and gives support and encouragement... To hover is not to nurture. Nurturance requires trust, reciprocal obligation, and the willingness to let go.<sup>142</sup>

Women leaders often nurture through the power of encouragement, which is often underestimated, concludes Hurty.<sup>143</sup>

Collins describes how African American women's tradition of providing nurture

---

<sup>138</sup> Ibid.

<sup>139</sup> Ibid.

<sup>140</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 215-16.

<sup>141</sup> Ibid., 180-81.

<sup>142</sup> Ibid., 180.

<sup>143</sup> Ibid., 118-19.

and discipline for each other's children, which she calls "othermothering," develops into leadership whose purpose is to lift up others, and ultimately the entire community. In the process, local leaders are nurtured and empowered. She cites studies of union organizing in which Black women emerged as "centerwomen" whose skills "gained from their centrality in their families enabled them to keep people together, ensure that obligations were fulfilled, and maintain group consensus."<sup>144</sup> Collins writes, "our experiences as othermothers, centerwomen, and community othermothers fosters a distinctive form of political activism based on negotiation and a higher degree of attention to context."<sup>145</sup> Black women achieve institutional transformation by working to change oppressive rules and policies, and define their jobs in terms of institutional transformation rather than "trying to fit into the existing system," which gives them "a degree of 'spiritual independence,'" notes Collins.<sup>146</sup>

Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock describe this tradition of women's leadership as "developmental leadership" based on women's mutual nurturance, a tradition which "holds that all aspects of social life should be permeated with the values of home associated with nurturing the development of human beings."<sup>147</sup> In this tradition, "women see themselves more like mothers who create nurturing families that support growth and development of people and communities," they add.<sup>148</sup> The NFC's tradition of women's leadership is distinctive from those groups studied by Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock in that its tradition of developmental leadership originated from African American women within the community, rather than from

---

<sup>144</sup> Collins, 158, citing Karen Brodtkin Sacks, "Computers, Ward Secretaries, and a Walkout in a Southern Hospital," My Troubles are Going to Have Trouble with Me, ed. Karen Sacks and Dorothy Remy (Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 1984), 173-90, and citing Karen Brodtkin Sacks, "Gender and Grassroots Leadership," Women and the Politics of Empowerment, ed. Ann Bookman and Sandra Morgen (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1988) 77-94.

<sup>145</sup> Collins, 160, citing Carol Gilligan, In a Different Voice (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982), and citing Mary Field Belenky, Blythe McVicker Clinchy, Nancy Rule Goldberger, and Jill Mattuck Tarule, Women's Ways of Knowing (New York: Basic Books, 1986).

<sup>146</sup> Collins, 159.

<sup>147</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 16.

<sup>148</sup> Ibid., 261.

outside leaders coming into the community to help organize.

Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock describe ways in which women leaders operating out of this model develop structures and places in which women can come together to dialogue about pressing issues, support, and empower each other, collaborating to make things better for each other and their communities. They call these places, “public homeplaces,” because they are built on the model of the home, where everyone is included and participates as a contributing, valued member.<sup>149</sup> The NFC office is a public homeplace. Members in this model focus particularly on persons who have been excluded and silenced, they write. Further, the model is built on maternal practice:

In short, this tradition puts forth a model of public leadership dedicated to “drawing out,” “raising up,” and “lifting up” people and communities. As such, it is a leadership paradigm organized around values, metaphors, and activities generally associated with maternal thinking and maternal practice...<sup>150</sup>

In an organizational chart of what developmental leaders’ public homeplaces would look like, leaders might sometimes be in the center of the circle, but they would often be around the circle’s edge among everyone, they write. Public homeplaces work in close collaboration with other groups, so that the circle symbolizing the homeplace would be interlocking with many other circles:

The ultimate structure would look very much like a net or a web with many interconnections. Often you would even need to draw threads that encircle the globe.<sup>151</sup>

Regan and Brooks also name collaboration and caring as characteristics of women’s leadership, as well as courage, intuition, and vision.<sup>152</sup> All of these processes rely on cooperation rather than competition.

**Women come to know their own and each others’ desires and needs through inclusive, mutual dialogue in a context of collaboration.** The emphasis on mutual collaboration leads naturally to the need for mutual dialogue.

---

<sup>149</sup> Ibid., 155-179.

<sup>150</sup> Ibid., 17, citing Ruddick, 1994.

<sup>151</sup> Ibid., 18.

<sup>152</sup> Regan and Brooks, 178.

This is what Hurty calls reciprocal talk.

Reciprocal talk is the strategy of “talking with” others in the process of decision-making or problem-solving. It is a checking out of ideas or plans with those who are likely to be affected.<sup>153</sup>

She adds that reciprocal talk involves an equal give-and-take between listening and talking. Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock describe dialogue metaphorically as midwifing in which people raise questions and share understandings of how things work, creating a vision of how they believe things should work. As dialogue progresses people become more committed to each other and to the “clearly defined goals” that emerge from the process, they write.<sup>154</sup>

Inclusive collaboration among women relating as peers is an aspect of women's leadership. Regan and Brooks note that women grow up with a set of rules for life below the fault line guided by values of care and collaboration: “As we have moved into the public sphere over the last twenty years, we have taken our rule books with us, initially quite ignorant that there is another set of rules operating in that arena.”<sup>155</sup> They define collaboration as “the ability to work in a group, eliciting and offering support to each other member, creating a synergistic environment for everyone.”<sup>156</sup> Their research emerged from mutual dialogue among women principals sharing their understandings of leadership, who had known each other and met in a support group for twenty years. Because women give others permission to care for each other, competition often changes to cooperation when the number of women in a group reaches a critical proportion, they note; “competitive behavior recedes in a caring environment, and collaboration becomes possible.”<sup>157</sup> They add that women feel free to ask for help, and to help each other:

Their behavior is inclusive. They reach out to other people... they gather people in, collaborating to get the job done. A significant by-product that often results from this approach is the development of new leadership and greater self-esteem for those empowered through shared

---

<sup>153</sup> Hurty, 180.

<sup>154</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 15.

<sup>155</sup> Regan and Brooks, 73.

<sup>156</sup> Ibid., 26.

<sup>157</sup> Ibid., 29.

ownership...<sup>158</sup>

This description illustrates how, through inclusive collaboration and dialogue, women nurture and encourage each other, thus empowering new leadership.

**Visioning as an active collaborative process is a characteristic of women's leadership.** The ability to collaboratively create a common vision is crucial in setting goals for effective group action. Regan and Brooks describe vision, or "visioning," as an active inclusive process in which women use skills of synthesis and mutual dialogue to vision together:

Vision is the ability to formulate and express original ideas, enabling others to consider options in new and different ways. It is... a process through which the leader enables everyone to synthesize what may first appear to be different points of view, but that when brought together, create a totally new and progressive idea.<sup>159</sup>

They write that part of building trust in a collaborative environment involves making sure everyone shares ideas, which makes vision possible. They quote Mintzberg's observation that "It is integrity--a genuine feeling behind what the leader says and does--that makes leadership truly visionary..."<sup>160</sup> They note: "Visionary leadership is trusting one's intuition" and working with care in collaboration with others to find out their ideas and bring everyone's ideas together in a way that makes sense.<sup>161</sup>

Starhawk describes the power of long-term collaborative vision which is necessary because cultural transformation requires persistence over long periods of time.

If we cannot live to see the completion of that revolution, we can plant its seeds in our circles, we can dream its shape in our visions, and our rituals can feed its growing power.<sup>162</sup>

Wimberly describes the importance of Christian education that helps participants develop a vision for living, and empowers them to act.<sup>163</sup> Women's leadership involves mutually decided-on ethical action. Ruether states that she does not

---

<sup>158</sup> Ibid., 26.

<sup>159</sup> Ibid., 36.

<sup>160</sup> Ibid., 36, citing Henry Mintzberg, Mintzberg on Management: Inside Our Strange World of Organizations (New York: Free Press, 1989), 122.

<sup>161</sup> Ibid., 37.

<sup>162</sup> Starhawk, Dreaming the Dark, 180.

<sup>163</sup> Wimberly, 25.



believe in a faith that does not involve action.<sup>164</sup> Most liberation theologies stress the importance of liberative praxis and concrete action to transform oppressive structures and social conditions. The ability to act effectively relies on collaborative visioning such as brainstorming, prioritizing, conflict-management, and consensus-decision-making which can be taught through religious education.

**Women developmental leaders have historically laid the groundwork for entire social movements.** As developmental leaders begin considering local/national and local/global implications of conditions in their own communities, they have often been moved to participate in, and even pioneer social movements. Ella Baker and Septima Clark are developmental leaders who laid the grassroots foundations for the Civil Rights movement by developing the leadership of grassroots people, write Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock. Developmental leaders uplift their neighbors by supporting their development as full human beings.<sup>165</sup> They describe the work of historian Charles Payne, who notes that developmental leaders seldom have institutional backing, working on a voluntary basis without titles and salaries, and are likely to be working class, rural, and female. They point out his assessment that it was the developmental leaders who nurtured, developed, and strengthened local leadership and local infrastructures, making them capable of rising to meet the Civil Rights Movement when it arrived at the Black Belt and on into Mississippi. They note that Payne maintains that it was not the charismatic leaders who made the Civil Rights Movement viable or successful, and doubts that a few charismatic leaders would have been able

within a few years to move large numbers of dependent and, to all appearances, apolitical people--none of them having any semblance of legal rights at the local level, all of them vulnerable to violence-- to a position of actively working to change the conditions of their own lives.<sup>166</sup>

Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock describe Ella Baker's development of the Student Nonviolent Coordinating Committee (SNCC) and In Friendship,

---

<sup>164</sup> Ruether, quoted in Look at the World Through Women's Eyes.

<sup>165</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 8-10, 13.

<sup>166</sup> Ibid., 170, citing C. M. Payne, I've Got the Light of Freedom: The Organizing Tradition and the Mississippi Freedom Struggle (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995), 2.

organizations which supported and nurtured leadership, and Septima Clark's development of the Citizenship Schools in the South. SNCC developed youth leadership in both the most poor and oppressed areas as well as the more privileged areas in the nation--and Ella Baker played a key role in this organization, note Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock:

It was SNCC that finally galvanized the movement in areas of the Black Belt that the older, more established civil rights organizations saw as too resistant and too dangerous to organize.<sup>167</sup>

They note that SNCC used In Friendship's model of supporting local leaders to create a national network of leadership with the same social justice goals.

Septima Clark founded Citizenship Schools throughout the South, which empowered blacks and prepared them for voter registration.

In the process she enrolled a large percentage of rural blacks in the civil rights movement... In some communities it was extraordinarily dangerous to even try to register. In Clark's mind the overriding goal of the Citizenship Schools was not so much to attain literacy and voter registration, but to discover and develop local leadership.<sup>168</sup>

She engaged respected local leaders in informal positions running the schools.

Through her support, they became teachers and coaches who similarly nurtured and supported the leadership of their neighbors. They note that as a result, new statewide political organizations grew out of the Citizen Schools in South Carolina, Georgia, and Mississippi:

From one end of the South to the other, if you look at the black elected officials and the political leaders you find people who had their first involvement in the training program of the Citizenship School.<sup>169</sup>

Other social movements in the U.S. pioneered significantly by women include the environmental movement led by Rachel Carson, the social transformation and anti-child labor movement led by Jane Addams, the temperance movement against family violence and militarism, the movement against drunk driving pioneered by Mothers Against Drunk Driving (MADD), the antinuclear movement, (including the

---

<sup>167</sup> Ibid., 171.

<sup>168</sup> Ibid., 172.

<sup>169</sup> Ibid., 172, citing Septima Clark, Ready from Within, ed. C. S. Brown (Trenton, N.J.: Africa World Press, 1990), 69-70.

idea for a nuclear freeze and the related international campaign,) “grassroots consciousness-raising about the arms race,” the women’s peace movement which began as a feminist/pacifist consciousness, and African American women’s club movements.<sup>170</sup> Collins notes that African American women were also quite politically active in the abolitionist and anti-lynching struggles.<sup>171</sup> Notably, Ida B. Wells brought lynching into the forefront of the nation’s consciousness and conscience.<sup>172</sup>

Women’s mutuality in relationship naturally develops into leadership as well as institutional and cultural transformation as women move from the personal to the public spheres of life.

### **Connectedness and Shared Body**

Connectedness may be known and communicated most deeply in experiences of shared body between a child and a mother. As children are weaned and grow, connectedness is maintained through skills such as sharing feelings and empathy, mutual nurturing and empowerment, and shared responsibility for relationships, which combine with embodied experiences to create an understanding of the self-in-relation which characterizes women’s psychology.<sup>173</sup> These characteristics are later developed into skills such as reciprocal talk and collaboration which serve to maintain connectedness within web-like social organizations. Connectedness is described by Hurty as an overarching, yet distinct characteristic of women’s leadership “involves caring, interdependence and commitment to

---

<sup>170</sup> Al Gore, introduction to Silent Spring by Rachel Carson (Boston : Houghton Mifflin Company, 1994), xv-xvi, xix; Sybil Oldfield, Women in World Politics, 120-22; Alonso, 47-49, 20-21, 102; Vickers, 120-22; Riggs, 61-75.

<sup>171</sup> Collins, 57.

<sup>172</sup> Written display materials, “Without Sanctuary: Lynching Photography in America,” art exhibition, Emory University and Martin Luther King, Jr. National Historic Site, Atlanta, 1 May--31 Dec. 2002, curator Joseph F. Jordan.

<sup>173</sup> Surrey, “Self-In-Relation,” in Women’s Growth in Connection, 53-59.

community.”<sup>174</sup> She notes that connected social organizations are based on inclusive peership in which autonomy and community are balanced.<sup>175</sup> Connectedness also encompasses an understanding of the self as essentially connected to others rather than separate, and an organic worldview in which the fates of all are entwined in the common good.<sup>176</sup> Such worldviews likely contribute to recognition of the importance of building trust with others and working for the common good. In Christian theology and scripture, the body of Christ is a metaphor for the family of God.<sup>177</sup> Thus, connectedness, a relational proximity to others motivated by care and maintained through relational and leadership skills, can point to world views whose understanding of global human family challenge constructions of other persons and nations as “the enemy.” Such world views call for alternative approaches to international diplomacy and challenge militaristic approaches to the resolution of international conflicts.

Women’s mothering, described as an active connectedness by Ruddick also involves skills that build trust by initiating and reliably maintaining relationships over time and by addressing conflict directly and fairly. She contrasts this active connectedness with military styles of relating that rely on isolation, alienation, and attempts to gain superior power. She concludes by recommending active connectedness as a viable alternative approach to diplomatic negotiation. The peacemaking actions of negotiators like Suzanne Massie, as well as women’s peace organizations offer concrete examples of women’s attempts to create peace through active connectedness. Heather Casey notes that a whole body of literature has emerged, describing women’s distinctive styles of diplomatic negotiation.<sup>178</sup> In addition, women researchers and women’s groups critique U.S. and other world leaders when they rely on violence instead of diplomatic negotiation to achieve

---

<sup>174</sup> Hurty, 176.

<sup>175</sup> Ibid., 178-79.

<sup>176</sup> Gilligan, 127, 72-75; Myers, 20-28.

<sup>177</sup> Romans 12:5 in Ryrie, 1560.

<sup>178</sup> Heather G. Casey, Assistant Professor of Political Science, Brenau University, conversation with author, Jan. 2002.

peace. Their reviews of history challenge the long-term efficacy of violence and war as a path to peace.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** Connectedness is the fertile ground out of which NFC women's solidarity and community leadership has emerged. Their trustworthiness over time has gained them credibility not only with their local community, but with the local high school, local government officials, and other community organizations; they have been called upon on numerous occasions to help negotiate difficult situations. In many ways, NFC members serve not only as advocates, but as diplomatic negotiators on behalf of their community, fostering collaboration with the city and other community groups, and translating policies and procedures back to the community.

NFC leaders work hard to understand others' perspectives and to create points of connection across diverse world views in the process of negotiating difficult situations. In negotiation, Miss Ann often uses examples that help others to grasp points of connection between their own situations and the situations of community members. She often articulates conflicts in nonjudgmental ways that allow others to imagine themselves in the situation of community members and to identify with their feelings and experiences in order to create common ground for collaborative change.

Connectedness maintained through sustained, active relationships with their community and larger culture characterizes the NFC's work. Women maintain connected relationships through regular contact with each other and with local community members, as well as with other community groups, city and county commission members, legislators, and other public officials, which facilitates and enhances their collaborative efforts. The women participate in all meetings affecting their community and understand the future of their families and communities to be directly connected with the decisions of the larger community and its governance structures. NFC members also participate in other related groups, such as the Human Relations Council.

**Experiences of shared body are embodied experiences of connection that contribute to women's sense of self-in-relation and shape**

**women's leadership.** Women's experiences of menstrual synchrony, sexuality, conception, pregnancy, childbirth, and breastfeeding can reinforce women's often close mother-daughter relationships, and can lead women to conceptualize themselves as "essentially connected," to others rather than "essentially separate".<sup>179</sup> Ruddick notes that, other than sexuality, birth "undermines the individuation of bodies" more so than other human experiences in life:

The growing fetus, increasingly visible in the woman's swelling body, an infant emerging from the vagina, a suckling infant feeding off a breast, the mother feeding with and of her body express in dramatic form a fusion of self and other.<sup>180</sup>

In pregnancy, for instance, a mother and child's fate are intimately intertwined. As children grow, this fusion with the mother is transformed into a connectedness that is maintained through relational intimacy based on empathy, and mutual caretaking of the relationship between mothers and daughters and mutual empowerment as already described.<sup>181</sup> This sustained mutuality develops over time into an understanding of the self as connected to others.<sup>182</sup> Women's experiences of shared body likely contribute to women's tendency to conceive of themselves as a self-in-relation described by Surrey and Jordan.<sup>183</sup>

Women's embodied and psychological connections with others foster a deeper awareness that what happens to one, happens to all. Many indigenous cultures have cosmologies in which people have a strong communal ethic and identity, and individuals exist as a microcosm of the whole.<sup>184</sup> Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr.'s statement that no one is free until all are free recognizes the larger connections between all people and communities, and ultimately, nations.

#### Connectedness, genuineness in caring, and sustained trustworthy

---

<sup>179</sup> Surrey, "Self-in-Relation," in Women's Growth in Connection, 53-66; Gilligan, 127-72.

<sup>180</sup> Ruddick, 191.

<sup>181</sup> Surrey, "Self-in-Relation," in Women's Growth in Connection, 53-66.

<sup>182</sup> Jordan, "Empathy and Self-Boundaries;" Jordan, "The Meaning of Mutuality;" Surrey, "Self-in-Relation;" and Surrey, "The Relational Self in Women: Clinical Implications," in Women's Growth in Connection, 67-80; 81-96; 53-66; 35-43.

<sup>183</sup> Ibid.

<sup>184</sup> Mann, 207-12, 234-35; Myers, 20-21.

relationships over time are foundational characteristics of women's mothering and leadership.<sup>185</sup> Connection is also the foundational characteristic underlying women's leadership as described by Hurty.<sup>186</sup> Women leaders tend to understand leadership not as a role, but as an expression of genuine caring that sustains relational connectedness over time.<sup>187</sup> School teacher Opal notes that "the gift of leadership" is "not bound in a role," but in actions that benefit children," note Nee-Benham and Cooper. Opal believes that teachers are leaders who must be "given the authority and power to make choices and to define the mission of a school with the needs and well-being of children clearly in focus."<sup>188</sup>

Women lead through connectedness and have a sense of self that is inseparable from their sense of connectedness to others, note Regan and Brooks; they maintain connected relationships with others.<sup>189</sup> Like Hurty, they describe connectedness as a characteristic of women's leadership, but they include it (along with inclusiveness,) as an aspect of collaboration.<sup>190</sup> Hurty writes that connectedness involves embracing the self and others,

Individuality and uniqueness can be valued in a connective community where equality, mutuality and reciprocity are present, and where separateness does not replace connectedness. Connectedness does, however, reject hierarchy in favor of an interactive web where autonomy and community are balanced.<sup>191</sup>

The NFC participates in such organizational webs. Connectedness as a web of collaborative relationships based on mutuality and peership is descriptive of women's NGOs worldwide. These webs continue to operate as effective collaboratives for peace and social justice.

#### **"Active connectedness" is a characteristic of women's leadership**

---

<sup>185</sup> Synthesis of Hurty, 3; Egan, 35, 90-94; and Ruddick, 46-51. Egan describes genuineness as an important characteristic of clinical counselor skill development.

<sup>186</sup> Hurty, 178-79.

<sup>187</sup> Regan and Brooks, 40-42; Noddings, 132, 144.

<sup>188</sup> Attributed to Opal, quoted in Ah Nee-Benham and Cooper, 106-08.

<sup>189</sup> Regan and Brooks, citing Sally Helgesen, The Female Advantage: Women's Ways of Leading (New York: Doubleday, 1990), 26.

<sup>190</sup> Regan and Brooks, 26-27.

<sup>191</sup> Hurty, 179-80.

**that informs women's distinctive approaches to conflict resolution, negotiation, and diplomacy.**<sup>192</sup> The ability to create relationships based on trust and accountability that women learn and teach in mothering are incorporated into women's leadership and diplomacy as an active connectedness, sustained through ongoing initiation and maintenance of relationships based in genuine concern for the needs of the other. "Because of the almost universal division of labor based on gender, women everywhere create cultures intensely focused on promoting the development of people and communities--not warmaking," write Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock.<sup>193</sup> Mothers relate to their children through an active connectedness that involves mutual giving and receiving as well as speaking rather than leaving, struggling to stay in the nonviolent fight, and remaining on the scene, writes Ruddick. "Peace is a way of living in which participants counting on connection demand a great deal of each other," Ruddick writes. "The peacemaker asks of herself and those she cares for not what they can afford to give up, but what they can give, not how they can be left alone, but that they can do together," she adds.<sup>194</sup>

"Maternal thinking," Ruddick writes, "articulates an opposed and superior conception of conflict resolution rooted in a maternal view of relationships."<sup>195</sup> Mothers, children, siblings, and friends, are not equal to each other; "power relations are shifting and complex," she writes, and strengths and weaknesses change places through mutuality in different contexts.<sup>196</sup>

Ruddick contrasts "active connectedness" with a prevailing diplomatic approach called "conflict resolution through mutual concessions," (CRTMC, so named by philosopher W. B. Gallie.) The nonviolent maternal practice of active connectedness offers an alternative to CRTMC, which is a conception of conflict and its resolution that has dominated public negotiation for decades of treaty making and

---

<sup>192</sup> Ruddick, 183, 176-84.

<sup>193</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 165, citing S. L. Bern, "The Lenses of Gender: Transforming the Debate on Sexual Inadequacy (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993).

<sup>194</sup> Ruddick, 181.

<sup>195</sup> Ibid., 180.

<sup>196</sup> Ibid.



arms negotiation.<sup>197</sup> She writes that Gallie describes this form of negotiating as dangerous and exploitative. "CRTMC is allegedly successful when each partner is free from fear of the other and can live alone, independently, in 'peace,'" Ruddick writes.<sup>198</sup> CRTMC involves negotiation between equals in which each gives up as little as necessary, (and ideally only the bargaining chips invented to be given up,) notes Ruddick. She points out that CRTMC is essentially negative even when it works:

At its best, CRTMC leads to a stasis of separate but equal partners each with cause to doubt whether the other will persist in renouncing violence if and when he becomes able to profit by it. Its best, then is... only second best to outright domination and is inherently unstable.<sup>199</sup>

Ruddick notes that "the task of making peace by giving and receiving while remaining in connection is radically different from and less dangerous than CRTMC."<sup>200</sup>

Ruddick points out the dangers of trusting nuclear weapons to the logic of CRTMC, and the equal insanity of the massive-scale diversion of national and world resources away from the concerns of children, families, and communities, toward the manufacture of "suicidally destructive weapons."<sup>201</sup> When CRTMC negotiators look at the emotions of peace, of life, they view them with pessimism, and an underlying equation in which strength, weakness, and unstable equalities result in domination, writes Ruddick. Mothers view the emotions of life more optimistically as crucial information. Mothers have experienced firsthand the costs of dominating and being dominated--"the fear and hatred of the dominated and anyone who sympathizes with them," the loss of trust of the dominated, and the pain of watching those they dominate "lose pleasure in themselves."<sup>202</sup>

Importantly, mothers teach their children to "learn to take strength from each

---

<sup>197</sup> Ibid., 178, citing W. B. Gallie, "Three Main Fallacies in the Discussion of Nuclear Weapons," in Dangers of Deterrence, ed. Nigel Blake and Kay Pole (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1983)

<sup>198</sup> Ruddick.

<sup>199</sup> Ibid., 179-80.

<sup>200</sup> Ibid., 181.

<sup>201</sup> Ibid.

<sup>202</sup> Ibid., 182.

other's strength rather than primarily from their weakness," to relate in mutual ways with others, and to "respect another's lively being."<sup>203</sup> She writes:

"Without being atypically unselfish, a mother may measure her power in terms of her ability to nurture a child whom she cannot dominate, a child lively with her own desires and projects."<sup>204</sup>

Mothers and children create together "an ongoing, changing approximation of mutuality," out of which they modify aggression in the interest of connection and develop connections that limit aggression before it arises, she writes.<sup>205</sup> Maternal peacemakers rely on radically different understandings of the self and human nature that emerge from women's psychologies like Jordan's, in which personal integration is achieved through relatedness, and interest in connection is the basic motivating force for psychological growth.<sup>206</sup> Jordan distinguishes the understanding of personal uniqueness from the need to be separate:

The espousal of self-containment, self-sufficiency, and self-assertion as a model for self-development contributes to the illusion of separateness and leads paradoxically to an experience of self as endangered and fragmented. When disconnected from you, I feel less confident that you will be responsive to my needs...<sup>207</sup>

Jordan points out that as a result of the lack of relational trust, the self develops systems of power, rights, and entitlements in attempts to assure that the needs of the self will be met by others.<sup>208</sup> This kind of disconnection, central to CRTMC, makes it unlikely that nations will accurately understand each others' actions or needs, let alone establish mutually responsive relationships. Ruddick notes that maternal practices are governed by trust building and connectedness:

Whatever their public antimilitarist commitments, nonviolent mothers offer an invigorating image of peace as an active connectedness. All participants resist others' violence and their own temptations to abandon or assault, persisting in relationships that include anger, disappointment, difference,

---

<sup>203</sup> Ibid.

<sup>204</sup> Ibid.

<sup>205</sup> Ibid.

<sup>206</sup> Judith V. Jordan, "Clarity in Connection: Empathic Knowing, Desire, and Sexuality," *Women's Growth In Diversity*, 51.

<sup>207</sup> Ibid.

<sup>208</sup> Ibid.

conflict, and nonviolent battle.<sup>209</sup>

Ruddick observes that there is a parallel process between maternal struggles for nonviolence and international struggles for peace that lasts.

Mothers can, and often do, renounce the violence to which they are tempted, fight back against the violence done to them and their children, name and insist on responsibility for damages done, yet forswear a scarring hatred in favor of a peace in which they can love and work.<sup>210</sup>

Forgiveness and the ability to move forward are important aspects of active connectedness in personal, communal, and international relations. Women leaders and peace organizations have often employed active connectedness in negotiating and diplomatic relations. A more publicly acknowledged explicit recognition of the value of mothers' practices of active connectedness for peacemaking and conflict prevention between nations may also empower more women to raise their sons and daughters to counteract militarism and to choose nonviolence.<sup>211</sup> The family also emerges as an important model for women's leadership in the research of Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock. There, skills such as inclusion, support of each family member, and support by each family member of the family as a whole, are learned and practiced.<sup>212</sup>

**Active connectedness is central to preventive diplomacy.** Women's leadership and matrilineal cultures like the Iroquois rely on active connectedness as an aspect of preventive diplomacy. Examples from women's historic actions for peace provide vivid illustrations of women's practices of active connectedness, and lend insight into their potential and real contributions to world transformation. These historic gestures of peacemaking based on active connectedness are supported by connectedness in women's theological understandings like McFague's conception of "the world as God's body" and the organic worldview described by Moore and

---

<sup>209</sup> Ruddick, 183-84.

<sup>210</sup> Ibid.

<sup>211</sup> Vickers cites a study of conscientious objectors during World War II by Dr. Elise Boulding which reveals that few women outside the historic peace churches supported their sons' pacifist positions. Vickers, 43-44, citing Elise Boulding, "Women and Peace Work," Women in the 20th Century World (New York: Sage, 1977).

<sup>212</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 262-266.

Myers.<sup>213</sup>

An aspect of women's leadership relevant to active connectedness not specifically named by Ruddick is hospitality. The Iroquois practiced peacemaking through "gifting," a form of hospitality difficult to translate into western thought, writes Mann.<sup>214</sup> This practice of regularly coming together with other nations to share gifts may have served to help the Iroquois maintain actively connected relationships with other nations.<sup>215</sup> The Iroquois League of Nations founded in 1142 C.E. existed for four centuries, mostly in peace, until colonization began with Columbus in 1492.<sup>216</sup> Eisler notes that "it takes far more courage to challenge unjust authority without violence..."<sup>217</sup> Women have often historically relied on connected relationships and nonviolent diplomacy in their efforts to prevent war.

International women took initiatives based on active connectedness and negotiation to prevent world World War I. According to Vickers, the first women's peace societies were begun in the U.S. in the 1830s.<sup>218</sup> Alonso describes their development as part of a feminist-pacifist consciousness.<sup>219</sup> This dual consciousness was largely modeled from the Iroquois women leaders and matrilineal culture, described by Mann.<sup>220</sup> The strength and leadership of Iroquois women was so well known to early colonists that it was expressed in "Columbia," the earliest symbol of the United States, notes Mann.<sup>221</sup> Harriet Hyman Alonso notes that the women's rights and feminist peace movements "burst on the scene" as elaborated

---

<sup>213</sup> McFague, World as God's Body, 20, 13-25; Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 144-47, 208-12; Myers, 17-28.

<sup>214</sup> Mann, 230-37, 442-43.

<sup>215</sup> Ibid., 230-37.

<sup>216</sup> Ibid., 38-39.

<sup>217</sup> Eisler, 393.

<sup>218</sup> Vickers, 118.

<sup>219</sup> Alonso, 20-25.

<sup>220</sup> Mann, 35, 40-43, 223, 265, 312.

<sup>221</sup> Ibid., 245-49, 180-82, citing Grinde and Johansen, Exemplar of Liberty, 125-34. This image is similar to that used by Columbia Pictures.

independent movements when World War I broke out.<sup>222</sup> Sybil Oldfield describes international women's spectacular effort to organize and prevent World War I through mediation and negotiation. She notes that Jane Addams received a cable from women in the Netherlands, during February, 1915, asking U.S. women to join together to form an International Women's Congress to stop the war.<sup>223</sup> "The original objects of the Women's International Congress were to (1) to demand that international disputes shall in the future be settled by some other means than war and (2) to claim that women should have a voice in the affairs of the nations," writes Oldfield.<sup>224</sup> Women of the congress offered concrete, practical alternatives to violent, competitive warfare. These resolutions for war prevention included the following, writes Oldfield:

a more just and cooperative regulation of international commercial, nonmilitary trade; open diplomacy instead of covert intrigue and secret treaties; and self-determination for small nations. They also supported the creation of international bodies for arbitration and conciliation once conflicts had broken out.<sup>225</sup>

She notes that these resolutions anticipated and influenced Wilson's Fourteen Points.<sup>226</sup> These women "presented a peace petition to the UK government in July 1914 on behalf of 12 million women in 26 countries," writes Vickers.<sup>227</sup> Oldfield notes that the women's congress sent envoys to all the capitals of Europe, both neutral and belligerent.<sup>228</sup> Jane Addams was sent to accompany "Dr. Aletta Jacobs and Dr. Alice Hamilton in meetings with the foreign ministries in London, Berlin, Vienna, Budapest, Bern, Rome, Paris, and Le Havre." Oldfield describes the resistance met by these courageous women:

All the belligerents claimed they were fighting in self-defense and must carry on to the bitter end. To be seen willing to negotiate would look like

---

<sup>222</sup> Alonso, 21.

<sup>223</sup> Oldfield, in *Women in World Politics*, 158-59.

<sup>224</sup> *Ibid.*, 160.

<sup>225</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>226</sup> *Ibid.*, 165.

<sup>227</sup> Vickers, 120.

<sup>228</sup> Oldfield, in *Women in World Politics*, 160, citing the report of the Women's International Congress held in the Fawcett Archive, City of London University.

weakness.<sup>229</sup>

Vickers notes that Addams was most struck by “the sheer horror of militarism as expressed by young soldiers of all nationalities:”

We were told in several countries that in order to inhibit the sensibilities of this type of man, stimulants were given to the soldiers before a bayonet charge was ordered. The men had to be primed with rum or absinthe.”<sup>230</sup>

The Women’s International Congress met again in 1919 where it formally organized as a nonprofit, nongovernmental organization, (NGO), called the Women’s International League for Peace and Freedom, which has been a leader in U.S. women’s peace work for almost ninety years. Despite their “detailed prophetic critique of the punitive clauses of the Treaty of Versailles” delivered to “the deaf ears of the U.S. ambassador to Paris,” Jeanette Rankin, the first woman elected to the U.S. Congress, was the only member of the Congress to vote against U.S. participation in WWI.<sup>231</sup>

Suzanne Massie’s diplomatic intervention during the Cold War. The blackout of diplomatic relations between U.S. President Ronald Reagan and Russian Yuri Andropov that occurred in 1983 when Russian fighter jets shot down a Korean Boeing 747 jetliner on its way to Seoul, illustrates the dangerous nature of the disconnected, individualistic, competitive, and dominating assumptions that underlie CRTMC. Massie’s courageous struggle to restore dialogue between these two men in 1983 illustrates the power of women’s leadership based on connection, dialogue, nonviolence, and mutuality. Ethicist James Fowler describes the intervention of Massie, who was an American historian and specialist in Russian culture, instrumental in reestablishing negotiations between the U.S. and Russia.<sup>232</sup> Fowler quotes Massie’s Moscow conversation with a Soviet in the government:

---

<sup>229</sup> Ibid., 160. This is the same sentiment I have heard as a school counselor from high school boys and girls who tell me that they cannot walk away from a fight because they would appear weak.

<sup>230</sup> This quote is attributed to Jane Addams according to Davis, American Heroine, 226; quoted in Oldfield, in Women in World Politics, 161.

<sup>231</sup> Ibid., 162-63; Vickers, 119.

<sup>232</sup> James Fowler, Weaving the New Creation: Stages of Faith and the Public Church (New York: HarperSanFrancisco, 1991), 50-54.

"He looked at me with his eyes blazing and said, 'You don't know how close war is?' I was used to Soviet brands of bluffing... but there was something about the urgent way he spoke, plus my knowledge of his high connections, which chilled. I could not put it out of my mind..."<sup>233</sup>

She became determined to try to speak with President Reagan, but was turned away. She met with a Senator, then Reagan's National Security Advisor, and finally, Reagan and his staff, and was sent to the Soviets to reestablish communication, which she did. Massie had eighteen talks with Reagan, briefing him before all meetings with President Gorbachev.<sup>234</sup>

In 1985, a Geneva summit between Reagan and Gorbachev was called, in which personal breakthroughs were made that led to subsequent meetings in Reykjavik and later in Washington. Preparing to brief Reagan, she remembered a wooden egg made by farmers in Volga with picture of the Virgin Mary painted on it and the Russian statement, "Don't Blow Up the World." Her son had told her, somewhat bitterly, "You should give that to President Reagan; he's the one who needs that message," recounts Fowler.<sup>235</sup> She gave Reagan the egg at the end of their conversation, saying, "For the Russians the egg is the symbol of new beginnings. Why don't you give it to Mr. Gorbachev? He'll know what it means." The president did not reply. She told Fowler that "Sometimes you don't have to see everything... God does His work as He wishes."<sup>236</sup> When asked how she came to take the tremendous initiatives she took, she said, "I simply knew in a deep way that I had to get to the president, and that I was the one who had to do it."<sup>237</sup> Fowler concludes that these events "bear the marks of the subtle power of divine providence... making a way where there is no way."<sup>238</sup>

Reagan's lack of response to Gorbachev's peace overtures, might be considered a normal part of the bargaining process that is central to CRTMC. With

---

<sup>233</sup> Ibid., 51.

<sup>234</sup> Ibid., 53.

<sup>235</sup> Ibid.

<sup>236</sup> Ibid.

<sup>237</sup> Ibid., 54.

<sup>238</sup> Fowler writes that he tells of Suzanne Massie's story with her permission and it is based upon an interview with her, and upon facts from other sources.

Massie's help, a fifty percent reduction in strategic nuclear weapons, (involving some of the most dangerous nuclear weapons,) was agreed on by Reagan and Gorbachev in 1985, Fowler notes.<sup>239</sup>

The examples of women like Jane Addams and her colleagues and Suzanne Massie provide models for contemporary uses of active connectedness in women's daring and dramatic initiatives to repair international relationships and fashion peace. Heather Casey, Assistant Professor of Political Science at Brenau University notes that a whole body of literature has emerged describing women's styles of diplomacy.<sup>240</sup> Women offer unique contributions to peacemaking because of their "concern with relationships," writes Vickers, adding that "women tend toward holistic views which focus on problems in their general context and over a longer time period, including past as well as future." Here, Vickers notes women's greater attention to context, also noted by Collins, particularly historical context, as it applies to diplomacy. She believes that women have unique abilities in the area of negotiation:

...in the global context their perspective makes it possible for them to see the inter-relationships between equality, development and peace, and the need to analyse any strategies about each within the context of the other two, and enables them to become catalysts for peace and political change.<sup>241</sup>

Education of women leaders for roles in international diplomacy and peacemaking can help prepare leadership for a peaceful world.

**Women's historical critiques reveal that U.S. and world leaders have often failed to use preventive diplomacy to avert war.** Women writing in a variety of disciplines critique the failure of world leaders to use diplomatic negotiations as an alternative to violence, and describe the tragic consequences of such choices. A synthesis of their research reveals a disturbing consistency in the

---

<sup>239</sup> Synthesis of Fowler; 50-54; and Ruth Leger Sivard, Arlette Brauer, and Milton I. Roemer, World Military and Social Expenditures 1989 (Washington, D.C.: World Priorities, 1989), 39.

<sup>240</sup> Casey.

<sup>241</sup> Vickers, 130, citing research by Betty Reardon for the United Nations/NGO kit on "Women and Peace," UN/NGOs, Geneva.



failure of many U.S. leaders (with the notable exception of former President Jimmy Carter,) to utilize diplomatic negotiations to fashion peace and avert war, with preventable and profoundly tragic consequences. These choices rest on a rejection of connectedness with other nations as part of one human family, and rely instead on dualistic constructions in which the other is portrayed as “the enemy.”<sup>242</sup> Such patterns are continued in current crises like the U.S. war in Afghanistan, the conflicts between Israel and the Palestinians, and in the Bush administration’s decision to develop small-scale nuclear weapons for use in conventional warfare as part of its war on terrorism. Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock note the importance of the human family in women’s leadership.

The moment that one embraces the idea that we are all members of one family, the dualisms that pit the We against the Other become ludicrous.<sup>243</sup>

Women have historically valued the importance of maintaining connectedness and the integrity of the human family through diplomatic negotiation in international relations; women’s critiques challenge failure to use preventive diplomacy.

Julia Ward Howe wrote her famous Mother’s Day Proclamation, “Appeal to Womanhood Throughout the World,” calling for a worldwide Congress of Women in response to the Franco-Prussian War of 1870. During the war, Howe wondered, “Why do not the mothers of mankind interfere in these matters, to prevent the waste of that human life of which they alone bear and know the cost?” quote Laura E. Richards and Maude Howe Elliott in their biography of Howe.<sup>244</sup> They note that her appeal was translated into French, Spanish, Italian, German, and Swedish and was broadcast in many countries, (see Appendix F). In December, 1870, Howe, William Cullen Bryant, and Mary F. Davis, organized a “World’s Congress of Women in behalf of International Peace” in New York, followed by one in Boston.

---

<sup>242</sup> Ruddick, 164, citing Jean Bethke Elshtain, “Reflections on War and Political Discourse: Realism, Just War, and Feminism in a Nuclear Age,” Political Theory (February 1985) 49050. Elshtain notes that military theorists use absolute and abstract terms in order to create a distinction between killing and murder.

<sup>243</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 266.

<sup>244</sup> Laura E. Richards and Maude Howe Elliott, assisted by Florence Howe Hall, Julia Ward Howe 1819-1910 1-2 (Atlanta: Cherokee Publishing, 1990), 301.

Quoting scripture, Howe also preached about peace in London. She followed these efforts by creating an annual Mothers' Day festival on June 2, focusing on peace advocacy which were held annually over thirty-nine years by she and her followers as well as other groups such as the Pennsylvania Peace Society and the Universal Peace Union, (who last celebrated it in Riverton, New Jersey, in 1912).<sup>245</sup>

In 1915, Women from the Netherlands called for a Women's International Congress and advocated diplomatic mediation between nations in an attempt to end World War I. Delegations of women from thirteen countries attended, including Jane Addams' U.S. delegation. Women from six other countries sent letters of support, writes Oldfield.<sup>246</sup> The women resolved to send delegations of women to every belligerent and neutral nation asking for a negotiated rather than military settlement of the war. Neutral nations were asked to mediate a settlement, and they in turn, suggested that the United States should head such an effort. Jane Adams pleaded with President Wilson to head an effort of neutral governments to mediate between belligerent nations and prevent U.S. involvement in World War I. Instead Woodrow Wilson led the U.S. into the war, writes Oldfield. "Far from ending as soon as possible with a just, negotiated peace, the war dragged on through the slaughter of the Somme, Verdun, and Passchendaele to the punitive, doomed Treaty of Versailles," she further notes.<sup>247</sup> As the newly-formed WILPF predicted, the punitive terms of the Treaty and the war itself, which left Germany bombed out and suffering massive starvation,) set up the conditions for World War II.

Oldfield describes the failure of world leaders to utilize mediation to prevent the war as "the chance the world missed."<sup>248</sup> In retrospect, the suffering and horror of the Holocaust and the nuclear bombings which could have been prevented, is sobering. World War I left Germany bombed out, and in the depths of poverty and devastation--conditions which fermented World War II and created a people ripe for

---

<sup>245</sup> Ibid., 302-19.

<sup>246</sup> Oldfield, in Women in World Politics, 160.

<sup>247</sup> Ibid., 160-61.

<sup>248</sup> Oldfield, in Women in World Politics, 155-67.

manipulation by Hitler and his inhuman racist ideologies. Oldfield writes, "By 1920, Jane Addams' only preoccupation was how to organize postwar reconstruction so that future wars could be prevented and her thoughts on this problem were published in 1922 as *Peace and Bread in Time of War*."<sup>249</sup> She believed that the struggle for power was not the central human reality, but the reality of the human experience of life needs, particularly the need for food, and compassion for those who are without food. A collective international effort organized primarily by women culminated in Fridtof Nansen's 1921 address to the United Nations requesting "a coordinated international effort to relieve twenty-five million starving Russians," which was rejected, writes Oldfield.<sup>250</sup>

The U.S. bombed Hiroshima and Nagasaki after without attempting diplomatic negotiations, and thus entered World War II. The U.S. government had prior warning of Pearl Harbor and allowed U.S. soldiers to be killed in the "surprise" attack, a fact which the U.S. public is still largely unaware, notes Canadian physicist Rosalie Bertell.<sup>251</sup> Both Bertell and Welch document world leaders' rejection of diplomatic negotiation that resulted in U.S. action to drop the bomb, even though "on 16 July 1945 the emperor of Japan had asked the Soviet government to mediate peace between Japan and the United States."<sup>252</sup> Bertell notes that Soviet leader Molotov told the Emperor that "they would 'study' the question."<sup>253</sup> Truman responded by dropping pamphlets over Japan, that said, "Surrender

---

<sup>249</sup> Ibid., 163, citing Jane Addams, *Peace and Bread in Time of War*, (1922; reprint, Boston: Hall, 1960), 75.

<sup>250</sup> Oldfield, in *Women in World Politics*, 164, citing Addams, 213.

<sup>251</sup> Rosalie Bertell, *No Immediate Danger: Prognosis for a Radioactive Earth* (Summertown, Tn.: Book Publishing, 1985), 151, citing historian John Costello, whose observation was discussed in the *Toronto Sun* 14 May 1981, 11. Bertell, 151, writes that the documents were revealed in the *New York Times* by defense specialist Drew Middleton. Bertell notes that Costello used intelligence material in the U.S. National Archives and British Security Co-ordination Documents to determine "that a warning of the Pearl Harbor attack was submitted to both the British and U.S. governments at least two weeks before it took place... Churchill's records for that period are marked 'Closed for 75 years' in the Public Record Office. It has been speculated that the national leaders deemed the surprise element of the attack 'necessary' to rouse the U.S. public sufficiently to enter the Second World War."

<sup>252</sup> Bertell, 135-37; Welch, 42.

<sup>253</sup> Bertell, 136.

unconditionally or be destroyed,” although “the nature of the new bomb was not explained.”<sup>254</sup> Four days after Japan had made its second request for a diplomatically negotiated peace settlement, the bomb was dropped on Hiroshima. Bertell writes that the U.S. apparently had a deliberate plan to test two types of nuclear weapons: uranium and plutonium in a real-war situation. The U.S. filmed the blasts, but suppressed the footage for thirty years. Bertell writes:

[The American people] knew nothing about Japanese surrender attempts prior to the atomic bombing. They were led to believe that only a bloody invasion of the Japanese mainland could have ended hostilities.<sup>255</sup>

The book, Hiroshima Notes, which tells the stories of survivors, was also suppressed by U.S. occupation forces from 1950 until 1981 in an attempt to conceal the devastating health effects of the nuclear attack and its consequences to future generations.<sup>256</sup> Bertell writes, “Most A-bomb victims became radically pacifist, realising very quickly that the presence of nuclear bombs made war--any war--now unthinkable.”<sup>257</sup> The Hiroshima Peace Institute at the Hiroshima City University in Japan now teaches courses in theories of peace and peace methodologies research.<sup>258</sup>

These U.S. nuclear attacks “were apparently meant as much as a threat to the Russians as a punishment to the Japanese,” writes Bertell, thereby intensifying existing tensions between the U.S. and Russia into the Cold War whose potential for nuclear destruction overshadowed the world for two generations, notes Bertell.<sup>259</sup> Russia developed nuclear capabilities in 1948.

Millions of people throughout the world recognized the destructive power of nuclear weapons and an approaching crisis between the U.S. and the Soviet Union, and signed documents that appealed for peace, known as the Stockholm Appeal, which was formally delivered to the World Peace Council on March 19, 1950, notes

---

<sup>254</sup> Ibid.

<sup>255</sup> Ibid., 151.

<sup>256</sup> Ibid., 137, 146, 88-105.

<sup>257</sup> Ibid., 138.

<sup>258</sup> Chronicles of Higher Education, faculty position advertisement, 12 Oct. 2001.

<sup>259</sup> Bertell, 156.

Bertell.<sup>260</sup>

Former President Jimmy Carter charts a dramatic increase in the use of violence to solve international conflicts by presidents who followed him in office including Ronald Reagan (1981-1989), George Bush (1989-1993), and William Clinton (1993-1995), in his book, *Talking Peace: A Vision for the Next Generation*.<sup>261</sup>

Former President Bush refused diplomatic negotiations in the Gulf War. Vickers describes President H.W. Bush's complete refusal to negotiate with President Hussein out of his concern "that the whole of Middle East oil would fall into the hands of someone they considered a dictator, who could then blackmail consumer nations." She reports that "There were many... in the U.S. government, who wished to give negotiations and sanctions a chance..."<sup>262</sup> The WILPF campaigned actively for a diplomatic negotiations, and Church Women United (C.W.U.), sent more than 30,000 signatures on a petition calling for negotiations instead of war to the White House, writes Vickers.<sup>263</sup> Former President Carter also urged that peaceful options be exhausted first.<sup>264</sup> The Iraqi Women's Federation demonstrated for peace before the war broke out, and the Pan-Arab Women's Solidarity Association called for a resolution of the crisis by Arab nations, writes Vickers. In the U.S., Church Women United sent 30,000 peace petition signatures calling for negotiations instead of war to the White House and Congress. Alan Geyer and Barbara Green provide a detailed account of President Bush's "diplomacy-as-communication-of-threats-and-ultimatums--but 'no negotiation, no compromises, no face-saving measures,'" which failed to prevent war; Bush's letter to Saddam Hussein called for unconditional withdrawal from Kuwait.<sup>265</sup>

---

<sup>260</sup> Ibid., 156-57.

<sup>261</sup> Carter, 43-47.

<sup>262</sup> Vickers, 56-57.

<sup>263</sup> Ibid., 51-53.

<sup>264</sup> Carter, 18.

<sup>265</sup> Alan Geyer and Barbara Green, *Lines in the Sand: Justice and the Gulf War* (Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1992), 100, 99, 94-100.

The September 11th tragedy might have been prevented if diplomatic measures had been used rather retaliation. Factors that precipitated the September 11th terrorist attacks on the United States include: Former President Clinton's retaliatory bombings of Sudan and Afghanistan after the 1998 embassy bombings, U.S. historic support of the oppressive regime of the Sha in Saudi Arabia to assure U.S. continued access to oil while ignoring Saudi human rights violations, the perception that U.S. has one-sidedly supported Israel in "Israel's conflict with the Palestinians," U.S. failure to vacate Saudi Arabia after the Gulf War, U.N. sanctions against Iraq, and entrenched patterns of global corporate imperialism.<sup>266</sup> News correspondent Peter Jennings notes that most Muslims did not condone bin Laden's terrorism against the U.S., nevertheless, "There is an accumulation of resentment about the United States and a deep desire on behalf of all Muslims that the United States would understand them better."<sup>267</sup> All of these precipitating factors could have been eliminated through diplomatic negotiation and ethical international conduct.

In response to the terrorist actions of September 11, 2001, President George Bush unequivocally declared war on terrorism, refusing diplomatic negotiations with the Taliban. Like Jeanette Rankin, "Representative Barbara Lee, a Democrat from California," was the "lone member of Congress to vote against using military force" in war--this time--in the U.S. war against terrorism in Afghanistan.<sup>268</sup>

The provisional government in Afghanistan, which seemed to be so efficiently set up in the aftermath of the war, was actually made possible through previous long-term diplomatic work focused on building relationships among Northern Alliance leaders by Roger Plunk, a "free-lance" peacemaker.<sup>269</sup>

---

<sup>266</sup> Abdullahi An-Naim, Emory University law professor and Islam and Human Rights, "Not the True Islam," interview by Deborah Scroggins Atlanta Journal Constitution, 16 Sept. 2001, C-7; Minefield: The United States and the Muslim World, prod. Tom Yellin, dir. Roger Goodman, reported by Peter Jennings, ABC television, WSB, Gainesville, Ga., 15 Sept. 2001; Peter Bergen, author of Holy War, Inc., interview by Steve Scully Washington Journal, (12 Nov. 2001) C-SPAN cable television, Gainesville, Ga., citing his interview with Osama bin Laden.

<sup>267</sup> Jennings.

<sup>268</sup> "Who Epitomizes Freedom to You? A Few Freethinkers Name Their Heroes," O, The Oprah Magazine, Feb. 2002, 143.

<sup>269</sup> Roger Plunk, "The Freelance Peacemaker," Utne Reader, Jan.-Feb. 2002, 64-66.

Unfortunately, neither Plunk's leadership role, nor the crucial foundational role of diplomatic negotiation, were discussed in mainstream media accounts. On April 20, 2002, one hundred thousand people marched in Washington, D.C. in "United We March Against the War at Home and Abroad." The march was sponsored primarily by a coalition of four primary groups; smaller groups such as the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom and others supported and participated in the march.<sup>270</sup>

A pattern of international relations characterized by demands for unconditional surrender or withdrawal accompanied by threats of violence and a refusal of diplomatic negotiation emerges in the presidencies of Truman, former president Bush, and current president Bush, and indeed most U.S. presidents.

Bush's descriptions, in early 2002, of certain nations as an axis of evil are dualistic and destructive of the potential for diplomatic trust building and goodwill. They deny any U.S. responsibility for international conflicts, contradict Christian understandings of the inclusive family of God and other organic worldviews, rupture and escalate international tensions; and refuse any attempt to mend international relations through the active connectedness that can be achieved through diplomatic negotiation. These statements create alienation and hostility, rather than a connectedness that relies on intensive conflict resolution.

This alienation is only intensified by proposed development of small-scale nuclear weapons which is already under way by the Bush administration.<sup>271</sup>

Lessons from history regarding the immoral failure of the U.S. to use diplomacy to avert nuclear bombings of Hiroshima and Nagasaki provide little hope that these weapons can be used responsibly in the future. Further, they reveal that in the

---

<sup>270</sup> Jody Dodd, Leadership and Outreach Coordinator of the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, conversation with author, 30 April 2002. The march was sponsored by the National Youth and Student Coalition, the National Coalition for Peace and Justice, the 911 Emergency Response Network, and New York Labor Against War. Mobilization for Global Justice, a group in Washington to attend the IMF and World Bank meetings, also attended the march.

<sup>271</sup> Raffi Khatchadourian, "Relearning to Love the Bomb: A Move is on to Blur the Line Between Conventional and Nuclear Weapons," The Nation, 1 April 2002, 26-27. This is discussed in more detail in a later chapter.

event of such use, the public is unlikely to be accurately informed of events. Evidence that such patterns are continuing is revealed in information from the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom. Jody Dodd, Leadership and Outreach Coordinator of the WILPF, asserts that the WILPF strongly believes, despite the U.S. government's continuing denial, that radioactive depleted uranium-tipped shells used by the U.S. military in Kuwait during the Gulf War are the cause of the radiation sickness of the Gulf War Syndrome.<sup>272</sup> Gulf War veterans have also called for an investigation regarding the relationship between their illnesses and the

---

<sup>272</sup> Jody Dodd, Leadership and Outreach Coordinator of the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, conversation with author, 20 April 2002; Paul Sullivan, (Executive Director of NGWRC) "NGWRC (National Gulf War Resource Center) Criticizes Conflict of Interest: DoD (Department of Defense) Appoints Energy Department to Review Radiation, Letter to Ms. Isabel Fisenne of the Environmental Measurements Laboratory, U.S. Department of Energy," posted on 4 Oct. 1999, (article on-line); available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRC) <http://www.ngwrc.org>. This article describes the NGWRC's investigative report and medical research papers which reveal numerous health effects of depleted uranium, including the creation of tumorigenic cells in mice, strong evidence that it is carcinogenic, and mutagenic characteristics in animals. The report notes that "radioactive toxic waste was found in the semen of some veterans. The VA (Veterans Administration) also found neurological problems associated with DU contamination. One Gulf War veteran has a tumor near the site of a DU shrapnel wound." Additional articles on-line available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRC) <http://www.ngwrc.org> include the following: The Associated Press, "Air Force to Resume Training in Nevada Using Depleted Uranium Rounds: Air Force Claims No Health or Environmental Threat," posted on 5 April 2002; S. J. Hodge, et. al., "Detection of Depleted Uranium in Biological Samples from Gulf War Veterans," *Mil. Med.* Dec. 2001, 166(12 Suppl): 69-70, Bethesda, Maryland: Armed Forces Radiobiology Research Institute, posted on 11 Jan. 2002; Charles Sheehan-Miles, "NGWRC Petitions the Department of Justice/Gulf Vets' Resource Center Files Petition: DOJ Ruling Favors Corporate Interests Over Veterans," posted on 24 June 1996; H. Kang, et. al., "Pregnancy Outcomes among U.S. Gulf War Veterans: A Population-Based Survey of 30,000 Veterans," *Ann. Epidemiology* 11, no. 7 (11 Oct. 2001): 504-11, Environmental Epidemiology Service, Department of Veterans Affairs, Washington, D.C., posted at the National Gulf War Resource Center website as "Birth Defects Higher in Gulf War Vet Children: New Study Shows Higher Levels of Birth Defects, posted on 10 Oct. 2001; Suzanne Gamboa, "Study: Gulf War Vets' Children More Likely to Have Birth Defects: New Study from V.A., Johns Hopkins Contradicts Earlier Pentagon Claims," 5 Oct. 2001, Washington, D.C., posted 10 Oct. 2001; Dave Parks, "Gulf War Teaching Military Lessons: Birmingham News on the Atlanta Conference," posted on 5 May 2002; Waief Faleh, "WHO (World Health Organization) Studies Depleted Uranium in Iraq: The Six-Member WHO Team Arrived in Baghdad Late Monday on a Mission Agreed to in Geneva in April to Study Levels of Cancer and Other Diseases in Iraq," posted on 5 Sept. 2001; "Gulf War Vets Face Higher Risk of Lou Gehrig's: Government Study First to Acknowledge Link Between Service and Specific Disease," posted on 11 Dec. 2001; "V.A. Recognizes Gulf War Illnesses, Forms New Research Advisory Committee: New Panel Meets In Washington April 11-12," posted on 6 April 2002.



use of dirty uranium shells in the Gulf War.<sup>273</sup> The development of any such new nuclear weapons would be a violation of the 1970 Nuclear Proliferation Treaty.<sup>274</sup>

Similar allegations have been made by callers to C-Span's Washington Journal, notably during its April 29, 2002 interview of Kimberly Kagan, U.S. Military Academy at West Point Assistant Professor of History. During the show, a caller stated that the U.S. government had used depleted uranium in Kuwait without informing U.S. servicemen. Kagan declined to comment.<sup>275</sup> Symptoms of U.S. servicemen and residents of Kuwait--and related birth defects in children--closely parallel the health effects of nuclear radiation described by Canadian physicist Rosalie Bertell.<sup>276</sup>

These factors as well as the massive destructive power of nuclear weapons, shed light on the immorality of the existence of such weapons and their power, by virtue of their very existence, to hinder the development of connectedness and trust among nations.

Alternatively, because people are most likely to use the skills they know, teaching women's leadership skills and conflict resolution facilitated through active connectedness can increase the probability that they will be used, just as teaching the skills of war increases the probability of their use.

History bears out these probabilities: the U.S. provided training and arms to groups that later became the Taliban movement during the Soviet invasion of

---

<sup>273</sup> Sullivan, "NGWRC Criticizes Conflict of Interest"; Paul Sullivan, "Gulf War Vets Press for Investigation," posted spring 2002, (article on-line); available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRC) <http://www.ngwrc.org>.

<sup>274</sup> Khatchadourian, 26-27.

<sup>275</sup> Kimberly Kagan, U.S. Military Academy at West Point Assistant Professor of History, interview by Steve Scully, Washington Journal, C-SPAN cable television, Gainesville, Ga., 29 April 2002.

<sup>276</sup> Bertell, 137-46, 88-105.

Afghanistan (under the presidency of George Bush, followed by Clinton).<sup>277</sup>

Saddam Hussein was empowered to attack Kuwait largely due to U.S. aid during the Iran-Iraq war, during which the Reagan administration provided classified intelligence, American-made weapons, and technology to both Iraq and Iran.<sup>278</sup>

During the years immediately preceding the Gulf War in 1991, the Reagan and Bush administrations provided Iraq with "billions of dollars in U.S. government financing and hundreds of millions of dollars' worth of advanced machinery and electronic equipment," notes William D. Hartung.<sup>279</sup> "While Bush administration officials tried to downplay the importance of this assistance, there is now no question that the United States provided vital resources that were utilized in Iraqi programs for the construction of missiles, conventional bombs, and nuclear, chemical and biological weapons," notes William D. Hartung.<sup>280</sup> Together, the U.S., the Soviet Union, France, and the Gulf sheikdoms provided Hussein with "tens of billions of dollars' worth of advanced weaponry during the 1980s," adds Hartung.<sup>281</sup>

The U.S. used and NATO may well have also used depleted uranium-tipped shells in Kuwait.<sup>282</sup> Given that the Taliban is considered responsible for the September 11th terrorist attacks, and afterward, threatened to dump nuclear waste

---

<sup>277</sup> William Hartung, And Weapons for All (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1994), also available from <http://www.worldpolicy.org>, 127, 122, citing Robert Pear, "30 Afghan Rebels Slain by Rival Band," New York Times, 18 July 1989; Clifford Krauss, "Congress May Cut Afghan Rebel Aid," New York Times, 30 Sept. 1990; and Jim Hoagland, "Afghan Endgame," Washington Post, 27 April 1992. See also Hartung, 100, 105, and 212, citing Jeff Gerth, "Help for Rebels for U.S. Arms," New York Times, 4 Feb. 1987.

<sup>278</sup> Vickers, 54.

<sup>279</sup> Hartung, 224. See also the World Policy Institute research available on-line from <http://www.worldpolicy.org>.

<sup>280</sup> Ibid., citing Kenneth R. Timmerman, The Death Lobby: How the West Armed Iraq (New York: Houghton Mifflin, 1991), and citing Alan Friedman, Spider's Web: The Secret History of How the White House Armed Iraq (New York: Bantam Books, 1993).

<sup>281</sup> Hartung, 206.

<sup>282</sup> Dodd, Leadership and Outreach Coordinator, Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, conversation with author, 30 April 2002; Frida Berrigan, World Policy Institute, "U.S. Weapons Systems in Afghanistan," Women's International League for Peace and Freedom (WILPF), (articles on-line), posted 7 Dec. 2001, available from <http://www.reachingcriticalwill.org>. Berrigan notes that the A-10/oA-10 Thunderbolt II or "warhog" plane carried "armor piercing" depleted uranium weapons during the Gulf War.

on the U.S., it would appear that armament and training for war, gives rise to further violence, rather than peace. Further, weapons developed for use on others are frequently used in return on their developers. Other examples include the U.S. Army School of the Americas, in Ft. Benning, Georgia which teaches counterinsurgency operations, and as recently as 1991, taught torture techniques and execution.<sup>283</sup> These practices have been visited on Latin American and U.S. citizens in numerous Latin American countries.<sup>284</sup>

Biases toward violent, rather than peaceful conflict resolution are also often reflected in approaches to the study of history. Hall County high school social studies teacher, Kathy Strickland, observes that U.S. History and World History courses and texts are often structured around wars and battles. She adds that many of her students have noticed this pattern and have shared with her questions and confusion regarding this overemphasis. Curriculum revisions can offer students new opportunities to learn about diplomatic negotiation and conflict resolution skills, and to study international institutions that, with reform, hold promise for peacemaking, such as the United Nations.<sup>285</sup>

Vickers notes that women are increasingly "playing an important role in exercising pressure on governments for the peaceful resolution of conflict."<sup>286</sup>

Women's NGOs in Chechnya advocated with their government to stop the Chechnian War.<sup>287</sup> Israeli and Palestinian women of the Joint Palestinian/Israeli Women's Co-ordinating Committee have urged their leaders to negotiate a peaceful settlement since 1989, writes Vickers. In 1990, they "expressed their

---

<sup>283</sup> School of Assassins Watch, "School of Assassins: The U.S. Army School of the Americas, a Trail of Suffering in Latin America," (flyer), Columbus, Ga.: SOA Watch, also available from: <http://www.derechos.org/soaw/>.

<sup>284</sup> Michelle Tooley and Rick Axtell, "Guatemala and the Slaughter of the Innocents," Seeds Magazine, Dec. 1995, 12, 14.

<sup>285</sup> Kathy Strickland, Social Studies teacher in a Georgia high school, conversation with author, April 2002.

<sup>286</sup> Vickers, 136-38.

<sup>287</sup> Tatiana Zabelina and Yevgenia Issraelyan of the Moscow Institute of Youth and the Institute of U.S.A. and Canada, "The War in Chechnya: A Feminist Perspective," Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom (1996): 61-65.

alarm and repugnance at the rapid deterioration of conditions in their region,” writes Vickers, presumably resulting from the the failure of their respective leaders to work effectively for peace.<sup>288</sup>

Women’s historical critiques demythologize the long-term efficacy of violence in creating peace, suggesting instead the effectiveness of international diplomacy based on an active connectedness. Women’s connected leadership holds promise for the securing of a sustainable peaceful future for the world.

**Women’s research exposes the myth that violence and war are effective means of solving conflicts long-term.** The ineffectiveness of violence, war and threats of war, without the use of conflict resolution, is discussed in contexts such as war, retaliation against terrorism, and peacekeeping missions.

As already noted, both World Wars and the Holocaust might have been prevented if world leaders, particularly Woodrow Wilson had been willing to utilize diplomatic negotiation rather than violence during World War I. The devastating poverty created by WWI and the punitive Treaty of Versailles laid the foundation for World War II. Like WILPF, Gandhi also criticized this treaty, which he said, would have been more accurately described as the terms for war, rather than for establishing peace. Puri notes that Gandhi believed the treaty to be a “treaty of revenge against Germany” which only led to more war.<sup>289</sup> World War II also could have been prevented through the use of diplomatic negotiation by Truman with the Emperor of Japan. World War II led to the Cold War and the threat of nuclear annihilation which lasted for decades.

Women’s NGOs such as the Women’s International League for Peace and Freedom opposed the U.S. retaliatory war in Afghanistan after the September 11 attacks.<sup>290</sup> Former President Clinton’s bombings (which killed a few thousand civilians) in Sudan and Afghanistan were retaliation attacks after the 1998 embassy

---

<sup>288</sup> Vickers, 137.

<sup>289</sup> Rashmi-Sudha Puri, *Gandhi on War and Peace* (New York: Praeger, 1987), 166-67, citing Pyarelal, *Mahatma Gandhi, The Last Phase*, vol. 1 (Ahmedabad: Navajivan, 1956), 117, 169, citing *Harajan*, vol. 6 (New York: Garland, 1973), 290.

<sup>290</sup> Jody Dodd, Leadership and Outreach Coordinator of the Women’s International League for Peace and Freedom, conversations with author; 20 and 30 April 2002.

bombings. Clinton's retaliatory bombings were described by Peter Jennings as one of the underlying reasons for the September 11 attacks.<sup>291</sup> This reliance on retaliatory attacks by Clinton and Bush has embroiled the United States in years of unresolved conflicts with terrorists.

Mark Juergensmeyer notes that it is common for retaliation to lead to prolonged conflict. He observes that violent retaliations against terrorist strikes "have seldom been effective."<sup>292</sup> Such attacks rarely destroy their targets and often invite more terrorist attacks in return. He emphasizes that, "few governments have been willing to sink to the savage levels and adopt the same means of gutter combat as the groups involved in terrorist acts."<sup>293</sup> Finally, such retaliations play into terrorist conceptions of a cosmic war that includes no easy compromise between enemies. Governments which have chosen to use retaliatory violence "abandoning their own democratic principles in response to terrorism--have embarked on perilous journeys," he writes. He cites for example the Algerian military junta that seized control from the Islamic Salvation Front in 1992 and embroiled the country in years of conflict as a result. He points out that more effective responses include supporting moderate leadership within communities which diminishes support for extremists, supporting a peaceful union between nation states through cooperation and diplomacy, the exercise of moral integrity in keeping with religious values, and diplomatic negotiation.<sup>294</sup> He cites as a more positive example, Britain prime minister Tony Blair's response to the violence of the Irish Republican Army.<sup>295</sup> Juergensmeyer writes,

the government's stance in following the rule of law and not overreacting to terrorist provocations demonstrated its subscription to moral values. This

---

<sup>291</sup> Abdullahi An-Naim, Emory University law professor and Islam and Human Rights, "Not the True Islam," interview by Deborah Scroggins Atlanta Journal Constitution, 16 Sept. 2001, C-7; Minerfield: The United States and the Muslim World, prod. Tom Yellin, dir. Roger Goodman, reported by Peter Jennings, ABC television, WSB, Gainesville, Ga., 15 Sept. 2001.

<sup>292</sup> Mark Juergensmeyer, Terror in the Mind of God: the Global Rise of Religious Violence (Berkeley: University of Calif. Press, 2000), 237.

<sup>293</sup> Ibid., 237.

<sup>294</sup> Ibid., 235-43.

<sup>295</sup> Ibid., 237.

made it difficult for religious activists... to portray the government as a satanic enemy. It also increased the possibility of some sort of accommodation with religious activists on both sides of the Northern Ireland dispute--leading to the signing of a peace accord in 1998.<sup>296</sup>

Juergensmeyer's admonitions, like the findings of women scholars, are consistent with Christian scripture which calls for people to live harmoniously in peace and supports injunctions against revenge.<sup>297</sup>

Women's studies of history reveal that nonviolent conflict resolution through efforts such as mediation, diplomacy, and negotiation are central to the creation of a sustainable peace. In peacekeeping efforts, (which involve the use of military police to prevent conflicts), the most important factor in creating a sustainable peace "is not the mission on the ground but whether it is accompanied by sufficient efforts to facilitate the resolution of the underlying conflict that led to the violence," notes Carolyn Stephenson.<sup>298</sup> The reduction of violence through the use of violent force is not a long-term solution, she notes. The use of violent force is costly in terms of time, money, opportunities lost, and the loss of human life, she points out--and the potential for violent outbreaks remains. "The cost of simply maintaining order without resolving underlying conflicts may not be worth it, either to the local or the international community," she notes, suggesting that peacekeeping forces should include nonviolent efforts to address underlying conflicts through mediation and negotiation.<sup>299</sup> Stephenson attributes the United Nations' funding difficulties to an international bias toward the use of violent force in the resolution of conflict. She writes,

If the international system is ready to move in the direction of international peace, security, and justice, it must overcome the myth of the efficacy of violence and take on the more difficult task of creating security cooperatively.<sup>300</sup>

---

<sup>296</sup> Ibid., 238.

<sup>297</sup> Romans 12:14-21, Ryrie, 1560: "Do not repay evil with evil. Be careful to do what is right in the eyes of everybody. If it is possible, as far as it depends on you, live at peace with everyone."

<sup>298</sup> Carolyn Stephenson, "Peacekeeping and Peacemaking," in Introducing Global Issues, eds. Snarr and Snarr, 83.

<sup>299</sup> Ibid., 84.

<sup>300</sup> Ibid., 85.

Stephenson suggests that this international propensity for the overuse and misuse of violent force is to blame for the lack of better international support for the United Nations, rather than the U.N.'s failure to facilitate international peace. She writes,

The efficacy of violence is a myth: at best, only some win--and at the great expense of others. Because violent force does not make peace or justice, its use by the U.N. would not seem to be the most cost-effective use of its limited resources.<sup>301</sup>

Stephenson recommends the use of less violent and longer term efforts for creating international security with emphasis on approaches such as peacemaking and peacebuilding, rather than traditional approaches to enforcement such as peacekeeping.

In her biography, Gandhi on War and Peace, Puri notes that despite the vast number of literary works about Gandhi, very little has been written on "Gandhi's concern for peace and abhorrence of war."<sup>302</sup> Her biography addresses this gap in the literature and preserves his writings describing the realistic possibility of achieving world peace and the inefficacy of violent retaliation and war.<sup>303</sup> Like Stephenson, Gandhi decried the effectiveness of war, which is "a patched-up [temporary] situation resulting from mutual exhaustion," writes Puri.<sup>304</sup> Instead he, like Stephenson and others, called for arbitration of disputes, establishment of just economic relations, and abolishment of relations based on greed and exploitation between nations, notes Puri.<sup>305</sup>

Of course, for Gandhi the primary means for attaining liberation from exploitation was nonviolence. Gandhi believed that peace could only be attained when world nations recognized themselves as members of one human family

---

<sup>301</sup> Ibid.

<sup>302</sup> Puri, preface.

<sup>303</sup> Ibid., 219, citing Gandhi, Young India, 23 June 1919, 51. See also Puri, 178, 167, 227.

<sup>304</sup> Ibid., 167.

<sup>305</sup> Ibid., 173, 198, citing Pyarelal, Mahatma Gandhi, The Last Phase, vol. 1 (Ahmedabad: Navajivan, 1956), 119. See also Puri, 218, Harijan, vol. 3, 276, and vol. 10, 389; Gandhi's Correspondence with the Government 1942-44 (Ahmedabad: Navajivan, 1959), 143.

governed by the law of love.<sup>306</sup> Although the influences on Gandhi's life were many, including the teachings of Hinduism, Buddhism, and Christianity, he appears to have first observed nonviolent noncooperation in wartime during the Boer War, when he witnessed Boerian women effectively practicing nonviolent noncooperation against the British. These practices were later expanded by Gandhi in the liberation of India from Great Britain.<sup>307</sup> Puri further documents the efficacy of nonviolence.

India's freedom, it is now almost universally recognized, touched off the rapid dissolution of empires in Asia and Africa. Freedom came to Burma, Ceylon (Sri Lanka), and many other countries of Asia and Africa not entirely through armed struggle or violence, though perhaps not strictly through Gandhian nonviolence either.<sup>308</sup>

She notes that India's use of nonviolent noncooperation influenced the manner by which other countries were freed from colonialism. Gandhi pointed out that although the U.S. Civil War abolished slavery in law, the rights and respect for African Americans was not restored by bloodshed. Gandhi's advice regarding nonviolence was later taken by Martin Luther King, Jr. and by Corazon Aquino in his contention for the presidency of the Philippines in 1986, notes Puri.<sup>309</sup> Nonviolence was also a significant factor in the liberation of South Africa from Apartheid. Thus, the nonviolent noncooperation used by Boerian women in the Boer War--shaped and expanded by Gandhi and others--changed the world.

In summary, Puri writes, "Never has war really solved a problem... --or improved international relations."<sup>310</sup> War only multiplies problems, Puri notes...

It originates in greed and hatred and promotes destruction and exploitation. An obsolete historical device, war is absolutely incapable of curing the ills of the world or establishing right, equality, justice, prosperity, or peace among nations.... The situation is clearly intolerable; nations, pleads Gandhi, have to learn to live by loving each other, cooperating with each other.<sup>311</sup>

Gandhi's beliefs about the inefficacy of war, preserved and articulated by Puri, are

---

<sup>306</sup> Puri, 162, citing Gandhi, Young India, 23 June 1919, 50.

<sup>307</sup> Ibid., 141.

<sup>308</sup> Ibid., 186.

<sup>309</sup> Ibid., 189.

<sup>310</sup> Ibid., 227.

<sup>311</sup> Ibid.



highly compatible with the historical critiques and views of many women scholars and activists and highlight the significance of Boerian women's use of nonviolent noncooperation.<sup>312</sup>

Women's leadership has led to distinctive contributions to international diplomacy and the achievement of peace through nonviolent means, combined with a recognition of the long-term ineffectiveness of violence and war in resolving conflicts. Because of women's experiences of themselves as deeply connected to others, women may have a heightened awareness that a peaceful and just society for every nation is a central aspect of their own security, and the security of their families, communities, and the earth.

### **Synthesizing Thinking**

The constant complex embodied changes that women experience require women to learn to integrate and synthesize new experiences and self-understandings. The recognition of embodied patterns in cycles such as menstruation and anticipation of events like pregnancy may foster in women an ability to recognize overall patterns and synthesize them in order to understand complex processes and develop an overview. Early mother-daughter relational skills and indigenous cosmologies also contribute to the development of synthetic thinking, in particular, the synthesis of opposites. These skills are central to bicultural methods of coping as well as effective teaching.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** Because of the multilayered levels of oppression affecting Newtown, NFC women face overwhelming interlocking needs which must be synthesized and prioritized, along with their responses.

NFC synthesize and weave together different projects, ideas, and visions over time to meet multiple community needs. Miss Tanya, a youth leader in the

---

<sup>312</sup> For instance, Stephenson in Introducing Global Issues, and Vickers.

NFC, described how women simultaneously work together on several ideas that address different needs, and over time, work on everybody's ideas. This way there is a communal effort to equally value and address everyone's needs as well as everyone's vision. Several women stated that women seemed able to see the "big picture," and envision ways in which multiple visions fit together.

**Synthesizing thinking is embodied in women.** Female embodiment requires women to integrate new experiences like menarche at an embodied level, and to synthesize this new aspect of the self with existing self-understandings. Female embodiment requires women to synthesize many subtle changes and experiences over the course of every month's cycle, and menstrual patterns may help women learn to apprehend larger perspectives over time. The ability to have a larger overview of a situation is likely related to women's use of situational ethics, and women's ability to utilize synthesizing thinking to solve problems. Female embodiment calls on women to negotiate and synthesize conflicting needs within themselves. A women can be faced with conflicts between her desire to be active and her desire to rest during menstruation; conflicts between desiring to have a baby and a career; and conflicts between anticipation of childbirth and fears for her own health and safety. Whether a woman's conflicting needs are experienced within the self or in relation to the surrounding culture, they require negotiation, and some form of synthesis and resolution. The ability to juggle many tasks at once, a characteristic learned through mothering, especially by women who work and mother, involves continual synthesizing of many tasks, many people's needs, and many different schedules.

Even when using analyzing skills to break things down into component patterns or parts, women seem to be especially capable of re-synthesizing the information. The transformation of structures and processes of culture requires not only the ability to analyze and deconstruct, but also the ability to synthesize and reconstruct in new, creative forms. Much of women's theological scholarship relies on an integration of analyzing and synthesizing processes, in which current cultural practices are deconstructed and recreated. Moore writes:

...the Greek word used in Mark for mind was *dianoia*, or "coherence." Thomas Trotter suggests that the meaning might be interpreted as "Love God by the way you put things together."<sup>313</sup>

Raphael cites Gilligan's description of the "female" web as "a feminist alternative to unequal... hierarchy."<sup>314</sup> Women tend to develop peer-relationships with others in the form of a web, rather than in a linear hierarchy. In a web formation, relationships are organized using synthesizing thinking. In a hierarchy, people are analytically separated into categories which are not organically related. Melissa Raphael describes the spiritual feminist use of the web as a common postmodern model for ecological relationship:

for non-centralized communication or networking (as on the Internet's World Wide Web) between groups of like-minded people. The web is also an ethical symbol and a model of natural holistic justice in that each connected element of the web is as important as another.<sup>315</sup>

Web-like networks of women's leadership allow a wide range of collaboration and greater access to research and insights regarding avenues for social transformation. For example, Stienstra describes women's communication networks which "distribute information about women across the world," such as ISIS (International Women's Information and Communication Service,) WIN, (the Women's International Network,) and IWTC, (the International Women's Tribune Centre,) which is also a library and is located in the NGO building across the street from the United Nations in New York.<sup>316</sup>

**Women's embodiment, early mother-daughter relationships, and the cosmologies of many indigenous people promote the development of synthetic thinking in psycho-social development. Awareness of feelings**

---

<sup>313</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 205, citing F. Thomas Trotter, Loving God with One's Mind (Nashville: Board of Higher Education and Ministry, United Methodist Church, 1987), 24.

<sup>314</sup> Raphael, Theology and Embodiment, 151, citing Carol Gilligan, In A Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982).

<sup>315</sup> Raphael, Theology and Embodiment, 150.

<sup>316</sup> Deborah Stienstra, "International Women's Movements," Women in World Politics, eds. D'Amico, Francine, and Peter R. Beckman (Westport, Conn.: Bergin and Garvey, 1995), 149. A number of the books addressing global conditions affecting women which were used in this dissertation were purchased from the IWTC library.

requires ongoing synthesizing of feelings and thoughts and other sensory information. The process of empathy alone is a highly complex synthesizing process in which the feelings, thoughts, experiences, and worldviews of another are compared, contrasted, tried-on, in relation to the feelings, thoughts, experiences, and worldviews of the self. Surrey and Jordan describe how daughters develop their self-understandings in close relationships with their mothers through mutually empathic mirroring, nurturing care, feedback, and empowerment.<sup>317</sup> As a result, a daughter's fledgling self-understanding develops as she internalizes information from her relationship with her mother. As she gets older, this process expands to include an expanding circle of relationships including other immediate family, extended family and friends, schoolmates and other community members.

Because young girls rely on mutual listening to negotiate relationships, understand themselves as selves-in-relation with others, and expect that personal growth will occur through emotionally intimate relationships, they are likely to experience themselves synthesizing information from various relationships into a more relationally complex web-like worldview that includes awareness of others' multiple and conflicting needs, desires, and worldviews.

Iroquois culture and spirituality is based on the idea of twinship in which opposites interact to create balance without erasing differences. A societal valuing of community is supported by an economic system of communalism in which everyone is a valued part of the whole and the community is one.<sup>318</sup> The ability to conceive of the oneness of humanity relies on the skill of synthetic thinking. Brock writes that "Erotic power is the energy that produces creative synthesis, and is enhanced by relationships that emerge from creative synthesis," producing connectedness.<sup>319</sup> She adds that, "In living through heart, we can begin to love the

---

<sup>317</sup> Judith V. Jordan, "Empathy and Self Boundaries;" and Janet L. Surrey, "The Self-in-Relation: A Theory of Women's Development;" both from Women's Growth in Connection, 73: 54-59.

<sup>318</sup> Mann, twinship: 26, 62-63, 71-73, 88-94, 306-08; communalism: 204-219; oneness: 162-64.

<sup>319</sup> Brock, 39.

world...” and this love provides energy for creating wholeness.<sup>320</sup>

As many feminist scholars have noted, dualistic thinking has been an organizing principle of western patriarchal cultures, resulting in the devaluing of women and feminine characteristics in general, as well as other groups. Schaef also notes that dualistic all-or-nothing thinking is also a characteristic of rigid dysfunctional families, and she describes U.S. patriarchal culture as an addictive cultural system.<sup>321</sup> Dualistic thinking has historically played a role in demonization and negative mythmaking processes regarding people of color.<sup>322</sup> Dualistic thinking is different from the Iroquois concept of twinship in that dualistic thinking relegates people and ideas as opposites that are statically defined, judged, and ostracized; while in the Iroquois concept of twinship, people and ideas that are opposites mutually inform and learn from each other over time, achieving balance as they synthesize and integrate aspects of each other. Dualistic thinking has historically been used to justify cultural oppression, domination, and genocide of entire cultures, while the Iroquois concept of twinship fosters reconciliation of alienated people and ideas, healing, and transformation.<sup>323</sup>

**Synthesizing thinking is central to adaptive bicultural and multicultural coping.** If cultural differences beyond ethnicity, such as gender, sexual orientation, or disability are understood to carry distinctive language, concepts, ways of being, and worldviews, then every person is to some degree bicultural.

Unconditional valuing of each person by family and society regardless of differences is a basic mental health need, without which, internalized dominance and internalized oppression can result. The development of effective leadership can be facilitated through mental health counseling and religious education that addresses these dynamics while fostering the ability to take differences inside the core self. Effective leaders learn to allow the self to be genuinely informed and changed by authentic relationships with others in person, through texts, and in community.

---

<sup>320</sup> Ibid., 24.

<sup>321</sup> Schaef, *Society as an Addict*, 37-41, 33, 112-14, 137-39.

<sup>322</sup> Mann, 304-12; Collins, 70-78, 166-76.

<sup>323</sup> Mann, 26, 62-63, 71-73, 88-94, 306-08, 162-64, 204-19.

Each person's self-identity includes components of race, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, age, disability, economic status, etc. Each of these components includes oppressive and oppressed aspects of the self. A woman might experience herself as oppressed because of her age, but oppressive as a white female who benefits from white privilege. Elizabeth Ellsworth notes that all of us have multiple, conflicting, partial, and changing identities, made up of interactions between all of these different aspects of the self.<sup>324</sup> Self-understanding within a constantly growing and developing self requires constant self-reevaluation and resynthesizing of all of these aspects of the self. This is part of what makes multicultural negotiation within the self, (a process that is rarely even described), so complex, and it is part of what makes facing racism, sexism, and classism, so difficult.<sup>325</sup>

Antonia Darder describes four styles of bicultural coping, which are used at different times as needed. These styles are 1.) cultural negotiation, which involves synthesizing, mediating, reconciling, and integrating elements of both cultures, with an emphasis on retaining the primary cultural identity while transforming the surrounding dominant culture, 2.) cultural alienation, which involves internalization of the dominant culture and rejection of the primary culture, 3.) cultural dualism, which involves relating dualistically and uncritically within two separate cultures, and 4.) cultural separatism, which involves relating only within the primary culture and rejecting the dominant culture. Darder emphasizes that all coping styles are functional depending on the

---

<sup>324</sup> Elizabeth Ellsworth, "Why Doesn't This Feel Empowering? Working Through the Repressive Myths of Critical Pedagogy," Feminisms and Critical Pedagogy eds. Carmen Luke and Jennifer Gore (New York: Routledge, 1992), 103, citing the following: Linda Alcoff, "Cultural Feminism versus Post-Structuralism: The Identity Crisis in Feminist Theory," Signs, 13 (Spring, 1988); Gloria Anzaldua, Borderlands/La Frontera: The New Mestiza (San Francisco: Spinster/Aunt Lute, 1987); Theresa de Lauretis, ed., Feminist Studies/Critical Studies (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1986); Hooks, Talking Back: Thinking Feminist, Thinking Black (Boston: South End Press, 1989); Trihn T. Minha, Woman, native, Other (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1989); and Chris Weedon, Feminist Practice and Poststructuralist Theory (New York: Basil Blackwell, 1987).

<sup>325</sup> Janet Surrey notes that girls do not individuate from, but rather differentiate within relationships to their families and presumably cultures as well. Janet Surrey, "The Relational Self in Women: Clinical Implications;" Surrey, "The Self-in-Relation: A Theory of Women's Development;" Surrey, "Relationship and Empowerment;" all from Women's Growth in Connection, 36-39; 58-9; 170-73.

context.<sup>326</sup> The ability to negotiate between cultures requires the skill of synthesizing and integrating information from multiple cultures into a cohesive worldview. Virgil Elizondo, Gloria Anzaldua, and others have written about the struggle of Latino people to develop a mestizo identity, an identity that exists on the border of U.S. and Mexican culture. For many, this has involved synthesizing indigenous Mexican, Spanish “conqueror,” and U.S. citizen identities into a cohesive self-identity that makes sense. This synthesizing process has been especially challenging for persons trying to come to terms with being descendants of people who are both conquerors and conquered peoples writes Gloria Anzaldua.<sup>327</sup> It is likely that skills of synthesizing thinking are learned as survival mechanisms for many bicultural people and are taken for granted.

Each aspect of a person's identity, race, gender, etc. offers strengths and weaknesses or areas of future growth and development in the self that function differently within different situations and cultural contexts. In order to explore these different functions--both analytical and synthesizing skills are needed. One must be able to analyze the strengths and weaknesses of each quality that is an aspect of the self within different situations and cultural contexts, in an ongoing process of integration and negotiation that occurs within the self. In today's increasingly pluralistic world, people are not only faced with the task of synthesizing complex self-identities, but also the task of understanding and synthesizing greater numbers of diverse multicultural people in relation to the self.

**The skill of synthesizing thinking makes it possible to conceive of egalitarian inclusion among peers within egalitarian systems that respect multiple needs and worldviews.** Dualistic thinking underlies concepts of revolution in which one group in power is replaced by another group in power, whereas synthesizing thinking is required for democracy and democratic transitions. Synthesizing thinking also makes it possible to reconceive dualistic thinking that splits the private spheres of life off from the public spheres. It is synthesizing thinking that

---

<sup>326</sup> Antonia Darder, Culture and Power in the Classroom (New York: Bergin and Garvey, 1991), 53-60.

<sup>327</sup> Elizondo, 65-66, 59-60; Anzaldua, 49-53.

recognized that patterns in the personal sphere continue into the public sphere-- articulated in feminist catch-phrases like "the personal is political." Synthesizing thinking recognizes the value of integrating traditionally "male" and "female" human characteristics into both the public and private worlds. The public spheres of life need women's unique leadership styles, just as the private spheres of home and hearth need active, present, nurturing fathers.

In the literature, women are often found to be skilled in synthesizing the conflicting needs, desires, visions, and worldviews of their communities. An accurate synthesis of needs relies on good skills of listening, and reciprocal talk (mutual sharing of concerns, feelings, ideas, and experiences,) among collaborating community members.<sup>328</sup> A thorough acknowledgment of community members' needs allows for conflicting needs and priorities to be discussed and resolved through consensus. Once needs are prioritized through consensus decision-making, collaborative visioning can occur, which requires another round of synthesizing thinking. The process of synthesizing allows multiple and conflicting views to coexist, dialogue, and inform each other so that more creative visioning and approaches can evolve out of a dynamic group process.

Moore's book The Art of Teaching from the Heart relies on synthesizing thinking to present multiple methodological approaches to religious education in dialogue with process theology. She describes ways in which she exists professionally on the boundaries of multiple academic disciplines, and the interdisciplinary approach of her book. Her discussion of gestalt educational methods relies in particular on synthesizing thinking.<sup>329</sup> Public school teacher Opal compares teaching to jazz music in its synthesizing of different notes, tones, color, and tempo. She writes: "Teaching and leading also require the use of many tools, in different combinations, to build learning environments and develop ways of learning that are creative and child centered."<sup>330</sup>

---

<sup>328</sup> Hurty, 183.

<sup>329</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, viii, 1-8, 13, 23-25, 59-89, particularly 61-62, 70-71.

<sup>330</sup> Attributed to Opal, quoted in Ah Nee-Benham and Cooper, 105.



Synthesizing thinking is also crucial to conflict management; it's rejection of dualisms disallows claims of absolute virtue and requires each participant to be accountable for acting and for reconciling the ethical strengths and weaknesses of their actions. Creative solutions also require the ability to creatively combine multiple options through synthesis. Thus, synthetic thinking contributes positively to human development, women's leadership, and peacemaking.

## **CHAPTER 4**

### **Embodied Self-Giving to Children**

In conclusion of the literature review, we now turn to the last of three chapters describing themes which are generative for peacemaking, emerging from women's studies of women's embodied experiences in relation to psychology, theology, and leadership. "Embodied Self-Giving to Children" focuses on characteristics of women's knowing that uniquely shape women's self-giving experiences of solidarity, passion, protection, and risk-taking in relation to children.

Women's cycles of desire create embodied experiences like pregnancy, which can: heighten women's solidarity with children; inspire women to be strong and to courageously take risks for the good of their families and communities; and move women to nonviolent action to protect the security and safety of their children. Each section begins with insights from the NFC interview study, and proceeds to identify themes from the literature that are generative for leadership and peacemaking. Implications for structural and systemic change are described with an emphasis on current historical contexts.

### **Pregnancy As Passionate Solidarity<sup>1</sup>**

Women's "passionate solidarity" with children is revealed in embodied experiences such as pregnancy and the risks of childbirth as well as commitments to child rearing.<sup>2</sup> These activities place the needs and care of children at the center of women's priorities even when they are not at the center of community, national, and global priorities. Women's passion for healthy children, families, communities, and nations, is a model for the reorganization of global resource management priorities. The bonding that women experience during motherhood can motivate peace action and foster solidarity among women for the sake of future generations.

---

#### **Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** The commitment of NFC

<sup>1</sup> Leslie Kendrick articulated this phrase, which refers to a passionate investment in and willingness to risk in solidarity for others, particularly children (139).

<sup>2</sup> Ibid.

women to their youth and a healthy community is a “passionate solidarity” which shapes the priorities, and directions of the club. The club is organized around the needs of healthy families, i.e. the next generation. Leadership for social justice is motivated by concern for the needs of children and youth, which include a healthy environment, social and economic justice, and many other concerns.

**Mothers give embodied energy, time, and physical space, and risk their lives in the process of gestating, birthing, and rearing children.**

Embodied experiences can intensify a woman’s bonding with her child and intensify her passion to see it survive and thrive, a passion which Kendrick calls “passionate solidarity.”<sup>3</sup> A woman may also learn to bond with others from her relationship with her mother, transferring these ways of valuing others to relationships within her community or actualizing them through her vocation as a teacher, counselor, doctor, or other community-serving capacity. This passion places children in the center of cultures and their priorities. Kelly writes:

We must put women and children at the center of political consensus-- women and children as part of the Earth, not apart from the Earth. Life creation, rather than life destruction, is our political aim.<sup>4</sup>

United Nations Secretary-General Javier Perez de Cuellar stated in 1987 that the importance of children to a society reflects its health and integrity:

...the way a society treats its children reflects not only its qualities of compassion and protective caring, but also its sense of justice, its commitment to the future, and its urge to enhance the human condition for common generations.<sup>5</sup>

These leaders share an orientation to children in which the needs of children are central to the development of healthy families and societies.

**Women’s embodied nurturing and often primary parental role places the care and nurture of future generations as a central priority of mothering, and is a model for a parallel reorganization of community,**

---

<sup>3</sup> Ibid., 139.

<sup>4</sup> Kelly, in Women in World Politics, 175.

<sup>5</sup> Filomina Steady, ed., Women and Children First: Environment, Poverty, and Sustainable Development (Rochester, Vt.: Schenkman Books, 1993), citing Javier Perez de Cuellar, “Message to International Meeting of the Convention on the Rights of the Child,” Lignano, Italy (New York: U. N., 1987), 132.

**national, and global priorities.** Women's perspectives offer an important corrective for the neglect of children and families in the United States and around the world. Miller-McLemore describes the neglect experienced by mothers, children, and families in the U.S., noting that despite much rhetoric to the contrary, the U.S. is not a nation whose priorities revolve around its children.

...the labors of love essential to the welfare of children hold little real value. Statistics on health, poverty, education, drugs, mortality rates, abuse, homelessness, and suicide reveal an incredible insensitivity to the actual demands of children and mothering.<sup>6</sup>

She writes that although the United States is ideologically "child- and mother-centered," it is not so in reality. Miller-McLemore notes that some women writers are part of the backlash-against-feminism movement in which feminism is inaccurately blamed for many societal ills. She writes that women writers such as Sylvia Ann Hewlett blame feminists for not finding "a way to integrate children into the 'fabric of a full and equal life.'" Miller-McLemore responds that "neither have men or anti-feminists."<sup>7</sup> She writes, "If Hewlett better understood the contradictions of raising children in a culture that ultimately devalues them, she would be less shocked by the lack of enthusiasm she receives when she tries to arrange a family-policy panel at the Economic Policy Council of the United Nations Association," which was to have included the "'topmost ranks' of business, academe, and organized labor."<sup>8</sup> Miller-McLemore adds:

We must wonder about a society in which those who make it to the "topmost ranks" have little to do with children, out of the sheer necessity of their "success."<sup>9</sup>

She notes that Hewlett has since changed her thinking, now realizing that "*no* group in this society puts them center stage." Hewlett points out that "the private and public neglect of children in America is unique among developed nations, notes

---

<sup>6</sup> Miller-McLemore, 73.

<sup>7</sup> Ibid., 72.

<sup>8</sup> Ibid., 73, citing Sylvia Ann Hewlett, A Lesser Life: The Myth of Women's Liberation in America (New York: William Morrow, 1986), 369.

<sup>9</sup> Ibid.

Miller-McLemore.<sup>10</sup> Angela Davis cites Eleanor Holmes Norton's observation in a 1985 New York Times article that the "disruption of Black family life is, in exaggerated microcosm, a reflection of what has happened to American family life in general."<sup>11</sup> She attributes this decline to the U.S. monopoly capitalist economy, "the reverberations of which are being felt most acutely in the Afro-American community."<sup>12</sup> The historical shift from small business entrepreneurial capitalism to monopoly corporate capitalism in the United States, escalated during the 1980s when significant antitrust and environmental legislation was repealed, has aggravated existing patterns of racism as well as quality of living and income gaps between the rich and poor. Eisler also notes that the work of mothering and raising children is not "perceived as a community responsibility to be subsidized from community funds" in the United States, although she points out, U.S. government subsidies for raising crops such as tobacco, which "destroys life," were commonplace for many years.<sup>13</sup>

U.S. social structure resources will become even more scarce as a result of the war in Afghanistan, which, along with World War I, the Gulf War, and many other armed conflicts, could have been avoided through the use of preventive diplomacy, reliance on renewable energy sources rather than fossil fuels such as oil, integrity-based rather than resource-based relationships with countries like Saudi Arabia, and nondominating global economic relationships with other countries.<sup>14</sup>

The U.S. budget is drained by "wealthfare" subsidies to corporations, (for instance, McDonald's received \$466,000 in 1992 to advertise Chicken McNuggets in Turkey from the Agriculture Department's Market Promotion Program), and funding of the military (thus, benefitting military contractors,) which alone accounted for almost

---

<sup>10</sup> Ibid., 73-4, citing an interview with Hewlett, Publishers Weekly (July 12, 1991): 50.

<sup>11</sup> Eleanor Holmes Norton, "Restoring the Traditional Black Family," New York Times, 1985, quoted in Angela Y. Davis, Women, Culture, and Politics (New York: Vintage Books, 1990), 83.

<sup>12</sup> Davis, 79.

<sup>13</sup> Eisler, 342-3.

<sup>14</sup> Jennings.

half of the budget before September 11, 2001.<sup>15</sup> Women's critiques often describe the destructiveness of social structure cuts that result from military spending priorities. Angela Davis writes,

In cities like Chicago, Black youngsters suffer from diseases of malnutrition that afflict children in the famine areas of Africa, yet school breakfast and lunch programs have been abolished in order to provide the weapons developers and manufacturers with an unending supply of money.<sup>16</sup>

Davis notes that Lockheed, General Electric, Boeing, and General Dynamics, (some of the United States' largest defense contractors paid no federal income taxes between 1981 and 1983, despite their profits totaling \$10 billion. She notes that over sixty cents of each dollar supports the military, so that it would only take four years for a person earning twenty-two thousand dollars per year to give an entire year's salary to the Pentagon.

She further notes that militarization is a major cause of unemployment and "scandalous levels of joblessness for Black people."<sup>17</sup> Black people "are literally robbed of jobs," she writes, "at the rate of thirteen hundred jobs for each increase of \$1 billion in the military budget."<sup>18</sup> Citing statistics from the Bureau of Labor, she points out that \$1 billion spent on weapons production creates twenty-one thousand military jobs, while \$1 billion "would produce an average of twenty-five thousand nonmilitary jobs and as many as fifty-four thousand jobs in hospitals and seventy-two thousand jobs in educational services."<sup>19</sup> She notes that large numbers of Black people, particularly Black women, seek work in health and education and are particularly hurt by militarization.<sup>20</sup>

From 1961 to 1990, close to one hundred military bases were converted to

---

<sup>15</sup> Zubow and Nesbitt poster series; War Resister's League, "Where Your Income Tax Money Really Goes: The United States Federal Budget for Fiscal Year 1997," (New York: War Resister's League, 1996); Childs, 31-46; Sassen, 46-9, 81-92, 97-100; Clarke and IFG, 7-8, 10-11.

<sup>16</sup> Davis, 70.

<sup>17</sup> Ibid., 70-1.

<sup>18</sup> Ibid., 86, citing Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, The Women's Budget, WILPF, N.Y. (June 1985).

<sup>19</sup> Ibid., 71.

<sup>20</sup> Ibid.

civilian use, notes Jeanne Vickers. She adds that the Pentagon reported that 93,000 jobs at the bases were lost; however, over 158,000 jobs were created in occupations such as civilian airlines and air freight companies, industrial parks, educational institutions and other civilian uses.<sup>21</sup>

Vickers points out the importance of the 1982 United Nations Expert Report on economic conversion prepared by Inge Thorsson, which noted that disarmament and development were closely linked. The report demonstrated "the negative economic and social effects of arms spending" in both industrial and developing nations.<sup>22</sup> For instance, from 1978 to 1988, Third World countries spent twenty-three more percent of their resources on imported weapons than they received in economic development aid. Further, the interest on Third World debt exceeded aid from developed countries. As a result, poverty deepened at alarming rates, she notes.<sup>23</sup> The cost of social structure and environmental reconstruction in Kuwait after the Gulf War is estimated at seventy billion U.S. dollars, she adds.<sup>24</sup> Citing statistics from the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, she points out that with \$500 million, (the cost of one of the 100 B-1 bombers planned at that time,) immunizations and basic health supplies for fifty million children in Asia, Africa, and Latin America could be provided.<sup>25</sup> "For many nations in the southern hemisphere, "the failure of economic development was perceived as a much greater threat to security than nuclear war," according to the 1980 Report of the Independent Commission on International Development Issues, (the Brandt Report,) writes Carolyn Stephenson.<sup>26</sup>

Jeanne Vickers points out that one-third of the world's people do not have access to pure drinking water, which contributes to eighty percent of Third World

---

<sup>21</sup> Vickers, 74.

<sup>22</sup> Ibid., 73.

<sup>23</sup> Ibid., 71-2.

<sup>24</sup> Ibid., 70.

<sup>25</sup> Ibid., 71-72.

<sup>26</sup> Carolyn Stephenson, "Peacekeeping and Peacemaking," Introducing Global Issues, eds. Michael T. Snarr and D. Neil Snarr (Boulder, Colorado: Lynne Rienner, 2002), 73.

diseases. She cites Ruth Leger Sivard's budget in which the costs of environmental restoration equal only slightly over a third of the National Aeronautics and Space Administration's (NASA) space station, forty-five billion dollars.<sup>27</sup> The proposed 2003 federal budget includes \$776 billion in military spending, comprising forty-six percent, with human resources budgeted at \$540 billion, comprising thirty-two percent of the budget.<sup>28</sup>

Angela Davis notes that due to escalated militarization during the Reagan administration, and resulting social structure cuts, (such as AFDC, food-stamps, and other programs,) six million more people joined the ranks of those living in poverty. This was accompanied by an increase in homelessness due to funding cuts amounting to sixty-three percent of the subsidized housing budget. Davis concludes that mass unemployment and rising poverty will continue until a "radical antimonopoly program of jobs with peace is instituted."<sup>29</sup> The nonprofit organization, National Campaign for Peace Tax Fund is supporting a bill, entitled the Religious Freedom Peace Tax Fund Act (HR 1186), (proposed seventeen years ago,) which would establish a separate tax fund for conscientious objectors which can only be used by the federal government for nonmilitary purposes. This bill would allow U.S. citizens to refuse to provide funding for wars and other military projects at their discretion. Although this bill has been held up in the Ways and Means Committee of the House of Representatives for some time, citizen advocates can work to increase its sponsors and move it to the floor.<sup>30</sup>

Just as the U.S. underfunds its own social structure in favor of military spending, so have its expenditures on the Afghanistan war (\$1 billion per month,) far outpaced its financial commitment to the country's reconstruction: \$296 million for

---

<sup>27</sup> Ibid., 70.

<sup>28</sup> War Resisters League.

<sup>29</sup> Davis, 88.

<sup>30</sup> Tom Kierans, Outreach Development Director of the National Campaign for Peace Tax Fund, conversation with author; 30 April 2002. The bill is currently delayed in the Ways and Means Committee of the House of Representatives, and needs citizen support to move it out of committee for vote by the House, and to encourage bipartisan support in the Senate for sponsorship. A list of Ways and Means Committee members or additional information can be obtained from the National Campaign for Peace Tax Fund, (202)-483-3751.



the first year of reconstruction pledged at the January of 2002 donors' conference in Tokyo, writes Jan Goodwin, writing in The Nation. She describes this commitment to reconstruction as "lukewarm... at best."<sup>31</sup>

Concerned citizens and parents trying to understand the forces affecting the lives of their families are often thwarted by a lack of investigative reporting and censorship in U.S. media, which is dominated by corporate-owned television stations and newspaper conglomerates.<sup>32</sup> Riley writes, "Global news networks are not only determining what news and events to report--increasingly, packaging them as entertainment--but also helping to determine the course of events."<sup>33</sup>

The Children's Defense Fund founded by Marian Wright Edelman to advocate for the needs of all children, documents the low prioritization of the needs of children in its annual report, which reveals that in 1996, the U.S. had the highest child poverty and mortality rates among all industrialized nations, even though wealthy and middle-class children's families are much better off than families in other industrialized nations.<sup>34</sup> They note that children living in poverty are 2-3 times less likely to complete high school.<sup>35</sup> During the 1980s and '90s, incomes of poor families in the U.S. dropped by an average of almost \$2,000 per year to \$10,387 per year. The average incomes of middle-class families stayed about the same, while average incomes of upper-income families rose by \$22,500 per year, according to the CDC.<sup>36</sup>

Unemployment and economic stress have been positively linked to child abuse.<sup>37</sup> The incidence of child abuse and neglect doubled between 1984 and

---

<sup>31</sup> Jan Goodwin, "An Uneasy Peace: Afghan Women are Free of the Taliban, But Liberation is Still a Distant Dream," The Nation, 29 April 2002, 22.

<sup>32</sup> Clarke and IFG, 9, 15-6 ; Riley, 5.

<sup>33</sup> Riley, 5, citing "States of Disarray: The Social Effects of Globalization," a UNRISD report for the World Summit for Social Development (Geneva: U.N. Research Institute for Social Development, 1995), 2.

<sup>34</sup> Children's Defense Fund, State of America's Children Yearbook 1996 (Washington, D.C.: Children's Defense Fund, 1996), 6.

<sup>35</sup> Ibid., 5.

<sup>36</sup> Ibid., 3.

<sup>37</sup> Ibid., 69.

1994, with a total of 3.1 million abuse reports, about one-third of which were confirmed, and a two-thirds increase in the number of children in foster care over the previous decade. In addition, they report that approximately three million children suffered from serious emotional disturbances and many do not receive services.<sup>38</sup> The Children's Defense Fund report also notes that because of the hours that many parents work, "more than one-fourth of all eighth-graders spend two or more hours alone after school."<sup>39</sup> They describe the findings of a 1995 Carnegie Council on Adolescent Development report, "Young adolescents are least likely to get the adult support and guidance they need, leaving them at great risk of too-early pregnancy as well as drug and alcohol abuse, AIDS and other sexually transmitted diseases, suicide, violence, and inadequate education."<sup>40</sup> Commenting on these trends Jeff Madrick writes,

By 2000, the nation had only begun to make up for the erosion in living standards over the preceding two decades. Male wages were still historically low. Families on average, were working much longer.<sup>41</sup>

He adds that "half or more male workers lost ground as they aged from their thirties into their forties, fifties and sixties."<sup>42</sup> He notes that this period has also seen "newly harsh employment practices."<sup>43</sup> He writes, "Probably never before have so many workers been fired so rapidly, with companies cutting back work hours faster than sales," which is "far easier to do in part because there is such a large temporary work force."<sup>44</sup> In 1995, the chief economist at Lehman Brothers financial firm noted, "Never in our history have American workers been asked to do so much for so little," quotes the C.D.C. report.<sup>45</sup>

---

<sup>38</sup> Ibid., 68, citing the National Committee to Prevent Child Abuse.

<sup>39</sup> Children's Defense Fund, 50.

<sup>40</sup> Ibid., 49, citing the Carnegie Council on Adolescent Development, "Great Transitions: Preparing Adolescents for a New Century."

<sup>41</sup> Jeff Madrick, "Enron, the Media and the New Economy," The Nation, 1 April 2002, 19.

<sup>42</sup> Ibid., 18.

<sup>43</sup> Ibid., 20.

<sup>44</sup> Ibid.

<sup>45</sup> Children's Defense Fund, 4.

A one percent increase in unemployment in the United States (based on the 1970 census) was regularly followed by an increased mortality of 37,000 deaths per year," or two percent, including natural causes such as heart attacks as well as unnatural causes, "including almost two thousand more suicides and homicides than otherwise occur," writes James Gilligan, M.D.<sup>46</sup> In addition, homicides and imprisonments go up by six percent, and the infant mortality rate by five percent, he notes. Further, the unemployment rate of African Americans has been at least twice that of European Americans in postwar years, he adds.<sup>47</sup> He writes that globally each year, two to three times more people die from poverty--232 million--than were killed in the Holocaust against the Jews over six years.<sup>48</sup>

"You cannot work for one day with the violent people who fill our prisons and mental hospitals for the criminally insane without being forcibly and constantly reminded of the extreme poverty and discrimination that characterizes their lives," writes James Gilligan, M.D.<sup>49</sup> He recalls Gandhi's observation that poverty is the deadliest form of violence, Gilligan adds that "Any approach to a theory of violence needs to begin with a look at the structural violence in this country."<sup>50</sup>

Not only is poverty a hazard, but there are increased levels of pollution in many low-income communities which are "more likely to be exposed to pollution from industry and waste," write Physicians for Social Responsibility.<sup>51</sup> Once a minor ailment, asthma has become "the number one childhood illness in the United States," affecting 14-15 million Americans and five million children; the death rate for

---

<sup>46</sup> James Gilligan, *Violence: Reflections on a National Epidemic* (New York: Vintage Books, 1996), 194, citing the following: Hussein Abdilahi Bulhan, *Frantz Fanon and the Psychology of Oppression* (New York: Plenum Press), 1985; M. H. Brenner, *Mental Illness and the Economy* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press) 1973; and M. H. Brenner, "Personal Stability and Economic Security," *Social Policy*, 8:2-4, 1977.

<sup>47</sup> Ibid.

<sup>48</sup> Ibid., 196.

<sup>49</sup> Ibid., 191.

<sup>50</sup> Ibid., 191.

<sup>51</sup> Physicians for Social Responsibility, (U.S. Affiliate of International Physicians for the Prevention of Nuclear War), "Asthma and the Role of Air Pollution: What the Primary Care Physician Should Know" University of Maryland School of Medicine Environmental Health Education Center, Washington, D.C., 1997, 3.

children under nineteen increased seventy-eight percent from 1980 to 1993.<sup>52</sup>

They note that particularly, the elderly, as well as children who are African American or Puerto Rican or who live in low-income neighborhoods are most severely affected.<sup>53</sup> They cite studies which link asthma to pollution: ozone, sulfur dioxide from oil and coal burning, particulates (soot), and especially among poor inner-city areas indoor pollution such as pervasive cockroaches which cause allergies in many children.<sup>54</sup>

In 1996, the U.S. ranked sixteenth out of eighteen industrialized countries in living standards among the poorest one-fifth of our nation's children, and 39th out of 160 countries in student teacher ratios in K-12 classrooms, which likely makes it more difficult to preventively detect school violence.<sup>55</sup> In contrast, in 1996, the U.S. ranked first in military technology among industrialized nations, and is the number one seller of weapons and military exports around the world.<sup>56</sup> Edelman claims, we are on the verge of losing our children to the dangers of "drugs, violence, too-early parenthood, poor health and education, unemployment, family disintegration" and ultimately, to the "meaninglessness of a culture that rewards greed and guile, and tells [children that] life is about getting rather than giving."<sup>57</sup> Due to increasingly stressful work schedules, many American homes are turned into empty spaces where parents come home to eat and rest between jobs, and children grow up with

---

<sup>52</sup> Ibid., 1-2, citing National Center for Environmental Health.

<sup>53</sup> Physicians for Social Responsibility, 2, citing the following: ALA Trends, Table 3; NIAID, Asthma and Allergy Statistics 1996; Crain et. al., Pediatrics 1994;94:356-62; De Palo et. al., Chest 1994;106:447-51; and American Academy of Pediatrics Committee on Environmental Health, Pediatrics 1993;91:1212.

<sup>54</sup> Physicians for Social Responsibility, 2-5, citing the following: Bascom, Toxicol Lett 96,86:115-30; Koren, Environ Health Perspect 1995,103Suppl6:235-41; Pope et. al. Environ Health Perspect 1995,103:472-80; and Rosenstreich et. al. New England Journal of Medicine 1997;336:1356-63).

<sup>55</sup> Children's Defense Fund, xx; Kahn and Bailey, 181, citing Sivard, Brauer, and Roemer, World Military and Social Expenditures 1989 (Washington, D.C.: World Priorities, 1989).

<sup>56</sup> Children's Defense Fund, xx ; Vickers, 41-3.

<sup>57</sup> Marian Wright Edelman, The Measure of Our Success: A Letter to My Children and Yours (Boston: Beacon, 1992), 15; quoted in Miller-McLemore, 74.

limited parental supervision and nurturance.<sup>58</sup> Unintentional neglect of children contributes to gang membership and hinders the development of empathy and caring that is central to responsible citizenship. Further, “the level of quality in most U.S. child care centers’ infant/toddler rooms is not developmentally appropriate; it does not fully meet children’s needs for health and safety protections, warm relationships, and learning opportunities,” points out the 1996 Children’s Defense Fund report.<sup>59</sup>

These are patterns that must be reversed and transformed. The priorities, values, and concerns of healthy mothering which place the needs of healthy children, families, and communities at the center of society, offer an important corrective to the addictive and exploitive patterns which have created these economic conditions and their social consequences.

**The passionate solidarity with children experienced by mothers can create solidarity with other mothers and can become a motivational source for peace action.** Experiences of pregnancy and mothering can create bonding among women across differences and stimulate serious reflection about the kinds of social conditions that nurture healthy children and families. Kendrick points out that pregnancy is experienced as passionate solidarity with God for many women, especially those who are Christian.<sup>60</sup> In addition, she and Ruddick note that pregnancy and mothering can be opportunities for women to connect with other women’s experiences as mothers, and to make empathic connections with women trying to mother in difficult circumstances different from their own. In this way, women make nonparochial connections with other women across differences.<sup>61</sup> This may

---

<sup>58</sup> Jeffrey Gettleman, “It’s Like Getting Fleeced: Cotton Mill Workers at a Martinsville, Va., Firm Will Soon Be Joining the Thousands of U.S. Textile Workers Left Behind in a Landscape of Plants Closed by Globalization,” *L.A. Times*, 20 February 2002, part A, p.1; Clarke and IFG, 7-8, 12-5; Kahn and Bailey, 48-90; *Future of America’s Youth*, panel discussion on *America’s Children 2002 Report*, a federal report on policy affecting America’s children sponsored by the *Institute for Educational Leadership*. Moderated by Margaret Dunkle-Welch, Policy Exchange Director for the Institute for Educational Leadership, C-SPAN television, 3 Nov. 2001; report available from <http://www.childstats.gov/americaschildren>.

<sup>59</sup> Children’s Defense Fund, 29.

<sup>60</sup> Kendrick, 125-6.

<sup>61</sup> *Ibid.*, 125, 133-5, 145-7; Ruddick, 177.

be expressed as a deepened concern for the situation of women and children in oppressed communities, a dynamic that Kendrick observed in the women she interviewed.<sup>62</sup>

Moore notes ways in which recognition of world interdependence has highlighted the need for worldwide solidarity. She notes that solidarity has political connotations, and that solidarity with workers or victims is made clearer in worldviews that emphasize the idea that everything and everyone are related to each other.

Such a worldview reminds us that the actions of people are so intertwined that if one group does not choose to participate in a positive solidarity with others, it may participate in a solidarity destructive of others in ways it never expected or intended.<sup>63</sup>

Teaching needs to include politics, practicing solidarity with oppressed communities and participating in world transformation, she adds.

Passionate solidarity with children can also motivate peacemaking. Many women's peacemaking groups center around concerns for children. Critical pedagogue Henry A. Giroux describes how becoming a parent spurred his interest in creating a peaceful world for his children.<sup>64</sup> During the Camp David Accord negotiations between leaders of Israel and Egypt, former president Jimmy Carter recalls how Israel President Begin was moved to come to a peace agreement while looking at pictures of his grandchildren:

As he looked at the pictures and read the names aloud, he became very emotional. He was thinking, I am sure, about his responsibility to his people and about what happens to children in war. Both of us had tears in our eyes.<sup>65</sup>

Carter's description of the peace process of the Camp David Accords provides important models for peacemaking and conflict resolution.<sup>66</sup>

The passion of pregnancy, childbirth, and breastfeeding is common in mothering. Mothering has historically been a source of women's authority for

---

<sup>62</sup> Kendrick, 125, 133-5, 145-7.

<sup>63</sup> Moore, 120.

<sup>64</sup> Henry A. Giroux, *Schooling and the Struggle for Public Life: Critical Pedagogy in the Modern Age* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1988), xi.

<sup>65</sup> Carter, 17.

<sup>66</sup> Ibid., 3-20.

leadership and peacemaking in the public sphere. Temma Kaplan notes that the women activists at Love Canal drew on their authority as mothers speaking out to save their families.<sup>67</sup> NFC members spoke often about stepping forward to advocate for the needs of the children and the community as already described. Mothers' groups in Liberia, Chechnya, Argentina, and elsewhere work as peace advocates on behalf of their children.<sup>68</sup>

The passionate solidarity that parents feel with their children has transformative potential to reorient communities and nations to revolve around the needs of all children and families equally, rather than simply an elite few. The ultimate worth and value of every child, every person, family, community, nation and the Earth can function as a powerful magnet pulling everything around it into alignment, and transforming everything in culture that does not share this foundational value. A world that revolves around the ultimate worth of every child is possible.

Suffragette Elizabeth Cady Stanton emphasized solidarity among all people:

"As regards international peace, obviously the woman's mission is to recognize the bond of humanity between all the peoples, the human solidarity deeper and prior to the national." <sup>69</sup>

Solidarity among women and within communities is a characteristic in particular of many African, Latin, and Native American communities.<sup>70</sup> Aquino describes Latin American women's solidarity in standing for life, against oppressive structures of the current international economic order that cause death for so many people:

All these aspects [of women's new initiatives in politics and the church in Latin America] revolve round the same nucleus: Against the unjust irreversible logic of the present system, which produces so many deaths, women adhere stubbornly to the logic of life. ...So, while not forgetting the possible ambiguity inherent in human experience, I describe the positive aspects of this collective strength, which is permeated by the constant search

---

<sup>67</sup> Kaplan, 15-45.

<sup>68</sup> Melba Smith, "A Gathering Amid Beauty, Worldly Pain... Mothers of Liberia," United Nations Digest, Women's Division of the United Methodist Church at the United Nations, June 1995; Zabelina and Issraelyan, 61-65; Ruddick, 225-34.

<sup>69</sup> Alonso, 44.

<sup>70</sup> Myers, 20; Asasi-Diaz, 41-5, 177, 194; Mann, 160-4, 208-11.

for life.<sup>71</sup>

Solidarity among women is discussed by Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock who describe four U.S. women's leadership movements: The Mothers' Center Movements in U.S. and Germany, the National Congress of Neighborhood Women, and the Center for Cultural and Community Development.<sup>72</sup>

The growth in nongovernmental organizations, (NGOs,) especially women's and grassroots NGOs in the U.S. and around the world has been significant. Deborah Stienstra notes that the 1982 declaration by women's NGOs articulates the unifying concerns that women share internationally: "Feminism is international in defining as its aim the liberation of women from all types of oppression and in providing solidarity among women of all countries; it is national in stating its priorities and strategies in accordance with particular cultural and socioeconomic conditions."<sup>73</sup> She notes that there is solidarity among women internationally through the global women's movement:

International women's movements have and will continue to shape the world that we live in. Whether by lobbying national governments to include legislation on the situation of elderly women or by creating alternative feminist health networks, these movements will continue to bring women together around issues of concern to them.<sup>74</sup>

She notes that "unprecedented solidarity and communication" has occurred among women around the world as a result of these movements:

This has had the effect of increasing information about the research on women's situations throughout the international community. It has also meant that women have not had to rely exclusively on governments for action but can turn to feminist alternatives.<sup>75</sup>

As a result, the face of world politics has been forever changed, as women's movements provide an alternative perspective distinctive from other international

---

<sup>71</sup> Aquino, 102-3, citing Elsa Tamez, "Justicia y justificacion en ocasion de la deuda externa de America Latina," *Pasos* 22 (1989), 11-13.

<sup>72</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 155-311.

<sup>73</sup> Stienstra, in *Women in World Politics*, 150, citing Charlotte Bunch and Roxanna Carrillo, "Feminist Perspectives on Women in Development," ed. Irene Tinker *Persistent Inequalities: Women and World Development* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990), 80.

<sup>74</sup> *Ibid.*, 154.

<sup>75</sup> *Ibid.*



organizations. Although, too often, governmental responsiveness to women's groups is not where most women want it to be, it is increasing, and even seemingly small victories have often had far-reaching effects. For instance, women's NGOs organized internationally and in the United Nations (where many NGOs have observer status and provide education on critical issues), to prevent the dumping and subsequent marketing of baby formula in Africa, where women were picking up the formula samples and using them. Often, after using the samples, women's breast milk dried up, they had no money to buy formula, and their babies died. This particular NGO effort is described in detail by WEDO, Women's Education and Development Organization, as an example of how the solidarity of women's NGOs resulted in halting these practices, and the creation and distribution of international guidelines and educational information in Third World countries regarding bottle-feeding. Their successful challenge to the power of transnational corporations resulted in United Nations support for women's concerns. Although baby formula is still being marketed by some TNCs, the dumping of formula has ceased and marketing has decreased.<sup>76</sup> Through initiatives such as this, the United Nations has evolved into an empowering place for NGOs to advocate on behalf of people and communities.

Deborah Stienstra notes that many of the leaders in international women's movements are still from the First World. She writes:

Many movements are led by white, middle-class women from the First World. But there has been a continuous rise in the leadership from women in the Third World since 1970, which has resulted in the increasing orientation of international women's activities provided by women in the Third World.<sup>77</sup>

Irene Blea provides a history of the movement of Latin American women into this international arena, and in particular their participation in the United Nations Decade for Women Conferences which began with the 1975 International Women's Year

---

<sup>76</sup> Women's Environment and Development Organization, (WEDO), no. 1 "Codes of Conduct for Transnational Corporations: Strategies Toward Democratic Global Governance," Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) Primer: Understanding the Impact of the Global Economy on Women and the Environment (New York: WEDO, 1995).

<sup>77</sup> Stienstra, in Women in World Politics, 153.

(IWY) in Mexico City.<sup>78</sup> The National Congress of Neighborhood Women in New York, brings local grassroots women to conferences and meetings and empowers them to represent and advocate for their perspectives within communities and with government officials.<sup>79</sup>

The IWY and the United Nations Decade for Women Conferences with their accompanying Nongovernmental Organization Forums (NGO Forums) were created by the international women's movement. Both greatly strengthened and accelerated the growth of the global women's movement, notes Carolyn Stephenson. The importance of the work of NGOs in the field as well as NGO recommendations submitted as documents to the U.N. Decade for Women and other conferences has become quite significant to many countries and to the work of the United Nations itself, she notes.<sup>80</sup> In addition, Deborah Stienstra notes that women's networks have been created around the world to increase communication among women.<sup>81</sup> The global women's movement has become a diverse and powerful arena for social change.

### **Vulnerability, Risk, Strength, and Courage**

Vulnerability and risk-taking are embodied in women, and are also characteristics of women's relationships with others and leadership. Central to trust building and connection, vulnerability and risk must be incorporated into diplomacy and are central to cooperation among nations and international structures of

---

<sup>78</sup> Irene I. Blea, U.S. Chicanas and Latinas within a Global Context: Women of Color at the Fourth World Women's Conference (Westport, Conn.: Praeger Publishers, 1997), 21-33.

<sup>79</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 224-8.

<sup>80</sup> Carolyn M. Stephenson, "Women's International Nongovernmental Organizations at the United Nations," ed. Anne Winslow Women, Politics, and the United Nations, Contributions in Women's Studies, 151 (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1995), 135. The United Nations Decade for Women Conferences were first held in Mexico City in 1975, then in Copenhagen in 1980, Nairobi in 1985. No world conference occurred in 1990. The 1995 World Conference on the Status of Women was accompanied by women's NGOs meeting outside Beijing in Huairou. See Stephenson, 135-151, and Look at the World Through Women's Eyes.

<sup>81</sup> Stienstra, in Women in World Politics, 149.

cooperation. Tenderness and strength are combined in women's leadership and teaching. Effective women leaders draw out the strengths of others. Relationships with other women are important sources of strength for women, particularly for African American women. The courage to face oppressive situations and speak out for the survival of communities, is a characteristic of women's leadership.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** Women in the NFC face their own vulnerability as well as that of their community on a daily basis, and are further reminded of the risks of living in their community every time they attend a funeral for a community member. Because of the denial of the larger community, they take risks when they speak out. Drawing strength from each other, they continue to stand up for their community with courage and persistence.

Women of the NFC nurture the strengths of others. Women leaders in the NFC have a keen watchful eye for the strengths of others, particularly those of youth and children. They encourage each other's strengths, and give youth leadership opportunities. The club held a regional Y2K Summit in 2000 that drew people and youth from all over the south, including a youth dialogue session for youth facing environmental degradation, which was well attended by attentively listening adults. In the summer of 2000, the NFC was the only group throughout the nation to bring five youth to a national dioxin education conference in Berkeley, California. Through a grant from the Atlanta Women's Foundation, thirty young girls were able to participate in a Leadership Development Program for Girls built around the leadership characteristics of local women during the summer of 2002.

As a facilitator and participatory curriculum developer for the girls leadership program, I noticed that the girls focused with rapt attention most closely when we were discussing their living conditions and issues relevant to their lives. We brainstormed about things that they wanted to change in their community and took this list on a field trip to the local City Commission, where one girl read the list out loud to local commissioners. This was an act of courage and risk-taking.

A significant number of the girls lived in public housing apartment complexes. Gainesville's mayor visited our class two times during the summer to respond to this

list, the second time in concert with the Federal Housing Director who came to discuss the girls' concerns. Some of these discussions were difficult, but helpful. We also looked on the internet and studied hexane, a flammable, toxic chemical produced by a local company, which most of the girls live near. We also studied the increased levels of air pollution in neighborhoods of people of color compared with whites in Hall County.<sup>82</sup> These studies provided girls with opportunities to discover the courage to know what is happening in their community.

The courage to know what you know is considered crucial to survival. Miss Janice, a woman of great personal strength, described in her NFC interview how important it is to "know what you know." At times when community members have wanted to deny the reality of the deaths in Newtown, she has spoken out and told her story. She lost two of her three children to lupus in their late teens and early twenties. She lost her husband to cancer, and she herself survived a brain tumor. The NFC holds Toxic Tours for students studying the environment.

The courage to stand up and speak out for social justice was one of the most consistent themes in the interviews. Miss May states:

Believe in what you believe in and what you're fighting for. ...be present--because numbers speak loud. Value what you do and be ready to show how it's going to make a difference.

Club members have worked to rectify structural forms of violence in the community by approaching the city commission about needed changes. To them, speaking out is not about getting angry, but going through appropriate channels and taking nonviolent action to stand up for the community.

**Vulnerability and risk are embodied in women and are characteristics of women's leadership that need to be incorporated in the structures of institutions of global governance.** It is possible that because women's embodiment forces women to face and take risks at physiological levels in order to love themselves and others, women may be more likely to learn the skill of risk-taking in relationships and utilize it in their leadership and peacemaking. Women's

---

<sup>82</sup> Information available on-line at <http://www.scorecard.org>, an environmental site providing statistics on air, water, and soil pollution all over the U.S., by Environmental Defense, Washington, D.C.

immune systems are lower during menstruation, and the risk of not surviving surgery during menstruation is significantly increased during that time notes Weideger.<sup>83</sup> In order for heterosexual women to fall in love, they risk the possibility that their feelings will lead them to become emotionally and sexually intimate, which could result in pregnancy and health risks. Kendrick writes of pregnancy, "Seldom does life require such an unyielding commitment in the face of so much unknown."<sup>84</sup> Breastfeeding requires vulnerability not only to pleasure, but possible pain and discomfort. Mutual sharing of feelings and experiences involves risk-taking in emotional intimacy.

Women principals in Regan and Brooks' study took risks to speak out for the needs of children, and to leave jobs incongruent with their ethical standards.<sup>85</sup> Many African American women risk their jobs to create institutional transformation that will uplift the African American community.<sup>86</sup> Vulnerability and risk-taking are key ingredients of the trust-building processes central to women's leadership and are directly related to the ability to share power in peer relationships with other people, groups, and diplomacy between nations. Womens' efforts to gather together nations to negotiate, share power, and relate as peers, can be seen in the women who tried to prevent World War II and other armed conflicts.

Because women's and peace NGOs today work closely with the United Nations, many have dreamed that the U.N. would serve as a global institution whereby international conflicts could be negotiated fairly and nonviolently to prevent wars.<sup>87</sup> Bertell sheds light on the failure to take risks and refusal to share power of U.S. Senate leaders that has prevented the U.N. International Court of Justice (also commonly referred to as the World Court,) from serving in the leadership role it was

---

<sup>83</sup> Weideger, 182, citing P. C. B. MacKinnon and I. L. MacKinnon, "Hazards of the Menstrual Cycle," Brit. Med. J. 1:555, 1956.

<sup>84</sup> Kendrick, 131.

<sup>85</sup> Regan and Brooks, 32-3.

<sup>86</sup> Collins, 159.

<sup>87</sup> Carter, 40; Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO), no. 2 "Transnational Corporations at the U.N.: Using or Abusing Their Access," Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) Primer: Understanding the Impact of the Global Economy on Women and the Environment (New York: WEDO, 1995).

created to serve:

The International Court of Justice was specifically included in the United Nations Charter, Articles 7 and 92, in the hope of providing a rational alternative to the use of force--and nuclear weapons--for the resolution of international conflict.<sup>88</sup>

She notes that all U.N. members are automatically members of the court.

The concept of world peace through world law was to be embodied in the U.N. judicial organ which could actually create law, based on the precedent of its own decisions, for the entire international community... Many U.N. members accepted the Charter and World Court as it was set up by the founders. The U.S.A., however, which had never been a member of the League of Nations or of the Permanent Court, by Senate vote on 2 August 1946 added a reservation in its ratification statement.<sup>89</sup>

This reservation, (called the Connally Amendment,) limited the Court's jurisdiction so that it has no say over conflicts that occur within the jurisdiction of the U.S., she writes, noting that the U.S. feared loss of sovereignty.<sup>90</sup> She writes, "While the role of the U.S. reservation on the jurisdiction of the International court of Justice should not be overstated, it was and is a major impediment to replacing war with conflict-resolution skills and law."<sup>91</sup> In response to the U.S. reservation, Great Britain and Canada added similar reservations in 1969 and 1970. By 1972, forty-six nations had "formerly accepted jurisdiction" by the International Court of Justice, most with reservations.<sup>92</sup> She notes, "The superpowers, each fearing for loss of national sovereignty, effectively prevented formation of a strong International Atomic Energy Commission and a strong International Court of Justice."<sup>93</sup> As Bertell illustrates, risk-taking for the sake of the safety of the world's children requires courage. The amendment was strongly opposed within the U.S. and in the international community, nevertheless, she writes, the Senate passed the amendment:

---

<sup>88</sup> Bertell, 146.

<sup>89</sup> Ibid., 146-7.

<sup>90</sup> Ibid., 147, citing B Weston et al., International Law and World Order, (St. Paul: West Publishing, 55165, June 1980).

<sup>91</sup> Vickers, 148.

<sup>92</sup> Ibid., 147-8, citing International Court of Justice Statute, Declarations under Article 36 (2).

<sup>93</sup> Ibid.

The history of the International Court has clearly demonstrated the self-defeating nature of a major nation's refusal to back compulsory jurisdiction.<sup>94</sup>

The amendment prevents the Court from "acting on behalf of the public good at times of international crisis, thereby causing people to lose faith in government by justice and law rather than power," notes Bertell, and as a result "prevents people from recognizing and believing that international resolution of conflicts is possible."<sup>95</sup> She adds, "Given our human history of developing ever more complex networks of co-operation, this pessimistic conclusion seems unnecessarily defeatist."<sup>96</sup>

Senator Javits' Senate resolution of May, 1971 "would have allowed a gradual turning over of responsibility from a national to a world court as international law became more developed," but she notes, as of 1985, the Senate had not acted on it.<sup>97</sup> In June 1992, United Nations Secretary-General Dr. Boutros-Ghali stated that most international disputes could be resolved without force if nations agreed to binding arbitration by the International Court of Justice, writes Vickers.<sup>98</sup> He also recommended pursuit of "an active preventive diplomacy, with a view to monitoring development of crises and devising adequate means to defuse them and prevent their escalation," quotes Vickers.<sup>99</sup>

U.S. refusal to share control is also evident in the structure of the U.N. Security Council, which Carter notes, incapacitates effective U.N. actions. United Nations decisions can be blocked by the veto of one of these five nations, because almost all important U.N. issues affect one of these nations. As a result, "the United Nations became relatively ineffective in making or implementing decisions," notes Carter.<sup>100</sup>

---

<sup>94</sup> Ibid., 148

<sup>95</sup> Ibid.

<sup>96</sup> Ibid., 148-9.

<sup>97</sup> Ibid., 149. The resolution would make the U.S. subject to the World Court's jurisdiction in (1) treaty interpretation, (2) all questions of international law, (3) questions regarding facts that, if established, would be considered a breach of an international responsibility, and (4) questions regarding the nature or extent of reparations that must be made when a breach of an international responsibility has occurred.

<sup>98</sup> Vickers, 85.

<sup>99</sup> Ibid., 85, citing final paragraph of a Declaration by a panel of eminent persons (including two Nobel Prize laureates), United Nations, N.Y., April 1986.

<sup>100</sup> Carter, 40-1.

This concentrated power is undemocratic and can be transformed through structural reforms, proposals for which have been offered by the Stanley Center, a nonprofit organization.<sup>101</sup> A one-nation, one-vote restructuring of the United Nations has been supported by those many who wish to see the influence of the superpowers countered, notes Carolyn Stephenson.<sup>102</sup>

Participation in such democratically restructured institutions of global governance will require leaders with diplomatic negotiation skills and the strength to support nonviolent democratic international processes of justice. Rather than leaders who rely on brittle, unyielding ultimatums and violence, leaders who nonviolently combine vulnerability and risk, strength and tenderness are needed. The ability to share power and control necessary to leadership, diplomatic negotiation, and virtually all forms of collaboration between individuals, groups, and nations requires the ability to be vulnerable and take risks in the mutual process of building trust.

**The combination of strength and tenderness is a characteristic of women's leadership and teaching.** The combination of strength and tenderness is described by diverse women in theology, education, and leadership. Opal writes that teaching is "dependent on the union of inner strength and outward flexibility."<sup>103</sup> Both African American and Latin American women creatively combine strength and tenderness as characteristics of mothering and leadership.<sup>104</sup> Bernice Reagan, who is both a role model and mentor for cultural workers and the founder of the singing group, "Sweet Honey in the Rock," chose the singing group's name to express this paradox write Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock. Reagan notes that black women have been forced by historical circumstances to develop the "standing power" of rocks and mountains."<sup>105</sup> She elaborates:

---

<sup>101</sup> Stanley Platt, "Global Problems Require Global Solutions, the Way to Go: a Restructured and Empowered United Nations, An Open Letter," (flyer), Stanley Center, Minneapolis, Minnesota.

<sup>102</sup> Carolyn Stephenson, "Peacekeeping and Peacemaking," *Introducing Global Issues*, 2d ed., eds. Michael T. Snarr and D. Neil Snarr, (Boulder, Colorado: Lynne Rienner, 2002), 72.

<sup>103</sup> Attributed to Opal, quoted in Ah-Nee Benham and Cooper, 97.

<sup>104</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 290, 298-307; Aquino, 114-5, 136.

<sup>105</sup> Attributed to Bernice Reagan in A. Buffalo, "Sweet Honey in the Rock: A Capella Activists," *Ms.*, March-April 1993, 24; quoted in Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 26-7.



That quality has often obscured the fact that inside the strength, partnering the sturdiness, we are as honey. If our world is warm, honey flows and so do we. If it is cold, stiff, and stays put--so do we.<sup>106</sup>

Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock note that many historic black women have exhibited these qualities, including Harriet Tubman, who guided slaves through the underground railroad. Africanist scholar Molefi Kete Asante, describes Tubman as a Great Mother living within the heart of every African American person--one of a long line of leaders who have lifted up their people and whose example has created new leaders "to deliver the people from bondage to salvation," and who is a "spirit-mother, protecting, suckling, and leading her children," they write.<sup>107</sup> "Tubman's ferocity is understood to be as limitless as her capacity for caring," add Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock.<sup>108</sup>

The practice of tenderness as an aspect of daily life is central to theological reflection and one characteristic of liberation theology, notes Maria Aquino. Her emphasis on a combination of strength and tenderness is a point of connection with womanist theology. She describes the origins of a practice of tenderness in daily life, citing Ana Maria Tepedino's understanding of a practice of tenderness that "goes beyond the experience of oppression, the experience of God, and the struggle for justice seeking to create brotherly and sisterly relationships... among all people."<sup>109</sup> Aquino describes the importance of human warmth which Ivone Gebara relates to the creation of a more human world.<sup>110</sup> Women's persistent struggles for life and justice through faith make possible the presence of God in history:

Many women see in these developments the expression of their desire to struggle for a more human world, in which certain values presently dormant may be aroused, where people can accept affection, where life may triumph

---

<sup>106</sup> Ibid., 27.

<sup>107</sup> Molefi Kete Asante, *The Afrocentric Idea* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1987), 109; quoted in Belenky, Bond, Weinstock, 27.

<sup>108</sup> Ibid., 27.

<sup>109</sup> Ana Maria Tepedino, "Feminist Theology as the Fruit of Passion and Compassion," *With Passion and Compassion: Third World Women Doing Theology*, eds. Virginia Fabella and Mercy Oduyoye (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1988), 166; quoted in Aquino, 114.

<sup>110</sup> Aquino, 114-115.

over the powers of death.<sup>111</sup>

Aquino notes that *mujerista* theology has a clear option for poor and oppressed women, stresses daily life, and the primacy of desire and experience over rationality. She cites Ana Maria Tepedino's view that *mujerista* theology begins with faith experiences shaped by oppression, "with a view not only to individual liberation, but to liberation of an entire people," from "situations and structures that cause misery and dehumanization."<sup>112</sup> Women's leadership that combines tenderness and strength empowers women to make vital nurturing connections with others while taking strong stands against structures and systems of oppression.

**Drawing out people's strengths is a characteristic of mothering and women's leadership.** Effective leaders help others identify and build upon their strengths and celebrate their growing competence. Ruddick notes that mothers teach children to celebrate each other's strengths.<sup>113</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock describe ways in which women community leaders brought out others' strengths by nurturing them and "drawing out the voices of the silenced."<sup>114</sup> As a result, their communities became more nurturing places to live. They note that this leadership style departs from traditional ideas of women and public leadership. They describe ways in which women in the Mothers' Centers empowered others by encouraging them, believing in them and their abilities, and nurturing their strengths:

Leaders of public homeplaces are intensely interested in the development of each individual, of the group as a whole, and of a more democratic society. These leaders want to know each person, what they care about, and where they are trying to go.<sup>115</sup>

These leaders point out goals that people share, look for each person's strengths, and find strengths within their various cultures that can help build up the whole community, note Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock. By asking questions that draw out

---

<sup>111</sup> Ibid., 115, citing Gebara, "Women Doing Theology in Latin America," With Passion and Compassion, 132.

<sup>112</sup> Tepedeno, 114, With Passion and Compassion; quoted in Aquino, 114.

<sup>113</sup> Ruddick, 98-102, 182.

<sup>114</sup> Belenky, Bond, Weinstock, 4.

<sup>115</sup> Ibid., 14.

people's thinking, connecting with others, imagining themselves in other's situations, seeing the world through their eyes, and empathizing:

They mirror what they see, give people a chance to... see their strengths in new ways--strengths that may not have been recognized or described before ...they are like midwives helping the community give birth to new ideas and nurture them until they become powerful ways of knowing.<sup>116</sup>

In this way, women leaders build upon each other's strengths, encourage each other, and nurture each other's ideas for the good of their community.

**Spirituality, sisterhood, the mother-daughter bond, and community are key sources of strength for African American women.** Close

relationships with other women are often generative and sustaining for women.

Alonso notes that close friendships were characteristic of many of the early suffragettes.<sup>117</sup> Christine Wiley notes that for black women, relationship with Jesus is a living, vital relationship.<sup>118</sup> She explains that women rely on Jesus for strength, support, and real help in their daily struggles to "make a way out of no way" to support their families and communities. In addition to this strong spirituality, friendships between mothers and daughters and between African American women are among the most supportive relationships in these women's lives.<sup>119</sup> Chinese American public school teacher Opal believes that her strength has come from "a lifelong journey of coming to knowing her soul and the world she lives in."<sup>120</sup>

**The courage to face the reality of oppressive situations and speak out are characteristics of women's leadership that empower the survival of communities.** Effective women leaders dare to face oppressive situations that others may choose to deny because of their passion for the survival of their families and communities. Temma Kaplan describes the experience of homemaker turned activist Luella Kenny, (whose young son died because of the toxins at Love Canal.) when she spoke to ghetto children in an enrichment program. She writes, "unlike

---

<sup>116</sup> Ibid.

<sup>117</sup> Alonso, 261-2.

<sup>118</sup> Wiley, 16.

<sup>119</sup> Collins, 96-99.

<sup>120</sup> Ah Nee-Benham and Cooper, 108.

most audiences, they immediately understood how devastating it is to be homeless and not have any rights.”<sup>121</sup> Kaplan describes the disillusionment that Love Canal home owners, who grew up trusting and not overly questioning of authority, experienced when they found themselves and their families betrayed by New York state government officials who denied the situation and tried to cover it up.<sup>122</sup>

Ruddick describes the importance of knowing who to trust and which authorities to question: “Nonetheless, those mothers who make the work of training a work of conscience extend the range of their nonviolence when they identify proper trust and distrust of allegedly legitimate authority virtues and develop habits of resistance.”<sup>123</sup> Aquino notes that a healthy hermeneutic of suspicion and the strength to retain cultural values has been important to Latin American women:

Latin American women have not assimilated the imposition of values, tasks, models, or socio-religious projects involving the loss of their human quality or the denial of their rights to be actors in history. With particular power today, but also in the past, women have struggled to fulfill their own calling.<sup>124</sup>

She notes that women were not subdued by their oppressive conditions; rebellion focused on recreating justice and life was always present. Aquino emphasizes that women invent ways to oppose the “inhumanity and the condemnation to death of themselves, their children, and their comrades, a death decreed by the present machisma and patriarchal socio-economic system.”<sup>125</sup> Women offer “huge resistance” through “struggles for survival, for collective work, for the self-direction of popular projects, for food increases, for a better quality of life” and insist on a transformation of death-dealing structures.<sup>126</sup> She quotes Ivone Gebara’s description of women’s collective strength in response to imperial domination in Latin America, where for twenty years, women have defended life and resisted “social

---

<sup>121</sup> Kaplan, 17, 25.

<sup>122</sup> Ibid., 26, 16-8.

<sup>123</sup> Ruddick, 177.

<sup>124</sup> Aquino, 103.

<sup>125</sup> Ibid., 104, citing Ivone Gebara, “Option for the Poor as an Option for the Poor Woman,” *Concilium* 194 (1987): 113-4.

<sup>126</sup> Ibid.

and political forces organized for death,” through demonstrations against dictatorial regimes and authoritarianism, sexual and racial discrimination, and raised food prices:

the struggle for their own and their children's lives also takes place outside the four walls of home. Women shout and march in the streets demanding freedom for political prisoners, respect, and justice. ...those who have understood what it means to fight for life with all their strength call it a gift of the Spirit.<sup>127</sup>

Melissa Raphael notes that strong women are needed to recreate the world:

Spiritual feminists can only recreate the world, or, differently expressed, establish new possibilities for life to flourish, in so far as they embody that cosmogonic dragon power of the Goddess. Patriarchy often refers to strong, assertive women as 'dragons.' But in spiritual feminism... the dragon is a sexually autonomous, defiantly creative woman.<sup>128</sup>

Women leaders who stand up for their communities may be labeled as troublemakers at times, but it is this courage, strength, and willingness to take risks that makes possible the transformation of communities and nations.

### **Preservative and Protective Love**<sup>129</sup>

From the beginning of pregnancy, mothers continuously act to preserve and protect the health of their babies. As children grow, the spheres of maternal protection widen. Mothering has been a historic source of women's motivation and peace activism; mothers in Finland declared a moratorium on bearing children until the nation abolished its pro-nuclear energy policy.<sup>130</sup> Women's preservation and protection is often expressed in terms of nonviolence and antimilitarism, seen in women's theological constructions, leadership, and peacemaking. Mothers minimize risks through the removal of weapons; similarly, women leaders call for disarmament. As a result of their peace activism and advocacy to preserve and protect the health of communities, women's grassroots and nongovernmental organizations have become central to global protection of the Earth, its creatures, and its peoples.

---

<sup>127</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>128</sup> Raphael, *Thealogy and Embodiment*, 274-75.

<sup>129</sup> Ruddick, 65-81, 103-123. Ruddick coined this phrase.

<sup>130</sup> Vickers, 118, citing *Ms. Magazine*, November 1986.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** The NFC is an example of a grassroots organization whose work centers around the preservation and protection of its community. Women's concerns for protecting their children's rights have moved them to consistent and unwavering social action on behalf of their families and community over fifty years. This has included standing up for full inclusion of their children in the newly integrated white school, resisting the KKK in a mass rally in downtown Gainesville in 1998, attending workshops to increase their knowledge, and constant faithful community advocacy work.

**Preservative and protective love is embodied in women.** Ruddick notes that although "imbued with intense, ambivalent, thought-provoking feelings, mothering is an activity governed by a commitment that perseveres through feeling," which she terms "preservative love."<sup>131</sup> She describes one new mother's sense of responsibility to protect her new baby:

I remember saying "Pregnancy takes away one's right to suicide. You must take care of a life you birth."<sup>132</sup>

Ruddick describes the "preservative and protective love" of mothers, noting that:

...women tend to know... both the history and the cost of human flesh. Their knowledge derives from the work of mothering, which... has been historically female. It also derives, at least in part, from an experience or appreciation of female birthing labor on which all subsequent mothering depends. Their maternal conception of history of flesh sets women at odds with militarist endeavors.<sup>133</sup>

She notes that white South African feminist Olive Schreiner was aware of "so many months of weariness and pain while bones and muscles were shaped within; so many hours of anguish and struggle that breath might be; so many baby mouths drawing life at woman's breasts..." and the inherent conflict between the destruction of human life in war and women's embodied nurturing of new life.<sup>134</sup> She quotes Schreiner's extraordinary observation:

---

<sup>131</sup> Ruddick, 70.

<sup>132</sup> Ibid., 70.

<sup>133</sup> Ibid., 186-7.

<sup>134</sup> Ibid., 186, citing Olive Schreiner, Women and Labour, (1911; London: Virago Press, 1978), 173.

No woman... says of a human body, "it is nothing." ...she knows the history of human flesh; she knows its cost.<sup>135</sup>

One Vietnam vet stated that the military turned him into a trained killer; an identity few mothers would choose for their sons. His mother and sister have been relieved to see his recovery process culminate in ordination and ministry to inner-city youth.<sup>136</sup>

While Ruddick notes that historically many women have supported wars, and have had parochial understandings of peacefulness that did not extend to persons outside their family or group, women's experiences as birthgivers and mothers have the potential to be formed into a maternal peacefulness that is nonparochial and global.<sup>137</sup> Since Ruddick identifies nonparochialism as a key distinguishing factor of maternal peacefulness, more research is needed to explore how globally inclusive caring develops.

Mothering and antimilitarism. Pastoral theologian Kendrick also noticed a relationship between mothering and antimilitarism in her interviews with women. The U.S. began the Gulf war in the Middle East the same week that her individual and group interviews on breastfeeding were scheduled.

As we reflected on our experiences as nursing mothers, we could not disassociate from our concerns about the power struggles and loss of life involved in this outbreak of war.<sup>138</sup>

She quotes the feelings of one mother, Yvonne, who explicitly described connections between pregnancy, birth, and antimilitarism:

We don't "carry these kids in our body... and nurse them for nine months, and ...keep them out of the streets for ten more years and protect them" to have them sent "to a war to be shot by a bullet."<sup>139</sup>

These maternal antimilitaristic statements are not anecdotal or limited to this historical period. Historically, women's experiences of mothering, have been a source for women's leadership and peace activism. In Iroquois culture, women were

---

<sup>135</sup> Ibid., 186.

<sup>136</sup> Vietnam veteran, interview by author, 2001, Gainesville, Ga., written notes, Gainesville, Ga.

<sup>137</sup> Ruddick, 177.

<sup>138</sup> Kendrick, 197.

<sup>139</sup> Kendrick, 197-198.

the lifegivers; they were seen as having a deeper understanding of what went into the creation of life attended by an inherent greater respect for life, and so they were afforded authority over matters involving life and death, writes Shenandoah.

Women leaders in the Iroquoian Confederacy were spiritual advisors, political counselors, and healers, and were responsible for selecting heads of their families, (clans,) who became "Clanmothers," representing their families in all social activities of the Haudenosaunee, she adds.<sup>140</sup> Mann describes the leadership role of the Iroquoian Clan Mothers:

To the Iroquois, past and present "woman" connotes high status, goodness, intelligence.... Clan Mothers were always "matrons": mature, wise, experienced women.<sup>141</sup>

The Jigonsaseh was the leader of the Clan Mothers. Mann describes instances in which Clan Mothers met with colonial leaders in meetings from which colonial wives were excluded, providing colonial women with leadership models and bringing to their attention their exclusion from public policy.

Mann notes that Clan Mothers heard the concerns of people from the grassroots up, meeting in councils to determine the most important societal issues, which were sent by "speakers" to the men's council. The Council discussed these issues and sent input back to the Clan Mothers and the Jigonsaseh, who had final decision making power on all matters. In contrast to hierarchical structures, "grassroots" people represented by Clan Mothers decided which issues were most important:

These, then, were the powerful women guiding national agendas through their abilities to name and dename officers of the Councils, adopt new citizens, keep both the domestic and the international peace, declare the wars, and, always, shepherd the sacred will of the people into the policies of the League...<sup>142</sup>

She writes that "women were the legal advocates of peace, not war."<sup>143</sup> They were "required, by law, to initiate three successive efforts to bring a nation into the

---

<sup>140</sup> Joanne Shenandoah, CD Album jacket introduction, *Matriarch: Iroquois Women's Songs* (Boulder: Silver Wave Records, 1996).

<sup>141</sup> Mann, 22, 154-5.

<sup>142</sup> Ibid., 182.

<sup>143</sup> Ibid., 179.



Great Peace by persuasion..."<sup>144</sup> She notes that the gantowisas could forbid or declare war, appoint warriors, overrule the war chiefs, and negotiate peace. The nature of war itself was also vastly different. War in pre-colonial Iroquois involved running the contender out of the area, "not murdering them."<sup>145</sup> She states that the most important social roles of Haudenosaunee men had nothing to do with warfare, which was the "lowest step of their social and political advancement."<sup>146</sup> In traditional pre-colonial Zulu culture, the structure of war was nonviolent; competitive dancing was used to solve conflict and was followed by prolonged feasting.<sup>147</sup> The Iroquoian people were noted for their respectful nonviolent treatment of women and children, in which child abuse, domestic violence, and rape did not exist.<sup>148</sup> The relationship between nonviolent families and a nonviolent culture has also been observed by western feminists and family advocates.

In the U.S., the development of the women's suffrage and peace movements were interrelated; the suffrage movement was inspired by the Iroquois Clan Mothers writes Mann.<sup>149</sup> Mann does not address what, if any, influence the Clan Mothers might have had on the suffragettes' development of a pacifist consciousness, but it is likely that the peaceloving nature of the Iroquois was influential. Alonso describes an early feminist-pacifist consciousness:

From the early 1800s to 1914, proponents of women's rights became more and more committed to the idea that each human being had the inherent right to develop her or his own potential, regardless of gender, race, ethnic background, or class.<sup>150</sup>

They had recognized that social, economic, and political equality for women were

---

<sup>144</sup> Ibid., 180, citing Parker, Constitution of the Five Nations, 54.

<sup>145</sup> Mann, 137.

<sup>146</sup> Ibid., 27.

<sup>147</sup> Charlie Saboor, Sunday School teacher, conversation with author, 2000.

<sup>148</sup> Mann, 271-5, 86, 76-7. This is in contrast to child-rearing practices in Europe from the Middle Ages to the nineteenth century also documented by Eisler, 184, citing John Boswell, The Kindness of Strangers, (New York: Pantheon, 1988, 421); and citing Frances Gies and Joseph Gies, Marriage and the Family in the Middle Ages (New York: Harper and Row, 1987).

<sup>149</sup> Mann, 244-8. Barbara Mann notes that the French suffrage movement was also inspired by the Iroquois Clan Mothers, the gantowisas.

<sup>150</sup> Alonso, 21.

crucial to the development of a healthy nation in need of freeing itself from injustices, she adds. Julia Ward Howe “proposed that a national day [June 2] be proclaimed to honor mothers, for she felt deeply that mothers, in particular, understood the suffering caused by war,” writes Alonso (see Appendix F).<sup>151</sup> Since then, Mother’s Day has been personalized, sentimentalized, and moved from the public to the private sphere. Addams noted that the feeding of children by nations preceded war by a million years, and that war has not been in the world more than 20,000 years, according to anthropologists, writes Oldfield.<sup>152</sup> In accepting her part in the 1931 Nobel Peace Prize, Addams said, “It was the mothers who first protested that their children should no longer be slain as living sacrifices... I should like to see the women of civilization rebel against the senseless wholesale human sacrifice of warfare.”<sup>153</sup>

Women around the world have an ancient and contemporary history of using female embodiment as a source of power for stopping wars. Midwife, Arisika Razak, tells of two different mythical accounts in which women stopped a war by pulling up their skirts and showing their vaginas--not to lie with the men--but as a symbol of their life-giving capacity and the obscenity of war in the face of this lifegiving capacity.<sup>154</sup> She notes that they were “displaying an emblem, a reminder that we all come from the same womb and we all have an obligation to peace.”<sup>155</sup> Vickers cites Aristophanes’ Lystistrata, in which women declared a sex strike until the men stopped fighting--a strike which ended the war. In 1986, Finnish women declared that they would not bear any more children until Finland changed its pro-nuclear energy policy, writes Vickers. Led by Marjo Linkkonen, the petition was made to the Ministry of Trade and Commerce in Finland.<sup>156</sup> Because nuclear

---

<sup>151</sup> Ibid., 45-6.

<sup>152</sup> Oldfield, in Women in World Politics, 163.

<sup>153</sup> This quote is attributed to Jane Addams, by Emily Cooper Johnson, ed., Jane Addams: A Centennial Reader (New York: Macmillan, 1960), 324; quoted in Oldfield, in Women in World Politics, 165.

<sup>154</sup> “Arisika Razak,” interview by Cathleen Rountree Coming Into Our Fulness: On Women Turning Forty (Freedom Calif.: Crossing Press, 1991), 83.

<sup>155</sup> Ibid.

<sup>156</sup> Vickers, 118, citing Ms. Magazine, November, 1986.

energy production yields by-products required for nuclear weapons, the elimination of nuclear power usually means the elimination of nuclear weapons capabilities.

**Nonviolence, peace activism, and preservative-protective love are characteristics of women's theological constructions, mothering, leadership, and peacemaking.** Women often interpret theologies of atonement with a critique of implicit sanctions to violence; God's nonviolent preservation and protection of human life is revealed in the New Testament. In her critique of atonement theory, June Goudey cites the research of Philip Greven who notes that persons who have been child victims of abuse have a greater tendency to be attracted to atonement theologies, because of the links between punishing god-images and child abuse.<sup>157</sup> Brock also discusses the punitive father image inherent in atonement theology, which she says, "reflects by analogy" images of divine "child abuse."<sup>158</sup> Jesus' life is a shining example of self-giving love and nonviolence--and self-giving love in integritous solidarity with the poor, strangers, women, and others rejected by society. In Gethsemane, Jesus stopped Peter from defending Him with the sword, never lifting a hand in violence to save his own life. Jesus was completely nonviolent toward other persons. God's parental nonviolence in response to Jesus' crucifixion and the contemporary violence of humans today is also stunning. In Pentecost God restores what was killed in Jesus' resurrection through the gift of the Holy Spirit, the Comforter. Soelle notes that the Christian church's moral system of values suggest that "churches of peace" say to young men and women, "As a Christian, you cannot be a soldier."<sup>159</sup>

Johnson describes images of God as Mother articulated by theologian McFague that relate to God's nonviolent advocacy for cultural transformation:

---

<sup>157</sup> June Christine Goudey, Atonement Imagery and Eucharistic Praxis in the Reformed Tradition: A Feminist Critique (Ph.D. diss., Boston University, 1993), 203-28, 172-180, citing Philip Greven, The Protestant Temperament: Patterns of Child-Rearing, Religious Experience, and the Self in Early America (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1977), and citing Philip Greven, Spare the Child: The Religious Roots of Punishment and the Psychological Impact of Child Abuse (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1991; Vintage Books, 1992).

<sup>158</sup> Brock, 56.

<sup>159</sup> Soelle, 65.

[She] makes a particularly interesting connection between motherly care and justice, bringing to light the toughness inherent in the maternal experience. ...mothers have a stake in the well-being of their children and do stand in judgment on whatever hurts them.<sup>160</sup>

McFague's description of God as Mother is built on "birth, gestation, and lactation" experiences that require strength and contribute "to the active defense of the young," so that " ...Those who produce life have a stake in it and will judge, often with anger, what prevents its fulfillment."<sup>161</sup>

Women's embodied experiences and sense of connection to children may make them prone to pause and less impulsive in the use of violence. Ruddick marvels at mothers' nonviolence with children:

From the perspective of nonviolent activism, what is striking about mothers is their commitment to nonviolent action in precisely those situations where they are undeniably powerful, however powerless they may feel--namely, in their battles with their children. ...I can think of no other situation in which someone subject to resentments at her social powerlessness, under enormous pressures of time and anger, faces a recalcitrant but helpless combatant with so much restraint. This is the nonviolence of the powerful.<sup>162</sup>

She notes that, "While poverty and isolation make nonviolence a miracle, the miracle seems to occur."<sup>163</sup> It is possible that, to some extent, these connections are also translated into relationships with others, as only about ten percent of all violent crimes are committed by women, notes Eisler.<sup>164</sup>

Brigit Brock-Utne names three characteristics of women's historic work for peace: a concern for life, especially for children, as well as other women and themselves; nonviolence; and transpolitical, transnational approaches directed toward building solidarity with women of different political loyalties or nations.<sup>165</sup>

---

<sup>160</sup> Johnson, She Who Is, 181.

<sup>161</sup> Sallie McFague, Models of God: Theology for an Ecological, Nuclear Age (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1987), 113; quoted in Johnson, She Who Is, 181.

<sup>162</sup> Ruddick, 166.

<sup>163</sup> Ibid., 63.

<sup>164</sup> Eisler, 253, citing June Stephenson, Men Are Not Cost-Effective (Napa, Calif.: Diemer, Smith, 1991), and citing Myriam Miedzian, Boys Will Be Boys (New York: Anchor Books, 1991).

<sup>165</sup> Vickers, 118, citing Brigit Brock-Utne, Educating for Peace (London: Pergamon Press, 1985.)

Preservative and protective mothering often evolves into leadership.

Twentieth-century nonviolence practices used by Gandhi and Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. were first used by Boerian women in Africa against the British.<sup>166</sup> Gandhi first witnessed nonviolent noncooperation in wartime as a medic in the armed services, where he was impressed by the Boerian women's use of nonviolence during the Boer War. Gandhi believed that the women's use of nonviolent noncooperation and self-suffering finally caused the British to relent and end the war, notes Rashmi-Sudha Puri.<sup>167</sup> He recognized nonviolent noncooperation as a possible strategy for India's liberation from Great Britain, she adds.<sup>168</sup> Vickers notes that more than sixty percent of those marching in the Salt March of 1930 were women, as were more than half of those arrested.<sup>169</sup>

The leadership of Septima Clark, Ella Baker, Rosa Parks, and Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. illustrate strategies for nonviolent change during the Civil Rights Movement. Septima Clark and Ella Baker developed the grassroots foundation for the civil rights movement through Students' Nonviolent Coordinating Committee (SNCC), In Friendship, and the Voter Registration Schools, note Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock.<sup>170</sup> Like many others, Rosa Parks trained in nonviolent resistance techniques at the Highlander Center. Her arrest helped catalyze the Civil Rights Movement, but much had already been done and much would continue. Nonviolent strategies of change and resistance offer important alternatives to violence and can be incorporated into the curricula of religious and secular education as important aspects of responsible citizenship as well as education.

Women's history as activists and educators for peace in the U.S. and around

---

<sup>166</sup> Puri, 141. Puri, 156, also notes Gandhi's later recognition of women in Gujarat who stood against Lathi charges "unflinchingly," as well as the use of nonviolence in Peshawar.

<sup>167</sup> Ibid., 141. For a description of what is meant by nonviolent noncooperation, see also 156-7.

<sup>168</sup> Ibid.

<sup>169</sup> Vickers, 151.

<sup>170</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 170, 164-79, citing Charles M. Payne, I've Got the Light of Freedom: The Organizing Tradition and the Mississippi Freedom Struggle (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995).

the world often appear as extensions of their protective mothering roles. Historically, women have organized internationally to stop wars.<sup>171</sup> “The WILPF has opposed every war ...and has supported negotiation, mediation or arbitration of all international disputes, world disarmament, world organization to insure peace and raise the economic status of vast areas of the world, self-determination, and insurance of basic human rights to every individual...” writes Alonso.<sup>172</sup> Until the U.S. became involved in the Vietnam War in 1965, U.S. women’s antiwar work occurred primarily through the WILPF, she adds.

Vickers notes that Israeli and Palestinian women have met annually for years in Jerusalem, black and white women in South Africa, Catholic and Protestant women in Northern Ireland, Sinhalese and Tamil women in Sri Lanka, and Christian and Muslim women in Pakistan, for dialogue and mutual campaigns to peacefully resolve problems that create violent conflict in their countries.<sup>173</sup> The German Green Party is also based on nonviolent social change and rejects military intervention. One of its founders, Petra Kelly, was disillusioned with politics centered around “economic growth at all costs,” pro-nuclear power, and pro-deployment of nuclear weapons in Western Europe.<sup>174</sup> Vickers cites First Lady of Greece Margarita Papandreou’s message to women

to join forces with the peace movement and turn its spectacular energies and skills into changing the war system. More and more women are realizing that the struggle for women’s rights is a larger struggle, a revolutionary struggle, which is inextricably intertwined with peace.<sup>175</sup>

International women’s peace movements are a significant aspect of the global women’s movement, which is strengthened by women’s recognition that peace is a necessary foundation for all cultural and global transformations.

### **Mothers preserve and protect their children by minimizing risk**

---

<sup>171</sup> Alonso, mothering: 10-2, 16, 45-7, 54, 216, 86, 263-4, 49, 240, 204, 207, 218, 242, 191; organizing to stop war: 56-84, 71, 83, 90, 144, 198, 257, 241-2.

<sup>172</sup> Alonso, 194.

<sup>173</sup> Ibid., 130.

<sup>174</sup> Kelly, in Women in World Politics, 175-6.

<sup>175</sup> Vickers, 126.

**through the removal of all weapons; disarmament is a historic characteristic of women's peacemaking.** The presence of weapons significantly and unnecessarily raises the stakes in any conflict. Ruddick writes that mothers routinely remove weapons as a way of preserving and protecting the peace.<sup>176</sup> Rather than valorizing epic stories of violence and war, Eisler suggests creating stories about chemical warfare such as "neuropeptide-like substances that make people feel so good they would rather not fight" rather than chemicals which make people too sick to fight. She also wryly suggests creating "empathy-and-caring-producing" chemical "weapons" that empower people to care for rather than destroy others, noting the possibility that "some enterprising chemical company" might actually attempt to create them.<sup>177</sup>

"Our present path, as Bertell wrote, is headed toward species death, whether fast, with nuclear war or technological disaster, or slow, by poison," notes Petra Kelly.<sup>178</sup> "It is probably true to say that... the atomic bomb was developed, tested and deployed without the knowledge of consent of the American people or their elected representatives in Congress..." writes Bertell. She adds, "The same has been true in Canada, Great Britain, France and most probably in the Soviet Union."<sup>179</sup>

Women around the world have historically intervened against nuclear weapons through peace encampments, antinuclear peace demonstrations and other means.<sup>180</sup> Kelly writes that the nuclear, defense, and chemical industries must be dismantled, including nuclear power with unilateral disarmament, and civilian-based, nonmilitary forms of defense.<sup>181</sup> During the 1980s, women's peace camps were formed to oppose military and nuclear weapons. The best known of these is

---

<sup>176</sup> Ruddick, 71, 151, 164-5, 172-3.

<sup>177</sup> Eisler, 289.

<sup>178</sup> Kelly, in Women in World Politics, 174.

<sup>179</sup> Bertell, 154.

<sup>180</sup> Vickers, 118, 120-5; Raphael, Theology and Embodiment, 149-50, 230-33, 260; Starhawk, 164-80.

<sup>181</sup> Kelly, in Women in World Politics, 169.

Greenham Common, writes, Deborah Stienstra, which was organized to oppose cruise missiles on military bases in Great Britain.<sup>182</sup>

Nordic Women for Peace marched from Copenhagen to Paris in summer 1981, and again from Cardiff to the Greenham Common Air Force base in August 1981 to protest the installation of Cruise missiles planned to occur there in 1983. They formed a peace camp and stayed there more than two years, writes Jeanne Vickers, who notes, "These women made huge personal sacrifices because they felt so strongly about the issue." Men were able to visit the camp or stay in a supportive role but only women in the camp talked to the press, writes Vickers.<sup>183</sup> Aldermaston, Menwith Hill, Sellafield, and the Women's Encampment for Peace at the Seneca Army Depot in the U.S., are other nonviolent peace camp locations.<sup>184</sup> Some peace camps still remain and are part of a network of peace groups of feminist nonviolent action, writes Vickers.<sup>185</sup>

Raphael describes the "sheer power of endurance" and pacifist intentions of women in the camp, so that the word Greenham she writes, has come to symbolize "female prophetic presence" at all the camps. Similarly, Starhawk describes the women protesting and blockading the Diablo Canyon Nuclear Power Plant so that workers could not load fuel rods. Before the blockade began in force, women participated in nonviolence trainings, helped with the camp, and facilitated workshops. She notes that nonviolence training was the "rite of entry" for the camp. On the morning that the Nuclear Regulatory Commission was scheduled to grant the plant its low-power testing license, women appeared in groups of thirty all along the seven-mile-long road to the main gate to block it. They were arrested thirty or so at a time. Starhawk wrote, "When the first contingent of thirty people is rounded up, another thirty will appear suddenly a little further down the road."<sup>186</sup> Starhawk writes:

---

Here frustration is gone... What has freed me is action. I have acted with

<sup>182</sup> Stienstra, in *Women in World Politics*, 152.

<sup>183</sup> Vickers, 124-5.

<sup>184</sup> Ibid., 118, 120-5; Raphael, *Theology and Embodiment*, 149-50, 230-33, 260.

<sup>185</sup> Stienstra, in *Women in World Politics*, 152.

<sup>186</sup> Starhawk, *Dreaming the Dark*, 174.



my body, using not just words, but my whole being. I have become fully a part of this community of resistance, putting forth effort and taking risks... I feel better on that trail. Though I am hot, dirty, exhausted, and painfully aware that it is not really a difficult hike, it is that I am out of shape--I feel better than I have in years. Maybe ever. The blockade is well worth the price of admittance.<sup>187</sup>

Group by group, the women were arrested and detained in an old gym at the California Men's Colony, a prison. Those released returned to the blockade and were arrested again, she writes. Starhawk remembers her fears that two hundred women could be arrested by the National Guard and the police in a relatively short amount of time--even if they let their bodies go limp--and could not blockade the power plant forever. Yet she describes the powerful impression the women received during a ritual that the plant would never open. The blockade lasted three weeks; the plant never opened; and newly discovered safety violations caused the Nuclear Regulatory Commission to revoke its license, she writes.<sup>188</sup> She describes how facing the guns in the hands of National Guard soldiers helped the women to recognize internalized agents of self-hate and helped them,

ignore the voices that warn, "You'll get in trouble," and the constellations of fears that reflect the way power-over keeps us intimidated... We are changed--more deeply than any growth workshop, or therapy, or packaged adventure-tour could change us--because we are confronting something real, and our transformation of consciousness is integrated with our transformation of the reality that surrounds us.<sup>189</sup>

This kind of social action illustrates the depth of self-giving, passion, and commitment of women to preserve and protect future generations and the planet.

Other women's antinuclear groups include Comison in Italy, Pine Gap in Australia, Women for Meaningful Summites in the U.S. and the Shibo Kusa women of Mount Fuji in Japan, notes Eisler.<sup>190</sup> Angela Davis also emphasizes that peace is an important issue, especially for African Americans. She notes that nuclear bombs do not racially discriminate.

If it were at all conceivable that nuclear fallout could be programmed to kill

---

<sup>187</sup> Ibid., 175-6.

<sup>188</sup> Ibid., 180.

<sup>189</sup> Ibid., 174.

<sup>190</sup> Eisler, 365, citing V. Spike Peterson and Anne Sisson Runyan, Global Gender Issues (Boudler, Co.: Westview Press, 1993), 126-7.

some of us while sparing others, I can guarantee you that the warmakers in this country would see to it that Black people would be its first victims.<sup>191</sup>

Her hypothetical concerns are rendered more urgent by proposals for U.S.

production of small-scale nuclear weapons for use in conventional warfare.<sup>192</sup>

The preservative and protective actions of women of history provide models of self-giving and inspiration to address current historical challenges of disarmament and international security in the creation of a world centered around the needs and safety of all children. Carolyn Stephenson cites the conclusions of the Palme Commission, (also known as the Independent Commission on Disarmament and Security Issues)--that there can be no victory in nuclear war, so that peace is a necessity rather than an option.<sup>193</sup>

**Current challenges to women's efforts to preserve, protect, and raise children within a peaceful nation and world.** The United States has the horrific distinction of being the only country in the history of the world to have ever used nuclear weapons (at Hiroshima and Nagasaki) against another nation. In the Gulf War, the U.S. once again was the first to use depleted uranium shells against Iraq--again without the consent or prior approval of the United States people or the Gulf War servicemen who handled these materials, many of whom are now experiencing serious illnesses and birth defects in their children. The use of depleted uranium shells is a violation of the 1970 Nuclear Non-Proliferation treaty.

Osama bin Laden's threat to drop a dirty uranium bomb on New York did not come out of the blue, but is likely an outgrowth of the precedent of U.S. use of dirty uranium in the Gulf War.<sup>194</sup> Once again, it is the U.S. who broke this nuclear barrier first. In spring 2002, President Bush stated that the U.S. would withdraw from the Anti-Ballistic Missile Treaty within six months in order to build a national missile

---

<sup>191</sup> Davis, 68-9.

<sup>192</sup> Khatchadourian, 26-7.

<sup>193</sup> Carolyn Stephenson, "Peacekeeping and Peacemaking," in Introducing Global Issues, eds. Snarr and Snarr, 73.

<sup>194</sup> President George W. Bush, news conference, C-SPAN television, Gainesville, Ga., 6 Nov. 2001.

defense system.<sup>195</sup> The U.S. under the leadership of this administration is also preparing to produce small-scale nuclear weapons for use preemptively in conventional warfare and has named a list of countries as possible targets.<sup>196</sup>

When concern is expressed in the U.S. by the Bush administration and others regarding Iraq's possession of nuclear or chemical weapons, it is discussed as if the U.S. was not the first and only country to have ever initiated nuclear strikes in both past and recent history. It is only natural that such a history would be frightening to other nations. The United States' history of preemptive use of nuclear weapons puts U.S. citizens in grave danger of retaliation, and its plans to develop small-scale nuclear weapons put the world at risk of normalizing small nuclear bombs. This broader historical context sheds light on how current U.S. development of small-scale nuclear weapons for use in conventional warfare may be perceived by other countries. When U.S. history of nuclear use is combined with U.S. corporate practices of domination and exploitation in many areas around the world, the combination is even more sobering for other nations. It is the responsibility of U.S. citizens to change these patterns. The Women's International League for Peace and Freedom has launched a disarmament movement, "Reaching Critical Will," that makes public the names of the "Dirtiest Dozen" weapons manufacturers along with strategies for creating national change.<sup>197</sup> The Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, now over eighty years old, is still providing national leadership in areas of disarmament, diplomacy, and peace.

Weapons developed for use in warfare can also become accessible to teenage gang members. It is not inconceivable that the proliferation of dirty uranium and small scale nuclear weapons could make nuclear materials and small handmade nuclear bombs accessible to teen gang members and others engaged in criminal

---

<sup>195</sup> "Anti-Ballistic Missile Treaty Implementation Act," Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, (WILPF), (articles on-line), posted on 8 May 2002, available from <http://www.wilpf.org>.

<sup>196</sup> "Bush Goes Nuclear," *The Nation*, 1 April 2002, 3.

<sup>197</sup> "Reaching Critical Will: The Dirtiest Dozen Corporations--Partners in Mass Destruction," Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, (WILPF), (articles on-line), posted Sept. 2001, available from <http://www.reachingcriticalwill.org>.

activities within the U.S.

The Bush administration's current efforts, already underway, to build small-scale nuclear weapons, violate national and international law and threaten U.S. national security as well as the security of nations worldwide. Small-scale nuclear weapons are being created as "modifications" of existing bombs; they are in actuality new atomic bombs, and as such, break the 1970 Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty, blatantly ignoring the U.S. Congress actions in 1994 forbidding the U.S. Energy Department from either researching or developing mini-nuclear weapons because, "low-yield nuclear weapons blur the distinction between nuclear and conventional war," quotes Raffi Khatchadourian in The Nation.<sup>198</sup>

Small nuclear weapons are designed to burrow into the ground and destroy a bunker, (that might be storing hard and buried targets holding chemical weapons beneath mountains or in tunnels,) yet, with one-third the explosive yield of atomic bombs used in Hiroshima, they cannot attain the depth needed to contain the fireball blast through the earth's surface, and will create a cloud of radioactive dirt and debris, according to Robert Nelson of the Federation of American Scientists, writes Khatchadourian. Five-kiloton atomic bombs tested at the Nevada Test Site had to be detonated at a depth of 650 feet in order to be fully contained; mini-nukes cannot attain that depth, he adds.

Once a nuclear weapon is used it "breaches the firewall," states Rear Adm. Eugene Carroll, who notes that nuclear weapons are essentially useless because once the threshold between conventional and nuclear weapons is crossed, a nuclear phase is created, putting us at the mercy of the other side.<sup>199</sup>

This is exactly the fear of many New Yorkers, writes Jonathan Schell in the wake of the September 11th tragedy, who describes his fear at hearing that the Bush Administration's Nuclear Posture Review's policy will involve warehousing rather than cutting 2,000 nuclear weapons from the strategic arsenal, expanding nuclear weapons production to build new kinds of nuclear warheads, and most

---

<sup>198</sup> Khatchadourian, 26-7.

<sup>199</sup> Ibid., 27.

shocking, he writes, using nuclear weapons against at least seven countries: Russia, China, North Korea, Libya, Syria, Iraq and Iran. He writes, "Other countries are looking on with alarm..."<sup>200</sup> The Pentagon's topsecret Nuclear Posture Review outlined a nuclear weapons policy that included integrating nuclear weapons with "non-nuclear strategic capabilities," according to Defense Secretary Donald Rumsfeld, who states that non-nuclear adversaries could now face nuclear retaliation, writes Khatchadourian.<sup>201</sup>

Mini-nukes are already budgeted for production. The U.S. military has already developed a prototype earth-penetrating low-yield nuclear bomb, the B61-11, which was developed under the guise of modifying existing nuclear weapons that were removed from deployment as "weapons cuts," but kept in storage and modified, writes Khatchadourian.<sup>202</sup> Nuclear weapons and power research, development, and production made up sixty-six percent of the U.S. Energy Department (D.O.E.) budget in 1992, according to a Greenpeace report.<sup>203</sup> The Energy Department's 2003 budget request includes further studies of a "robust nuclear earth penetrator," writes Khatchadourian, and D.O.E. work groups to develop atomic warheads have already been created under Gen. John Gordon, an under secretary at the National Nuclear Security Administration.<sup>204</sup>

Khatchadourian, notes that according to the D.O.E. 2003 budget, these plans include engineering design work and testing. Contrary to the government's statements that testing is needed to insure the safety of an aging nuclear arsenal, Joseph Cirincione, a senior associate at the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, states that "The only reason you would need new tests is to verify new designs, new types of weapons, period," quotes Khatchadourian. Plutonium pits needed for a warhead's trigger mechanism are scheduled to be manufactured in

---

<sup>200</sup> Jonathan Schell, "Letter from Ground Zero," The Nation, 1 April 2002, 7.

<sup>201</sup> Khatchadourian, 26.

<sup>202</sup> Ibid.

<sup>203</sup> Tom Lent, Energy for Employment: How to Heat Up the Economy Not the Planet (San Francisco: Greenpeace, July, 1992). 23.

<sup>204</sup> Khatchadourian, 26.

modern pit facilities, whose funding was tripled last July, according to Nuclear Watch of New Mexico, a watchdog group. In January of 2002, the Tennessee Valley Authority approved \$3.25 million for the production of tritium, a gas used to make nuclear weapons smaller and lighter, central to the development of mini-nukes.<sup>205</sup>

In 1996, the International Court of Justice declared the threat or use of nuclear weapons illegal.<sup>206</sup> If the International Court of Justice had the power to enforce its declarations, the United Nations could intervene to prevent U.S. development of mini-nukes.

U.S. production of small-scale nuclear weapons may represent the greatest threat of uncontained nuclear war and terrorism the world has yet seen. Once these weapons are produced in the U.S., it is likely that other nations and terrorist groups will also develop them, so that, at some point, the U.S. could become a target for such weapons. In such scenarios, women are likely to bear the heaviest burdens, not only of social structure recovery (as in most wars,) or of radiation health effects such as cancer and thyroid disease, but also of the radiation effects visited on the next generation--borne by women in the body-- including birth defects (that have ranged from mild to "jellyfish" babies), stillbirths, miscarriages, and an inability to conceive, as experienced by some Hiroshima, Marshall Islands, and Gulf War Syndrome survivors.<sup>207</sup>

Here, the Biblical story of Esther is instructive. Mordecai's words of advice to Esther and her response are poignantly relevant to us as women in the U.S. where these weapons are being developed:

Do not think that because you are in the king's house you alone of all the Jews will escape. For if you remain silent at this time, relief and deliverance for the Jews will arise from another place, but you and your father's family will perish. And who knows but that you have come to royal position for such a time as this?

---

<sup>205</sup> Ibid.

<sup>206</sup> World Court Project, "World Court Declares Nuclear Weapons Threat and Use Illegal," (United Kingdom: World Court Project, 9 July 1996).

<sup>207</sup> Although small-scale nuclear weapons carry lower levels of radioactivity, their health effects are likely to be less than those suffered in Hiroshima, but greater than those suffered by Gulf War veterans exposed to depleted uranium. Vickers, 18-37; Bertell, 27, 42-3, 59, 72-3, 130, 137-46, 88-105; Sullivan.

Then Esther sent this reply to Mordecai: Go, gather together all the Jews who are in Susa, and fast for me... I and my maids will fast as you do. When this is done, I will go to the king, even though it is against the law. And if I perish, I perish.<sup>208</sup>

Today, silence carries more life-threatening potential than speaking out. The courage of women who have been leaders in the antinuclear movement in the U.S. from its inception, is no less needed today.<sup>209</sup> Their history offers an important and inspiring legacy for facing today's challenges in the creation of a peaceful, disarmed world.

**Women researchers emphasize views of national security based on social justice among nations, and decry wars based on greed and unjust economic gain.** In much of women's research and NGO literature, national security is described in terms of conflict resolution, peace, and economic justice; rather than in terms of weapons buildups or military might. In addition to challenging the myth of the efficacy of war, women challenge the veracity of many so-called "just" wars and motivations for war. The research of nonprofit organizations such as the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom documents ways in which war is largely a moneymaking industry.<sup>210</sup>

Women researchers conceptualize national security in terms of peace, economic and environmental justice, and human rights. "A concept of national security which gives priority to military threat rather than to dangers in the economic and social sectors of society can be bought only at the cost of poverty and misery and the violation of human rights," writes Vickers, adding that these costs are particularly borne by the poor, women, and future generations.<sup>211</sup> She points out that the United Nations understands security to refer to "political, economic, social, humanitarian and human rights and ecological" aspects of societies as well as to the

---

<sup>208</sup> Esther 4:12-16, Ryrie, 668.

<sup>209</sup> Vickers, 120.

<sup>210</sup> Frida Berrigan, World Policy Institute, "U.S. Weapons Systems in Afghanistan." Women's International League for Peace and Freedom (WILPF), (articles on-line); posted 7 Dec. 2001, available from <http://www.reachingcriticalwill.org>. See also William Hartung, And Weapons for All; and Vickers, 14.

<sup>211</sup> Vickers, 68.

military.<sup>212</sup> The international community has also agreed on the crucial relationship between peace, security, economic and social development, she notes.<sup>213</sup>

The concept of common security developed within the U.N. framework, through the Report of the Independent Commission on International Development Issues in 1980 (the Brandt Report), the Independent Commission on Disarmament and Security Issues in 1982 (the Palme Commission), and the Helsinki Agreement in 1975 (Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe), notes Carolyn Stephenson. These reports emphasized the importance of economic development, (which the Southern hemisphere nations considered more of a threat than nuclear war). The reports also recognized that no nation would survive nuclear war, and emphasized that military costs were creating economic insecurity everywhere and could be better reduced to fund development. They highlighted the importance of human rights and open east-west trade. These aspects of common security were expanded in the Brundtland Commission report, Our Common Future, to include the importance of common environmental security, notes Carolyn Stephenson.<sup>214</sup>

Vickers challenges militaristic understandings of global security, and describes security instead in terms of the "right to food;" eliminating or reducing Third World debt; transforming policies and priorities of global institutions such as the International Monetary Fund (IMF); national health including women's nutrition and more widely-spaced pregnancies; quality education for women; addressing problems of homelessness, unemployment and underemployment; creating equality; and eliminating discrimination.<sup>215</sup>

Economic justice is crucial in the maintenance of a sustainable peace. Vickers notes that because women bear the greatest burden of poverty and vulnerability,

---

<sup>212</sup> Ibid., 68, citing the final paragraph of a Declaration by a panel of eminent persons (including two Nobel Prize laureates), United Nations, N.Y., April 1986.

<sup>213</sup> Ibid., 76, citing Final Document of the U.N. Special Session Devoted to Disarmament, 1978, para. 5, U.N. Dept. for Disarmament Affairs, N.Y. and Geneva.

<sup>214</sup> Carolyn Stephenson, "Peacekeeping and Peacemaking," in Introducing Global Issues, eds. Snarr and Snarr, 73-74.

<sup>215</sup> Vickers, 88-104.



they have become more active in promoting world peace and “link their demands for peace with very concrete social demands, for equality, development and the solution of global problems.”<sup>216</sup> Women’s concerns include the increase in world poverty, the widening gap between rich and poor, the debt burden of Third World countries, the flow of wealth from the poor to the rich, and lack of medical care for many.<sup>217</sup>

Others have also pointed out the connection between economic justice and national security. Former World Bank senior vice president and chief economist Joseph Stiglitz has been outspoken in his critiques of the Washington Consensus (the U.S. Treasury Department and the Inter-Monetary Fund policies), writes Eyal Press in The Nation.<sup>218</sup> Stiglitz who served from 1997 to 2000 resigned rather than keep silent about the Inter Monetary Fund’s secrecy, undemocratic procedures, indifference to the poor, and structural adjustment policies benefitting foreign investors while creating unemployment and poverty for local people in poor countries. He points out that “during the 1990s, the number of people living in extreme poverty (less than \$2 per day) increased by nearly 100 million,” writes Press.<sup>219</sup> “The events of September 11 bring home the fact that addressing such issues is important for security reasons as well as for moral ones,” writes Press, noting that Stiglitz expressed similar observations in his interview:

...abject poverty and economies without jobs for males between the ages of eighteen and thirty are particularly good breeding grounds for extremism. Solving the economic problems doesn’t eliminate the risk of terrorism, but not solving them surely enhances it.<sup>220</sup>

It is no coincidence that the World Trade Center, a center of U.S. global finance and investment, was among the targets of the September 11 attacks. Press points out

---

<sup>216</sup> Ibid., 8.

<sup>217</sup> Ibid. She cites the Nongovernmental Organizations’ (NGO) Conference on the Relationship between Disarmament and Development, Stockholm, May, 1987, which was primarily organized by women; full statement available from WILPF, 1 rue de Varembe, Geneva.

<sup>218</sup> Eyal Press, “Revel with a Cause: the Re-Education of Joseph Stiglitz,” The Nation, 10 June 2002, 13.

<sup>219</sup> Ibid., 15-6.

<sup>220</sup> Joseph Stiglitz; quoted in Eyal Press, 16.

that Jagdish Bhagwati, an orthodox free-trade economist, also criticized the “Wall Street-Treasury Complex” for pushing undemocratic policies of unrestricted capital flows and foreign investment on Third World nations for its own benefit.<sup>221</sup>

Many Third World women’s NGOs research and articulate the relationship between development and disarmament, including DAWN (Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era,) AAWORD (Association of African Women for Research and Development,) and WAND (Women and Development) in the Caribbean and Latin America, notes Vickers.<sup>222</sup>

A discussion of the hidden unjust motivations behind many supposedly “just” wars reveals a poignant reality--many of our nations’ young men and women have given their lives in wars that were either completely preventable or largely unjust and indefensible. All too often, hidden motivations only become apparent to average citizens decades later--too late for responsible citizen action to prevent war and unnecessary deaths.

Historically, many violent conflicts have been motivated by economic concerns. “World War I became ‘the war to make the world safe for democracy’ only after German attacks on American shipping seemed to compel a declaration of war,” write Alan Geyer and Barbara Green.<sup>223</sup> Ron Sider describes how the 1954 CIA-assisted overthrow of a democratically elected government in Guatemala coincided with that government’s modest agricultural reform programs which appeared to threaten the interests of U.S. banana companies.<sup>224</sup>

During the 1980s, not only did the U.S. Central Intelligence Agency (CIA) conduct secret wars in Nicaragua and El Salvador against people’s movements there, it also sold tons of cocaine to Los Angeles street gangs such as the Crips and

---

<sup>221</sup> Press, 13.

<sup>222</sup> Vickers, 122.

<sup>223</sup> Geyer and Green, 18.

<sup>224</sup> Ron J. Sider, Rich Christians in an Age of Hunger. A Biblical Study 2nd ed. (Downers Grove, Ill.: Inter-varsity Press, 1984), 155-60, citing Carl Oglesby and Richard Schaul, Containment and Change (New York: Macmillan, 1967), 104, and citing Stephen Schlesinger and Stephen Kinzer, Bitter Fruit: The Untold Story of the American Coup in Guatemala (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, 1982).

the Bloods for over a decade--and gave the millions of dollars it made in drug profits to a Latin American guerrilla army run by the CIA, notes Gary Webb in his 1996 San Jose Mercury News investigative series described in Integrities magazine. This network was part of the Contra supply operation and created "the first pipeline between Columbia's cocaine cartels and the black neighborhoods of Los Angeles, a city now known as the 'crack' capital of the world," notes the Integrities summary of Webb's reports. Not only did this influx of cocaine begin a crack epidemic in the urban U.S. cities, but it also provided money and contacts for Los Angeles gangs to purchase automatic weapons. Integrities notes that Salvadoran air force planes flew to Columbia to load up with cocaine, and landed at a Texas U.S. Air Force base. Later, the cocaine money was flown to Costa Rica and the Honduras aboard U.S. commercial jets. CIA and federal government contacts protected the drug traffickers from investigations by the DEA, U.S. Customs, the Los Angeles County Sheriff's Department, and the California Bureau of Narcotic Enforcement--all of whom have complained that their investigations were hampered by the CIA or other unnamed entities in the name of national security, notes the article. The availability of automatic weapons and other weapons of war to youth gangs in the U.S. has been neither accidental or inevitable. Thus, the creation of war zones in U.S. inner cities is directly related to the creation of war zones in other countries. Similarly, the destruction of democracy in other countries is related to the destruction of safe, democratic communities in the U.S., notes the Integrities article.<sup>225</sup>

In 1992, New York Times reporter Patrick E. Tyler was able to view Pentagon planning documents through "an official who wished to call attention to what he considered vigorous attempts within the military establishment to invent a menu of alarming war scenarios that can be used by the Pentagon to prevent further reductions in forces or cancellations of new weapons systems from defense

---

<sup>225</sup> "Crack Cocaine and Assault Weapons--The CIA Connection," Integrities, 3015 Freedom Blvd., Watsonville, Calif., 10, no. 3, 1996, 12-14, citing Gary Webb's investigative series in San Jose Mercury News, 750 Ridder Park Drive, San Jose, Calif. 95190, which appeared 18, 19, and 20 August 1996, also available from Mercury Center Web: <http://www.mercury.com/drugs/>.

contractors," quotes Vickers.<sup>226</sup> The documents outlined seven potential conflict scenarios that could draw U.S. forces into battle, including attacks against Iraq, North Korea, Russia, a possible military coup in the Philippines, a "narco-terrorist" plot blocking the Panama Canal, and a possible global enemy or expansionist coalition. Though the Pentagon viewed these scenarios as "illustrative, not predictive," their suggestions would halt or reverse the trend toward reductions in military spending.<sup>227</sup> Vickers notes that these Pentagon recommendations were eventually modified, adding, "It is clear, however, that the military mind-set has not changed, and that such scenarios would be strongly supported by industries and States likely to be affected by arms reductions."<sup>228</sup>

In the Middle East, a more detailed discussion of recent wars and U.S. oil interests sheds further light on relationships between economic interests and violent conflicts. Vickers notes that in the Gulf War, the U.S. feared that "the whole of Middle East oil would fall into the hands of someone they considered a dictator, who could then blackmail consumer nations."<sup>229</sup> Alan Geyer and Barbara Green state, "Clearly the most concrete intention of U.S. policy in the Persian Gulf has been the protection of oil interests from domination by any nation hostile to the United States or to oil-rich Saudi Arabia and the smaller Gulf states."<sup>230</sup> They add that "Bush's moral interests were never credibly connected with oil interests, and... U.S. energy policies in the 1980s contributed greatly to the onset of the Gulf crisis"--policies which promoted "private interests" and avoided "public discipline."<sup>231</sup> They describe oil as one of six "articulated or speculated objectives" of U.S. policy intentions in the Gulf War.<sup>232</sup>

On November 15, 1991, the National Council of Churches charged that the president had not clarified its U.S. policy intentions and had offered misleading and

---

<sup>226</sup> Vickers, 14.

<sup>227</sup> Ibid.

<sup>228</sup> Ibid.

<sup>229</sup> Ibid., 56.

<sup>230</sup> Geyer and Green, 77.

<sup>231</sup> Ibid., 79.

<sup>232</sup> Ibid., 69.

sometimes contradictory explanations for the steady expansion of U.S. presence, write Geyer and Green. The NCC stated that, "The nation still has not been told in clear and certain terms what would be required for the withdrawal of U.S. troops."<sup>233</sup> Geyer and Green further note that earlier, Ronald Reagan's Secretary of Defense Caspar Weinberger stated in a classified 1984-88 Defense Guidance report, that the U.S. should protect with military force the Persian Gulf oil, should it appear to be threatened.<sup>234</sup>

Given this perception of vulnerability, it would seem logical that, soon after the Gulf War ended, the U.S. Department of Energy might have invested heavily in the research and development of renewable sources of energy, yet this did not occur. Despite continued subsidies for oil, gas, coal, and nuclear power totaling \$29.7 billion in the Bush, Jr.-backed energy bill; wind power, through commercial investments, is nevertheless becoming a viable source of electricity for the economy as well as a fuel for cars, states Matt Bivens in The Nation.<sup>235</sup> He writes, "America is the Persian Gulf of wind,"--wind power can now be efficiently and cheaply stored by using it to create hydrogen, which yields no byproducts other than drinkable water.<sup>236</sup> Toyota plans to begin selling hydrogen-powered cars in January 2003.<sup>237</sup>

The failure of the U.S. government to invest in wind power is puzzling, given its promise. In the U.S., fossil fuels and nuclear power create fewer jobs and a "boom and bust" cycles of employment, while renewable sources such as wind create greater numbers of permanent jobs; "the California Energy Commission estimates that the state's alternative energy industry has generated 30,000 new jobs since 1975"--the wind farm alone was employing 380 people (as of 1992,)

---

<sup>233</sup> Ibid., 68, citing Pressing for Peace: The Churches Act in the Gulf Crisis (New York: National Council of Churches, January 1991), 8.

<sup>234</sup> Geyer and Green, 77, citing Caspar Weinberger, quoted in Joe Stork and Martha Wenger, "From Rapid Deployment to Massive Deployment," eds. Micah L. Sifry and Christopher Cerf The Gulf War Reader (New York: Times Books, Random House, 1991), 37.

<sup>235</sup> Matt Bivens, "Fighting for America's Energy Independence," The Nation, 15 April 2002, 12, 14.

<sup>236</sup> Ibid., 12.

<sup>237</sup> Ibid.

writes Tom Lent of Greenpeace.<sup>238</sup> Thus, U.S. government investments in fossil fuels and nuclear power and its lack of interest in renewable energy sources cannot be explained by the opportunities for employment generated by these industries.

The following information suggests some clues that may be relevant to such puzzling U.S. priorities. "According to the Center for Public Integrity, the top one hundred officials in the [current] Bush White House have the majority of their personal investments, up to \$144.6 million, sunk in the old-guard energy sector," notes Bivens.<sup>239</sup> Both Bush and Cheney are former oil executives, and National Security Advisor Condoleezza Rice "was corporate counsel at Chevron," notes Ted Rall, of AlterNet.<sup>240</sup> Katrina vanden Heuvel and Stephen F. Cohen, write, "More serious... is the opinion spreading across Moscow's political spectrum that the Bush Administration's war on terrorism now has less to do with helping Russia--or any other country--fight Islamic extremism on its borders than with establishing military outposts of a new (or expanded) American empire... with control over the region's enormous oil and gas reserves as its primary goal."<sup>241</sup> They further note that "by 2003, there will be a U.S. or NATO military presence in at least eight or nine of the fifteen former Soviet Republics..."<sup>242</sup> The Pentagon's Nuclear Posture Review explores "'contingencies' that could require nuclear attack on Russia, China, North Korea, Syria, Iraq or Iran," notes The Nation.<sup>243</sup>

There is also evidence that the War in Afghanistan may have been motivated by plans to access Soviet oil through a proposed pipeline through Afghanistan. Rall

---

<sup>238</sup> Lent, 10-12,16, citing the following: Matthew Clark et. al., A Comparison of the Employment Creation Effects of the AES-Harriman Cove Coal-Fired Generating Station and Maine Demand Side Management, draft report, The Goodman Group, Boston, Mass.: December 1991; Hap Boyd, U.S. Windpower, conversation with author, 6 Feb. 1991; and citing "Energy Commission Technology Development Programs," Energy Development Report, (Sacramento: Calif. Energy Commission, 1988), 96.

<sup>239</sup> Matt Bivens, 14.

<sup>240</sup> Ted Rall, "Bush Fuels Oil Conspiracy Theory," (articles on-line), posted 10 Jan. 2002, available from <http://www.AlterNet.org>.

<sup>241</sup> Katrina vanden Heuvel and Stephen F. Cohen, "Endangering U.S. Security," The Nation, 15 April 2002, 5. Cohen is professor of Russian studies at New York University.

<sup>242</sup> Ibid., 5.

<sup>243</sup> "Bush Goes Nuclear," editorial, The Nation, 1 April 2002, 3.

cites a 1996 Unocal (formerly Union Oil Company of California), plan for creation of a trans-Afghanistan pipeline; and John J. Maresca, (Vice President of International Relations at Unocal Corporation,) in his testimony to the House Committee on International Relations Subcommittee on Asia and the Pacific on February 12, 1998, recommends such a pipeline through territory controlled by the Taliban from Central Asia to the Indian Ocean, as the "best option with the fewest technical obstacles."<sup>244</sup> Rall notes that "the Clinton administration funded the Taliban through Pakistani intelligence," even "paying the salaries of high-ranking Taliban officials," in order to stabilize the area for the proposed pipeline, but withdrew support after the embassy bombings.<sup>245</sup> According to Julio Godoy, Bush resumed pipeline negotiations with the Taliban, who refused U.S. conditions in August 2001. U.S. representatives then threatened military action and told the Taliban, 'either you accept our offer of a carpet of gold, or we bury you under a carpet of bombs.'<sup>246</sup> After the September 11 attacks, Bush appointed Zalmay Khalilzad, former Unocal employee, as special envoy to Afghanistan, notes Rall. He adds that, according to Pakistan's Frontier Post report, the discussion to revive the Unocal pipeline project was revived in conversation between U.S. ambassador Wendy Chamberlain and Pakistan's oil minister in October 2001.<sup>247</sup> Military presence in the Persian Gulf area and the Caspian basin, began "well before" September 11th and was accelerated after the attacks in order to protect U.S. oil interests, notes Michael T. Klare.<sup>248</sup>

Such information suggests at the very least, a need for extreme caution on

---

<sup>244</sup> Rall, 2; Testimony by John J. Maresca, Vice President, International Relations, Unocal Corporation to House Committee on International Relations Subcommittee on Asia and the Pacific, 12 Feb. 1998, Washinton, D.C., (articles on-line), available from: [http://www.house.gov/international\\_relations](http://www.house.gov/international_relations), 4.

<sup>245</sup> Rall, 2.

<sup>246</sup> Jean-Charles Brisard quoted in a Paris interview according to Julio Godoy, "U.S. Policy on Taliban Influenced by Oil," c.2001 Asia Times Online Co. Ltd., (articles on-line), available from <http://www.serendipity.magnet.ch>, citing Jean-Charles Brisard and Guillaume Dasquie, Ben Laden: La Verite Interdite, (Bin Laden: The Forbidden Truth), (France, 2001), available from <http://www.amazon.com>.

<sup>247</sup> Ibid.

<sup>248</sup> Michael T. Klare, Pacific News Service, "Bush's Master Oil Plan," (articles on-line), posted on April 23, 2002, available from: <http://alternet.org>.

the part of U.S. citizens with regard to an extended war on terrorism and proposals regarding new nuclear weapons, as well as the need for healthy skepticism in general toward idealistic notions of “just causes” of war.<sup>249</sup>

A constructive synthesis of research by women and men reveals a pattern of unjust motivations such as greed behind many wars, and challenges the idea that many U.S. wars have been just. The difficulty in ascertaining the real political and economic motivations for many conflicts and the historical proliferation of unjust wars recognized in retrospect, suggest that resistance to war is likely to be a safer and more prudent course of action than acquiescence.

Women's critiques offer a view of national security that emphasizes the relationship between foreign policy, economic justice, and peace. They reveal the importance of citizen advocacy for economic justice in U.S. foreign policies and U.S. influences on the policies of global institutions. Women's NGOs have had some of the greatest success in working for economic justice and transforming the policies of global institutions, particularly in the United Nations.<sup>250</sup>

**Women's nongovernmental organizations are central to global protection of the Earth, its creatures, and its peoples.** Women's NGOs have sprung up by the thousands over past decades. NGOs have been effective in representing the needs of grassroots communities around the world, offering distinctive analyses of global conditions.<sup>251</sup> Oldfield describes Addams' faith in NGOs:

Internationalism, Jane Addams believed, is much too vital to the life of the world to be left to the rulers of the world, for they, in fact, are the very last people on earth capable of conceding the necessary diminution of their... powers. Our only alternative, according to her, is to rely upon

---

<sup>249</sup> Puri, 226, notes that Gandhi rejected the ideas of St. Augustine and Thomas Aquinas that there could be a “just war” if one party was morally in the right. Gandhi's view was similar to that of Immanuel Kant, she writes, who did not believe that just wars existed.

<sup>250</sup> Carolyn M. Stephenson, “Women's International Nongovernmental Organizations at the United Nations,” ed. Anne Winslow Women, Politics, and the United Nations, Contributions in Women's Studies, 151 (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1995), 135-8, 150-1; Stienstra, in Women in World Politics, 148-154; Margaret E. Galey, “The United States and Women's Issues,” Women, Gender, and World Politics, 137-40; WEDO, no.1 “Codes of Conduct for Transnational Corporations,” 5.

<sup>251</sup> WEDO, National Congress of Neighborhood Women, and WILPF, for instance.



nongovernmental agencies to practice internationalism for life's sake, thereby creating an international order through the "internationalism of the deed" rather than the internationalism of abstract rhetoric."<sup>252</sup>

NGOs challenge current forms of global governance in international institutions like the WTO, which has the capacity to overturn national laws.<sup>253</sup>

Women's NGOs resemble the grassroots-up form of Iroquois clan mother leadership in which local people set the agendas and priorities for consideration. NGOs' close ties and accountability to local communities contributes to their credibility and integrity. Their proximity increases their accuracy in recognizing local needs, and collaborating to meet them. They often serve as advocates and liaisons between communities and foundations, governments, and global institutions. The U.N. International Women's Year in 1975 began its Decade for Women which saw "marked historic levels of growth in women's nongovernmental organizations, (NGOs), international cooperation, and acceleration and intensification of the growth of the global women's movement."<sup>254</sup>

The organization and education work of international NGOs and women's movements "played a central role in the creation of the International Women's Year and the Decade for Women," writes Stephenson.<sup>255</sup> She points out that the U.N. Conferences and accompanying forums "were in turn largely responsible for the development of both an international women's movement and the more formal governmental and nongovernmental infrastructure that could begin to serve as the basis of an international women's regime."<sup>256</sup> This level of organization raises future possibilities of developing women's international agencies of global justice and

<sup>252</sup> Oldfield, in Women in World Politics, 164.

<sup>253</sup> Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO), no. 3 "Who Makes the Rules? Decision-Making and Structure of the New World Trade Organization," Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) Primer: Understanding the Impact of the Global Economy on Women and the Environment (New York: WEDO, 1995).

<sup>254</sup> Stienstra, in Women in World Politics, 144; Meiklejohn Civil Liberties Institute, "Report to the President from the U.S. Delegation to the United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing, China, September 4-15, 1995, Platform for Action," Meiklejohn Civil Liberties Institute.

<sup>255</sup> Carolyn M. Stephenson, in Women, Politics, and the United Nations, 150.

<sup>256</sup> Ibid., 150-1.

governance.<sup>257</sup>

The global women's movement, which saw an explosion of NGOs in the 1990s, centered around four main areas: the environment, human rights, reproductive health, and and the global economy, writes Maria Riley. "The series of U.N. Conferences during this decade has become the arena for women to articulate their agendas and to organize politically to influence global decisionmaking processes," she notes.<sup>258</sup> Stephenson describes the crucial role of women's NGOs in opening the work of the United Nations to the influence of citizens groups.<sup>259</sup> She adds that NGOs have played a crucial role in putting pressure on U.N. member governments to make proposals aimed at improving the status and participation of women, and have subsequently used those documents to call countries to be accountable to implement them and to change those laws and structures that must be altered in order to do so. Stephenson concludes that "without WINGOS, [Women's International NGOs,] most of the progress on women's issues in and around the U.N. would not have taken place."<sup>260</sup>

Women's NGOs working in solidarity around the world have tremendous yet-untapped potential for peacemaking. NGOs around the world may offer the greatest hope for addressing many world problems by restoring socially and economically just relationships within and among nations, and creating sustainable peace. Women's traditions of nonviolence and peace activism provide models, inspiration, and hope for the future of global disarmament, halting of U.S. production of small-scale nuclear weapons, strengthening and sustaining of local communities, transformation of global institutions, and adoption of new global priorities that center around the health and well-being of children, families, and communities.

---

<sup>257</sup> Such forums are already occurring, for instance the World Women's Congress for a Healthy Planet, held in Miami to prepare for the Earth Summit (the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development or UNCED), at which "Women from every region of the world presented dramatic evidence of their battles against ecological and economic devastation before a tribunal of five eminent judges," writes Vickers, 72. They developed from this testimony the Women's Action Agenda 21, which they presented at the Conference, she adds.

<sup>258</sup> Riley, 10.

<sup>259</sup> Stephenson, in Women, Politics, and the United Nations, 135-151.

<sup>260</sup> Ibid., 151.

## **Part 2**

### **New Directions in Religious Education**

Education holds promise for the nurturance and development of leaders capable of working nonviolently and collaboratively to create healthy communities and local environments that support human rights and celebrate multiculturalism in a context of lasting peace.

Chapter 5 provides an overview of structures that support peace education and professional peacemaking. Section 1 provides educational insights from the NFC study. Section 2 provides an overview of approaches to peace education, including relevant aspects of religious education theories. Section 3 provides an overview of United Nations mandates for peace education and ways in which they lay the foundation for expansion of peacemaking professions. Section 4 describes criteria for evaluating the health of a community's social structure, which is important for building just communities capable of sustaining local and global peace. Section 5 describes structures through which peace education can be brought into local communities, including ways in which local communities, churches, and academic institutions can work together in addressing social structure health through the creation and maintenance of basic standards of community health that apply to all people. Section 6 explores ways to prepare professional peacemakers to facilitate these processes through a Women's Leadership for Peacemaking bachelor's degree program.

Chapter 6 elaborates an embodied theory and practice of religious education for peacemaking. It begins with insights from the NFC study (Section 1), followed by theological assumptions (Section 2), and epistemological and content guidelines (Section 3). These form the basis for a Women's Leadership for Peacemaking bachelor's degree described in Section 4 synthesizing these educational implications. A concluding section discusses the preparation of leadership for international peacemaking movements (Section 5).

## **CHAPTER 5**

### **Structures of Peace Education and Professional Peacemaking**

This chapter is an overview of several approaches to peace education, as recommended by the United Nations. We will begin with insights from the NFC action research, and religious education literature. Those provide a background for exploring the United Nations mandates and specific contributions that women's leadership and NGO organizing can make. Peacemaking is understood both in terms of conflict-prevention through global disarmament, and in terms of creating healthy social structures and local environments that support healthy communities and build nations capable of sustaining long-term peace through justice. Criteria for evaluating the health of communities and establishing basic standards of social structure health are offered. Four main structures for peace education that could advocate for these standards are discussed: family peace and justice centers, nonprofit organizations such as churches, K-12 schools, and colleges. Educational approaches will be discussed in broad terms in this chapter, laying foundations for the more specific discussion of peace education in Chapter 6.

**Community-based education: Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** The study of the Newtown Florist Club included an action-research component, which is a significant source of insight for planning peace education. In summer 2001, I collaborated with women from the NFC community to create and co-facilitate a seven-week Summer Leadership Development Program for Girls, focused on peacemaking.

Many of the girls who participated lived in Newtown or in nearby housing projects. Together, the girls developed a list of changes they wished to see in their community, which they presented to the City Commission, with a request for action. I then asked the Mayor to speak to the girls, and she came after their presentation to address their list of concerns. She came back a second time when the Gainesville Housing Authority Director addressed their concerns about the public housing facilities. Over the course of the summer, thirty girls attended, with an average daily attendance of approximately twelve. Girls ranging from thirteen to eighteen were

recruited. The girls participating in the program were mostly 13-14, with two girls aged eleven, and two seventeen-year-olds, (both of whom were court-ordered to participate.) All of the girls who participated were local African American girls except for one European American girl who did the program as her court-ordered community service.

During the first week, the course content and process focused on learning and practicing women's leadership skills which shaped the educational process of the whole course. This included communication skills such as listening, brainstorming and problem-solving, as well as interpersonal skills of caring, connecting, respect, collaboration, "visioning," and anger management.<sup>1</sup> The major leadership content focused on videotapes of the NFC women discussing their work together. Each video was a compilation of video clips of different women discussing one thematic area: the importance of listening, genuinely loving and caring about each other, risk-taking, standing up and speaking out, and others. Discussions were supplemented by handouts that defined and described each skill. Opportunities to practice and apply these skills were woven throughout the seven weeks through role playing, analysis of individual anger management patterns, group discussions, group brainstorming, collaborative problem-solving, standing up for their communities, and collaborative group projects. The girls also shared their own struggles in group discussions. As they shared, connections and differences were made more explicit between their struggles and the struggles of other women and people of color, especially in the women's and Civil Rights movements, and in the forms of structural and systemic violence that are occurring in other local communities as well as globally.

During weeks two through seven, the course focused on the following areas: human rights and multiculturalism, environmental racism, government, local and global economics, women's history of peacemaking in the U.S. and globally, and self-care. Field trips contributed both process and content aspects to the course.

The summer Leadership Development Program for Girls also included

---

<sup>1</sup> Regan and Brooks, 36, developed this term to describe processes in which people collaboratively develop common visions of the future of their group or organization.

speakers who gave presentations to the girls from Gainesville College regarding college and financial aid; the Health Department regarding pregnancy, AIDS, and STD prevention; the police department regarding general safety education and drug prevention; and a local Methodist African American woman pastor regarding women's leadership. I also presented handouts regarding the technical and college preparatory track credits needed for high school graduation. The NFC held a special graduation reception for the girls participating in this program, which was attended by the Mayor, and a wide range of community members. This summer program is one example of community-based education.

**Understandings of peace education.** Turning now to religious education theories, the work of Mary Elizabeth Moore, Ann Wimberly, and Maria Harris all discuss the importance of addressing issues of social justice and the transformation of oppressive systems and structures. None of these address peace education explicitly or extensively, but they provide pointers for future work. Moore's emphasis on revering others reveals effects of structural forms of oppression. She explains how difficult it is for students to revere themselves in the midst of oppressive structures that devalue human life.<sup>2</sup> Wimberly's story-linking method focuses on themes of liberation in contemporary and historical African American narratives of courage and survival amidst racist and classist oppression.<sup>3</sup> Harris includes a meditation on the killing power of the Trident nuclear submarine, and highlights the importance of claiming the power to rebel against authoritarianism and the destruction of life.<sup>4</sup>

Jeanne Vickers provides a helpful overview of women's understandings of peace education from other disciplines, including what it is--and what it should include. Vickers describes Australian peace activist Nancy Shelley's criteria for effective peace education:

---

<sup>2</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 212-16.

<sup>3</sup> Wimberly, 39-48.

<sup>4</sup> Harris, Teaching and Religious Imagination, 90-92.

--focuses on respect for the dignity of persons, effective personal relationships, conflict resolution, social justice, collaboration in community, and the sharing of world resources;

--addresses forms of oppression related to sexism, racism, and other forms of injustice and the relationship between violence and power;

--radically reevaluates approaches to curriculum, school structures, and the personal relationships within schools;

--addresses the state of the planet's ecosystems, and the creation of positive relationships between humans and biological diversity;

--studies the causes of war, offers alternative ways of addressing conflict, and develops structures and processes of personal, national and international conflict resolution;

--develops inclusive processes by which schools and communities can work together to "affect the whole of society."<sup>5</sup>

Jeanne Vickers echoes the insights of the NFC women when she highlights interpersonal and political skills for peacemaking. For example, she describes Brigit Brock-Utne's understanding that: "an education for peace is an education for cooperation, for caring and sharing, for the use of nonviolence in conflict-solving."<sup>6</sup> Peace education might also incorporate the goals of women's peace initiatives like the Women's Action Agenda 21, created in 1991, by fifteen hundred women from eighty-three countries who attended the World Women's Congress for a Healthy Planet which met in preparation for the Earth Summit, (the U.N. Conference on Environment and Development,) in 1992. These women held a tribunal of five eminent women judges who heard dramatic evidence of women's struggles against "environmental and economic devastation" from which they developed the Agenda which...

declared that military expenditures, the arms trade and armed conflict deprive billions of human beings of basic security and well-being and that all military activity, including research, development, production of weaponry, testing manoeuvres, presence of military bases, disposal of toxic materials, transport

---

<sup>5</sup> Vickers, 139, citing Nancy Shelley, "The Case for a Feminist Contribution to Peace Education," Australian Women's Education Coalition, October 1982.

<sup>6</sup> Ibid., 139, citing Brigit Brock-Utne, Educating for Peace (Pergamon Press, London, 1985), 72.

and resource use, has a disastrous environmental impact...<sup>7</sup>

The Agenda noted that these conditions often result in the foreign occupation of lands and compromise human and environmental rights. The Agenda demanded that all nuclear weapons be dismantled or destroyed, that military spending be reduced by fifty percent, and the complete cessation of all nuclear testing, as well as space and supersonic flights that damage the ozone layer or release carbon dioxide. The Agenda continued, proposing...

creation of national civilian commissions, with half the members women, to open to public scrutiny all military activities, expenditures and research and development; that national armies be converted into environmental protection corps, and that daughters and sons be educated to shun military service if military power be used to exploit the resources and peoples of other nations.<sup>8</sup>

Today, these goals are still viable and relevant and provide concrete criteria by which the effectiveness of peace education might, in part, be measured.

Drawing from Brigit Brock-Utne, Vickers points out other important characteristics of peace education, which she describes as social processes. These include: practicing equal rights and power sharing among all members of a community, and learning nonviolent conflict resolution skills, respect for human rights, disarmament education, development education, and human rights education.<sup>9</sup>

Vickers notes that women have been among the first to "recognize the necessity for peace education."

"[Women] are fully aware... that, as the first educators of their children, mothers are in a privileged position to lay the groundwork for teachers who can later try to influence the ways in which formal education affects attitudes towards peacemaking and peace-keeping--a difficult task within the average competitive school system."<sup>10</sup>

Here she makes an argument similar to that which is at the core of beliefs in the Iroquois nation--that women as the Lifegivers are the first educators of children, in

---

<sup>7</sup> Vickers, 72, citing Official Report, World Women's Congress for a Healthy Planet, Miami, 8-12 November 1991, Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO), 845 Third Avenue, New York 10022.

<sup>8</sup> Ibid.

<sup>9</sup> Ibid.

<sup>10</sup> Ibid., 140.



charge of their moral education and formation as citizens of the nation.<sup>11</sup> Vickers believes that women “are the fundamental and formative peace educators,” holding the key to attitudinal change that is central to the creation of a nonviolent world.<sup>12</sup> At the same time, she emphasizes the importance of equal, respectful, mutual, nonviolent relationships between parents, and partnership in general between men and women. She feels that mutuality must be part of every learning situation: families, schools and universities, communities and community organizations, labor and professional organizations, government, diplomatic relationships, inter-governmental and nongovernmental organizations, and “every structure and process through which people and societies learn and conduct their public affairs.”<sup>13</sup>

Families also are critically important. Vickers describes efforts of parents to involve their families in activities that teach “peaceful and amicable resolution of family conflicts, an ecologically responsible home life which is mindful of the needs of others, and a sense of responsibility for working towards cooperative human relations--in the family, the community and at the global level.” These activities have far-reaching goals: “In such families there is a conscious effort to develop a sense of justice with regard to the inequities between men and women and between rich and poor people and nations, and to inspire the children to act for change.”<sup>14</sup>

Peace education involves learning experiences that provide opportunities for the establishment and development of interpersonal and political skills, reverent relationships, narratives of courage and survival, experiences of meditation, practicing equal rights and power sharing. Peace education also involves the study of disarmament, development, environmental and human rights, citizenship and conflict resolution skills. Finally, the effectiveness of peace education can be measured against concrete goals that relate to disarmament and conversion to nonmilitary functions as well as standards of social structure and environmental health.

---

<sup>11</sup> Mann, 266, 270-75.

<sup>12</sup> Vickers, 140, 138.

<sup>13</sup> Ibid., 140.

<sup>14</sup> Ibid, 141.

**United Nations Mandates for Peace Education.** In the last decade, the United Nations and the Peace Caucus of Women's NGOs meeting in Beijing and Huairou offered significant declarations and calls for peace education with implications for the establishment of peacemaking as a profession. The 1995 U.N. Beijing Women's Conference Peace Caucus' Platform is described by Cora Weiss, U.S. delegate to the NGO Forum:

The Platform for Action sits on three legs: equality, development, and peace. I've been trying to promote peace. Women are calling for the introduction of peace studies to curricula throughout the world. Just as we teach reading, writing, and arithmetic, why don't we teach peace?<sup>15</sup>

The United Nations 1978 Declaration on the Preparation of Societies for Life in Peace, according to Vickers, called upon all States:

(i) To ensure that their policies relevant to the implementation of the present Declaration, including educational processes and teaching methods as well as media information activities, incorporate contents compatible with the task of the preparation for life in peace of entire societies and, in particular, the young generations;

(ii) Therefore, to discourage and eliminate incitement to racial hatred, national or other discrimination, injustice or advocacy of violence and war.<sup>16</sup>

She notes that paragraph 255 of the 1985 Nairobi Strategies "called for peace education to be established for all members of society, particularly children and young people."<sup>17</sup> These mandates point to the responsibility of formal and informal education processes, communications, information and mass-media systems to provide for peace education. The document stresses that women and men should educate and socialize children "in an atmosphere of compassion, tolerance, mutual concern and trust, with an awareness that all people belong to the same world community."<sup>18</sup>

The International Peace Research Association's (IPRA) Commission on Peace Education has shed light on important links between women's studies and

---

<sup>15</sup> Look at the World Through Women's Eyes.

<sup>16</sup> Vickers, 138-39, citing U.N. General Assembly, 85th Plenary Meeting, Resolution 33/73 of 15/12/78.

<sup>17</sup> Vickers.

<sup>18</sup> Ibid., 139, citing paragraph 256 of the Nairobi Strategies.

peace education.<sup>19</sup> Vickers also notes the importance of UNESCO documents such as the 1974 Recommendation on Education for International Cooperation and Peace and Education regarding Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, as well as the 1980 Final Document of the World Congress on Disarmament Education. She points out that the important role played by women peace educators in the formulation of these documents is evident in the “comprehensive view[s] compatible with women’s perspectives.” She further notes that the documents “reflect the important inter-relationships between security, disarmament, development, human rights and peace.”<sup>20</sup>

Crucial calls for action were articulated in the Draft Platform for Action of Women’s NGOs participating in the Peace Tent at the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing, 1995 and are listed as follows:

- \* Introduce into all educational institutions, peace education curricula.
- \* Establish peacemaking as a profession that is supported by the United Nations.
- \* Establish processes for holding accountable leaders who have brought their country to war.
- \* Train women, men, and children worldwide in the skills of nonviolent peacemaking and conflict resolution at every educational level.
- \* Help with postwar reconstruction, repatriation of refugees and displaced persons.
- \* Follow through on commitments made at all United Nations-sponsored conferences, including those made at the world conferences of women.
- \* The number of women in all decision-making positions should be increased, including in agencies and government as well as in processes of peace planning and peace negotiation processes.
- \* Conflict prevention centers run by women should be established in areas where there is a potential for violent conflict, through U.N. funds.
- \* Democratize the U.N. Security Council by enlarging the membership based on better regional representation through General Assembly elections.

---

<sup>19</sup> Ibid., 144-45, citing especially the special peace education of IPRA’s journal, The Bulletin of Peace Proposals.

<sup>20</sup> Ibid., 145.

- \* Stop research, production, sale and transfer of all weapons and adhere to the United Nations Arms Register.
- \* Ban nuclear weapons and systems along with any civilian nuclear production, toward the goal of complete denuclearization; remove and dismantle all arsenals, including nuclear and land mine arsenals.
- \* Reduce military budgets to no more than one percent of the gross domestic product by the year 2005.
- \* Assess, determine, and implement the steps necessary in order to transition "from a culture of war to a culture of peace."<sup>21</sup>

These calls for action pave the way for formalizing peacemaking education and peacemaking as a profession. In light of women's roles in international peace-building, as in community-based action, women's leadership should be actively studied in peacemaking degree programs. This would balance over-emphases on traditional male leadership characteristics--especially at national and international levels, and in international diplomacy. Peacemaking education will need to take account of these calls for action and the vocations that arise out of them.

Sophisticated networking and organizing among NGOs worldwide could be instrumental in accomplishing these calls for action worldwide. This might involve the creation of NGO staff positions, national and international collaboration in action initiatives and information dissemination, and internship opportunities for students.

If NGOs organized to advocate for disarmament, while also advocating intra-nationally for social structure priorities with specific criteria and standards, this could create the potential for local communities to band together and support each other in standing up for these goals, not only within nations, but internationally. The global success of peacemaking efforts will depend on the cooperation of nations in disarming and redirecting their resources toward healing local communities and environments and sustaining their health long-term. Helen Lewis observes that economic development is linked to the quality and intensity of citizen involvement, and describes a "twelve-step recovery program" for local communities that includes

---

<sup>21</sup> United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing, China, NGO Forum. "Draft Platform for Action, Proposed Beijing Declaration to Accompany the Draft Platform," International Peace Update, November 1995, Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, (also available on-line from <http://www.iisd.ca/linkages/4wcw/dpa-000.html>).

profiling and assessing local communities and their resources and needs (see Appendix G).<sup>22</sup> Edelman states that it will take a national movement to accomplish such goals in the United States--this is likely true in other countries as well.<sup>23</sup> The simple act of establishing minimum criteria for healthy communities could change the way people think about what is achievable and reasonable.

**Methods and criteria for evaluating the health of a community's social structure** have been established by various other disciplines. Local communities can come together to establish what they consider to be minimum standards and best practices of community health. Some possible criteria are listed in Appendix H.

These criteria offer a beginning for evaluating the health of local communities. They can change the way people think about their communities as well as local and national priorities. Too many of today's children grow up in neighborhoods that resemble war zones; in fact, their post traumatic stress is equivalent to children who actually did grow up in war zones.<sup>24</sup> Instead of rating cities based on the average cost of living, why not hold cities and local, state, and national governments accountable to criteria that concretely describe the health of the city, its people, its social structure, and its environment? In order to equip people to organize their societies around these standards, educational efforts are urgent: through local peace and justice centers, women's centers, peace-oriented college degrees, and the identification of local leaders.

---

<sup>22</sup> Lewis, 11, citing Putnam, Making Democracy Work: Civic Traditions in Modern Italy, (Princeton University Press, 1993).

<sup>23</sup> Marion Wright Edelman, plenary speech American Academy of Religion, question and answer period, Orlando, FL, 21-24 Nov. 1998.

<sup>24</sup> Joy D. Osofsky, "The Impact of Violence on Children," The Future of Children "Domestic Violence and Children," 9, no. 3 (winter 1999) The David and Lucile Packard Foundation, 36, information also available from <http://www.futureofchildren.org>, citing the following: J.D. Osofsky and E. Fenichel, eds. "Caring for Infants and Toddlers in Violent Environments: Hurt, Healing, and Hope," Zero to Three (December 1993-January 1994) 14:1-48; L.A. Leavitt and N.A. Fox, The Psychological Effects of War and Violence on Children (Hillsdale, N.J.: Lawrence Erlbaum, 1993); J. Garbarino, N. Dubrow, K. Kostelny, and C. Pardo, Children in Danger: Coping with the Consequences of Community Violence (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1992); C.C. Bell and E. J. Jenkins, "Traumatic Stress and Children," Journal of Health Care for the Poor and Underserved (1991) 2:175-85.

When enough communities articulate basic standards for community health, these can be synthesized to form local, state, and national benchmarks. These benchmarks can be mandated as a nation's first priority in allotting funding and creating programs. All other priorities, particularly those involving corporations and the military, would be considered only after these priorities have already been fully met.

This process of determining basic standards for community health from the grassroots level up, synthesizing them to create national benchmarks that receive priority funding in a nation, can be used by other nations as well, and can serve as a guideline for the work of foundations, NGOs, and other organizations that offer international aid. For instance, if there was at least one center or consortium of organizations of some sort in every city or community, a strong network could be created between these consortia, nationally and internationally, making it possible for local communities to address issues affecting them much more effectively when they originate in the policies of national or global agencies. Through such collaborative national and international networks, local communities can begin to challenge policies and funding priorities, and create citizen-run countries in which governments serve the people instead of elite special interests. Eventually, these collaborative networks could become capable of restructuring national governments, the media, and governmental agencies such as the World Bank, the IMF, and the World Trade Organization. In addition, these collaboratives could exercise solidarity to create worldwide disarmament and establish diplomatic procedures for maintaining peace in international relations. A first step might be a cooperative national effort to make it possible for conscientious objectors to pay their taxes to a Peace Tax Fund for nonmilitary local, state, and/or government use.

**Bringing peace education into local communities.** Peace-oriented colleges and other educational centers could do significant work in holding cities accountable to basic standards of community health. Such educational centers could include Peace and Justice Centers or collaborative consortia of existing local organizations working together with foundations. This work would include reflecting on

local-global connections, addressing local and global issues, multicultural field experiences, inclusive collaboration with grassroots groups and nonprofit NGOs, and advocating with local, state, and national government officials.

**Collaborative Education for Peace:** One educational approach would be to bring together members of grassroots or nonprofit organizations from different cultural groups, representatives from religious communities in the city, and other interested persons. Participants would be asked to brainstorm what they would like to see changed in their community, as the NFC girls were asked. A facilitator could help participants identify themes and concerns. The group could then prioritize the issues and take these priorities to their specific communities for further discussion.

These issues might be made a first priority for local peace and justice centers, which could help participants access resources and information, guide participatory research, sponsor conferences, do fieldwork, and engage in action. Paulo Freire's focus on problem-posing and identifying generative themes and oppressive myths would be helpful for facilitating this process, particularly if a group hopes to address denial, powerlessness, structural oppression; or racist, sexist, and classist misperceptions.<sup>25</sup>

Through local peace and justice centers, families and religious communities could also collaborate in education and advocacy. This often happens at the NFC. Education could include perspectives from different religious traditions that are relevant for peacemaking. Such centers would provide a place for families to learn together about peacemaking and its place in multiple faith traditions. The city of Gainesville, for instance, would benefit greatly from such a center. Significant numbers of people are committed to peace and justice, but they are often isolated from one another. A center could raise awareness, enhance the sharing of information, the building of common work, and the enhancement of citizenship and multicultural and interfaith dialogue.

Peace and justice centers focused inclusively on the social structural and environmental health of a community are as necessary as medical and mental health

---

<sup>25</sup> Freire, Pedagogy of the Oppressed, 61-67, 83-89.

centers. If effective in addressing issues such as reducing environmental dangers, unemployment, creating youth recreation activities or centers, and providing other community services; family violence, teen pregnancy, and health effects due to toxic environments could be reduced, thereby decreasing the strain on mental health and medical systems.

In addition to community initiatives, these approaches can also be used in K-12 schools. Katherine Isaac's book illustrates case studies in which elementary school children researched waste dumped near their school, found it was toxic, and successfully lobbied their legislators to have it removed; children were heard when adults were not.<sup>26</sup> Curricula for existing courses can be strengthened for peacemaking content, and additional courses, for instance, in citizenship, can be added. For example, courses in government can be reviewed and updated to incorporate the shift from national to global governance that is occurring, with an explanation of international agencies like the World Trade Organization and illustrations of local effects of global policies. The relationship between nonmonopoly economic systems and just governance can be explored. Courses in history can be shifted away from dominant themes of wars and battles to a greater emphasis on community life, conflict resolution, and international diplomacy. Courses in family life can teach anger management and conflict resolution skills, whereby connections between peaceful families and nations can be illustrated.

A special track that includes courses geared toward peacemaking could be created at the high school level, for which a special certificate could be given at graduation.<sup>27</sup> Extracurricular citizenship clubs could also be created and funded at the same level as sports, with peace fairs and other projects that help with fundraising.

Churches also need to become intentional centers of peacemaking education. Much of the work on citizen action would be relevant to churches and other religious

---

<sup>26</sup> Katherine Isaac, Ralph Nader Presents Civics for Democracy: A Journey for Teachers and Students (Washington, D.C.: Essential Books, 1992), 9-10.

<sup>27</sup> This track could be created so as to meet requirements for both technical and academic high school degrees.



communities. Families can participate together in peacemaking groups within the church, studying issues, practicing interpersonal and leadership skills, sharing field experiences, doing participatory research, and engaging in citizenship.

Peace education resources include Katherine Isaac's book, Civics for Democracy: A Journey for Teachers and Students, which provides a history of successful citizens' movements in the U.S., (including the Civil Rights Movement, the Labor Movement, the Women's Rights Movement, the Consumer Movement, and the Environmental Movement,)--examples from history that inspire. In addition, it describes numerous techniques for citizen actions.<sup>28</sup> The Wellesley College resource, Shaping a Better World: A Teaching Guide for Global Issues/Gender Issues provides global peace education perspectives on topics such as sweatshops, human rights, children's rights, the status of women and girls, genetically engineered foods, and war and peace.<sup>29</sup>

Rites of Passage Programs: Another approach to peace education in local communities is rites of passage programs. These are discussed by many people, including those who attend specifically to gender, such as Judith Duerck and James Nelson.<sup>30</sup> Coming of Age rituals in the church are especially powerful when they include discussion of the theological significance of female and male embodiment. Resources for developing rituals for girls are found in Leslie Kendrick, Melissa Raphael, and this dissertation.<sup>31</sup> Resources for boys are found in James Nelson.<sup>32</sup>

Matthew Fox's understanding of original blessing lends an important foundation for such rituals as does scripture in Genesis which states that all people are created in the image of the Divine.<sup>33</sup> These rituals could be done in the context

<sup>28</sup> Isaac.

<sup>29</sup> Kahn and Bailey.

<sup>30</sup> Judith Duerk, Circle of Stones: Woman's Journey to Herself (San Diego: LuraMedia, 1989), 4-14; James Nelson, The Intimate Connection: Male Sexuality and Masculine Spirituality (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1988), 11-66, 85-132; James Nelson, Embodiment: An Approach to Sexuality in Christian Theology (Minneapolis: Augsburg, 1978), 70-103.

<sup>31</sup> Kendrick; Raphael, Theology and Embodiment.

<sup>32</sup> Nelson, Intimate Connection, and Embodiment.

<sup>33</sup> Fox, 142-56; Genesis 1:26-31, Ryrie, 9.

of ongoing, same-gender, small group experiences that explore biblical and theological foundations of embodied epistemologies and healthy spirituality. These groups can also help youth to make connections between theological implications of embodiment, healthy families and communities, and social justice. These groups can focus on spiritual formation, character development, intergenerational study of women's and men's leadership, citizenship, vocation, and peace education.

Deacons can be trained to provide intergenerational mentoring to individuals and in small, gendered groups to focus on self-esteem. These groups can also and give teens a place to think more deeply about the purpose of their lives and vocation. Such programs may result in decreases in sexual activity, teen pregnancy, substance abuse, and gang-related activity. Through having a healthier understanding of what it means to be "a woman," or "a man," stereotypical understandings can be reduced and teens can be empowered to fulfill their greatest potential as human beings. Because stereotypical understandings have traditionally linked manhood with fighting, refusing to show weakness, and sexual acting out; and have linked womanhood with sexual attractiveness, powerlessness, and meekness; this kind of education can help reduce violence in schools and neighborhoods as well as promiscuity, while also challenging such destructive stereotypes. Because small groups can provide opportunities for teens to talk about embodiment and sexuality, safe relationships may be developed with adults allowing teens to discuss abuse, fears, or traumas in an environment where they can be referred to counseling or other needed services.

Aesthetic Peace Education: The arts--music, dance, painting, and film--are also important avenues for peace education. One fine example of arts education for peace is the work of Noris Binet, who held multicultural forums for women in Nashville, Tennessee, during the 1990s. Her forums for "Women on the Inner Journey" often began with panel discussions on a particular topic, followed by open microphone dialogue. Original paintings by local women artists related to the topic were displayed, and the discussion was followed by a session in therapeutic dance. In one workshop focused on women's solidarity, women tossed around a huge ball

of red yarn, wrapping themselves in it and dancing, through which women's menstrual connectedness and synchrony was visually and kinesthetically illustrated. Binet also utilized women's altars and meditation in workshops, drawing on the importance of altars in her Latin American heritage. In 1995, she created a Women's Altars art exhibit of thirty artists in a downtown Nashville gallery, which people stood in line for hours to see.<sup>34</sup> Binet's work over the years has done much to build solidarity between African-, Latin-, and European-American women in Nashville, out of which was published a book of artwork and stories of collaboration: Black and White Women: Building a Bridge.<sup>35</sup>

Building on Noris Binet's model, I created a Feminine Images of God and Women's Altars art exhibit in Gainesville, Georgia in 1998, with over thirty participating local artists, and again, a very large crowd. The exhibit was interfaith and multicultural, including an altar remembering women and girls held captive by the Taliban in Afghanistan, and an altar depicting a closed nuclear plant protected by women saints. Accompanying the exhibit were weekly workshops, including a study of feminine images of God in the Bible, womanist theology, and a poetry reading. Like Binet's exhibit, this exhibit was also recorded on film.

Similar exhibits on other topics such as environmental degradation could also be done accompanied by educational literature, workshops, drama, and dialogue sessions. Information on volunteering and donating to local organizations working on environmental issues could be made available. In this way, issues that are otherwise rarely, if ever, addressed can be brought into the open for public dialogue. Such events can be accomplished by a class, organization, or a community; they are inexpensive, requiring mainly time.

Similarly, the NFC has a history of using the arts for educating youth combined with recreational experiences. They have used street drama, (a funeral for

---

<sup>34</sup> I participated with an altar in the exhibit. Noris Binet, Coordinator of the "Women's Altars" art exhibit, Women's Visions Gallery, Nashville, Tn., 1995.

<sup>35</sup> Noris Binet, *Women on the Inner Journey: Black and White Women: Building a Bridge. Healing Racial Wounds Through Art and Spirituality* (Nashville: James C. Winston Publishing, 1994), available from (615) 297-6654.

drugs in the streets,) youth dance performances in nursing homes, beauty and talent pageants to uplift the self esteem of young girls and strengthen their public speaking, singing groups, bands, and carnivals. Miss Lisa described her work coordinating this artistic activity, saying that her reward was in those youth who came back to her later to tell her how meaningful these events were in their lives. The NFC also combined their guest lecture at Emory University with an art exhibit of the black and white photographs in their book.

Through the Hunger Coalition, Diane Saliba organized a huge "Colors of Africa" celebration in the Lawrenceburg, Tennessee town square, located only about thirty minutes away from the KKK Pulaski headquarters.<sup>36</sup> The youth and family celebration included African drumming (by a group that grew out of Edgehill Methodist Church youth ministries,) and other cultural and educational experiences--a powerful immersion in African culture.<sup>37</sup> This event, videotaped by the local TV station, was shown repeatedly on local television for some time.<sup>38</sup> In 1995 and 1996, I edited and published a journal that combines theology, the arts, spirituality, and social justice, as well as academic and grassroots works by women. The Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom included articles on womanist theology, theological implications of menstruation, how women in Chechnya tried to stop the war, nonprofit NGO research, original poetry, art, and a CD of women's original songs. The second issue of the journal focused on peacemaking and includes contributions from over 60 women and organizations.<sup>39</sup>

The filming of local arts events makes it possible for them to be aired on local television channels, further broadening the scope of their educational reach. The creation of a Woman's Action Network, consisting of local programming by women,

---

<sup>36</sup> Diane Saliba, multicultural celebration coordinator for the Hunger Coalition's "The Rainbow Project: Colors of Africa" in Lawrenceburg, Tenn., conversations with author, 1995, 2001.

<sup>37</sup> Mustafa Abdul-Aleem, "The Sound of Children Learning: My Experience Playing Afrikan Drums in the Schools," Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom (1996): 207-09; available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).

<sup>38</sup> Saliba.

<sup>39</sup> Susan M. Perz, ed., Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom (winter 1995); available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).

made available all over the world, could have important implications for peacemaking as well. Such a network could focus, not only on the arts, but on local documentaries of women's peace and environmental work, development, and human rights, with women's local perspectives, concerns, and critiques shaping national and international news.

Education in Intentional Communities: Intentional communities offer another model of peace education—one of example through alternative lifestyles. Such communities represent alternative and communal structures, and they are dotted across the United States. Some of the better known communities are Koinonia Farms and Jubilee Farms in Georgia, the Farm in Lawrenceburg, Tennessee, and the Sojourners community in Pennsylvania. Even week-long visits in such communities can be educational, sometimes life-changing. Smaller intentional communities are also significant. Hundreds of communal experiments were conducted through the 1970s and 1980s in the U.S., often focused on simplified lifestyles. Simplification was often paired with working with and for people on the margins of society.

Release-time and adult education centers can also offer opportunities for peace education. One example of this reveals opportunities for peace education with a religious perspective. Currently students can earn high school credit by enrolling in elective courses such as New Testament, Ethics, Media and Religion, and World Religions, with their parents' permission at Centerpoint, which offers release-time education courses to Gainesville and Johnson High School students in Hall County, Georgia. In 1998, Centerpoint became one of the first religious organizations in Gainesville to invite the NFC to help educate its students. Centerpoint is supported by local churches. Centerpoint also provides professional counseling for youth and families, and mentors for students needing extra support. These programs are funded by city and county schools and through grants.<sup>40</sup> Inclusive leadership is central to the success of this model. Release-time education

---

<sup>40</sup> David Smith, Centerpoint Director, conversation with author, Gainesville, Ga., 2001.

could be expanded to include courses in peace education.<sup>41</sup>

Adult education also raises possibilities. This year, the NFC will offer the leadership development program for girls as a Current Issues course for one high school credit at the Hall County Evening School. Adult education programs can also offer a certificate in peacemaking for interested adults. Dual-enrollment between colleges and high schools offers additional opportunities for peace education, for which students can earn both high school and college credit.

**The establishment of peace colleges and peacemaking as a profession.** Cora Weiss and the 1995 Beijing Women's NGO Peace Caucus call for the establishment of academic peace colleges. She notes that, in order to have "a peaceful generation in the next century, peacemakers must be educated and prepared." She writes:

Peace is taught. It's learned. It's not natural. We have war colleges, we need peace colleges. We ought to leave our GATTs at the door to the twenty-first century, the guns and the nukes and the bombers and missiles and the war culture should really be left behind.<sup>42</sup>

Cora Weiss expresses the belief that women will enforce existing standards and human rights, and will demand peace. She concludes:

Because if we don't have peace, we can't have development. If we don't have peace, we can't... we can't have anything.<sup>43</sup>

In his book, Talking Peace, former President Carter quotes scripture promising that there would be a time when "nation shall not lift up sword against nation, neither shall they learn war any more."<sup>44</sup> Carter emphasizes the importance of preventative diplomacy, as opposed to rhetoric of "diplomacy" that is actually a coordination of military efforts among nations, as seen in President Bush's 2001-2002 war against terrorism. Rep. Dennis Kucinich introduced a bill in July 2001 to establish a

---

<sup>41</sup> Such courses could include Women's Psychologies; Men's Psychologies; Leadership for Peacemaking; Multiculturalism in Christian Community; Citizenship; Current Issues in Peacemaking: An Overview; Ethical Vocation in a Global Economy; Peace, Diplomacy, and Conflict Resolution; Environmental Ethics; and Democracy in a Global Society.

<sup>42</sup> Look at the World Through Women's Eyes.

<sup>43</sup> Ibid.

<sup>44</sup> Carter, 36.

Department of Peace to oversee diplomatic negotiation between nations, to counter balance the U.S. Dept. of War, and to deal with issues related to workforce and education; the bill was referred to the Subcommittee on 21st Century Competitiveness.<sup>45</sup>

Some colleges offer degrees in peacemaking that focus on conflict resolution, often with an emphasis on mediation in the courts; some programs are broader. Somewhat more common are degrees in peace studies. These programs do not usually attend specifically to women's contributions to peacemaking or leadership capabilities. Both women and men ultimately need to be educated in leadership and its gendered dimensions. However, most leadership training is currently based primarily on traditional understandings of leadership; without gender analysis, most of these are androcentric in bias. In this historical period, academic degrees that focus on women's leadership for peacemaking are needed because of: (1) the extraordinary historical contributions of women, women's organizations, and matrilineal cultures; (2) the historic exclusion of women and women's perspectives from leadership, diplomacy, and leadership theories; (3) the explosion of women's NGOs and other leadership initiatives; (4) an increasing openness and call for women in all levels of leadership by the United Nations and by women themselves; (4) the crisis state of the world's ecology and social structures; and (5) the existence of nuclear, chemical, and other weapons of mass destruction.<sup>46</sup>

The success of establishing viable women's peace programs is tied to the success of endeavors to fund viable careers requiring skills in women's leadership and peacemaking. The explosive growth of nongovernmental organizations in areas such as the environment, Third World development, international women's rights, and world hunger contribute to vocational opportunities for those interested in

---

<sup>45</sup> Dennis Kucinich, H.R. 2459 "To establish a Department of Peace," 11 July 2001, (legislation on-line), available from <http://www.thomas.loc.gov>.

<sup>46</sup> Vickers, 118, 132, 71; Alonso; Mann; Stienstra, in Women in World Politics; Kristen Timothy, "Women as Insiders: The Glass Ceiling at the United Nations," Women In World Politics: An Introduction eds. Francine D'Amico and Peter R. Beckman (Westport, Conn.: Bergin and Garvey, 1995), 85-94; Shiva; Khatchadourian.

peacemaking.<sup>47</sup> Opportunities for teaching about peacemaking exist in many different settings including primary and secondary schools, (courses such as citizenship, ethics, or peacemaking,) as well as in publishing, curriculum development, and many other areas. Peace education can also serve as a foundation for women interested in starting new nonprofit organizations, for careers such as law and business, and a source for leadership in peace and justice centers and Mothers' Centers.

Education that prepares women for leadership and vocations in peacemaking is greatly needed, and can make significant contributions by providing effective leadership and strategies--not only for healing local communities, nations, and international institutions--but also toward disarmament and the prevention of war.

---

<sup>47</sup> Ibid., 118-132; Stienstra, in Women in World Politics.



## **CHAPTER 6: Embodied Theory and Practice of Religious Education for Peacemaking**

This chapter focuses on theological assumptions which ground epistemology and content guidelines for religious education and peacemaking. Underlying theological assumptions are synthesized with an embodied epistemology to guide educational goals and practices. Specific proposals are then offered, focusing particularly on a bachelor's degree centered around women's leadership and peacemaking.

Four core purposes of women's leadership for peacemaking education undergird this study: (1) to developmentally nurture and instill foundational beliefs in the sacred worth of every person, the Divine, the Earth, and its living ecosystems, (2) to nurture women's leadership for peacemaking, (3) to positively contribute to social systems and institutions that collaboratively act to heal the people, social structures, churches, governments, and ecosystems of the world, and (4) to prepare leadership for national and international nonviolent peacemaking movements, which are capable of creating the massive changes needed to preserve the Earth within a sustainable world peace. These four goals serve as central goals of education in creating socially just and peaceful communities and nations toward the end goal of sustainable world peace.

**Insights from the Newtown Florist Club.** Five main themes emerge from NFC insights that have relevance for education: the development of empathic skills through education, the importance of establishing collaborative relationships with other organizations, the cultivation of advocacy skills, and the demythologizing of oppressive social and environmental conditions.

Empathic skills can be developed through education. In particular, the NFC offers insights into educational methods for nurturing empathic skills between diverse people and groups. Reading and/or role playing stories and case studies like those in the NFC's book, The Newtown Story: One Community's Fight Against Environmental Racism can be powerful educational experiences that foster empathic

and intellectual connectedness across differences. Linking issues with data from field research is another way to build empathic connections that enhance respect and understanding of people whose life experiences differ from one's own or challenge prevailing beliefs. For example, conditions in some African American neighborhoods such as poverty, toxic dumping, and higher levels of pollution can be compared with data regarding higher disease rates and shortened life-spans of African American persons described by Townes and other epidemiological studies.<sup>1</sup>

Collaborative relationships can be developed with different groups and organizations. The NFC collaborates with many diverse community organizations, agencies, educational institutions, and foundations, as well as the local, state, and national governments. These relationships vastly expand the knowledge base as well as the community service capabilities of the club.

In 1998, the NFC established a ministers' group to educate and collaborate with local ministers about their community's struggle, the first multicultural gathering of ministers in Gainesville in several years. These meetings led to collaboration with the priest of a Latin American congregation, who asked to meet with the NFC staff to discuss the possibility of holding a peace march in the town square against gang violence. A youth in his church had been shot and killed by gang members. The NFC staff agreed to help the priest negotiate the process of getting city approval. As a result, a powerful peace march occurred, culminating in a rally with speakers and performances. Now this event occurs annually, and the NFC and the Latin American community participate regularly in each others' events.

The Leadership Development Program for Girls was a collaboration of the NFC, the Atlanta Women's Foundation, Gainesville city school system (renting buses), city and county schools (advertising the program), a local school, (allowing free use of facilities), the City Commission (explaining their meeting procedures to the girls), local speakers, and the mayor and housing authority director (discussing and addressing the girls' concerns).

---

<sup>1</sup> Townes, In A Blaze of Glory, 47-60; Townes, speech; Hahn and Eberhardt, 350-55; Robert A. Hahn et. al., "Poverty and Death in the United States--1973 and 1991," Epidemiology 6, no. 5 (September 1991): 490-97.

**Experiences of advocacy provide significant opportunities for learning.**

Advocacy can be cultivated through activities that build confidence in public speaking and citizenship skills, as well as through direct action experiences. The NFC has traditionally taken its youth to City Commission meetings and encouraged them to voice their concerns as early as age thirteen. The NFC's 2001 Leadership Development Program for Girls approached the Gainesville City Commission meeting in a similar way, encouraging the girls to speak out for their community. Miss April, one of the NFC founders, was quoted earlier as saying: "I may not dot all my i's or cross all my t's, but you know what I'm talking about." This phrase has been repeated for several generations of NFC leaders to encourage people to speak their mind. The NFC also provides as many public speaking opportunities for its youth as possible.

**Experiential learning is an educational method that provides opportunities to test knowledge and skills through direct experiences.** In addition, students learn through practical experiences that call upon them to bring to bear upon the learning environment their resources as whole-persons. Because the NFC is involved in a diverse range of social issues that affect the health and quality of life of their community, this community service organization provides extensive and important opportunities for experiential learning.

In 1998, the NFC was moved by a desire to protect its community to organize a counter-rally in response to the KKK rally being held outside the downtown courthouse. The NFC counter rally produced a nonviolent multicultural gathering of at least 600 people who turned out to say "KKK--not in our town!" to the small group of KKK members willing to appear in public without hoods. The experience was sobering, as SWAT team members with weapons filled the fenced-off area between the two groups and surveyed the area from the tops of nearby buildings, revealing the historic depths of strength and courage of people of color.

The experience brought home to me the real danger that persons targeted by hate groups feel, and the reality that action must match our beliefs--otherwise

they are meaningless. Through this and other experiences, I realized that as a European American, I cannot fully understand the level of threat that many African Americans feel in relation to hate groups in the U.S.--a fact which strengthens my desire to stand up. Solidarity is established through willingness to stand up during difficult times and situations. I also learned that the risk of standing up for community is reduced when more people speak out.

These experiences also strengthened my resolve to do preventative diversity education in public schools as a school counselor. Students growing up in homes of hate-group participants are likely to be deficient in the kinds of social skills needed to live in a multicultural, pluralistic world. Curricular resources could help these students, and those having difficulties could receive additional assistance from school counselors. The mental health profession has yet to understand the addictive dimensions of hate or the need for treatment, particularly in cases of hate-crime convictions. More research on the co-incidence of substance abuse and other addictions with hate is needed, as well as the relationship between hate culture, parenting, and antisocial behavior in youth.

Oppressive social and environmental conditions must be demythologized.

The opportunity to study and reveal oppressive myths that support the maintenance of oppressive conditions opens up new possibilities for learning, effective intervention, and advocacy. A number of the girls in the Leadership Development Program described oppressive housing and environmental conditions. Many of their parents work long hours. Our curriculum included a social analysis of public funding in their community as compared to funding of corporations and the military; they also studied protections of corporations by global institutions like the World Trade Organization. The girls researched the properties of hexane, one of the main chemicals released in the community, on the internet, and they studied differences in levels of pollution affecting Hall County residents, determined by race; (this was possible because most of the industry was built in African American neighborhoods).<sup>2</sup> We also studied the global women's and NGO

---

<sup>2</sup> Scorecard, an environmental site providing statistics on air, water, and soil pollution all over the U.S., available from <http://www.scorecard.org>.

movements as sources of local and global transformation.

**Theological assumptions underlying religious education for peacemaking.** Theological assumptions are drawn from theologies of the erotic, liberation theologies, and a women's embodied epistemology. These will be developed here, and then related through the rest of the chapter to education and peacemaking.

The first theological assumption is that God is love and God's love is inherently life-giving. To quote Gustavo Gutierrez, God is the "God of life."<sup>3</sup> This suggests the importance of a theological emphasis and cultural orientation centered around birth, love, and that which is life-giving. God's identity as Love, is the God who loves to love. God is made strong by loving and so are we. Love is inherently life-giving. God's love always creates new life, either by nurturing and challenging it, or by liberating creation from oppressive circumstances. Gutierrez, for example, describes God as liberating people from oppression, providing them with bread, a metaphor for meeting human needs.<sup>4</sup> This implies the fulfillment of healthy core human desires. Ada Maria Isasi-Diaz describes the struggle for liberation as "the struggle to be self-determining within the context of community and in view of the common good, and to have the material conditions needed to develop into the fullness of our capacity."<sup>5</sup> The "struggle for fullness of being, for liberation, and indispensable preparation for the coming of the kin-dom of God" are central to *mujerista* theology.<sup>6</sup> Scripture says, "I came that you might have life, and life abundantly!"<sup>7</sup>

A central goal of education is the creation of socially just and peaceful communities and nations toward the goal of world peace. Peace is the condition necessary for nurturing life in its multifaceted forms and requires just, equitable, and inclusive social structures, media, and governmental structures at local, national, and

---

<sup>3</sup> Gutierrez, xv.

<sup>4</sup> Ibid.

<sup>5</sup> Isasi-Diaz, xi.

<sup>6</sup> Ibid.

<sup>7</sup> John 10:10, (RSV), 96.

global levels.<sup>8</sup>

A second assumption is that every person and all of creation is created in the image of God, the “kabod YHWH,” which is the “weighty radiance” of the glory of God’s Divine Love.<sup>9</sup> Created in this God’s image, our original identity and human nature is the same. Original blessing described by Matthew Fox is central to the idea that every person is created in the image of Divine Love, and is innately of sacred value.<sup>10</sup> Each person and creation reflects what Elizabeth Johnson translates from the Hebrew as the “weighty radiance” of God’s glory.<sup>11</sup> When we understand God as Love, then the glory of God is God’s powerful love that brings life and liberates those in oppressive circumstances. We are called to do no less. The meaning of life is to love and be loved, and in the absence of “being loved,” the ability to love remains the central characteristic of Christian faith modeled in Jesus Christ. Jesus is a role model of God’s love for Christians, a guide, a Comforter, and a friend.

Carol Saussy notes that for many women, discovery of “the Goddess who is with her,” is to discover a more inclusive understanding of the Divine, “in a way that helps a woman know herself as holy.”<sup>12</sup> It is important for women to understand that they are created in the image of Goddess and that Divine love is uniquely incarnate in femaleness, in ways that reveal self-renewing potential for the “beloved community.”<sup>13</sup> Relationality is central to women’s ways of knowing and is generative for the intimacy of the beloved community described by Martin Luther

---

<sup>8</sup> Social structure refers to a wide range of systems and structures that mediate the distribution of goods and services that provide for a society’s basic needs, including for example, education, mental health services, medical services, housing, food, safety, water, environmental protection, community recreation.

<sup>9</sup> Elizabeth Johnson, Antoinette Brown Lecture at Vanderbilt University, Nashville, 23 March 1995.

<sup>10</sup> Fox, 142-56; Genesis 1:26-31, Ryrie, 9.

<sup>11</sup> Johnson, Antoinette Brown Lecture.

<sup>12</sup> Carol Saussy, 154; Starhawk, *Dreaming the Dark*, 141, and Raphael, *Thealogy and Embodiment*, 75-77, 72-3, also emphasize the importance of the Goddess in similar statements. Starhawk emphasizes the importance of the Divine within.

<sup>13</sup> King, Jr., 73, 146, 252.

King, Jr., and others in the African American community. Relational values, free of racism, parochialism, and greed, are central to the creation of just social structures, national priorities, and structures of global governance. People learn through their bodies in gendered ways.

A third assumption is that we are co-creators with God, with nature, and with each other as one family. As such, we are called to value and co-create our own, each other's, and the Earth's life experiences. Brock writes, "we are all part of one another and cocreate each other at the depths of our being."<sup>14</sup> As cocreators, we are called to value ourselves, the Divine, others, and the earth innately. Regardless of faith, ethnicity, gender, socioeconomic status, sexual orientation, age, ability, or other differences, we are all part of one body. What we do with our lives shapes the future of all.

A fourth assumption is that living in the image of God means committing one's self to the participative vocation of nourishing life and participating in God's liberative work. Such transformation involves ethical vocation, parenting for social justice, and structural change at all levels of society and governance.

God relies on humanity to do good. When these passions and vocations are not inspired and formed through education, "good" people do nothing, and people die. This occurs when people focus on limited parochial concerns, and choose not to participate with God and other people in co-creating for the good of all. Like it or not, we are all part of a global community. Mujerista theology highlights questions of survival that include not only overcoming oppressive conditions such as poverty which materially threaten survival, but also self-determination, notes Ada Maria Isasi-Diaz.<sup>15</sup> Oppressive conditions and racism converge in environmental racism that negatively affect the lifespans of African Americans and other people of color.<sup>16</sup> Citizens of the United States bear a special responsibility because of the power

---

<sup>14</sup> Brock, 49.

<sup>15</sup> Ada Maria Isasi-Diaz, 47-67, 16.

<sup>16</sup> Emilie M. Townes *In a Blaze of Glory*; see also "And All the Colored Folks is Cursed," Martin Luther King, Jr. Lecture, Claremont School of Theology, Claremont, Calif., Feb. 1996; Dave Kitchen and Sharon Kitchen.

and wealth accumulated within our nation and the devastating consequences of their misuse all over the world. Citizenship means attending not only to respectful and equal relationships with each other and between communities of differences, but also transforming the structures and systems of our nation and world.

**Epistemological and content guidelines for peace education.** A central goal of education is the creation of socially just and peaceful communities and nations toward the goal of a sustainable world peace. The following are epistemological and content guidelines emerging from the study and the theological assumptions.

**1. People learn through their bodies in gendered ways.** Female embodiment offers unique learning experiences with important instructive possibilities for nonviolent peacemaking. What is needed is a better-integrated understanding of the female embodied self and its relationship to learning, leadership, and peacemaking. This can take the form of active participation in such programs as NFC's Leadership Development Program for Girls. It can also take the form of coursework in formal academic settings, suggesting the possibility of a bachelor's degree program in women's leadership for peacemaking. Such a degree program could include courses in women's psychologies, women's leadership, the history of women's peacemaking, and embodied epistemologies. A proposal for such a program is presented in more detail later in this chapter.

Women's psychological research is historically recent and is still not well-known. Research on the influence of female embodiment on women's lives is even more recent. The importance of this information to women cannot be underestimated. It empowers women by validating their bicultural ways of relating in a predominantly male-cultured world. Similar work is needed on men's embodiment and epistemologies as well.

Embodied learning might best be done in small, same-gender facilitated groups. For example, women could discuss their embodied experiences using models such as Leslie Kendrick's approach, focusing on such experiences as menstruation, pregnancy, or breastfeeding; they would then proceed to reflect



theologically about these experiences.<sup>17</sup> Kendrick's model could be expanded and followed with reflections on how these experiences and theological reflections could shape women's leadership and peacemaking. Committed relationships and parenting could be added to these topics with emphasis on how embodied and relational experiences inform students' theological understandings and ethical commitments. Students might be asked to identify what actions they need to take as a result of this study.

The shape of this kind of study can be informed by examples that already exist. Women in Kendrick's group described powerful empathic connections with women in war situations or experiencing starvation during the time that they were breastfeeding their own children.<sup>18</sup> These experiences could be reflected on as sources of energy for social justice action. Lamaze classes and breastfeeding support groups in local Mother's Centers or churches could also be expanded to include this kind of reflection.

These experiences could be also multiculturally broadened, expanding Ann Wimberly's story-linking method, to include stories from African-, Latin-, Asian-, and Native-American contemporary experience or heritage, lesbian or gay experience. These stories could be compared with the absence or presence of similar stories of such faith in the Bible and other texts.<sup>19</sup> Such story-linking can bring voices into groups that would otherwise be unheard, even opening the way for forming empathic bonds and collaborative action across differences.

Mixed gender groups can also be created for specific purposes. Other possibilities for embodied learning include coming of age rituals, Sunday School literature, and reorganization of the academic calendar around the moon's cycles with four-day breaks every cycle. Women's embodied differences make possible unique forms of embodied actions for peacemaking such as those of women in Finland who declared to their government that they would bear no children until

---

<sup>17</sup> Kendrick, 6-7, 192, 197-98.

<sup>18</sup> Ibid.

<sup>19</sup> Wimberly, 39-48.

nuclear power were banned.<sup>20</sup>

**2. People learn social justice and the worth of human beings and creation through relationships.** Just as the NFC community learned through relating with one another and the larger Gainesville community, so relationships are an important way of knowing for others. Relationships involving direct contact with others enhance effectiveness and accountability. Meaningful relationships that focus on building justice and quality of life also stir respect for other people, communities, and the earth. This requires the practice of relational skills that foster social justice and respect for the worth and dignity of human and created life.

The first of these skills is the ability to nurture and instill beliefs regarding the ultimate worth of every person regardless of differences which guide leadership.<sup>21</sup>

This skill includes others: the ability to take differences inside the core self; the ability to address internalized dominance and oppression in relationships as well as oppressive systems; and the ability to allow the self to be genuinely informed and changed by authentic relationships with others.

It is crucial that this commitment to the ultimate worth of every child is extended to every person, regardless of race, ethnicity, gender, age, weight, affectional/sexual orientation, economic status, disability, or any other difference. This value is crucial to the spiritual and ethical formation of individuals and a necessary foundation for institutions--especially the church if it wishes to be a just structure capable of helping to create other just structures and systems.

Mary Elizabeth Moore's discussion of revering the self, others, and the Divine and her discussion of "teaching from the heart" already offer a well elaborated foundation and describe processes of revering for religious education.<sup>22</sup> This can be supplemented through the study of honor elaborated by Elaine Scarry and Matthew Fox's concept of "original blessing," along with a study of economic, environmental, and governmental systems and structures and how they positively and negatively

---

<sup>20</sup> Vickers, 118.

<sup>21</sup> Regan and Brooks, 39-41.

<sup>22</sup> Moore, Teaching from the Heart, 212-24.

affect people's lives.<sup>23</sup> Immersion educational approaches add a vital experiential dimension achieved by taking classes into communities experiencing oppressive structural violence. One example is the NFC's Toxic Tours. Moore notes that systems and structures create powerful messages through life conditions that can effect persons' experiences of themselves, their families, and their communities and their sense of being revered, honored, and valued.<sup>24</sup> The power of these messages can be difficult to overcome in a classroom, but Katherine Isaac offers models of community activism in which students collaboratively work to change conditions in their own neighborhoods.<sup>25</sup> One example is in the NFC's Leadership Development Program for Girls, which requested that the City Commission address housing conditions in their neighborhood. This demonstrates a religious education praxis of revering.

Beginning counselor education courses have already developed definitions and concrete descriptions of crucial component skills, such as respect for others, genuineness, and congruent communication.<sup>26</sup> These can be incorporated more fully into other educational settings, as well as insights from ant-racist and conflict-mediation training work.

Multicultural education regarding different worldviews can focus on how different worldviews and ways of being are incorporated into systems and structures as well as ways in which they inform persons and groups. Educational institutions seeking to practice revering will incorporate into their policies, practices, boards, and structures, diverse persons and multicultural ways of operating.

The ability to value every person requires the ability to value the multifaceted self, as well as people who differ from oneself. This ability is described by anti-racism educator Ellsworth; it is a skill that can be taught.<sup>27</sup> The ability to recognize

---

<sup>23</sup> Orlando Patterson, *Slavery and Social Death: A Comparative Study* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982), 1-14; Fox, 42-56.

<sup>24</sup> Moore, *Teaching from the Heart*, 216.

<sup>25</sup> Isaac, 3-10.

<sup>26</sup> Egan, 35, 63, 90-100.

<sup>27</sup> Ellsworth, 103, 90-115, citing the following: Alcoff; Anzaldua; de Lauretis; Hooks, *Talking Back*; Minha; and Weedon.

and heal internalized oppression and dominance is also an important skill central to this goal. These skills can be learned in individual and/or group therapy experiences outside the classroom, as well as in carefully planned classroom work, spiritual direction, support groups, and action groups. These experiences can nurture the inclusion of heterogeneous others in personal and professional relationships and groups. As positive aspects of other worldviews are absorbed and incorporated into one's repertoire of relating, they can be more easily and naturally incorporated into the policies and structures of institutions and governments.

The culmination of this first skill--nurturing and instilling beliefs in human dignity and worth--is a commitment to work for health and equality within and between ALL families, communities, social structures, states, and nations. This commitment could be formalized and celebrated in rituals in churches or colleges to emphasize their importance. In religious organizations and colleges, a theology of vocation for youth and adults could undergird an ethics-based approach to vocation focused on nonviolence and inflicting no harm to social structures or the environment, balanced with healthy financial self-care.

A second skill central to the practice of socially just relationships is the ability to connect deeply with the Divine constantly, to recognize one's deepest desires, to "follow one's bliss"--and care about the bliss of others.<sup>28</sup> Some ways of enhancing this skill are spiritual direction and meditative practices such as prayer, breastfeeding, journaling, dance, jogging, African and other forms of drumming. Maria Harris notes the importance of meditation as a formative aspect of religious education.<sup>29</sup>

A third skill related to the practice of socially just relationships involves a sincere interest in relating with others. Noddings's work on caring illustrates the relationship between caring and vocation, so that work is a genuine expression of the interested, caring self.<sup>30</sup> Persons who have experienced disrupted, abusive, or

---

<sup>28</sup> Joseph Campbell with Bill Moyers, *The Power of Myth*, ed. Betty Sue Flowers (New York: Doubleday, 1988), 117-21, 148, 155, 190-91, 193, 222, 229.

<sup>29</sup> Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 103, 89-90, 159-163.

<sup>30</sup> This is consistent with Regan and Brooks' findings that successful women principals do not see themselves as performing a role, but rather as caring for the community to whom they are responsible, Regan and Brooks, 39-42; Noddings, 175-182, 19-21, 46-51, 79-80, 73.

neglectful relationships are likely to have less interest and motivation in relating to others, and without outside support, may have difficulty grasping educational or theological concepts, such as, for instance, trust. Nurturing educational environments as well as opportunities to form ongoing therapeutic relationships through therapy, spiritual direction, and small group work can facilitate healing and inspire greater interest in relating with others.

**Empathic listening is a fourth skill that undergirds socially just relationships.**

Several skills foster such listening including awareness of feelings, the ability to reflect or mirror feelings and empathically summarize conversation content back to the speaker, the ability to recognize and name needs in one's self and others, and the ability to respond empathically to others through appropriate action. These skills address goals of overcoming the numbing of our innate sensibilities that make it possible for people to dominate, oppress, exploit, and kill. Beginning empathy skills are already effectively taught in counseling skills and theories courses in counselor education departments, utilizing laboratory experiences in which students roleplay problem situations and practice responding to each other, tape record themselves, and are graded on their ability to achieve basic competency in these skills--which are more difficult to master than they might appear. These skills have been taught as early as first grade to students in elementary schools (using Robert Myrick and Tom Erney's peer facilitation model), where they are much more easily mastered by children, who do not have to unlearn unhelpful response patterns at that age.<sup>31</sup> These educational approaches can be adapted and incorporated into formal and informal educational programs.

One of the most important aspects of adapting empathy skills from counselor education programs is to broaden students' awareness of others' real-life contexts beyond a simplistic understanding of an individual's relational experiences. The ability to accurately empathize with the self and others requires four different types of

---

<sup>31</sup> Robert Myrick and Tom Erney developed a "Peer Facilitation" program to teach these skills to first grade students, described in their book, Caring and Sharing, 71-93. As part of a counselor education practicum, I taught these skills to first graders in an elementary school. They were quite good at it.

contextual awareness: (1) awareness of the histories of different groups that shape their perspectives; (2) awareness of structural and systemic contexts; (3) awareness of multicultural dynamics in a given situation; and (4) awareness of environmental and geographic contexts.

Mutual caring is a fifth skill needed for socially just relationships to occur.

These skills include equal valuing of the needs of self and others, reciprocal talk, mutual encouragement and empowerment, mutual need-meeting, and mutual caretaking of a relationship. These skills can be taught through in-class, prescribed roleplays in which students practice these skills, as well as through roleplays in which students make up scenarios to illustrate the skills involved.<sup>32</sup> As part of the curriculum for the NFC's leadership development for girls, the girls participated in both types of roleplays. Field-based education and immersion-over-time educational experiences can be important formative processes for the development of these skills.

A sixth skill in the creation of socially just relationships is a sincere desire to cooperate and collaborate, rather than to compete and dominate. Nancy, a woman principal in Helen Regan and Gwen Brooks' study, noted that when the number of women reaches a majority in an organization, the group dynamics shift from competition to cooperation and collaboration.<sup>33</sup> This is an important shift in group dynamics; it is a trust-building and trust-maintaining process that enables diverse people to establish mutually empowering working relationships in which the good of everyone, is sustained and is foundationally valued.<sup>34</sup> The desire to collaborate is closely aligned with the ability to trust others, which is based on past experiences. This is one reason why personal counseling and small group work are crucial to leadership development. Not only do they provide opportunities to heal in conscious ways from past experiences, but they provide new safe relationships

---

<sup>32</sup> Moore's description of case study, narrative, and phenomenological methods in Teaching from the Heart, 27-162, as well as Wimberly's story-linking method of religious education, 39-48, can help facilitate this learning.

<sup>33</sup> Regan and Brooks, 98.

<sup>34</sup> The common good cannot not necessarily be equated with what is good for the majority.

which are imprinted over old traumas, and are processes of revering that enhance those described by Moore.

Two forms of collaboration skills can be elaborated: intra-organizational collaboration and inter-organizational collaboration. Collaborative processes within organizations include: group facilitation, brainstorming, the ability to synthesize needs, problem-solving, collaborative visioning, and group consensus decision-making skills. Most of these skills are systematically taught in counselor education programs, particularly in group therapy courses.<sup>35</sup> Newtown Florist Club consultant, Kristina Peterson, asked workshop participants what they would like their community to look like in five years--an example of collaborative visioning. Inter-organizational collaboration is increasingly important in that it facilitates multicultural interaction and helps people recognize common and complimentary needs, problems, resources, and contributions. Inter-organizational collaboration is important for community organizing and is often a requirement of foundation grants, which seek to encourage this kind of community networking and interaction. Field-based education is one significant way that such collaboration can be incorporated into education, particularly in partnership with nongovernmental organizations, (NGOs), and grassroots community organizations. Some of the most current, cutting-edge, and globally networked research is being done today by NGOs, but little of this research is available in most academic libraries or included in college syllabi.

Conflict management is a seventh area of skills needed to create socially just relationships. This skill-competency area includes component skills of personal anger management, community conflict resolution, strategies of nonviolent resistance, the ability to agree to disagree, a practical sense of justice that addresses conflicts directly and requires wrongdoers to make restitution whenever possible, coupled at times, with radical forgiveness. Numerous personal anger management curricula exist.<sup>36</sup> I have developed one for Johnson High School as a half-time school

---

<sup>35</sup> Counselor Education Program, Education Department, University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida.

<sup>36</sup> Rosemarie S. Morganett, Skills for Living: Group Counseling Activities for Young Adolescents (Champaign, Ill.: Research Press, 1989).

counselor there. Conflict resolution skills are taught at Brenau University in a two-part course.<sup>37</sup> Strategies of nonviolent resistance and change are taught by Gandhi's grandson at the M. K. Gandhi Institute for Nonviolence at Christian Brothers University in Memphis, Tennessee, as well as through community education, participatory research, and activism centers like the Highlander Center. A practical sense of justice is described by Ruddick and is congruent with Biblical understandings of forgiveness and repentance.<sup>38</sup>

Oppression is expensive in what it does to children, adults, and communities, and it is even more expensive to correct. Affirmative action and related programs are attempts to correct not only past injustices, but they are structural boundaries and corrective measures that help to correct continuing prejudices and injustices.

People can learn to develop a different way of thinking--to see the world with an eye toward justice--by learning the different multicultural histories of their communities, developing deeper relationships with diverse others, and learning to connect their own health and safety with the health and safety of diverse others. This can be accomplished through examining global patterns affecting local communities, through practicing restitution, and through rituals of forgiveness.

Community advocacy, including willingness to speak out and take significant personal and professional risks for the good of the self, others, and the Earth is an eighth skill. This skill is largely learned through field experience, although students can be prepared in advance for these experiences by watching films, developing role-plays, and reading about communities and individuals who have done this. Maria Harris' description of claiming the power to rebel is informative of this process.<sup>39</sup>

Strength and perseverance regardless of success are skills that sustain socially just relationships over time, and are sustained by healthy spirituality and strong personal and community relationships. In addition, Welch notes that the ability to persevere over time is related to the willingness to participate in actions and

---

<sup>37</sup> Ken K. Frank, Associate Professor of Humanities, Director of Legal Studies and Conflict Management Program, Brenau University, conversation with author, 15 February 2001.

<sup>38</sup> Ruddick, 171-76, 172, 180-84.

<sup>39</sup> Harris, 90-92.



interventions that have no guarantee of success, whose successes are partial and negotiated in ongoing ways. These skills are particularly evident in African American traditions of resistance and struggle for social justice, she notes.<sup>40</sup> These skills can be developed through field experiences in which students or participants are immersed in grassroots community organizations attempting to address the kinds of multilayered, interlocking forms of oppression described by the NFC. Moore's discussion of narrative method can also be utilized in the study of persons who have persevered over time.<sup>41</sup> Isaacs describes successful U.S. citizen movements.<sup>42</sup>

Finally, socially just relationships require attending to self-care, including a healthy spirituality, emotionally intimate and integritous personal relationships that are intentional sources of personal and professional support, a clear understanding of professional ethics, attention to personal health, safe living conditions, employment, and financial health. hooks' notes that, although it is natural for teacher's to need some affirmation from students, this natural need conflicts with students' resistance to liberatory education. Some students may be critical of teachers who challenge them, recognizing the value of liberatory education only at a later time.<sup>43</sup> In these instances, solid personal and professional support is essential self-care that undergirds liberatory teaching. Many issues can be addressed through a noncredit course in professional ethics, workshops, and retreats.

**3. People learn through experiences of parenting and otherwise caring for and about children.** These experiences have implications for direct nurturing care as well as for policy interventions in society. These can be fostered through religious education for families, communities and larger societies. Rita Nakashima Brock has done extensive theological work on the centrality of healthy parenting and families to a healthy society.<sup>44</sup> Miller-McLemore's theological work is an important critique of U.S. government priorities, and the Mother's Center

---

<sup>40</sup> Welch, 96-97.

<sup>41</sup> Moore, 131-58.

<sup>42</sup> Isaacs, 13-154.

<sup>43</sup> Hooks, *Teaching to Transgress*, 37-42, 206.

<sup>44</sup> Brock, 9-17, 21, 24-28, 35-42.

movements in the U.S. and Germany provide important nonprofit models for supporting mothers.<sup>45</sup> Insufficient theological work has been done on parenting that is connected to political dimensions of parenting. Pam Couture's work is one exception.<sup>46</sup> Mary Field Belenky, Blythe McVicker Clinchy, Nancy Rule Goldberger, and Jill Mattuck Tarule; and Sarah Ruddick describe how women learn from becoming mothers.<sup>47</sup>

This epistemological guideline is particularly important for religious education in the church, because experiences with families and children are so present in the church. This dissertation offers only beginning possibilities, but theologies of marriage, parenting, and caregiving are important to study. Church rituals marking important family events can help couples and families make explicit connections between their love for each other and the ways in which this love overflows into love for communities and compassion for others. Rituals can also acknowledge the othermothering and otherfathering roles of persons in the church, as well as those of professional caregivers for children in the community.

**4. People learn by recognizing oppressive myths, recognizing destructive local/global patterns, and re-envisioning existing institutions and social structures.** The ability to recognize and expose oppressive myths is described by Freire as demythologizing.<sup>48</sup> His method can be sharpened through the following skills: the ability to make local-global connections and to communicate them in concrete, practical ways; the ability to utilize structural and systemic thinking as an aspect of critical thinking; opportunities to compare diverse life experiences; and opportunities to participate in immersion experiences within diverse communities and neighborhoods. The goal is to help people make connections through

---

<sup>45</sup> Miller-McLemore, 73, citing Sylvia Ann Hewlett, A Lesser Life: The Myth of Women's Liberation in America (N.Y.: William Morrow, 1986), 369; Miller-McLemore, 73-74, citing an interview with Hewlett, Publishers Weekly (July 12, 1991): 50; see also Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 180-201.

<sup>46</sup> Pamela D. Couture, Blessed Are the Poor (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1991); and Seeing Children, Seeing God: A Practical Theology of Children and Poverty (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 2000).

<sup>47</sup> Belenky, et. al., Women's Ways of Knowing, 35-36; Ruddick.

<sup>48</sup> Freire, Pedagogy of the Oppressed, 64-67, 120-22, 114-16, 82-87

understanding global structures and systemic dynamics that intensify perceptions of diversity and interconnectedness.

All of these opportunities are enriched and strengthened through exposure to peacemaking literature, which can reveal hidden and oppressive myths that operate at such global levels that they are often unknown or misperceived by citizens who are unaware of their existence. Dominance and privilege is more easily perpetuated when these educational approaches are absent because of difficulties in perceiving the overall picture and identifying root causes. In addition, comprehensive methods of assessing healthy communities are needed in order to expose oppressive practices and establish standards of community health capable of sustaining healthy families and peaceful nations.

Effective demythologizing depends on the ability to comprehend the larger picture and understand the interrelationship between the themes or patterns which emerge, notes Freire. He writes, "The investigation will be most educational when it is most critical, and most critical when it avoids the narrow outlines of partial or "focalized" views of reality, and sticks to the comprehension of *total* reality."<sup>49</sup> These abilities: to hold in mind a comprehensive view of reality, and to grasp the relationship between emerging patterns--require an ability to synthesize patterns at local-to-global levels as well as an ability to understand the relationality that connects everyone and everything in the universe.

Because this epistemological guideline relies on the ability to understand and synthesize complex relationships to form a comprehensive view, it requires a worldview in which all of life and creation is organically connected--one. Myers, Starhawk, and McFague articulate similar, yet different organic worldviews in which the Divine is the energy or the body of all that is. Afrocentric psychologist Myers provides a description of contributions of quantum physics to the Afrocentric belief that "all is one: God manifesting."<sup>50</sup> She writes that "reality is at once spiritual and material," sourced in the Divine. "All things are interrelated; the material realm is

---

<sup>49</sup> Ibid., 89.

<sup>50</sup> Myers, 17-28, 26.

merely the most outward manifestation of the spiritual," she adds.<sup>51</sup> Myers describes God as "all that is."<sup>52</sup> Starhawk--from a Wiccan perspective--also describes understandings of the Goddess as energy and as All-That-Is-One.<sup>53</sup> McFague's theological image of the world as God's body broadens the biblical understanding of the Christian community as the body of Christ to include all people and creation.<sup>54</sup> Others, such as Brock and Carter Heyward, understand the Divine as the loving relation between all people and creation.<sup>55</sup> These expansive understandings of the Divine point to a concern for the world's well-being that is part of God's own embodied experience. Thus, when caring or oppressive relationships exist between individuals, groups, or nations, or are incorporated into systems and structures of culture, these relationships also embody caring or rejection of the Divine. As Christians learn about global systemic and structural patterns, Jesus' own solidarity with the world is reinforced, and the intimate connections between personal survival and the healing of all peoples are made clear.

The ability to imagine and recreate social structures and policies is empowered when oppressive myths are recognized and discarded. This involves the ability to understand ways in which structures do or do not embody liberating processes. If they do not, liberatory practices can be employed, such as: collaboration, dialogue, inclusive decision-making, equitable funding, and nonviolent approaches to previously unacknowledged social and economic conflicts. Certain subject areas can also contribute to imagining and recreating social structures and policies. Studies of particular importance would focus on: the environment, the health of social structures and local/global economics, human rights and multiculturalism, peacemaking and disarmament, and governmental structures and

---

<sup>51</sup> Ibid., 63, 23.

<sup>52</sup> Ibid., 25.

<sup>53</sup> Starhawk, Dreaming the Dark, 28-29; Starhawk, Spiral Dance, 209, 38-40, 91-92.

<sup>54</sup> McFague, The Body of God, 13-22, 99-112.

<sup>55</sup> Brock, 45-46; Carter Heyward, The Redemption of God: A Theology of Mutual Relation (Washington, D.C.: University Press of America, 1982), 38-39.

NGOs.<sup>56</sup> These studies form content guidelines drawn from four primary research areas: main categories in NGO and nonprofit organizations' research and advocacy and U.N. conferences, the Newtown Florist Club, and research by women scholars.<sup>57</sup>

This coursework can eradicate myths that block effective peacemaking. Because women are often deeply concerned about their children's and community's welfare, peace analyses from women's perspectives often provide a full, concrete picture of what is needed for effective peacemaking. Brock's theological work places the needs of children and families at the center of healthy communities, nations, and world, an important centerpoint for social justice analysis through which global sources of local oppression are more clearly revealed.<sup>58</sup>

**5. People are motivated to learn about difficult social issues when they recognize the relevance to their own life situations, as well as the threats to their own and others' security.** People are motivated to act nonparochially when they are able to make connections between their own life situations and the life situations of others and to recognize common sources of oppression. Because the source of many injustices lies in global institutions, and because many people either do not think systemically, do not understand global institutions, or do not have time to research their destructive and constructive influences, many people do not understand the complexity of current threats and past destructiveness to local communities and environments. Education can help people understand the forces influencing their lives, connect with others' experiences of oppression, and act nonparochially for the good of all. Freire's discussion of semi-

---

<sup>56</sup> Multiculturalism includes differences related to: culture, ethnicity, and "race," as well as gender, age, ability, sexual orientation, religious faith, (including indigenous religions, Wicca, etc.) and economic status. Human rights includes study of privilege, discrimination and prejudice, hate groups, terrorism, structural and hate violence. Violence against women is included in multiculturalism as misogyny, (a combination that is also a feature of militarism, according to Ruddick, 200-03, 144-45).

<sup>57</sup> See bibliography list of NGO organizations and research in the nonprofit organization and various peacemaking categories.

<sup>58</sup> Brock, 9-17, 21, 24-28, 35-42.

intransitivity and Ruddick's discussion of parochialism are generative.<sup>59</sup>

Effective religious education stresses the crucial nature of leadership for nonviolent diplomacy, disarmament, just global governance, and peacemaking that prioritizes economic, environmental, and multicultural aspects of social justice, utilizing innovative, nontraditional community-based approaches. Christian theology teaches that God is passionately and actively invested in the healing of God's creation. God's passion for us incarnate in Jesus Christ, is a model for our passion for the world. For this reason, community-based field learning and immersion opportunities, coupled with systemic study of main areas of peacemaking can be powerful in helping people see connections between their own survival and the survival of diverse others.

**6. People's passions can shape their vocation and transform their communities.** When people are educated about the myths in their world and nurtured in their passions for healthy lives, they discover compatibilities between their passions and the needs of the world, as well as their own abilities to contribute to social transformation. With shrinking leisure and volunteer time, the cultivation of Christian commitments to good citizenship in vocational choices is crucial. "Tentmaking" by day and social justice ministry at night, practiced by Paul in Christian scripture is a luxury that many people cannot afford because many are already working two or three jobs just to survive.<sup>60</sup> Noddings' understanding of caring as a life vocation transforms work from role-playing to a genuine vocation of skilled caring.<sup>61</sup> This kind of vocational education for transformation can be implemented through spiritual gifts workshops, midlife reevaluation workshops, and young adult leadership education.

Important "best practices" in the area of social justice include the creation of local co-ops supporting local organic farmers and small businesses; business start-up assistance for sustainable production processes, wind and other renewable

---

<sup>59</sup> Paulo Freire, Education for Critical Consciousness (New York: Continuum Publishing, 1998), 17-20; Ruddick, 177, 225-34.

<sup>60</sup> Acts 18:3, Ryrie, 1523, 1968.

<sup>61</sup> Noddings, 175-82, 19-21, 46-51, 79-80, 73.

energies; retraining opportunities for persons employed in military or weapons industries; local healthcare co-ops; ordinances outlawing chain businesses; use of legal local currencies; credit unions; Land Trusts providing lowcost housing in perpetuity; socially responsible investing; support of Peace Tax Fund Resistance to military spending; and national laws which outlaw trading in currencies and require investments to be tied to local markets with “real” assets. Most of these practices are already being successfully used in local communities.<sup>62</sup> An interdenominational, interfaith network could be created to signify churches and other religious communities whose members have covenanted to engage in these and other social justice best practices. Similar local nonprofit, NGO coalitions could also be created that support such practices. These are concrete ways in which the church can incarnate a living “God of life.”

**7. People learn experientially--by doing.** Rosemary Radford Ruether notes that any theology that is not enacted is not viable. She writes:

I don't believe in any faith that's not in action. I mean any faith that's just some kind of theory that's not... a concrete way of living is meaningless as far as I'm concerned. So any kind of genuine faith is really a way of living, and it's a way of relating in terms of justice, and love, and mutuality.<sup>63</sup>

This is also good educational practice because often kinesthetic learners are left out of traditional educational approaches. Maria Harris discusses educational methods for educational praxis that include persons with such diverse learning styles.<sup>64</sup> Following counselor education models for learning and practicing effective communication skills, people learn communication and other leadership skills by practicing them--first in supervised critiqued laboratory experiences, and then in field experiences. Community-based immersion and field experiences, engaging in art, drama and roleplaying; exploring nature; standing with local grassroots people as they stand up for their communities in hearings and government meetings; and practicing leadership

---

<sup>62</sup> Synthesis of nonprofit research; Korten, 4; Homes and Hands: Community Land Trusts in Action prod. Helen S. Cohen, dir. Debra Chasnoff and Helen S. Cohen, approx. 20 min., Women's Educational Media with Institute for Community Economics, 1998, videocassette.

<sup>63</sup> Rosemary Radford Ruether, interviewed in Look at the World Through Women's Eyes.

<sup>64</sup> Harris, Teaching and Religious Imagination, 42-46.

skills are all important forms of experiential learning. Laboratory experiences for practicing leadership skills might be structured as small groups in which people learn to relate at deeper levels with others across diversity. These educational experiences enable people to gain tested competence in skills through practice and lived experiences. The citizenship skills described by Katherine Isaac can be incorporated as experiential elements. Examples include: pamphleteering, whistleblowing, forming a citizen group and recruiting others, public education through newsletters and public town meetings, participatory research, surveys, factfinding, boycotts, strikes, demonstrations, nonviolent civil disobedience, citizen lobbying, lawsuits, referendum, shareholder activism, media use, and grants.<sup>65</sup> Goals include internalizing the values of good citizenship and Christian faithfulness, as well as developing competence in relational leadership and citizenship skills.

The establishment of collaborative relationships between academic institutions, local communities, nonprofit organizations, and religious communities can multiply the educational opportunities. Academic institutions, for example, have unique opportunities and resources, and can collaborate by offering laboratory experiences and field placements, and conducting participatory research with local NGOs, civil and religious communities, that directly benefits their surrounding communities. Such experiences can be mutually enriching. It seems particularly appropriate for religious schools to be involved in studious collaboration regarding the issues of their surrounding communities. Inter-organizational collaboration can also make possible projects that require complex coordination and grant funding. Grassroots, religious, and NGO leaders might offer their expertise as guest lecturers. Local leaders might be empowered to audit courses or enroll in degree programs that enhance their effectiveness.

The Kenneth Cole Foundation's recent collaboration with the political science department at Emory University provides a model for such collaborations. The foundation recently donated \$600,000 to Emory to create twelve-week summer field experiences in which students are grouped to learn about and address a

---

<sup>65</sup> Isaacs, iii-iv.



particular community-building project.<sup>66</sup> Students participate in internships in several different public, private, and nonprofit organizations to learn collaboration and communication skills, field research techniques, and database work--fundamentals of community building.

The course Introduction to the City involves partnering with local communities to address public issues such as the need for affordable housing, increased health care access, and protection of the environment. Two features differentiate this model from many existing models. First, students are assigned as a team to internships in different organizations which are working together on a common issue that requires multigroup collaboration. Second, the school's commitment to the community is longterm. This allows the school-community partnership to fulfill multiple stages of a project, so that students can participate in important educational experiences, and communities can accomplish goals that require multiple phases. Students are more likely to develop commitments to healthy communities when their academic institutions model such commitments. Educators who use field-based and participatory research methods have formed a support organization, called Just Connections.<sup>67</sup>

These educational processes and epistemological guidelines can shape many different educational programs. One specific example--a degree program in women's leadership for peacemaking serves to illustrate. This is the subject of the next section.

**Women's leadership for peacemaking, a bachelor's degree.** Why is a bachelor's degree in women's leadership for peacemaking needed? The frequent absence of academic coursework in women's leadership is significant, given that academic research in women's leadership has increased dramatically in the last few years. A focused bachelor's degree in women's leadership for peacemaking is one of the logical places for such coursework to begin.

---

<sup>66</sup> Deb Hammacher, "Kenneth Cole Foundation Donates \$600K to Create Community Building and Social Change Program," Ethics News and Views, spring 2002, (Center for Ethics, Emory University), 8.

<sup>67</sup> Susan Ambler, convener, "Just Connections," (panel presentation at the Appalachian Studies Conference, Helen, Ga., 17 March 2001).

A concentration on five core aspects of peacemaking can be uniquely facilitated through a degree in women's leadership for peacemaking. Educators need to be able to facilitate a conscientization process within themselves and others in such a program which outlines major forces influencing their worlds.

As for content, six core aspects of peacemaking can be organized within one interdisciplinary approach, rather than limit peace education to individual courses within separate degree programs. These core subject areas, as described earlier, are: environment, social structure health and local/global economics, human rights and multiculturalism, peace and disarmament, governmental structures and NGOs, and peace education. Rarely are such studies included in one cohesive whole.

The epistemological and content guidelines, educational goals, and skills needed to empower women's leadership for peacemaking can be integrated into a cohesive model for higher education. One example is described below. This degree program can be offered within religious or secular colleges and universities, including peacemaking colleges, where existing courses might be adapted and new courses added.

#### Junior Year: Basic Studies in Women's Leadership

Total of 8 Courses:

##### Semester 1

Listening Skills: with communication lab and competency requirements.

Women's Multicultural Psychologies: including women's embodied epistemologies of leadership, peacemaking, and education.

Historic Overview of Selected Communities: Iroquoian Clan Mothers, U.S. Feminist-pacifists, African American Women's Clubs, Civil Rights Movements, U.S. Women's Peacemaking organizations, intentional communities, the environmental movement, the consumer movement.

Technological skills: building web-sites, power-point presentations

##### Semester 2

Conflict Resolution: also anger management, and self-care, with a communication lab.

Psychology and Sociology of Diversity: also patterns of domination and oppression, bicultural coping, and violence against women, with lab for small group exploration of diversity and communication skills.

Women's Leadership and embodied epistemology.

Theories of Education and Praxis: religious education, critical pedagogy,

community organizing, citizenship, and integrative service learning.

**Concomitant Junior Year, Year-long Noncredit Requirement**

All students are required to complete one year of weekly counseling off campus--individual, group, marriage, or family therapy.

**Senior Year: One Overview Course In Each Core Area of Peacemaking with emphasis on women's perspectives and experiences**

Total of 8 Courses plus one summer or winter term internship:

**Semester 1**

Women's International Peacemaking: The United Nations, NGOs, and the Global Women's Movement, women's approaches to diplomacy and disarmament, promoting peace and preventing war.

Environment: sustainability, toxic waste, renewable energy, women's environmental movements, organic foods.

Social Structure Health: education, health, human services, food security, nonprofit management, women and development, communalism, community health, global economics, international finance.

Global Governance: political leadership, democracy, national sovereignty, and the media.

**Semester 2**

Human Rights and Multiculturalism: including foundations for peacemaking in world religions, including indigenous religions.

Nonviolent Conflict Resolution II.

Research Methods that Support Peace and Justice Work: ethnographic studies, participatory research and action research methods with field education lab.<sup>68</sup>

Public Speaking and Video Production.

**Christian colleges add:**

1. A one-year noncredit requirement of weekly spiritual direction off campus, individually or in a group.
2. An overview course in biblical, theological, and spiritual foundations for peacemaking in the Christian tradition, including spiritual disciplines that support women's peacemaking, offered during winter or summer.

**Winter or Summer Term Internships Can Be Chosen From:**

**1. Local nongovernmental organizations (NGOs).**

Internships with local NGOs could be arranged to foster understanding of how local NGOs contribute to local social structures and global peacemaking, and to explore the relationship between local communities, NGOs, and the academy.

**2. Local churches involved in peacemaking.**

Local churches or denominational organizations that are involved in peacemaking activities are good internship sites, especially those that bring

---

<sup>68</sup> Lee Lyle Williams.

into dialogue local/global issues in relationship to the church's social justice role.

### 3. National and international opportunities.

Internships focused on fostering broader systemic understanding might be set in United Nations agencies in the U.S. or Geneva, U.S. embassies, women's NGOs in New York and Washington, D.C., the Women's International Tribune Library and Book Store, the U.S. Congress, and those women's NGOs with New York and Washington D.C. offices such as the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom. Internships may be offered during winter or summer sessions.

Such a model for peace education in higher education offers opportunities to gain concrete skills in leadership combined with a broad knowledge base of issues central to peacemaking and an understanding of local and global patterns that must be transformed.

**Conclusion: preparing leadership for international peacemaking movements.** People around the world are increasingly recognizing their inter-relatedness as global citizens. The hijacking of social structure funds for military-industrial and other corporate purposes is a global pattern which is threatening international food and finance security, while stealing knowledge and resources from indigenous communities.<sup>69</sup> Many transnational corporations, and the global structures that support them, are gutting the world's resources and destroying the social structures and environments of many nations. At the same time, nonprofit nongovernmental organizations have spring up globally in unprecedented numbers.

Because the U.S. has so many transnational corporations, because of its dominance globally, and because of its dominating positions in global institutions like the United Nations Security Council, the United States and its people bear a special burden and share a unique opportunity to address the conditions that are devastating communities and the environment all over the world. In particular, this requires transformation of existing structures of global governance. In addition, people in the

---

<sup>69</sup> Clarke and the IFG, 7-16; Zubow and Nesbitt poster series; Vickers, 41-67; Vandana Shiva, Stolen Harvest; Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO), no. 5 "Who Owns Knowledge? Who owns the Earth? Intellectual Property Rights and Biodiversity under the New GATT and World Trade Organization (WTO)," Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) Primer: Understanding the Impact of the Global Economy on Women and the Environment (New York: WEDO, 1995).

United States whose economic status is middle class or above are among a small percentage of privileged people globally who utilize a majority of the world's resources. This makes U.S. citizens accountable globally for the actions of this country and for the share of the world's resources we use.

One salient, long-term feature of war, besides the massive human, social structure, and environmental destruction it creates, is its profit-making capability for a small elite. Women's historical critiques serve to demythologize the existence of "just wars" and point to the long-term inefficacy of violence and war in creating peace, suggesting instead the effectiveness of international diplomacy. They further suggest that skilled diplomatic interventions and ethical foreign policies have not been used in many past and present wars--despite their nonviolent potential and suggest their potential to eliminate the need for war in the future.

Given the status of the U.S. as number one among industrial nations in weapons sales, its historic misuse of nuclear weapons, and its resistance to restrictions on the legality of nuclear weapons, U.S. citizens also bear a special responsibility in preventing current development of small-scale nuclear weapons which threaten U.S. and international security, and in supporting disarmament. The accomplishments of women in Finland who refused to bear children until nuclear power was banned is instructive for the kinds of untapped possibilities for peacemaking that exist, offering a particularly timely example.<sup>70</sup> Perhaps such a strike by U.S. women is warranted in regard to both nuclear power and weapons.

The field of religious education can exercise an important role in preparing leadership for peacemaking. Special attention needs to be given to the education of girls and women. A lawyer representing Zambia at the U.N. Fourth World Congress on Women NGO Forum states:

We are here to lobby our government to put more funds in the education of the girlchild because we believe that educating a girl is educating a nation, whereas educating a man is educating an individual.<sup>71</sup>

Educating both women and men is crucial to a healing world. Even so, this lawyer's

---

<sup>70</sup> Vickers, 118.

<sup>71</sup> Look at the World Through Women's Eyes.

quote recognizes the unique leadership potential of women at this time in history.

Religious education can play an important role in helping women recognize their uniquely transformative potential as leaders in the public sphere and in all areas of life in a world with increasingly fragile margins of survival.

Religious and secular structures of peace education, including global networking of women's colleges and women's studies programs in collaboration with women's international NGOs can play a huge role in preparing leadership, working toward global disarmament, and helping to determine the course of future peacemaking efforts.<sup>72</sup> Such collaboration can accelerate and intensify the effectiveness and scope of NGO work worldwide. As noted earlier, Stephenson observes that the international women's movement has developed "a more formal governmental and nongovernmental infrastructure that could begin to serve as the basis of an international women's regime."<sup>73</sup> This level of organization raises future possibilities of developing women's international agencies of global justice and governance.<sup>74</sup> This dissertation has focused on recognizing and expanding those roles.

A true story from the tragic ethnic conflict in Sarajevo illustrates how much more is really possible. During the worst of the killing in Sarajevo, a Bosnian woman, Esmuda Mujagic, sought safety in a Serbian shelter that was shelled by the Serbian Army. She describes her mysterious meeting with a man she had seen the day before in the shelter. He appeared to know everything she had experienced, and told her "The women will stop the war." He asked her to call the women together and told her all that would happen, adding that she must not speak of these things until his words had begun to be realized. She wondered how she could call the

---

<sup>72</sup> During a personal conversation, Andrea Birch suggested the possibility of creating increased international networking among women's colleges. Andrea Birch, Dean of the School of Fine Arts and Humanities, Brenau University, conversation with author; 2001.

<sup>73</sup> Stephenson, in *Women, Politics, and the United Nations*, 150-1.

<sup>74</sup> Such institutions are already occurring, for instance the World Women's Congress for a Healthy Planet, November 8-12, 1991 in Miami, in preparation for the Earth Summit, (described earlier) at which "Women from every region of the world presented dramatic evidence of their battles against ecological and economic devastation before a tribunal of five eminent women judges," notes Vickers, 72. The Women's Action Agenda 21 was developed out of this testimony, and presented to the Conference, she adds. See Vickers, 72.

women together when she could not escape the blockade. She left asking God if this was a dream. Wanting to see if the man's words were true, she walked courageously through the blockade. Since then, she recounts that all of his promises have come true. In 1993, she and Ms. Ema, a Croatian woman, organized a women's conference for peace in Sarajevo in 1994 called Through Heart to Peace, attended by women from fifteen countries, followed by similar conferences in 1995 in 1996.<sup>75</sup>

We should not underestimate our actions as peacemakers and the potential of small organizations and communities to form powerful interstate and international collaboratives capable of transforming the world. Seemingly small and inconsequential actions can have unpredictable and profound effects, as the "butterfly effect," of chaos theory attests.<sup>76</sup> Leadership education for peacemaking can prepare women to create local and global systemic changes capable of sustaining and nourishing a peaceful world centered around the needs of healthy children, families, communities, environments, and nations.

---

<sup>75</sup> Esmuda Mujagic, according to Claske Franck, "Dreams of Peace from Bosnia," (courtesy of Pacem in Terris, Warwick, N.Y.), Integrities, 3015 Freedom Blvd., Watsonville, Calif., summer 1994, 4-5. See also "The Second Through Heart to Peace Conference of Women of the World: Sarajevo Medugorje, 1st June, 1995," 43, and Anabel Watson of Hazelwood House in So. Devon, "Through Heart to Peace, Journey to Bihac and Kljuc: October 1st and 2nd 1995," 40-42, "Communiqué from the Third Through Heart to Peace Conference of Women of the World in Sarajevo, May 28th, 1996," 45, all (courtesy of Pacem in Terris, Warwick, N. Y.), Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom, (winter 1995), available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).

<sup>76</sup> Raphael, Thealogy and Embodiment, 248-50.

## **Appendix A**

### **Interview Questions for the Newtown Florist Club Interview Study**

1. How did you first become involved in the Newtown Florist Club? When did you first become involved in the NFC?
2. What made you decide to become active in your community?
3. Do you see yourself as a leader? How do you see yourself exercising leadership in the NFC and in the community?
4. How would you describe your leadership style?
5. What characteristics do you feel, make someone an effective leader?
6. How do members of the NFC work together?
7. Are there any ways in which the leadership characteristics of the women in the NFC differ from the men's ways of exercising leadership? If so, how?
8. What do you feel are the most important things that the NFC does in this community?
9. What do you feel are the most important leadership qualities of the women in NFC?
10. What values and beliefs underlie your leadership style?
11. What values and beliefs do you think are most important to the NFC?
12. What connections do you see between the leadership characteristics, values, and beliefs of the NFC and the historic values, characteristics, and beliefs of the African-American community and its struggles for Civil Rights?
13. What leadership characteristics, values, and beliefs would you most like to pass on to younger women and young girls?
14. Historical Memories of the Newtown Community. [This information was primarily for archival purposes]



## **Appendix B**

### **Skills Involved in Awareness of Feelings**

An awareness of one's own feelings may include the following skills, which are components of self-empathy:

1. The ability to feel one's own feelings.<sup>1</sup>
2. The ability to hold side-by-side multiple, and often conflicting, feelings about a particular situation or person, the self, etc.<sup>2</sup>
3. The ability to consider one's own feelings, thoughts, intuitions, and spiritual awarenesses in balanced relation to one another; and to make conscious choices about how deeply one goes into one's feelings, thoughts, or intuitions, for how long, and under what circumstances.<sup>3</sup>
4. The ability to distinguish between one's own feelings and someone else's feelings.<sup>4</sup>
5. The ability to distinguish between one's immediate feelings and one's deeper feelings. For instance, anger may be an immediate feeling, underneath which might be loss, hurt, fear of abandonment or disappointment, etc.<sup>5</sup>
6. The ability to recognize the connections between feelings and needs. Feelings help us know ourselves, love ourselves, and recognize and care about our needs.
7. The ability to make fine distinctions between similar feelings. For instance, the difference between sadness, regret, emptiness, and poignancy--all of which could be evoked by a loss.
8. The ability to distinguish between feelings that relate to addictive patterns of avoidance; and feelings that relate to healthy, real needs.
9. The ability to listen to the Divine.

---

<sup>1</sup> Paula Reeves, 8-10, 22-24, describes the importance of being able to recognize one's feelings as do Jordan, "Empathy and Self Boundaries," 69; Stiver, "The Self-in-Relation: A Theory of Women's Development," 54-59; Schaef, 88-89.

<sup>2</sup> Ruddick, 66-70.

<sup>3</sup> Susan M. Perz, clinical counseling experiences as a long-term therapist, corporate employee assistance counselor, and high school guidance counselor, totaling over ten years of experience.

<sup>4</sup> Jordan, "Empathy and Self Boundaries," 69-70; Stiver, "The Self-in-Relation: A Theory of Women's Development," 55, both in Women's Growth in Diversity.

<sup>5</sup> Paula Reeves, 24-25, points out that "anger is always a secondary response. Some other emotion always precedes anger. It may be vulnerability or sadness or fright. Whatever the underlying feeling is, when you contain your anger and turn your attention to that preceding emotion, the intimacy of your relationship to yourself deepens.

**An awareness of one's feelings in relation to the feelings of others may include the following skills, which are components of empathy:**

- 1. The ability to temporarily feel someone else's feelings, and to imagine their situation.**
- 2. The ability to make conscious decisions regarding how deeply one identifies with others' feelings, thoughts, experiences, and point of view, and for how long and under what circumstances.**
- 3. The ability to compare one's own feelings and thoughts with those of someone else, noticing similarities and differences.**
- 4. The ability to recognize as real the feelings and thoughts of someone else even if one has never experienced those feelings or experiences**
- 5. The ability to recognize and honor the fact that the thoughts, feelings, experiences, and perspectives of another constitute a world view that may be different from one's own.**
- 6. The ability to hold side-by-side the feelings and thoughts of the self--and those of someone else--when they conflict.**
- 7. The ability to respect and value the feelings, thoughts, and points of view and those of others, recognizing that conflicting points of view can both be "right."**
- 8. The ability to recognize the connections between someone else's feelings and their needs, concerns, and desires.**
- 9. The ability to allow one's own feelings and thoughts as well as those of someone else to shape one's decisions and actions.**
- 10. The ability to dialogue between the needs of the self and others, and to balance the needs of the self and others.**
- 11. The ability to compare and synthesize the feelings, thoughts, and points of view of multiple others while respecting and valuing them.**
- 12. The ability to dialogue between and to balance the needs of self, others, systems, communities, structures, and contexts in multilayered configurations.**
- 13. The ability to distinguish between surface and deeper feelings, is crucial to distinguishing between surface desires, addictions, and deeper desires in others.**

## Appendix C

### The Problem-Solving Model<sup>6</sup>

1. What is the problem?

You may need to gather multiple perspectives on what the problem really is, because people may see the problem differently or may bring different aspects of the problem. If it is a big problem, you may want to break it down into phases: Phase 1, Phase 2, and Phase 3, for instance.

2. State the problem as your group has defined it.

3. Brainstorm together all possible ideas to address the problem.

Do not exclude any. No ideas are silly or ridiculous. Let your imagination explore new possibilities and creative solutions. Write all the possible answers down for everyone to see.

4. What is your first step?

Decide together on your first step. It could be gathering more information about the problem, or working on the first step of the first Phase of the problem.

5. Make an outline of the steps that need to be taken next. Sometimes you have to do the first step before you know what the second step is going to be.

6. Break down the steps and have one person agree to be responsible for each step.

7. Develop a timeline in which each step should be completed.

8. Set a time relatively soon in which you will meet to discuss your progress and difficulties.

---

<sup>6</sup> Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 92-98; Counselor Education Program, Education Department, University of Florida, Gainesville, FL.

## **Appendix D**

### **El Pecho de Mi Madre**

Fue como aprendi la redondez de la luna, del sol y los planetas.  
Tocando lo suave y tierno de su piel, entendi lo suave y tierno de mi ser.

La leche que bebi, fue como un sumo de su ser,  
una experiencia que nunca olvidare,  
fue como la vida se formo en mi ser.

Solo veia luz formando aquella redondez,  
intensa y suave a la misma vez.

Bebiendo la dulce leche de su ser,  
fue como hoy me hice mujer.

By Noris Binet<sup>7</sup>

### **My Mother's Breast**

It was how I learned  
the roundness of the moon, the sun and the planet earth.

Touching the softness and tenderness of her skin,  
is how I understood the softness and tenderness of myself.

I saw only light forming that roundness,  
strong and soft at the same time.

The milk that I drank, was like the essence of herself  
An experience that I will never forget.  
It was how life formed itself into myself.

Drinking the sweet milk of herself  
is how today I became a woman.

By Noris Binet<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>7</sup> Used by permission.

<sup>8</sup> Translated by Noris Binet; used by permission.

## Appendix E

### Ann Wimberly's Eight Dimensions of Liberation in Christian Education

In Soul Stories, Ann Wimberly describes eight dimensions of liberation, and leaves the door open for other dimensions which might also emerge.<sup>9</sup> These eight dimensions are summarized below. Wimberly notes that, just as people have ideas of what liberation is, they also have ideas of what it means to fall short of liberation, to continue on the journey, and seek direction.

Dimension One: Positive self-regard and self-valuing

Knowing one's life as a gift and oneself as a valued human being, rather than through the eyes of society.

Seeing oneself as created and valued by God--seeing one's identity in God.  
Liberation from self-denigration.

Dimension Two: Access to the basic survival necessities of life with human dignity and respect

Liberation from material need to material sustenance.

For many, there are blocks to attaining what is fully needed for individual and family survival and thriving.

Dimension Three: Equal participation and benefiting from political, occupational, educational, residential, health care, and civic systems of the community and nation.

Full participation in the social systems and structures that support community and national life.

Liberation from human disenfranchisement to human enfranchisement.

Dimension Four: Respectful and just treatment by others: friends, family, and others with whom people have daily contact

Positive valuing and positive regard from others.

The human realization of the value God places on us, and destroying factors that block this realization.

Dimension Five: Education, arriving at a vision for living, and empowering the self's ability to act

Creating possibilities for breaking out of narrow boundaries, knowledge, feelings.

Belief in one's ability to act.

Active learning, teaching, and arriving at a vision of one's life as a Christian.

Belief in the power of hope, and encouragement to do one's best in the face of adversity.

Dimension Six: Significant relationship

Sharing oneself and one's stories with others.

Valuing life as a gift worth sharing.

Sharing love in the family.

Doing right by others.

---

<sup>9</sup> Wimberly, 22-26.

**Dimension Seven: Religious transformation**

Allowing the self to be changed by God through relating with God and through the story of God and the good news of Jesus Christ in Scriptures.

Seeing the difference between life that does not work and life in positive relation to God, self, others, and all things.

Being clear that by the power of God, our lives are turned around.

**Dimension Eight: Recognition of human responsibility for contributing to the liberation of others**

Mutual caring.

Concerns and actions focused on the needs of others as well as the self.

Concern for neighborhood children and family, and communities, with an emphasis on education and responding to their needs.

## Appendix F

### **Appeal to Womanhood Throughout the World** **(Julia Ward Howe's Mother's Day Proclamation of 1870)**

"Arise then, Christian women of this day!"<sup>10</sup> began Julia Ward Howe's 1870 Mother's Day Proclamation. She implored women to declare, "We will not have questions decided by irrelevant agencies. Our husbands shall not come to us, reeking with carnage, for caresses and applause."<sup>11</sup> She declared that women will not allow their sons to be trained to unlearn charity and mercy, adding,

We, women of one country, will be too tender of those of another country to allow our sons to be trained to injure theirs. From the voice of the devastated Earth a voice goes up with our own. It says: "Disarm! Disarm!"<sup>12</sup>

Asserting that violence does not create justice, she urged women to leave their homes to advocate peace, as men have left their ploughs to fight in war.

Let them solemnly take counsel with each other as to the means whereby the great human family can live in peace, man as the brother of man, each bearing after his own kind the sacred impress, not of Caesar, but of God.<sup>13</sup>

She asked that a congress of women across nationalities meet "to promote the alliance of the different nationalities, the amicable settlement of international questions, the great and general interests of peace."<sup>14</sup>

---

<sup>10</sup> Julia Ward Howe, "Appeal to Womanhood Throughout the World," quoted in Laura E. Richards and Maude Howe Elliott, assisted by Florence Howe Hall, Julia Ward Howe 1819-1910 1-2 (Atlanta: Cherokee Publishing, 1990), 302-03, also available from Women's History website, <http://womenshistory.about.com>. Howe's 1870 Mother's Day Proclamation was originally made in speeches and pamphlets.

<sup>11</sup> Ibid.

<sup>12</sup> Ibid.

<sup>13</sup> Ibid.

<sup>14</sup> Julia Ward Howe, "Appeal to Womanhood Throughout the World," quoted in Laura E. Richards and Maude Howe Elliott, assisted by Florence Howe Hall, Julia Ward Howe 1819-1910 1-2 (Atlanta: Cherokee Publishing, 1990), 302-03, also available from Women's History website, <http://womenshistory.about.com>. Howe's 1870 Mother's Day Proclamation was originally made in speeches and pamphlets.

## **Appendix G**

### **A Community: Twelve Step Recovery Program**

**Developed by Helen Lewis<sup>15</sup>**

1. Understand your history--share memories.
2. Mobilize, organize, and revive community.
3. Profile and assess your local community.
4. Analyze and envision alternatives.
5. Educate the community.
6. Build confidence and pride.
7. Develop local projects.
8. Strengthen your organization.
9. Collaborate and build coalitions.
10. Take political power.
11. Initiate economic activity.
12. Enter local, regional, national, and international planning processes.

---

<sup>15</sup> Lewis, Rebuilding Communities: A 12 Step Recovery Program.



## **Appendix H**

### **Basic Standards of Community Health**

The following is a list of basic standards that can be applied to aid in assessing the health of a community. This list is a constructive synthesis of issues, concerns, and basic needs affecting families, communities, and environments which have been documented by numerous researchers. Nationwide, more and more communities are becoming concerned and adopting initiatives to support children, youth, and healthy families. This list of Basic Standards of Community Health attempts to address some of the root needs and deficits affecting the health of families and communities, rather than listing only symptomatic indicators such as test scores, child abuse statistics, or drug abuse rates. This list is not meant to be exhaustive, but to stimulate consideration of core needs and issues that point out local concerns that may require local and local-state, -national, and even -global solutions.

Once a community has done a thorough, inclusive assessment, it can make a case in solidarity with other communities, (at state, national, and global levels), that local community and family health become a number one priority for the United States, and for all nations working together collaboratively--and that state, national and global resources be reallocated accordingly. The field of community psychology can be a resource for this work. Community psychology "recognizes that many of the problems people confront arise not from disturbances within their individual psyches, but from the failures of community systems to adequately socialize and support its citizens," writes Marc Goldstein.<sup>16</sup>

---

<sup>16</sup> Marc B. Goldstein, "Community Psychology: The Career for Champions," Eye on Psychi. Chi., winter 1998, 20-21, 42. For more information, see Graduate Study in Psychology, published by the American Psychological Association, and check the index under community, clinical-community, community-rural, community-school, community-clinical, and other such key works. See also the survey of graduate programs published in The Community Psychologist available from [meissen@twsum.uc.twsu.edu](mailto:meissen@twsum.uc.twsu.edu); and C. O'Donnell and J. Ferrari, eds., Education in Community Psychology: Models for Graduate and Undergraduate Programs (Haworth Press, 1997), available by calling (607) 722-5857, ext. 321.

### **Standards**

--Percentage of residents with access to basic social services, for instance: quality affordable health care (i.e. through local health care co-ops,) affordable housing, social services such as medical, mental health and addiction treatment, (not just crisis intervention,) affordable in-home nursing care, quality affordable nursing homes and assisted living.<sup>17</sup>

--Percentage of residents (by gender and race/ethnicity,) who can support themselves reasonably well by working a forty hour work-week. (Current poverty levels are set too low.)<sup>18</sup>

--Equal access and funding for education, i.e. educational funds are distributed equally throughout the national on a per capita basis, rather than in proportion to the area's tax base; diversity of teachers, counselors, administration, and students in public schools; lower student-teacher ratios, (1-15), student-school counselor ratios, (1-100), and a school nurse in every school; multicultural education including understanding of world religions incorporated into all grade levels.

--Percentage of students and adults who can read.

--Annual studies of illness and mortality by residence and employment, analyzed in comparison with industry locations, and air, water, and soil testing as needed. Proximity of neighborhoods to industry. Appropriate cleanup efforts and any needed relocation of affected households accomplished promptly, (through local, state, and federal government funds,) particularly in communities of color where industry and toxic dumping is often concentrated.<sup>19</sup>

--Percentage of renewable energy consumed; elimination of all nuclear power

---

<sup>17</sup> Childs, 48-61; and Barbara Lee, H.R.3000 "To establish a United States Health Service to provide high quality comprehensive health care for all Americans and to overcome the deficiencies in the present system of health care delivery," 1 Oct. 1999, (legislation on-line), available from: <http://www.thomas.loc.gov>. Rep. Lee's bill was referred to the Subcommittee on Health and Environment. See also Homes and Hands: Community Land Trusts in Action.

<sup>18</sup> Bobbi Murray, "Living Wage Comes of Age: An Increasingly Sophisticated Movement Has Put Opponents on the Defensive," The Nation, 23 July 2001, 24-28; Ehrenreich, 197-99.

<sup>19</sup> Townes, 56-57. See also Scorecard, an environmental site providing statistics on air, water, and soil pollution all over the U.S., by Environmental Defense, Washington, D.C., available from <http://www.scorecard.org>. Information is listed by zip code and by industry.

facilities; promptness of phaseout of fossil fuel energy sources.<sup>20</sup>

--Restoration of local endangered species, habitats, and migration routes.<sup>21</sup>

--The establishment of youth recreation centers and programs with adequate staff and multicultural programming.

--Safe neighborhoods, to be determined by appropriate measures, including white collar crime, street crime, drug sales, and prostitution.

--Rehabilitative, nonpunitive systems for drug users.

--Rehabilitative, restrictive systems for criminal offenders and drug sellers that include quality medical care; elimination of corporate prisons.<sup>22</sup>

--Comprehensive support for expecting parents, including expanded flex-time benefits allowing each parent to work half-time during the first three years of life while earning a livable income, uncancellable medical coverage that includes birthing centers providing water births and natural childbirth, breastfeeding consultants,

---

<sup>20</sup> Matt Bivens, "Fighting for America's Energy Independence," The Nation, 15 April 2002, 11-14; Tom Lent, Energy for Employment: How to Heat Up the Economy Not the Planet (San Francisco: Greenpeace, 1992). Nuclear accidents and nuclear waste disposal problems are described by Peter H. Raven and Linda R. Berg, Environment, 3rd ed. (Orlando, Fla.: Harcourt College Publishers, 2001), 253-64. Energy Secretary Bill Richardson stated in January 2000 that workers in nuclear plants have gotten cancer from radiation exposure at work, according to a Women's International League for Peace and Freedom (WILPF) fact sheet, "Health Effects and the Nuclear Age: Making the Connections," (articles on-line); posted winter 2000, available from [www.reachingcriticalwill.org](http://www.reachingcriticalwill.org), citing the following: Arjun Makhijani, Howard Hu, Katherine Yih, eds., Nuclear Wastelands: A Global Guide to Nuclear Weapons Production and Its Health and Environmental Effects (written in association with the Special Commission of International Physicians for the Prevention of Nuclear War and the Institute for Energy and Environmental Research), (Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1995); Permanent People's Tribunal International Medical Commission on Chernobyl, Chernobyl: Environmental, Health and Human Rights Implications Vienna, Austria, 12-15 April 1996; Jacob Shapiro, ed., Radiation Protection: A Guide for Scientists and Physicians (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1990); Matthew L. Wald, "U.S. Acknowledges Radiation Killed Weapons Workers," New York Times, 29 January 2000; Eileen Welsome, The Plutonium Files (New York: Dial Press, 1999).

<sup>21</sup> David W. Orr, Ecological Literacy: Education and the Transition to a Postmodern World (Albany: The State University of New York Press, 1994), 3-5 .

<sup>22</sup> Neglectful and inadequate medical care in many prisons, especially women's prisons is documented by Cynthia Cooper, writing in The Nation. Cynthia Cooper, "A Cancer Grows: Medical Treatment in Women's Prisons Ranges from Brutal to Nonexistent," The Nation, 6 May 2002, 30-34. The conflicts of interest which threaten human rights and corrupt justice through corporate "profiteering from the imprisonment of human beings" are documented by the nonprofit organization Grassroots Leadership, "Strategic Analysis: Stopping For-Profit Private Prisons," a report, 2001, also available on-line from <http://www.grasslead.org>; also documented in Domini, 56-57.

duelas, midwives, mother's in-home helpers, and other services; also, government funded Mother's Centers and quality affordable daycare.<sup>23</sup>

--Access to newspapers, radio, and television news sources that are publicly owned and operated, rather by corporations or sole proprietors.<sup>24</sup>

--Access to a family-centered interdenominational multifaith peace and justice center or other peace and justice education collaboratives.

--Percentage of individually-owned small businesses compared with corporations and chain businesses.

--Use of local legal currencies.<sup>25</sup>

--Local ordinances outlawing chain businesses.

--Percentage of banks that are local and invest in local businesses.<sup>26</sup>

--Availability of credit unions.

--Number of persons who are homeless.

--Equal accessibility to the arts and quality parks.

--Use of district voting and representation of diverse communities and groups in all levels of government.

--Segregation rates of neighborhoods.

--Equal salaries and incomes across racial/ethnic and gender differences.

--Percentage of young adults entering social services occupations or small businesses needed by the community.

--Conversion rates of military bases, personnel, and resources to nonmilitary functions that benefit social structures and the environment.<sup>27</sup>

---

<sup>23</sup> A duela is a woman who stays by the side of a woman giving birth through labor and delivery. The presence of duelas has been shown to shorten labor, ease delivery, and sometimes shorten the time before colostrum is available to the baby. John H. Kennell and Marshall H. Klaus, "Early Mother-Infant Contact: Effects on Breastfeeding," in *International Conference on Human Lactation, Breastfeeding and Food Policy in a Hungry World*, 208; Belenky, Bond, and Weinstock, 180-201.

<sup>24</sup> Clarke and the IFG, 9, 15-16; "What's Fair?" (brochure) Fairness and Accuracy in Reporting (FAIR), New York.

<sup>25</sup> Miyoko Sakashita, "Localizers: The Community Currency Alternative," *IFG News*, San Francisco, International Forum on Globalization (IFG), summer 1997, 12-13.

<sup>26</sup> Amy Domini, 107-26; Korten, 4-7.

<sup>27</sup> Vickers, 73-76

--Conversion of weapons factories and related military industries to nonmilitary functions that benefit the social structure and environment.

--At the federal level, rates of disarmament of weapons of war, as well as restricting availability of weapons of war such as assault rifles and machine guns in local communities through gun control and other means.

--Support for the creation of a Department of Peace to utilize diplomatic negotiation in prevention of war.<sup>28</sup>

--Local laws banning corporate lobbying at any level of government; persons violating such laws can be prosecuted for national lobbying by their state of residence and other cooperating states.<sup>29</sup>

--Access to organic foods and non-sweatshop-, U.S.-made products.<sup>30</sup>

--Locally enforced product labeling requirements regarding genetically engineered foods; and prosecution for irresponsible lack of containment of genetically modified crops that corrupt organic and conventional crops.<sup>31</sup>

--Local bans on products made in sweatshops.<sup>32</sup>

--Accessible public transportation and innovative transportation initiatives.

--Laws that cap salaries of CEO and other corporate officials and "tie them to a ratio of average compensation levels of production workers," for instance, 5:1 or 10:1, rather than 500:1.<sup>33</sup>

--Living wage laws that pertain not only to companies receiving government subsidies or contracts, but are citywide.<sup>34</sup>

---

<sup>28</sup> Dennis Kucinich, H.R. 2459 "To establish a Department of Peace," 11 July 2001, (legislation on-line), available from <http://www.thomas.loc.gov>.

<sup>29</sup> Jane Anne Morris, (Wisconsin Campaign), "America Needs a Law Prohibiting Corporate Donations," Synthesis/Regeneration 9: A Magazine of Green Social Thought, winter 1996, 37-38.

<sup>30</sup> Kahn and Bailey, 53-90; The Working Group on the WTO/MAI, A Citizens' Guide to the World Trade Organization: Everything You Need to Know to Fight for Fair Trade, (pamphlet on-line), posted on July 1999, available from <http://www.tradewatch.org>, 1-16.

<sup>31</sup> Ibid.

<sup>32</sup> Ibid.

<sup>33</sup> Program on Corporations, Law, and Democracy, "The Struggle for Democratic Control of Corporations: Taking the Offensive," (flyer), Feb. 1996.

<sup>34</sup> Murray, "Living Wage Comes of Age," 24-26.

## Bibliography

### Anthropology

#### **Menstruation**

- Buckley, Thomas, and Alma Gottlieb, eds. Blood Magic: The Anthropology of Menstruation. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988.
- Grahn, Judy. Blood, Bread, and Roses: How Menstruation Created the World. Boston: Beacon Press, 1993.
- Knight, Christopher. Blood Relations: Menstruation and the Origins of Culture. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1991.
- Reeves, Paula M. Women's Intuition: Unlocking the Wisdom of the Body. Berkeley: Conari Press, 1999.
- Shuttle, Penelope, and Peter Redgrove. The Wise Wound: Menstruation and EveryWoman. New York: Marion Boyars Publishers, 1999.
- Smith, David. Conversation with author; Gainesville, Ga., 2001.
- Taylor, Dena. Red Flower. Freedom, Calif.: The Crossing Press, 1988.
- Weideger, Paula. Menstruation and Menopause: The Physiology and Psychology, the Myth and the Reality. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1975.

#### **Sexuality**

- Douglas, Kelly Brown. Sexuality and the Black Church: A Womanist Perspective. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1999.
- Douglas, Lisa, and Marsha Douglas. "Astonishing Facts That Will Change Your Sex-Life Forever." New Woman, July 1977, 86.
- Kaplan, Helen. The New Sex Therapy. New York: Brunner/Mazel, 1974.
- Lebacqz, Karen, and Ronald G. Barton. Sex in the Parish. Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 1991.
- Love, Patricia, and Jo Robinson. Hot Monogamy: Essential Steps to More Passionate, Intimate Lovemaking. New York: Plume, Penguin Books, U.S.A., 1995.
- Rountree, Cathleen. Coming Into Our Fullness: On Women Turning Forty. Freedom Calif.: Crossing Press, 1991.
- Scantling, Sandra, and Sue Browder. Ordinary Women, Extraordinary Sex: Every Woman's Guide to Pleasure and Beyond. New York: Dutton, 1993.
- Shilts, Randy. And the Band Played On: Politics, People, and the AIDS Epidemic. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1987.
- Steinberg, David, ed. The Erotic Impulse: Honoring the Sensual Self. Los Angeles, J.P. Tarcher/Perigee, 1992.

#### **Conception, Pregnancy and Childbirth**

- Eisenberg, Arlene, Heidi E. Murkoff, and Sandee E. Hathaway. What to Expect When You're Expecting. New York: Workman Publishing, 1996.
- Gaskin, Ina May. Spiritual Midwifery. 3rd ed. Summertown, Tenn.: Book Publishing Company, 1990.
- Gentry, Jerry. Grady Baby: A Year in the Life of Atlanta's Grady Hospital. Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 1999.
- Leifer, Myra. Psychological Effects of Motherhood: A Study of First Pregnancy. New York: Praeger Publishers, 1980.
- Perz, Marian T. Conversation with author regarding folk saying; 1968.

### **Breastfeeding**

- Binet, Noris. "El Pecho de Mi Madre" ("My Mother's Breast.") Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom (winter 1995): 62.
- Gaskin, Ina May. Babies, Breastfeeding, and Bonding. South Hadley, Mass.: Bergin and Garvey Publishers, 1987.
- Nestler, Mary June. "Birth of Compassion." School of Theology at Claremont Occasional Paper. April 1995, 1-3.
- International Conference on Human Lactation (1977). Breastfeeding and Food Policy in a Hungry World. Ed. Dana Raphael. New York: Academic Press, 1979.

### **Mothering**

- Accardo, Pasquale J., ed. Failure to Thrive in Infancy and Early Childhood: A Multidisciplinary Team Approach. Baltimore: University Park Press, 1982.
- Miller-McLemore, Bonnie J. Also a Mother: Work and Family as a Theological Dilemma. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1994.
- Painter, Nell Irvin. Sojourner Truth: A Life, A Symbol. New York: W. W. Norton, 1996.
- Ruddick, Sara. Maternal Thinking: Toward a Politics of Peace. Boston: Beacon Press, 1989.

### **Sexual Abuse and Violence**

- Bass, Ellen, and Laura Davis. The Courage to Heal: A Guide for Women Survivors of Child Sexual Abuse. New York: Perennial Library, 1988.
- Women for Women in Bosnia. "Mass Rape: Natural, Cultural, or Social?" Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom (1996): 47-52; available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).

### **Female Genital Mutilation**

- Daly, Mary. Gyn/Ecology: The Metaethics of Radical Feminism. Boston: Beacon Press, 1990.
- Lightfoot-Klein, Hanny. Prisoners of Ritual: An Odyssey into Female Genital Circumcision in Africa. New York: Haworth Press, 1989.
- Toubia, Nahid. Female Genital Mutilation: A Call for Global Action. Rev. ed. New York: Rainbo, 1995.

### **Ancient Goddess Artifacts and Conceptual Systems**

- Eisler, Riane. Sacred Pleasure: Sex, Myth, and the Politics of the Body--New Paths to Power and Love. San Francisco: HarperCollins Publishers, 1996.
- Gimbutas, Marija. The Language of the Goddess. New York: Harper and Row Publishers, 1989.
- Patai, Raphael. The Hebrew Goddess. Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1967.
- Pearson, Ann. "Goddess Rhetoric in Medieval Iconography: Black Virgins, Mermaids, and Sheela-Na-Gigs." Paper presented at the American Academy of Religion, Philadelphia, Pa., 1995.
- Sjoo, Monica, and Barbara Mor. The Great Cosmic Mother: Rediscovering the Religion of the Earth. 2nd ed. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1991.

### **Medicine**

- Haas, Elson M., and Cameron Stauth. The False Fat Diet. New York: Ballantine Books, 2001.
- Hahn, Robert A., Elaine Eaker, Nancy D. Barker, Steven M. Teutsch, Waldemar Sosniak, and Nancy Krieger. "Poverty and Death in the United States--1973 and 1991." Epidemiology 6, no. 5 (Sept. 1991): 490-97.
- Hahn, Robert A., and Steven Eberhardt. "Life Expectancy in Four U.S. Racial/Ethnic Populations: 1990." Epidemiology 6, no. 4 (July 1995): 350-55.
- Kardestuncer, Tarik, and Howard Frumkin. "Systemic Lupus Erythematosus in Relation to Environmental Pollution: An Investigation in an African-American Community in North Georgia." Archives of Environmental Health 52, no. 2 (March/April 1997): 85-90.
- Northrup, Christiane. Women's Bodies, Women's Wisdom. New York: Bantam Books, 1990.
- Physicians for Social Responsibility, (U.S. Affiliate of International Physicians for the Prevention of Nuclear War). Asthma and the Role of Air Pollution: What the Primary Care Physician Should Know. University of Maryland School of Medicine, Environmental Health Education Center, Washington, D.C., 1997.
- Siegel, Bernie. Love, Medicine and Miracles: Lessons Learned about Self-Healing from a Surgeon's Experience with Exceptional Patients. New York: Harper Trade, 1991.

### **Psychology**

#### **European American Women's Psychologies**

- Jordan, Judith V., et. al. Women's Growth in Connection: Writings from the Stone Center. New York: Guilford Press, 1991.
- Miller, Jean Baker. Toward a New Psychology of Women. Boston: Beacon Press, 1976.
- Pettit, Rhonda. Conversation with author; 2001.
- Saussy, Carroll. God Images and Self Esteem: Empowering Women in a Patriarchal Society. Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1991.
- Ulanov, Ann Belford. The Feminine in Jungian Psychology and Christian Theology. Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1970.
- Washbourn, Penelope. Becoming Woman: The Quest for Wholeness in Female Experience. New York: Harper and Row Publishers, 1977.

#### **Diverse Psychologies**

- Gilligan, James. Violence: Reflections on a National Epidemic. New York: Vintage Books, 1996.
- Hingsburger, Dave. "Ring of Safety," Paper presented at the Sixth Annual Institute on Dual Diagnosis Conference, Chapel Hill, North Carolina, 28 July 1999.
- Jordan, Judith, ed., Women's Growth in Diversity: More Writings from the Stone Center. New York: Guilford Press, 1997.
- Matsumoto, David. Culture and Psychology: People Around the World. Delmar, Calif.: Wadsworth Thomson Learning, 2000.



### **African and African American Psychologies**

- Myers, Linda James. "The Deep Structure of Culture: Relevance of Traditional African Culture in Contemporary Life." Journal of Black Studies 18, no. 1 (Sept. 1987): 72-85.
- Myers, Linda James. Understanding an Afrocentric World View: Introduction to an Optimal Psychology. Dubuque, Iowa: Kendall/Hunt Publishing, 1993.
- Nobles, Wade W. "Extended Self: Rethinking the So-Called Negro Self-Concept." Paper presented to the National Association of Black Psychologists Convention, Aug. 1974, published in Journal of Black Psychology, 2, no. 2 (1976): 15-24.

### **Counselor Education**

- Abrams, Grace C., and Fran C. Schmidt. Activities for Exploring Conflict and Aggression. Portland, Maine: J. Weston Walch Publisher, 1978.
- Burgess, Ann Wolbert, and Aaron Lazare. Community Mental Health: Target Populations. Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice-Hall, 1976.
- Egan, Gerard. The Skilled Helper: A Model for Systematic Helping and Interpersonal Relating. Monterey, Calif.: Brooks/Cole Publishing, 1975.
- Glasser, William. Reality Therapy: A New Approach to Psychiatry. New York: HarperCollins, 1989.
- Goldstein, Marc B. "Community Psychology: The Career for Champions," Eye on Psychi Chi, winter 1998, 20-21, 42.
- Morganett, Rosemarie S. Skills for Living: Group Counseling Activities for Young Adolescents. Champaign, Ill.: Research Press, 1989.
- Myrick, Robert D., and Tom Erney. Caring and Sharing: Becoming a Peer Facilitator. 2nd ed. Minneapolis: Educational Media Corp., 2000.
- Wittmer, Joe, and Robert D. Myrick. Facilitative Teaching: Theory and Practice. Minneapolis: Educational Media Corp., 1980.

### **Women and Moral Development**

- Belenky, Mary Field, Blythe McVicker Clinchy, Nancy Rule Goldberger, and Jill Mattuck Tarule. Women's Ways of Knowing. New York: Basic Books, 1986.
- Gilligan, Carol. In a Different Voice. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982.

### **Archetypal Theory**

- Jung, Carl G. Four Archetypes. Collected Works, v.9, pt.1. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1969.
- . Memories, Dreams, Reflections. Rev. ed. New York: Vintage Books, 1973.
- . The Portable Jung. Ed. Joseph Campbell. Trans. R.F.C. Hull. New York: Penguin Books, 1976.
- . Psychology and Western Religion. Trans. R.F.C. Hull. Bollingen Series. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984.
- . The Secret of the Golden Flower: A Chinese Book of Life. Trans. Richard Wilhelm. Commentary by C.G. Jung. London: Kegan Paul, Tench, Trubner and Co., 1983.
- Lauter, Estella, and Carol Schreier Rupprecht. Feminist Archetypal Theory: Interdisciplinary Revisions of Jungian Thought. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1985.

### **Women's Leadership**

- Ah Nee-Benham, Maenette K.P., and Joanne E. Cooper. Let My Spirit Soar!: Narratives of Diverse Women in School Leadership. Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Corwin Press, 1998.
- Beckman, Peter R., and Francine D'Amico, eds. Women, Gender, and World Politics: Perspectives, Policies, and Prospects. Westport, Conn: Bergin and Garvey, 1994.
- Belenky, Mary Field, Lynne A. Bond, and Jacqueline S. Weinstock. A Tradition That Has No Name: Nurturing the Development of People, Families, and Communities. New York: Basic Books, 1997.
- Center for the American Woman and Politics. "CAWP Fact Sheet: Women in the U.S. Senate, 1975-1995." New Brunswick, N. J.: Center for the American Woman and Politics, Rutgers University, 1995.
- — —. "CAWP Fact Sheet: Women of Color in Elected Office, 1996." New Brunswick, N. J.: Center for the American Woman and Politics, Rutgers University, 1995.
- D'Amico, Francine, and Peter R. Beckman, eds. Women in World Politics: An Introduction. Westport, Conn.: Bergin and Garvey, 1995.
- Gill, LaVerne McCain. African American Women in Congress: Forming and Transforming History. New Brunswick, N. J.: Rutgers University Press, 1997.
- Hartman, Mary S., ed. Talking Leadership: Conversations with Powerful Women. New Brunswick, N. J.: Rutgers University Press, 1999.
- Hurty, Kathryn R. "Women in the Principal's Office: Perspectives on Leadership and Power." Ph.D. diss., University of California, Berkeley, 1985.
- Look at the World Through Women's Eyes, NGO Forum on Women, Huairou, China, August 30-September 8, 1995. Produced by Karen Hessel. 22 min. National Council of Churches on behalf of the U.S. Ecumenical Women's Network: Beijing and Beyond, 1996. Videocassette.
- McKenzie, Vashti M. Not Without a Struggle: Leadership Development for African American Women in Ministry. Cleveland: United Church Press, 1996.
- Parks, Rosa, with Gregory J. Reed. Quiet Strength: The Faith, the Hope, and the Heart of a Woman Who Changed a Nation. Grand Rapids, Mi.: Zondervan Publishing House, 1994.
- Regan, Helen B., and Gwen H. Brooks. Out of Women's Experience: Creating Relational Leadership. Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Corwin Press, 1995.
- Rosenthal, Cindy Simon. When Women Lead: Integrative Leadership in State Legislatures. New York: Oxford University Press, 1998.
- Winslow, Anne, ed. Women, Politics, and the United Nations. Contributions in Women's Studies, 151. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1995.
- Wolf, Naomi. Fire with Fire: The New Female Power and How It Will Change the 21st Century. New York: Random House, 1993.
- Women's International League for Peace and Freedom. "103rd Congress Enacts Record Number of Measures of Women." UPDATE on Women and Family Issues in Congress, Sept.-Oct., 1994.
- — —. "World Women's Conference." International Peace Update Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, Nov. 1995.

## **Theology and Theology**

### **Embodiment**

- Baker-Fletcher, Karen, and Garth Kasimu Baker-Fletcher. My Sister, My Brother: Womanist and Xodus God-Talk. Maryknoll, N. Y.: Orbis Books, 1997.
- Daly, Mary. Pure Lust: Elemental Feminist Philosophy. San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1992.
- Gudorf, Christine E. Body, Sex, and Pleasure: Reconstructing Christian Sexual Ethics. Cleveland: Pilgrim Press, 1994.
- Kendrick, Leslie. "The Theological Implications of Female Embodiment." Ph.D. diss., Southern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1991.
- Nelson, James B. Between Two Gardens: Reflections on Sexuality and Religious Experience. New York: Pilgrim Press, 1983.
- — —. Body Theology. Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1992.
- — —. Embodiment: An Approach to Sexuality and Christian Theology. Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1978.
- — —. The Intimate Connection: Male Sexuality and Masculine Spirituality. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1988.
- Raphael, Melissa. Theology and Embodiment: The Post-Patriarchal Reconstruction of Female Sacrality. Sheffield, England: Sheffield Academic Press, 1996.

### **The Erotic**

- Brock, Rita Nakashima. Journeys by Heart: A Christology of Erotic Power. New York: Crossroad Publishing, 1988.
- Collins, Patricia Hill. Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness, and the Politics of Empowerment. New York: Routledge, 1990.
- Heyward, Carter. The Redemption of God: A Theology of Mutual Relation. Washington, D.C.: University Press of America, 1982.
- — —. Touching Our Strength: The Erotic as Power and the Love of God. San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1989.
- Starhawk. Dreaming the Dark: Magic, Sex and Politics. Boston: Beacon Press, 1997.
- — —. Spiral Dance: A Rebirth of the Ancient Religion of the Great Goddess. New York: Harper Collins Publishers, 1989.
- Walker, Alice. The Color Purple. New York: Pocket Books, 1982.

### **Image of God**

- Daly, Mary. Beyond God the Father: Toward a Philosophy of Women's Liberation. Boston: Beacon Press, 1973.
- Goudey, June Christine. "Atonement Imagery and Eucharistic Praxis in the Reformed Tradition: A Feminist Critique." Ph.D. diss. Boston University, 1993.
- Gutierrez, Gustavo. The God of Life. Trans. Matthew J. O'Connell. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1991.
- Heyward, Isabel Carter. The Redemption of God: A Theology of Mutual Relation. Washington, D.C.: University Press of America, 1982.
- McFague, Sallie. The Body of God: An Ecological Theology. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993.
- — —. Models of God: Theology for an Ecological, Nuclear Age. Philadelphia:

Fortress Press, 1987.

Ruether, Rosemary Radford. Sexism and God-Talk: Toward a Feminist Theology. Boston: Beacon Press, 1983.

Wiley, Christine. "Faith Journey: How Black Women See God, Womanist Theology in Action." Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom (winter 1995): 13-20; available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).

### **Theology and Peacemaking**

Anzaldua, Gloria. Borderlands: The New Mestiza, La Frontera. San Francisco: Spinsters/Aunt Lute, 1987.

---. Making Face: Making Soul, Haciendo Caras: Creative and Critical Perspectives by Feminists of Color. San Francisco: Aunt Lute Foundation Books, 1990.

Aquino, Maria Pilar. Our Cry for Life: Feminist Theology from Latin America. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1993.

Baker-Fletcher, Karen. A Singing Something: Womanist Reflections on Anna Julia Cooper. New York: Crossroads Publishing, 1994.

Couture, Pamela D. Blessed Are the Poor. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1991.

---. Seeing Children, Seeing God: A Practical Theology of Children and Poverty. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 2000.

Elizondo, Virgil. The Future is Mestizo: Life Where Cultures Meet. New York: Crossroad Publishing, 1992.

Heyward, Carter. Our Passion for Justice: Images of Power, Sexuality, and Liberation. New York: Pilgrim Press, 1984.

Isasi-Diaz, Ada Maria. En la Lucha, In the Struggle: Elaborating A Mujerista Theology: A Hispanic Women's Liberation Theology. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993.

King, Ursula, ed. Feminist Theology from the Third World: A Reader. Maryknoll, N. Y.: Orbis Books, 1994.

Moore, Mary Elizabeth, and Beth Gardner, eds. Gatherings: Women's Resources for Theology and Celebration. Atlanta: Candler School of Theology, 2000.

Moraga, Cherrie, and Gloria Anzaldua, eds. This Bridge Called My Back: Writings by Radical Women of Color. New York: Kitchen Table, Women of Color Press, 1983.

Partnoy, Alicia. You Can't Drown the Fire: Latin American Women Writing in Exile. Pittsburgh: Cleis Press, 1988.

Riggs, Marcia Y. Awake, Arise, and Act: A Womanist Call for Black Liberation. Cleveland: Pilgrim Press, 1994.

Ruether, Rosemary Radford. New Woman; New Earth: Sexist Ideologies and Human Liberation. Minneapolis: Winston Press, 1975.

Williams, Delores S. "A Crucifixion Doublecross? The Violence of Our Images May Do More Harm Than Good." The Other Side 29 (1993): 25-27.

---. Sisters in the Wilderness: The Challenge of Womanist God-Talk. Maryknoll, N. Y.: Orbis Books, 1993.

---. "Violence Against God: Church Burnings, White Supremacy, and the Signature of Sin." The Other Side, Sept.-Oct. 1996, 19-20.

### **Spirituality**

Brennan, Barbara Ann. Hands of Light: A Guide to Healing Through the Human Energy Field. New York: Bantam Books, 1987.

- Chopra, Deepak. The Path to Love: Renewing the Power of Spirit in Your Life. New York: Harmony Books, 1997.
- Duerk, Judith. Circle of Stones: Woman's Journey to Herself. San Diego: LuraMedia, 1989.
- Fox, Matthew. Original Blessing: A Primer in Creation Spirituality. Santa Fe: Bear and Company, 1983.
- Harris, Maria. Dance of the Spirit: The Seven Steps of Women's Spirituality. New York: Bantam Books, 1989.
- Perz, Susan M. "You Are My Beloved Daughters." World Federation of Methodist Women Spiritual Growth Manual, Weaving Together in Spirit. Ireland, (July, 1998).
- Procter-Smith, Marjorie. Praying with Our Eyes Open: Engendering Feminist Liturgical Prayer. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1995.
- St. Romain, Philip. Kundalini Energy and Christian Spirituality: A Pathway to Growth and Healing. New York: Crossword Publishing, 1991.
- Sanford, Agnes. Healing Gifts of the Spirit. New York: HarperSanFrancisco, 1966.
- Townes, Emily M. "And All the Colored Folks is Cursed," (Martin Luther King, Jr. Lecture. Claremont School of Theology, Claremont, Calif., Feb. 1996).
- . In a Blaze of Glory: Womanist Spirituality as Social Witness. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1995.
- Weber, Christin Lore. WomanChrist: A New Vision of Feminist Spirituality. San Francisco: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1987.

### **Biblical Scholarship**

- The Bible: Revised Standard Version (Camden, N.J.: Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1952).
- Bynum, Caroline Walker. Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1982.
- Crockett, Joseph V. Teaching Scripture from an African-American Perspective. Nashville: Discipleship Resources, 1990.
- Johnson, Elizabeth. She Who Is: The Mystery of God in Feminist Theological Discourse. N.Y.: Crossroad Publishing, 1992.
- Meehan, Bridget Mary. Exploring the Feminine Face of God: A Prayerful Journey. Kansas City, Mo.: Sheed and Ward, 1991.
- Ryrie, Charles Caldwell. Ryrie Study Bible: New International Version. Chicago: Moody Press, 1986.
- Fiorenza, Elisabeth Schussler. In Memory of Her: A Feminist Theological Reconstruction of Christian Origins. N.Y.: Crossroads Publishing, 1983.
- The Song of Songs: A New Translation. Introduction and commentary by Ariel Bloch and Chana Bloch. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998.
- Trible, Phyllis. God and the Rhetoric of Sexuality: Overtures to Biblical Theology. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1978.
- . Texts of Terror: Literary-Feminist Readings of Biblical Narratives. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1984.
- Wink, Walter. Transforming Bible Study: A Leader's Guide. Nashville, Abingdon Press, 1980.

## **Education**

### **Religious Education**

- Coe, George Albert. Education in Religion and Morals. Chicago: Fleming H. Revell, 1904.
- — —. A Social Theory of Religious Education. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1917.
- — —. What Is Christian Education? New York: Charles Scribner Sons, 1929.
- Conde-Frazier, Elizabeth. Assistant Professor of Religious Education at Claremont School of Theology, Calif. Telephone interview by author, 2000. Written notes. Gainesville, Ga.
- Harris, Maria. Fashion Me a People: Curriculum in the Church. Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1989.
- — —. Teaching and Religious Imagination: An Essay in the Theology of Teaching. New York: Harper Collins Publishers, 1987.
- Moore, Mary Elizabeth. Education for Continuity and Change: A New Model for Christian Religious Education. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1983.
- — —. Teaching from the Heart: Theology and Educational Method. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1991.
- Noddings, Nel. Caring: A Feminine Approach to Ethics and Moral Education. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984.
- Suchocki, Marjorie. Claremont School of Theology chapel speech, Claremont, Calif., fall 1995.
- Weiler, Kathleen. Women Teaching for Change: Gender, Class and Power. South Hadley, Mass.: Bergin and Garvey Publishers, 1988.
- Wimberly, Ann Streaty. Soul Stories: African American Christian Education. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1994.

### **Education; Feminist and Critical Pedagogy**

- Abdul-Aleem, Mustafa. "The Sound of Children Learning: My Experience Playing Afrikan Drums in the Schools." Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom (1996): 207-09; available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).
- Darder, Antonia. Culture and Power in the Classroom. New York: Bergin and Garvey, 1991.
- Forrester, John, ed. Critical Theory and Public Life. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1985.
- Freire, Paulo. Education for Critical Consciousness. New York: Continuum Publishing, 1998.
- — —. Pedagogy of the Oppressed. New York: Continuum Publishing Company, 1993.
- Giroux, Henry A. Schooling and the Struggle for Public Life: Critical Pedagogy in the Modern Age. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1988.
- Hooks, Bell. Teaching to Transgress: Education as the Practice of Freedom. New York: Routledge, 1994.
- Luke, Carmen, and Jennifer Gore, eds. Feminisms and Critical Pedagogy. New York: Routledge, 1992.
- Orr, David W. Earth in Mind: On Education, Environment, and the Human Prospect. Washington, D.C.: Island Press, 1994.
- — —. Ecological Literacy: Education and the Transition to a Postmodern World. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1992.
- Roberts, Karen. "Uhuru Dance Company." Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom (1996): 206; available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).

### **Ethics**

- Childs, James M., Jr. Greed: Economics and Ethics in Conflict. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2000.
- Fowler, James. Weaving the New Creation: Stages of Faith and the Public Church. New York: HarperSanFrancisco, 1991.
- Hammacher, Deb. "Kenneth Cole Foundation Donates \$600K to Create Community Building and Social Change Program." Ethics News and Views, spring 2002, (Center for Ethics, Emory University), 8.
- Welch, Sharon D. A Feminist Ethic of Risk. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1990.

### **History of Christianity**

- Miles, Margaret. Carnal Knowing: Female Nakedness and Religious Meaning in the Christian West. Kent, Tenn.: Burns and Oates, 1992.

### **Women and Peacemaking**

- Alonso, Harriet Hyman. Peace as a Women's Issue: A History of the U.S. Movement for World Peace and Women's Rights. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1993.
- Basch, Linda, Nina Glick Schiller, and Cristina Szanton Blanc, Nations Unbound: Transnational Projects, Postcolonial Predicaments, and Deterritorialized Nation-States. Amsterdam, Netherlands: Gordon and Breach Publishers, 1994.
- Beneria, Lourdes, and Shelley Feldman, eds. Unequal Burden: Economic Crises, Persistent Poverty, and Women's Work. Boulder: Westview Press, 1992.
- Berrigan, Frida, World Policy Institute. "U.S. Weapons Systems in Afghanistan." Women's International League for Peace and Freedom (WILPF), (articles on-line); posted 7 Dec. 2001, available from <http://www.reachingcriticalwill.org>.
- Birch, Andrea. Conversation with author; 2001.
- Blea, Irene I. U.S. Chicanas and Latinas within a Global Context: Women of Color at the Fourth World Women's Conference. Westport, Conn.: Praeger Publishers, 1997.
- Brill, Alida. A Rising Public Voice: Women in Politics Worldwide. New York: Feminist Press, 1995.
- Casey, Heather G. Conversation with author; Jan. 2002.
- "Communiqué from the Third Through Heart to Peace Conference of Women of the World in Sarajevo, May 28th, 1996," 45, (Courtesy of Pacem in Terris, Warwick, N. Y.), Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom, (winter 1995), available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).
- Cooper, Cynthia. "A Cancer Grows: Medical Treatment in Women's Prisons Ranges from Brutal to Nonexistent." The Nation, 6 May 2002, 30-34.
- Davis, Angela Y. Women, Culture, and Politics. New York: Vintage Books, 1990.
- Dismukes, Gwynelle. Practicing Kwanzaa Year Round: Affirmations and Activities Around the Seven Principles. Summertown, Tenn.: GlobalCultures Ink Book Publishing, 2000.
- Dodd, Jody. Conversations with author; 20 and 30 April 2002.
- Edelman, Marion Wright. Plenary speech American Academy of Religion, question and answer period, Orlando, Fl., 21-24 Nov. 1998.
- Franck, Claske. "Dreams of Peace from Bosnia." (Courtesy of Pacem in Terris, Warwick, N.Y.), Integrities, 3015 Freedom Blvd., Watsonville, Calif., summer 1994, 4-5.

- Geyer, Alan, and Barbara Green, Lines in the Sand: Justice and the Gulf War. Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1992.
- Goldfield, Anne, and Myers, Holly. "Landmines--Threefold Sin Against the Spirit." Palo Alto, Calif. (Courtesy of Pacem n Terris, Warwick, N.Y.), Women's Commission for Refugee Women and Children, 1996.
- Goodwin, Jan. "An Uneasy Peace: Afghan Women are Free of the Taliban, But Liberation is Still a Distant Dream." The Nation, 29 April 2002, 20-23.
- Hazelwood House, "The Second Through Heart to Peace Conference of Women of the World, Sarajevo Medugorje, 1st June, 1995," So. Devon; Pacem in Terris, Warwick, New York. Reprinted in Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom. (1996): 43; available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).
- Hinsdale, Mary Ann, Helen M. Lewis, and S. Maxine Waller. It Comes from the People: Community Development and Local Theology. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1995.
- Howe, Julia Ward. "Mother's Day Proclamation--1870." Available from: [womenshistory.about.com](http://womenshistory.about.com). (Originally titled, "Appeal to Womanhood Throughout the World.")
- . Reminiscences, The Collected Works of Julia Ward Howe. 16 vols. Temecula, Calif.: Reprint Services Corporation, 1997.
- Hull, Gloria T., Patricia Bell Scott, and Barbara Smith, eds. All the Women Are White, All the Blacks Are Men, But Some of Us Are Brave: Black Women's Studies. Old Westbury, N.Y.: Feminist Press, 1982.
- Isaac, Katherine. Ralph Nader Presents Civics for Democracy: A Journey for Teachers and Students. Washington, D.C.: Essential Books, 1992.
- Osofsky, Joy D. "The Impact of Violence on Children." The Future of Children "Domestic Violence and Children," 9, 3 (winter 1999), The David and Lucile Packard Foundation, 33-49, information also available from: <http://www.futureofchildren.org>.
- Kahn, Janet, and Susan Bailey. Shaping a Better World: A Teaching Guide on Global Issues/Gender Issues. Wellesley, Mass.: Center for Research on Women, 2000.
- Lee, Barbara. H.R.1567 "To encourage the provision of multilateral debt cancellation for countries eligible to be considered for assistance under the Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC) Initiative or heavily affected by HIV/AIDS, and for other purposes," 4 April 2001, (legislation on-line), available from: <http://thomas.loc.gov>.
- Lee, Barbara. H.R.1050 "To establish a living wage...", 3 March 1999, (legislation on-line), available from <http://www.thomas.loc.gov>.
- . H.R.3000 "To establish a United States Health Service to provide high quality comprehensive health care for all Americans and to overcome the deficiencies in the present system of health care delivery," 1 Oct. 1999, (legislation on-line), available from: <http://www.thomas.loc.gov>.
- Lerner, Gerda, ed. Black Women in White America: A Documentary History. New York: Vintage Books, 1972.
- Mann, Barbara Alice. Iroquoian Women: The Gantowisas. New York: Peter Lang, 2000.
- Meiklejohn Civil Liberties Institute. "Report to the President from the United States Delegation to the United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing, China, September 4-15, 1995, Platform for Action." Meiklejohn Civil Liberties Institute.



- Menchu, Rigoberta. I, Rigoberta Menchu: An Indian Woman in Guatemala. Ed. Elisabeth Burgos-Debray. Trans. Ann Wright. London, Verso, 1984.
- Miss Ann. Interview by author, Nov. 2001, Videotape. Newtown Florist Club, Gainesville, Ga.
- Morris, Jane Anne. "America Needs a Law Prohibiting All Corporate Donations," Rachel's Environment and Health Weekly, 11 July 1996, (flyer), available from P.O. Box 5036, Annapolis, Maryland 21403-7036.
- Murray, Bobbi. "Living Wage Comes of Age: An Increasingly Sophisticated Movement Has Put Opponents on the Defensive." The Nation, 23 July 2001, 24-28.
- Patterson, Orlando. Slavery and Social Death: A Comparative Study. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982.
- Perz, Susan M., ed. Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom (winter 1995); available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).
- Perz, Susan M., ed. Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom (1996); available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).
- Perz, Susan M., in collaboration with Khushnud Azariah, the Women's Development Programme of Pakistan, Gabriele Mayer, and Mary Elizabeth Moore. "Women's Interview Responses Regarding the Situation of Women in Pakistan." Al-Mushir (The Counselor.) (Pakistan) 42, no. 4 (fall 2000): 127-146.
- Reaching Critical Will, a project of the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom (WILPF), "The Dirtiest Dozen Corporations--Partners in Mass Destruction," WILPF (articles on-line), posted Sept. 2001, available from <http://www.reachingcriticalwill.org>.
- Richards, Laura E., and Maude Howe Elliott, assisted by Florence Howe Hall. Julia Ward Howe 1819-1910 1-2 Atlanta: Cherokee Publishing, 1990.
- Salbi, Zaniab. Women for Women in Bosnia Lecture. Scripps College, Claremont, Calif., 1995.
- Saliba, Diane. Conversations with author, 1995, 2001.
- "The Second Through Heart to Peace Conference of Women of the World: Sarajevo Medugorje, 1st June, 1995." (Courtesy of Pacem in Terris, Warwick, N. Y.), Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom, (winter 1995), 43, available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).
- Sivard, Ruth Leger, Arlette Brauer, and Milton I. Roemer. World Military and Social Expenditures, 1989. Washington, D.C.: World Priorities, 1989.
- Smith, Melba. "A Gathering Amid Beauty, Worldly Pain... Mothers of Liberia." United Nations Digest. Women's Division of the United Methodist Church at the United Nations, June 1995.
- Soelle, Dorothee. The Strength of the Weak: Toward a Christian Feminist Identity. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1984.
- United Nations. The United Nations and the Advancement of Women, 1945-1995. New York: Dept. of Public Information, United Nations, 1995.
- United Nations. Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing, China, NGO Forum. "Draft Platform for Action, Proposed Beijing Declaration to Accompany the Draft Platform," International Peace Update, November 1995, Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, also available on-line from [www.iisd.ca/linkages/4wcw/dpa-000.html](http://www.iisd.ca/linkages/4wcw/dpa-000.html).
- United Nations Development Fund for Women. UNIFEM Annual Report, (flyer), 1991.

- Vickers, Jeanne. Women and War. Atlantic Highlands, N. J.: Zed Books, 1993.
- "Washington Feminist Faxnet." Washington, D.C.: Center for Advancement of Public Policy, 1995.
- Watson, Anabel, of Hazelwood House, So. Devon. "Through Heart to Peace, Journey to Bihac and Kljuc: October 1st and 2nd 1995," (Courtesy of Pacem in Terris, Warwick, N.Y.), reprinted in Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom, (winter 1995), 40-42, available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).
- "Who Epitomizes Freedom to You? A Few Freethinkers Name Their Heroes." O, The Oprah Magazine, Feb. 2002, 143.
- Williams, Lyle Lee. "From Common Sense to Good Sense: Participatory Research, Power, Knowledge and Grassroots Empowerment." Ph.D. diss., University of Tennessee, 1997.
- Wolfe, Naomi. Fire vs. Fire: The New Female Power and How It Will Change the 21st Century. New York: Random House, 1993.
- Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, (WILPF). International Peace Update Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, Nov. 1995.
- . "Health Effects and the Nuclear Age: Making the Connections," (articles on-line); posted winter 2000, available from <http://www.reachingcriticalwill.org>.
- Zabelina, Tatiana, and Yevgenia Issraelyan of the Moscow Institute of Youth and the Institute of U.S.A. and Canada. "The War in Chechnya: A Feminist Perspective." Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom. (1996): 61-65; available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).

### **Peace Studies**

- An'Naim, Abdullahi, Emory University law professor and Islam and Human Rights. "Not the True Islam." Interview by Deborah Scroggins Atlanta Journal Constitution, 16 Sept. 2001: C-7.
- "Anti-Ballistic Missile Treaty Implementation Act," Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, (WILPF), (articles on-line); posted on May 8, 2002, available from <http://www.wilpf.org>.
- Bergen, Peter, author of Holy War, Inc. Interview by Steve Scully Washington Journal, (12 Nov 2001) C-SPAN cable television, Gainesville, Ga.
- Booker, Salih, and William Minter. "Global Apartheid." The Nation, 9 July 2001, 11-7.
- "Bush Goes Nuclear." The Nation, 1 April 2002, 3.
- President George W. Bush, news conference, C-SPAN television, Gainesville, Ga., 6 Nov. 2001.
- Camp, Kay. "Nuclear Negotiations Now," Peace and Freedom, Magazine of the Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, Philadelphia, Jan.-March 1996, 15.
- Campbell, Joseph with Bill Moyers. The Power of Myth. Ed. Betty Sue Flowers. New York: Doubleday, 1988.
- Carter, Jimmy. Talking Peace: A Vision for the Next Generation. New York: Dutton Children's Books, 1993.
- "Crack Cocaine and Assault Weapons--The CIA Connection," Integrities, 3015 Freedom Blvd., Watsonville, Calif., 10, no. 3, 1996.
- Frank, Kenneth K. Conversation with author; 15 Feb. 2001.
- Grassroots Leadership. "Strategic Analysis: Stopping For-Profit Private Prisons." A report, 2001, also available from <http://www.grasslead.org>.

- Hanson, John E. Congress at Your Fingertips. McLean, Virginia: Capitol Advantage, 2000.
- Hartung, William. And Weapons for All New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1994, also available from <http://www.worldpolicy.org>.
- Human Rights USA Resource Center. Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Minneapolis.
- Juergensmeyer, Mark. Terror in the Mind of God: The Global Rise of Religious Violence. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000.
- Kagan, Kagan, U.S. Military Academy at West Point Assistant Professor of History. Interview by Steve Scully, Washington Journal, C-SPAN cable television, Gainesville, Ga., 29 April 2002.
- Khatchadourian, Raffi. "Relearning to Love the Bomb: A Move is on to Blur the Line Between Conventional and Nuclear Weapons." The Nation, 1 April 2002, 24-7.
- King, Martin Luther, Jr. A Testament of Hope: The Essential Writings of Martin Luther King, Jr. Ed. James M. Washington. San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1986.
- Kucinich, Dennis. H.R. 2459 "To establish a Department of Peace," 11 July 2001, (legislation on-line), available from <http://www.thomas.loc.gov>.
- MCLI Newsletter, Winter 2001. Meiklejohn Civil Liberties Institute, Berkeley, Calif.
- Minefield: The United States and the Muslim World. Produced by Tom Yellin, directed by Roger Goodman, reported by Peter Jennings, ABC television, WSB, Gainesville, Ga., 15 Sept. 2001.
- Platt, Stanley. "Global Problems Require Global Solutions, the Way to Go: A Restructured and Empowered United Nations, An Open Letter," (flyer), Stanley Center, Minneapolis, Minnesota.
- Plunk, Roger. "The Freelance Peacemaker," Utne Reader, Jan.-Feb. 2002, 62-67.
- Puri, Rashmi-Sudha. Gandhi on War and Peace. New York: Praeger, 1987.
- Schell, Jonathan. "Letter from Ground Zero," The Nation, 1 April 2002.
- School of Assassins Watch. "School of Assassins: The U.S. Army School of the Americas, a Trail of Suffering in Latin America," (flyer) Columbus, Ga.: SOA Watch, also available from: <http://www.derechos.org/soaw/>.
- Snarr, Michael T., and D. Neil Snarr, eds. Introducing Global Issues, 2nd ed. Boulder, Colorado: Lynne Rienner, 2002.
- Tooley, Michelle, and Rick Axtell. "Guatemala and the Slaughter of the Innocents," Seeds Magazine, Dec. 1995, 10-15.
- vanden Heuvel, Katrina, and Stephen F. Cohen. "Endangering U.S. Security." The Nation 15 April 2002, 5-6.
- "What's Fair?" (Brochure) Fairness and Accuracy in Reporting (FAIR), New York. World Policy Institute research available on-line from <http://www.worldpolicy.org>.

### **Nonprofit Research in Peacemaking**

- The Associated Press. "Air Force to Resume Training in Nevada Using Depleted Uranium Rounds: Air Force Claims No Health or Environmental Threat," posted on 5 April 2002, (articles on-line); available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRC) <http://www.ngwrc.org>.
- Ayvazian, Andrea, with Jones Kenneth and Nancy Emond. Dismantling Racism: Workbook for Social Change Groups. Exchange Project, Peace Development Fund, Amherst, Mass., 1996; also available from <http://www.peacefund.org>.

- Gamboa, Suzanne. "Study: Gulf War Vets' Children More Likely to Have Birth Defects: New Study from V.A., Johns Hopkins Contradicts Earlier Pentagon Claims," 5 Oct. 2001, Washington, D.C., (articles on-line); posted on 10 Oct. 2001, available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRS) <http://www.ngwrc.org>.
- "Gulf War Vets Face Higher Risk of Lou Gehrig's: Government Study First to Acknowledge Link Between Service and Specific Disease," posted on 11 Dec. 2001, (articles on-line); posted on 10 Oct. 2001, available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRS) <http://www.ngwrc.org>.
- Hodge, S. J., J. Ejnik, K. S. Squibb, M. A. McDiarmid, E. R. Morris, M. R. Landauer, D.E. McClain. "Detection of Depleted Uranium in Biological Samples from Gulf War Veterans," *Mil. Med.* Dec. 2001; 166(12 Suppl): 69-70, Bethesda, Maryland: Armed Forces Radiobiology Research Institute, posted on 11 Jan. 2002, (articles on-line); available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRS) <http://www.ngwrc.org>.
- HONOR. Questions and Answers on Treaty Rights. Honor Our Neighbor's Origins and Rights (HONOR), Minneapolis, Minn., 1993. See also <http://www.honorearth.org>.
- Kang, H., C. Magee, C. Mahan, K. Lee, F. Murphy, L. Jackson, G. Matanski. "Pregnancy Outcomes among U.S. Gulf War Veterans: A Population-Based Survey of 30,000 Veterans," *Ann. Epidemiology* 11, no. 7 (11 Oct 2001): 504-11. Environmental Epidemiology Service, Department of Veterans Affairs, Washington, D.C., posted at the National Gulf War Resource Center, website as "Birth Defects Higher in Gulf War Vet Children: New Study Shows Higher Levels of Birth Defects, posted on 10 Oct. 2001, (articles on-line); available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRS) <http://www.ngwrc.org>.
- Olsson, Joan. "White Privilege." Peace Development Fund, Amherst, Mass., (flyer), 1995; see also <http://www.peacefund.org>.
- Sheehan-Miles, Charles. "NGWRC (National Gulf War Resource Center) Petitions the Department of Justice/Gulf Vets' Resource Center Files Petition: DOJ Ruling Favors Corporate Interests Over Veterans," posted on 24 June 1996, (articles on-line); available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRS) <http://www.ngwrc.org>.
- Southern Poverty Law Center. 101 Tools for Tolerance. Montgomery, Ala.: Southern Poverty Law Center, 2000; see also <http://www.splcenter.org>.
- Paul Sullivan. Executive Director of NGWRC. "Gulf War Vets Press for Investigation," posted spring 2002, (article on-line); available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRC) <http://www.ngwrc.org>.
- Sullivan, Paul. Executive Director of NGWRC. "NGWRC (National Gulf War Resource Center) Criticizes Conflict of Interest: DoD (Department of Defense) Appoints Energy Department to Review Radiation: Letter to Ms. Isabel Fisenne of the Environmental Measurements Laboratory, U.S. Department of Energy," posted on 4 Oct. 1999, (articles on-line); available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRS) <http://www.ngwrc.org>.
- Swamp, Jake. The Great Law of Peace and the Constitution of the United States of America, Akwesasne, Mohawk Nation, (N. Y.): Tree of Peace Society, 1992.
- "V.A. Recognizes Gulf War Illnesses, Forms New Research Advisory Committee: New Panel Meets in Washington April 11-12," posted on 6 April 2002;

- (articles on-line); available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRS) <http://www.ngwrc.org>.
- Waiel, Faleh. "WHO (World Health Organization) Studies Depleted Uranium in Iraq: The Six-Member WHO Team Arrived in Baghdad Late Monday on a Mission Agreed to in Geneva in April to Study Levels of Cancer and Other Diseases in Iraq," posted on 5 Sept. 2001, (articles on-line); available from the National Gulf War Resource Center (NGWRS) <http://www.ngwrc.org>.
- War Resister's League. Where Your Income Tax Money Really Goes: The United States Federal Budget for Fiscal Year 1997. New York: War Resister's League, 1996.
- WarTimes, available from <http://www.war-times.org>.
- World Court Project. "World Court Declares Nuclear Weapons Threat and Use Illegal," United Kingdom: World Court Project, 1996.
- Written display materials, "Without Sanctuary: Lynching Photography in America," art exhibition, Emory University and Martin Luther King, Jr. National Historic Site, Atlanta, 1 May--31 Dec. 2002, curator Joseph F. Jordan.

### **Women and Economic Development**

- Domini, Amy. Socially Responsible Investing: Making a Difference and Making Money. Chicago: Dearborn Trade, 2001.
- Ehrenreich, Barbara. Nickel and Dimed: On (Not) Getting by in America. New York: Metropolitan Books, 2001.
- Emeagwali, Gloria T., ed. Women Pay the Price: Structural Adjustment in Africa and the Caribbean. Trenton, N. J.: African World Press, 1995.
- Heward, Christine, and Sheila Bunwaree, eds. Gender, Education, and Development: Beyond Access to Empowerment. London: Zed Books, 1999.
- Interhemispheric Resource Center. Women's Lives in a Changing World. Albuquerque: Interhemispheric Resource Center, Jan. 1995.
- Kohler, Ann. Financial report to Church Women United 2000 Leadership Conference, Hoboken, N. J., summer 2000; see also <http://www.churchwomen.org>.
- Lewis, Helen. Rebuilding Communities: A 12 Step Recovery Program. Essay draft, 1997. Based on "Community Development as Ministry," Dotson Nelson Lecture on Religion and Life, Samford University, Birmingham, Ala., 10 Oct. 1995.
- Morris, Jane Anne, (Wisconsin Campaign). "America Needs a Law Prohibiting Corporate Donations," Synthesis/Regeneration 9: A Magazine of Green Social Thought, winter 1996, 37-38.
- Riley, Maria, World Policy Institute. "Development at the Crossroads: Women in the Center." Resource Center Bulletin, Albuquerque: Alternative Women In Development (Alt-WID) Interhemispheric Resource Center, Aug. 1995.
- Safa, Helen I. The Myth of the Male Breadwinner: Women and Industrialization in the Caribbean. Boulder: Westview Press, 1995.
- Sassen, Saskia. Globalization and Its Discontents: Essays on the New Mobility of People and Money. New York: New Press, 1998.
- Sparr, Pamela, ed. Mortgaging People's Lives: Feminist Critiques of Structural Adjustment. London: Zed Books, 1994.
- Steady, Filomina Chioma, ed. Women and Children First: Environment, Poverty, and Sustainable Development. Rochester, Vt., Schenkman Books,

- 1993.
- United Nations. Department of Public Information. The United Nations and the Advancement of Women, 1945-1995. New York: United Nations, 1995.
- Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO). no. 1 "Codes of Conduct for Transnational Corporations: Strategies Toward Democratic Global Governance," Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) Primer: Understanding the Impact of the Global Economy on Women and the Environment. New York: WEDO, 1995.
- no. 2. "Transnational Corporations at the U.N.: Using or Abusing Their Access," Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) Primer: Understanding the Impact of the Global Economy on Women and the Environment. New York: WEDO, 1995.
- no. 3. "Who Makes the Rules? Decision-Making and Structure of the New World Trade Organization," Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) Primer: Understanding the Impact of the Global Economy on Women and the Environment. New York: WEDO, 1995.
- no. 4. "How Secure Is Our Food? Food Security and Agriculture Under the New GATT and World Trade Organization (WTO)," Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) Primer: Understanding the Impact of the Global Economy on Women and the Environment. New York: WEDO, 1995.
- no. 5. "Who Owns Knowledge? Who owns the Earth? Intellectual Property Rights and Biodiversity under the New GATT and World Trade Organization (WTO)," Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) Primer: Understanding the Impact of the Global Economy on Women and the Environment. New York: WEDO, 1995.
- no. 6. "Who Decides Where the Money Goes? Decision-Making and Structures of the World Bank and Regional Development Banks," Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) Primer: Understanding the Impact of the Global Economy on Women and the Environment. New York: WEDO, 1995.
- Women's International League for Peace and Freedom. Challenging Corporate Power, Asserting the People's Rights. Philadelphia: Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, 1999.
- UPDATE on Women and Family Issues in Congress, Sept.-Oct. 1994.
- The Working Group on the WTO/MAI. A Citizens' Guide to the World Trade Organization: Everything You Need to Know to Fight for Fair Trade, (pamphlet on-line); posted July 1999, available from <http://www.tradewatch.org>, 1-16.
- Zubow, Deborah, and Nesbitt, Elizabeth. "Who Gets Welfare?" Philadelphia: Women's International League for Peace and Freedom (WILPF) and National Welfare Rights Union (NWRU), 1995, poster series.

### **Economic Studies**

- Andriote, John Manual. "The Crystal Ball," Working Woman, Feb. 1998, 32.
- Frank, Thomas. "Shocked, Shocked! Enronian Myths Exposed." The Nation, 8 April 2002, 17-21.
- Gettleman, Jeffrey. "It's Like Getting Fleeced: Cotton Mill Workers at a Martinsville, Va., Firm Will Soon Be Joining the Thousands of U.S. Textile Workers Left Behind in a Landscape of Plants Closed by Globalization," Los Angeles

- Times, 20 Feb. 2002, part A, 1.
- Godoy, Juio. "U.S. Policy on Taliban Influenced by Oil," c.2001 Asia Times Online Co. Ltd., (articles on-line), available from <http://www.serendipity.magnet.ch>.
- Grossman, Richard L., and Frank T. Adams. "Taking Care of Business: Citizenship and the Charter of Incorporation," pamphlet, Cambridge, Mass.: Charter, Ink, 1993.
- Kafka, Peter, and Peter Newcomb. The 400 Richest People in America: Forbes. 2001 Annual Edition, 127-298.
- Klare, Micahel T. Pacific News Service. "Bush's Master Oil Plan," (articles on-line), posted on April 23, 2002, available from: <http://alternet.org>, 1-3.
- Lardner, James. "The Rich Get Richer: What Happens to American Society When the Gap in Wealth and Income Grows Larger?" U.S. News and World Report, 21 Feb. 2000, 39-43.
- Lietaer, Bernard. "From the Real Economy to the Speculative," IFG News, San Francisco, International Forum on Globalization (IFG), summer 1997, 7-10.
- Madrick, Jeff. "Enron, the Media and the New Economy," The Nation, 1 April 2002, 17-20.
- Mickey Mouse Goes to Haiti: Walt Disney and the Science of Exploitation. Produced by Rudi Stern. About 20 min. Crowing Rooster Arts, 1996. Videocassette.
- Minerbrook, Scot. "Home Ownership Anchors the Middle Class: But Lending Games Sink Many Prospective Owners," Emerge, 1993, 42-48.
- Nader, Ralph. Campaign speeches, 2000.
- — —. "Ralph Nader Speaks." Speech at Glenn Memorial Auditorium, Emory University, Atlanta, 31 Oct. 2001.
- National Conference of Catholic Bishops. Economic Justice for All: Pastoral Letter on Catholic Social Teaching and the U.S. Economy. Washington, D.C.: National Conference of Catholic Bishops, 1986.
- Newcomb, Peter, and Peter Kafka. The 400 Richest People in America: Forbes, 2000 Annual Edition, 117-377.
- Nichols, John. "Enron: What Dick Cheney Knew: An Investigation of the Company's White House Ties Should Begin at His Door," The Nation, 15 April 2002, 14-7.
- Nixon, Rob. "The Hidden Lives of Oil," The Chronicle Review, 5 April 2002, B7-9.
- Press, Eyal. "Rebel with a Cause: the Re-Education of Joseph Stiglitz," The Nation, 10 June 2002, 13-16.
- Program on Corporations, Law, and Democracy. "The Struggle for Democratic Control of Corporations: Taking the Offensive," (flyer), Feb., 1996.
- Rall, Ted. "Bush Fuels Oil Conspiracy Theory," (articles on-line), posted 10 Jan. 2002, available from <http://www.alternet.org>, 1-3.
- Robbins, Tim. "What I Voted For: Nader's Campaign Made a Lot of People Angry, But His Cause Is Worth the Fight," The Nation, 6-13 Aug. 2001, 24-26.
- Sakashita, Miyoko. "Localizers: The Community Currency Alternative," IFG News, San Francisco: International Forum on Globalization (IFG), summer 1997, 12-13.
- Sider, Ron J. Rich Christians in an Age of Hunger, A Biblical Study. 2nd ed. Downers Grove, Ill.: Inter-Varsity Press, 1984.
- Silverstein, Ken. "U.S. Oil Politics in the 'Kuwait of Africa: An Investigative Report,"

The Nation, 22 April 2002, 11-20.

Snarr, C. Melissa. "Reflections on Barbara Ehrenreich's Nickel and Dimed: Servant Leadership ~~Defined~~ Defiled," Ethics News and Views, Center for Ethics, Emory University, spring 2002.

Testimony by John J. Maresca, Vice President, International Relations, Unocal Corporation to House Committee on International Relations Subcommittee on Asia and the Pacific, 12 Feb. 1998, Washinton, D.C., (articles on-line), available from: [http://www.house.gov/international\\_relations](http://www.house.gov/international_relations), 1-6.

### **Nonprofit Research in Development**

Clarke, Tony, with the International Forum on Globalization. Dismantling Corporate Rule: Towards a New Form of Politics in an Age of Globalization, draft. San Francisco, Calif., International Forum on Globalization, 1995.

Homes and Hands: Community Land Trusts in Action. Produced by Helen S. Cohen, directed by Debra Chasnoff and Helen S. Cohen, approx. 20 min. Women's Educational Media with Institute for Community Economics, 1998. Videocassette.

Families and Work Institute, "American Workers," (brief commercial), Smart Medicine, TNT, February 2002.

Gordon, Rebecca. Cruel and Usual: How Welfare "Reform" Punishes Poor People. Oakland, Calif.: Applied Research Center, 2001.

Korten, David C. "That ABCs of Finance Capitalism," IFG News, summer 1997, San Francisco: International Forum on Globalization (IFG), 4-7.

Maquiladora Health and Safety Support Network. A Few Facts About Maquiladoras. Berkeley: Maquiladora Health and Safety Support Network, 1995.

Future of America's Youth. Panel discussion on America's Children 2002 Report, a federal report on policy affecting America's children sponsored by the Institute for Educational Leadership. Moderated by Margaret Dunkle-Welch, Policy Exchange Director for the Institute for Educational Leadership, C-SPAN television, 3 Nov. 2001; report available from <http://www.childstats.gov/americaschildren>.

Tradewatch, available at <http://www.Tradewatch.org>.

University of Southern California. Corporate Teach-In Conference on Global Economics for College Students and Faculty, Berkeley, Oct. 1996.

### **Women and the Environment**

Bertell, Rosalie. No Immediate Danger: Prognosis for a Radioactive Earth. Summertown, Tenn.: Book Publishing Company, 1985.

Carson, Rachel. Silent Spring. With an introduction by Al Gore. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1994.

Gibbs, Lois Marie, and the Citizens Clearinghouse for Hazardous Waste. Dying From Dioxin: A Citizen's Guide to Reclaiming Our Health and Rebuilding Democracy. Boston: South End Press, 1995.

Giese, Paula. "The Burial Ground Nobody Wants to Save: The Mdewakanton of Minnesota Face the Spectre of Nuclear Waste." Akwesasne Notes New Series, fall 1995, 33-9, also available on-line from <http://www.ratical.org/AkwesasneNs.html>.

Kaplan, Temma. Crazy for Democracy: Women in Grassroots Movements. New York: Routledge, 1997.



- Olson, Karen. "Our Planet, Our Selves: Carolyn Raffensperger's Quest to Make an Ounce of Prevention an International Cause." Utne Reader, May-June 2000, 62-64.
- Shiva, Vandana. Ecology and the Politics of Survival: Conflicts Over Natural Resources in India. Newbury Park, Calif.: Sage Publications and the United Nations University Press, 1991.
- . Monocultures of the Mind: Perspectives on Biodiversity and Biotechnology. New York: Zed Books, 1993.
- . Stolen Harvest: The Hijacking of the Global Food Supply. Cambridge, Mass.: South End Press, 2000.
- . The Violence of the Green Revolution: Third World Agriculture, Ecology, and Politics. Atlantic Highlands, N.J.: Zed Books, 1991.
- Spears, Ellen Griffith. The Newtown Story: One Community's Fight for Environmental Justice. Atlanta.: Center for Democratic Renewal and the Newtown Florist Club, 1998.

### **Environment**

- Ausubel, Kenny. "The Coming Age of Ecological Medicine," Utne Reader, May-June 2000, 56-60.
- Bivens, Matt. "Fighting for America's Energy Independence." The Nation, 15 April 2002, 11-14.
- Brown, Lester R.; Christopher Flavin, Hilary French, Janet N. Abramovitz, Chris Bright, Seth Dunn, Brian Halweil, Gary Gardner, Ashley Mattoon, Anne Platt McGinn, Molly O'Meara, Sandra Postel, Michael Renner. Edited by Linda Starke. State of the World 2000: A Worldwatch Institute Report. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 2000.
- Brown, Lester R., Christopher Flavin, Hilary French, Janet N. Abramovitz, Seth Dunn, Gary Gardner, Lisa Mastny, Ashley Mattoon, David Roodman, Payal Sampat. Ed. Linda Starke. State of the World 2001: A Worldwatch Institute Report. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 2001.
- Kitchen, Dave, and Sharon Kitchen. Native American radio show hosts and guest lecturers in Psychology of Cultural Diversity course, Brenau University, 1999.
- Lent, Tom. Energy for Employment: How to Heat Up the Economy Not the Planet. San Francisco: Greenpeace, 1992.
- Raven, Peter H., and Linda R. Berg. Environment. 3rd ed. Orlando, Fla.: Harcourt College Publishers, 2001.
- Scorecard, an environmental site providing statistics on air, water, and soil pollution all over the U.S., by Environmental Defense, Washington, D.C., available from <http://www.scorecard.org>.

### **Feminist Theory**

- Collins, Patricia Hill. Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness, and the Politics of Empowerment. New York: Routledge, 1991.
- Ensler, Eve. The Vagina Monologues. Rev. Ed. New York: Villard, 2001.
- Hooks, Bell. Killing Rage: Ending Racism. New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1995.
- Irigaray, Luce. An Ethics of Sexual Difference. Translated by Carolyn Burke and Gillian C. Gill. Ithaca, N. Y.: Cornell University Press, 1993.
- . The Speculum of the Other Woman. Translated by Gillian C. Gill. Ithaca, N. Y.: Cornell University Press, 1985.

- — —. This Sex Which Is Not One. Translated by Catherine Porter with Carolyn Burke. Ithaca, N. Y.: Cornell University Press, 1985.
- Lorde, Audre. Sister Outsider: Essays and Speeches. Freedom, Calif.: Crossing Press, 1984.
- Marks, Elaine, and Isabelle de Courtivon, eds. New French Feminisms: An Anthology. New York: Schocken Books, 1980.
- Scarry, Elaine. The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World. New York: Oxford University, 1985.
- Schaef, Ann Wilson. When Society Becomes an Addict. San Francisco: Harper and Row Publishers, 1987.
- — —. Women's Reality. New York: Harper Collins, 1991.
- Trask, Haunani-Kay. Eros and Power: The Promise of Feminist Theory. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1986.

### **Feminist Arts, Music, Film, Fiction, and Poetry**

- Berry, Wendell. The Collected Poems: 1957-1982. San Francisco: North Point Press, 1985.
- Binet, Noris. Women on the Inner Journey: Building a Bridge, Healing Racial Wounds Through Art and Spirituality. Nashville: James C. Winston Publishing, 1994, available from (615) 297-6654.
- — —. Coordinator of "Women's Altars" art exhibit, Women's Visions Gallery, Nashville, 1995.
- Chicago, Judy. The Dinner Party. New York: Penguin Books, 1996.
- Childs, Toni. A Woman's Boat. CD jacket, graphics and music. Los Angeles: Geffen Record Co.
- Dash, Julie. Daughters of the Dust: The Making of an African American Woman's Film. New York: New Press, 1992.
- Jones, Amelia, ed. Sexual Politics: Judy Chicago's "Dinner Party" in Feminist Art History. (Los Angeles): UCLA at the Armand Hammer Museum of Art and Cultural Center in association with the University of California Press, 1996.
- O'Keeffe, Georgia. Georgia O'Keeffe: One Hundred Flowers. Ed. Nicholas Callaway. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1987.
- Perz, Susan M. "Dedication." Poem. Louisville, Kentucky, 1985.
- Perz, Susan M. "I Am Woman," Journal of Sacred Feminine Wisdom. (Winter 1995): 67; available from [jwisdom@bellsouth.net](mailto:jwisdom@bellsouth.net).
- Shenandoah, Joanne. CD Album jacket introduction. Matriarch: Iroquois Women's Songs. Boulder: Silver Wave Records, 1996.

### **Nonverbal Behavior Research**

- Hall, Edward T. The Hidden Dimension. Garden City, N. Y.: Doubleday and Company, 1982.
- Horowitz, M.J. "Graphic Communication: A Study of Interaction Painting with Schizophrenics," American Journal of Psychotherapy, 17 (1963): 230-239.
- McLuhan, Eric, and Frank Zingrone, eds. Essential McLuhan. New York: BasicBooks, 1995.
- Montagu, Ashley. Touching: The Human Significance of the Skin. New York: Columbia University Press, 1971.
- Regan, John, Hao Ke-Qi, Huang Ping-An, Zhang Wei-Jiang, and Yang Chang-Qing. "To Learn Three Thousand 'Letters': Early Literacy in China." Arizona Reading Journal 24, no. 1 (spring/summer 1997).

### **Grant Writing and Fundraising**

- Klein, Kim. Fundraising for Social Change. 3rd ed. Inverness, Calif.: Chardon Press, 1994.
- Robinson, Andy. Grassroots Grants: An Activist's Guide to Proposal Writing. Berkeley: Chardon Press, 1996.
- Trombley, Nicole., ed., with Julio C. Rosa and Teena Nguyen. Grantmakers Directory 2000-2001: A Resource for Social Change Funders and Grantseekers. San Diego: National Network of Grantmakers, 2001.

### **College Catalogs, Courses, and Professional Resources**

- Ambler, Susan, convener. "Just Connections,"(panel presentation at the Appalachian Studies Conference, Helen, Ga., 17 March 2001.)
- Brenau University 2001-2002 Undergraduate and Graduate Catalogs. Gainesville, Ga.: Brenau University, 2001.
- Introduction to Counseling, course, Counselor Education Department, Education Department, University of Florida, Gainesville, Fl.
- Counseling Theories, course, Counselor Education Department, Education Department, University of Florida, Gainesville, Fl.